Absence of the genicular arterial anastomosis as generally depicted in textbooks.

Maher Sabalbal M.Sc.¹,², Marjorie Johnson Ph.D.², Vivian McAlister MB, FRCSI, FRCSC, FACS¹,³

¹Canadian Forces Health Service, ²Department of Anatomy and Cell Biology and ³Department of Surgery, Western University Canada

Address for correspondence:
Dr. Vivian McAlister
C4-211, University Hospital,
London, ON, Canada N6A5A5
Telephone 519 6632920
<vmcalist@uwo.ca>

Acknowledgement: Presented in part to the 2010 annual meeting of the American Association of Anatomists

Background: Textbook representations of the genicular arterial anastomosis show a large direct communication between the descending branch of the lateral circumflex femoral artery (DBLCFA) and a genicular branch of the popliteal artery but this is not compatible with clinical experience.

Objective: To determine if the arterial anastomosis at the knee is sufficient, in the event of traumatic disruption of the superficial femoral artery, to infuse protective agents or to place a stent to restore flow to the lower leg.

Methods: Dissection of 10 cadaveric lower limbs was performed to photograph the arterial anatomy from the inguinal ligament to the tibial tubercle. Anastomosis with branches of the popliteal artery was classified as: direct; approaching; or no evident communication.

Results: A constant descending artery in the lateral thigh (LDAT) was found to have 5 types of origin: Type 1 (2/10) lateral circumflex femoral branch of the femoral artery; Type 2 (3/10) lateral circumflex femoral branch of profunda femoris artery; Type 3 (1/10) femoral artery; Type 4 (3/10) superficial femoral artery and Type 5 (2/10) profunda femoris artery. In one limb, there were two descending arteries (Type 4 and 5). Collateral circulation at the knee was also variable: direct communicating vessel (3/10); approaching vessels with possible communication via capillaries (5/10): no evident communication (2/10). Communicating vessels, if present, are too small to provide immediate collateral circulation.

Conclusions: Modern representations of the genicular arterial anastomosis are inaccurate, commonly derived from an idealized image that first appeared Gray's Anatomy in 1910. The afferent vessel is not DBLCFA. The majority of subjects have the potential to recruit collateral circulation via LDAT following gradual obstruction to normal arterial flow which may be
important if LDAT is removed for bypass or flap surgery. A direct communication is rarely present and is never as robust as generally depicted in textbooks.
Introduction

Combat injuries of the thigh often involve the superficial femoral artery (SFA) – the conduit artery to the leg. It is our experience that angiography to delineate acute SFA injury in these situations sometimes shows contrast reconstitution of the popliteal artery below the SFA obstruction. While chronic occlusion of the SFA may allow for collateral circulation of blood to develop, acute disruption relies upon anatomical anastomoses, that are already present, to divert blood to the lower leg. We hypothesized that non-surgical treatment of lower limb ischaemia from SFA disruption is possible by the infusion of agents or the placement of stents in a genicular arterial anastomosis.

These anastomoses are not usually visible with clinical imaging including direct angiography, computerized tomographic angiography (CTA) or magnetic resonance angiography (MRA). All of the surgical or anatomical textbooks that we surveyed demonstrate arterial anastomoses at the knee using strikingly similar illustrations. These diagrammatic representations appear to be based upon an illustration that was included for the first time in the 18th American edition Gray's Anatomy of 1910 (Figure 1). Even though this 1910 illustration is similar in style to the other figures, which are drawings of dissections, it was not until the 32nd edition in 1968 that the figure was labelled a 'schematic' to distinguish it from the life drawings. The schematic and its modern versions show medial and lateral arterial anastomoses at the knee. The medial anastomosis, via the descending genicular artery (formerly called anastomotica magna) whose origin is the SFA at Hunter’s canal, is too distal to permit collateral flow if the SFA is injured in the thigh. The afferent vessel of the lateral anastomosis is the descending branch of the lateral circumflex
femoral artery (DBLCFA), which ends by direct communication with the lateral superior
genicular branch of the popliteal artery.

These illustrations suggest that collateral flow via the genicular anastomosis would be sufficient
to supply the leg if the SFA is acutely occluded, but this is rarely the case in trauma. This fact,
coupled with the possibility that the illustrations are being copied from one textbook to the next,
throws our understanding of collateral arterial flow at the knee into doubt. Uncertainty regarding
DBLCFA and its role in the genicular arterial anastomosis should be resolved if this vessel is to
be used as a graft in bypass or free flap surgery.\textsuperscript{4} It was our hope, undertaking this research, that
anatomic knowledge of the genicular anastomosis would assist the development of non-surgical
treatments of traumatic interruption of SFA flow that might be useful in combat situations.

\textbf{Methods}

Prior to commencing this study, we tested 3-dimensional reconstruction of anatomic cryosections
or cross-sectional images by CTA or MRA and found all to have insufficient detail to disprove
the presence of an anastomosis. Contrast enhanced studies failed because absence of flow via
anastomoses may have been due to preferential flow via regular channels. Manual 3-dimensional
reconstruction of anatomic cryosections failed because we lost track of secondary and tertiary
arteries well above the knee. Traditional anatomic dissection of cadavers provided more detail
and greater reliability. This study was approved according the guidelines of the Department of
Anatomy and Cell Biology at the Western University Canada. The subjects’ age, gender, donor
number, and cause of death were recorded. Young subjects were not available. Cadavers without
evidence of severe arterial disease on inspection were included in the the study. Donors were not
sequential but chosen according to availability with respect to teaching requirements in the laboratory. The cadavers were injected with 3% formalin through a duotronic embalming machine via the right femoral and left common carotid arteries. Latex was injected via the same arteries with the aid of a high powered air pressure pump.

Superior approach: The femoral artery was exposed anteriorly by incision from the mid-inguinal point, following the medial margin of Sartorius, to the tibial tubercle. The femoral sheath was opened and major branches of the common femoral artery (CFA) and SFA were dissected. At the level of the tibial tubercle, the skin was incised circumferentially allowing the superficial fascia to be reflected and removed. Profunda femoris artery (PFA) and its major branches were dissected and their branching pattern was noted. The muscles, nerves and veins were mobilized or excised to expose the femoro-popliteal arterial segment. The descending branches were identified and followed down the lateral aspect of the thigh deep to rectus femoris and within the substance of vastus lateralis until their diminished size and integrity was deemed unsafe for further dissection. At this point, the inferior approach was commenced.

Inferior approach: The popliteal fossa was entered and the popliteal artery was identified by first removing popliteal fat and fascia. The popliteal veins and their tributaries, alongside branches of the sciatic nerve, were removed. The genicular arteries were identified and dissected along most of their course. Branches of the lateral superior genicular artery were followed as they approached the territory of the terminal branches of the DBLCFA.

Photography: Each stage of dissection was photographed with a Nikon D80 single-lens reflex digital camera.

Analysis: Arteries offering a potential collateral circulation were dissected as far as possible (< 0.5 mm in diameter). The vessels were supported to prevent disruption and repaired if breakage
occurred. When dissection was no longer possible, the block of tissue in which the vessel terminated was preserved. Anastomoses were classified as: direct, approaching, or no anastomosis. A direct anastomosis was present if a single vessel was found to be continuous with branches of the CFA or SFA above and with branches of the popliteal artery below. An anastomosis was determined to be approaching if terminal branches from the femoral (CFA or SFA) and popliteal arteries could be dissected to a common block of tissue 2 x 2 x 2 cm. An anastomosis was thought to be unlikely, and categorized as no anastomosis, if arteries from the femoral (either CFA or SFA) and popliteal systems terminated in different blocks of tissue. Donor number, date, time and description were used to label all photographs.

**Results**

The average age of the dissected cadavers was 77.3 with a range of 53-88 years. Medical history was unknown except for the cause of death. The subjects’ age, gender, donor number, cause of death and anatomic findings are given in Table 1. There was considerable variation in this relatively small sample but no correlation was evident between variables. Even though some of the subjects died of cardiovascular or cerebrovascular events, severe peripheral vascular disease was not seen in our subjects.

A long artery was found in each of the specimens to descend down the lateral aspect of the thigh toward the knee. It usually lay between rectus femoris and vastus lateralis supplying each muscle. This was the only candidate artery that could have bypassed an obstruction in the SFA. The origin of this artery was variable which we categorized into 5 arrangements based on its parent trunk (Figure 2). In Type 1 (two of ten limbs), the descending artery arose from the lateral
circumflex branch of the femoral artery. In Type 2 (three of ten limbs), the pattern was similar to Type 1 except that the lateral circumflex femoral artery arose from the PFA. In Type 3 (one of ten limbs), Type 4 (three of ten limbs) and Type 5 (two of ten limbs) the descending artery arose directly from the CFA, SFA, or PFA respectively. In one limb, there were two descending arteries, one arising from the PFA (Type 5) and one arising from the SFA (Type 4).

A direct arterial communication was seen between the terminal branch of the lateral descending artery of the thigh and a terminal branch of the lateral superior genicular artery was seen in 3 of ten limbs. In 5 limbs, the two arteries were clearly approaching each other with their terminal branches ending in the same block of muscle, but a discernible communication was not seen. In the remaining 2 limbs, communication was thought to be unlikely as the descending artery and the lateral superior genicular artery terminated in different blocks of tissue at some distance from each other. On the medial side of the knee, a branch of the SFA arose at hunter’s canal and terminated in small branches at the capsule of the knee.

Thus, our findings differed from the common understanding of this anatomy in two ways: 1) a branch of the femoral artery descends in the lateral aspect of the thigh but it rarely arises from the lateral circumflex femoral artery; 2) robust direct communications between branches of the femoral and popliteal arteries do not exist. Only a minority of subjects had a direct anastomosis between extremely small vessels, some had the potential for communication via capillaries and others had no possibility of communication. In all subjects, collateral flow was unlikely to be sufficient in the event of acute obstruction of a normal SFA.
Discussion

Henry Gray designed his textbook to be relevant to medical students and practising surgeons. Vandyke Carter's drawings of dissections made by Gray and Carter for the first edition of the textbook in 1858 significantly contributed to the enduring success of the textbook. In the second edition of 1860, Gray added a written description of the collateral circulation after ligation of the femoral artery which he attributed to Sir Astley Cooper. Reading Cooper's original paper, it is clear that Cooper believed most patients would muster sufficient collateral flow, via the anastomoses of smaller vessels, to permit the surgeon to ligate any major artery in order to control aneurysms or hemorrhage. The observations which Gray quoted were made by Cooper when he performed an autopsy on a man whose superficial femoral artery was ligated for a popliteal aneurysm 7 years earlier. After Gray's untimely death in 1861, the textbook's first editor Timothy Holmes added a reference to an anatomic specimen taken from a patient who lived 50 years after John Hunter ligated his femoral artery. This prosection was made by Thomas Wormald, the patient's last physician, and is still retained by the Hunter Museum at the Royal College of Surgeons of England. Wormald presented the specimen to the college after giving a Hunterian oration on the topic in 1857, one year before Gray first published his textbook. Both Hunter's specimen and Cooper's description suggest the principal afferent vessel to be a descending branch of the PFA. Citation of Cooper's 1811 paper was maintained until 1949 while subsequent editions of Gray's Anatomy continued to use his description but without attribution.

The idealized illustration of the arterial anastomosis at the knee, which was added to early 20th century editions of Gray's Anatomy was preceded in 1908 by a diagram attributed to Paul Poirier and Adrien Charpy, whose multi-volume textbook was published in 1901. These illustrations
are most likely based on the Hunter specimen and Cooper's written description, both of which reflect pathological collateral circulation many years after ligation of an abnormal vessel. This potentially inaccurate idealization continues to be considered today to represent normal anatomy. Current editions of Gray's Anatomy continue to publish the 1910 illustration but now without any link in the text.

Anatomical study of the arterial anatomy of the lower extremity were commenced again by Dr DeBakey and colleagues in 1960. Subsequent studies used increasingly sophisticated angiography, with and without 3-dimensional imaging, mostly to document variation in the branching pattern of the popliteal artery, in particular to warn against harvesting a vascularized tissue graft based on the fibular artery in patients with a fibular dominant variant. None of these papers demonstrated collateral circulation via genicular anastomoses. There is a good reason why we rely on occasional 200 year old dissections of pathological circulation to define the normal arterial anatomy around the knee. It is still very difficult to demonstrate the genicular anastomosis, even in this technological age. CTA and MRA fail to show it because of preferential flow of contrast through the SFA in normal subjects. 3-dimensional reconstruction of anatomic cryosections do not have sufficient resolution to distinguish very small vessels especially at branch points or when sliced tangentially. Traditional dissection remains the best method to demonstrate this anatomy, with high resolution photography being our only advantage over the golden age practitioners of surgical anatomy whose dissection skills we may have lost.

While our ability to demonstrate the genicular anastomosis is limited, we were never hampered in our understanding of the DBLCFA. Textbooks invariably show this artery to be a branch of the
lateral circumflex femoral artery, which arises from the PFA. We only found this arrangement in four of the ten limbs dissected. DBLCFA, the name given to this arrangement is unsuitable for the other variants as it may mislead the surgeon. Variation in the arterial anatomy at this location has been demonstrated before using radiological techniques, but their findings have not found their way into surgical atlases.\textsuperscript{16,17} Our small sample and their studies suggest that only a minority of subjects have the classical arrangement of DBLCFA. Therefore, we suggest renaming the DBLCFA to the more anatomically correct: lateral descending artery of the thigh (LDAT)

The contribution of LDAT to a genicular anastomosis is also variable. It appears to be present or potentially present in about 70\% of patients. Removal of this potential for collateral circulation may have significant consequences if the SFA is already, or becomes, occluded. Acute distal limb ischaemia following anterolateral thigh free flap harvest has been reported.\textsuperscript{18} On the other hand, the calibre of communicating vessels, when they were seen, is never sufficient to preserve blood flow to the lower leg in the event of acute disruption of a normal SFA. Sir Astley Cooper described distal ischaemia requiring amputation following ligation of the SFA for popliteal aneurysm in his 1811 paper but he blamed cold weather.\textsuperscript{6} Most likely gradual obstruction of the SFA by atherosclerosis permits recruitment of collateral circulation in those patients fortunate enough to have a genicular arterial anastomosis.

The initial hope of the research reported here was to determine if non-surgical options might exist for soldiers who sustain SFA injuries in combat. Our finding that one third of subjects do not have a potential for collateral circulation at the knee makes that hope less likely. The study group is much older than the population at risk. There is a chance that we could mistake
collateral circulation, developed at a later age in response to occult peripheral vascular disease, for anatomical anastomoses and over estimate the number present. Our inability to demonstrate the anastomosis is therefore even more convincing of its absence in a substantial portion of the population.

References

1. Gray H. Anatomy, descriptive and applied. (Editor: Spitzka EA) Lea and Febiger, Philadelphia 1910, page 697 (Fig 484)
2. Gray H. Anatomy, descriptive and applied. (Editor: Johnston TB, Davies DV, Davies F) Longmans, London 1968, page 828 (Fig 744)
6. Cooper A. Dissection of a limb on which the operation for popliteal aneurism had been performed. Medico-Chirurgical Transactions 1811; 2: 249-259.

   <http://surgicat.rcseng.ac.uk/(xakhbt55xy4nld45vnubije0)/detail.aspx>


11. Morris GC Jr, Beall AC Jr, Berry WB, Feste J, DeBakey ME. Anatomical studies of the


Multi–Detector Row CT Angiography prior to Free-Flap Transplantation. Radiology
2005; 237:353–360


17. Massoud TF. & Fletcher, EWL. Anatomical Variants of the profunda femoris artery: an

18. Hage JJ. & Woerdeman LAE. Lower limb necrosis after use of the anterolateral thigh free
Table 1. Cause of death, type of origin of lateral descending artery of the thigh, and genicular anastomosis class of the 10 cadavers dissected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Donor Number</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Cause of Death</th>
<th>Origin of afferent artery</th>
<th>Genicular Anastomosis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1341</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>middle cerebral artery infarct</td>
<td>Type 1</td>
<td>Direct communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1358</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>Metastatic renal cell carcinoma</td>
<td>Type 2</td>
<td>Direct communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1373</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Cancer of oesophagus</td>
<td>Types 4 &amp; 5</td>
<td>No anastomosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1382</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Non small cell lung cancer</td>
<td>Type 1</td>
<td>No anastomosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1409</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>Intracerebral hemorrhage, accidental fall</td>
<td>Type 2</td>
<td>Approaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1413</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>Natural causes, hypertension</td>
<td>Type 5</td>
<td>Approaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1427</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>GI bleed, bladder cancer, chronic renal failure, congestive heart failure, bilateral pleural effusion</td>
<td>Type 4</td>
<td>Direct communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1428</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>Ischaemic heart disease, chronic heart failure, atrial fibrillation</td>
<td>Type 3</td>
<td>Approaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1430</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>Pneumonia, stroke</td>
<td>Type 4</td>
<td>Approaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1434</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>Heart failure, lung cancer, ischaemic heart disease, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease</td>
<td>Type 2</td>
<td>Approaching</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1: This figure of the genicular anastomosis, as depicted in editions of Gray's Anatomy since 1910, has been the basis for most modern illustrations of this anatomy which the current study finds to be inaccurate (Gray H. Anatomy, descriptive and applied. (Editor: Spitzka EA) Lea and Febiger, Philadelphia 1910, page 697, Fig 484)
Figure 2 Legend

Figure 2. Five types of lateral descending artery of the thigh (yellow arrows) as determined by its origin: Type 1 (upper left panel) lateral circumflex femoral artery (red arrow), a branch of the femoral artery (CFA); Type 2 (upper middle panel) lateral circumflex femoral artery, a branch of the profunda femoris artery (PFA); Type 3 (upper right panel) CFA; Type 4 (lower left panel) superficial femoral artery (SFA) and Type 5 (lower middle panel) PFA. The dissection in the lower right panel shows two descending arteries, Type 4 and Type 5.