We Teach It, But Do We Practice It? Challenging Our Own Ethics in Higher Education

Susan R. Madsen, Utah Valley University
James Davis, University of Notre Dame
Scott C. Hammond, Utah Valley University
Bonner Ritchie, Utah Valley University
INNOVATIVE SESSION PROPOSAL: Panel

We Teach It, But Do We Practice It?

Challenging Our Own Ethics in Higher Education

Presented at the Western Academy of Management (March 23, 2007)

Abstract

The purpose of this panel discussion is to provide business school faculty, administrators, and doctoral students a forum to discuss current issues and challenges related to the ethical decision-making and behavior of individuals and groups (i.e., faculty, administrators, and staff) within the higher educational arena. It will provide the attendees/participants the opportunity to challenge behaviors and practices commonly seen and held. There are a number of contexts that provide ethical/moral dilemmas in post-secondary settings. While several of these contexts have received significant attention from professional associations such as the Academy of Management, others have received little or no attention. The panel will consist of five experienced business educators who have been academic leaders on a variety of campuses. Although panelists will present their perspectives on particular topics of interest, the format will be informal and comfortable so a meaningful dialogue between and among panelists and attendees can ensue.
INNOVATIVE SESSION PROPOSAL: PANEL

We Teach It, But Do We Practice It? Challenging Our Own Ethics in Higher Education

I am thrilled to submit this innovative panel session proposal for your consideration this year at the Western Academy of Management (WAM) in March of 2007. I have spent the last month talking to a number of prominent faculty and leaders on the topic of ethics in higher education. It is clear that as an academy we often struggle with taking a close look at our own behaviors and practices. We often hesitate to reflect upon our own actions and behaviors with regard to a variety of ethical issues in higher education. In schools of business we teach ethics; yet, this session will challenge us to look deeper at our own actions, our own systems, and our own cultures with regard to ethics.

Dr. James Davis (from Notre Dame) and I facilitated a session at the Academy of Management in Atlanta (2006) titled “Faculty Ethics: Challenges, Issues, and Solutions.” Many participants expressed interest in having another forum to continue and expand the dialogue/discussion. Originally, Jim and I spoke of co-sponsoring a daylong symposium at Notre Dame in the spring. Instead we would like to propose a symposium format panel discussion at WAM. We believe that it will draw not only regular WAM members but also a group of colleagues, scholars, and administrators who may not typically attend. This session would provide a unique and engaging forum for interested individuals.

Purpose, Target Audience, and Format

The purpose of this panel discussion is to provide business school faculty, administrators, and doctoral students the forum to discuss current issues and challenges related to the ethical decision-making and behavior of individuals and groups (i.e., faculty, administrators, and staff)
within the higher educational arena. It will provide the attendees/participants the opportunity to challenge behaviors and practices commonly seen and held. This topic is one that finally needs to be discussed in the open and not only behind closed doors.

The target audience is any faculty member, administrator, doctoral student, or practitioner who is interested in improving the state of higher education today. Since the topic of ethics will be of interest to many participants, there will be interest in this session. We expect that others outside of the WAM may also be interested in attending for this session (see introduction).

We would like to propose a 2.5 to 3 hour session for this symposium. I do realize that the typical session is probably 1.5 hours. However, with the number, depth, and experience of the panelist who have agreed to participate—it is important that we have time to have an in-depth dialogue and discussion with the panelist as well as the participants. If needed, we can divide it into two concurrent sessions (A & B). It might also be a session you would consider having available for the larger WAM membership.

Proposed Session Content Areas

There are a number of contexts that provide ethical/moral dilemmas for university faculty and administration. While several of these contexts have received significant attention from professional associations such as the Academy of Management, others have received little or no attention. Contexts that must be considered include (but are not limited to) the following:

- **Authorship Issues**: Perhaps the context receiving the greatest attention is giving proper attribution and citation for the work of others. What standard is appropriate for the citation of the work of others? Not only are misrepresentation and plagiarism critical for professorial research, but for student course papers as well. What is
intellectual property in terms of scholarship? What should be done with our students? Justice vs. Mercy?

- **Faculty – Administration Disconnect**: Often faculty and administration have differing opinions about ethical standards and the consequences for honor code violation. Should there be a ‘global’ standard? What should faculty do when administrators do not follow through? What should administrators do when faculty do not follow through?

- **Faculty Consulting**: Teaching for other schools? Many faculty do not see a conflict of interest in teaching for another school while under contract with their University. Other faculty see no conflict of interest when providing for-profit consultation while under contract with a university. Is this an ethical issue that should be considered?

- **Faculty Politics and the Tenure Process**: Political fighting within departments and colleges often hurt individual faculty in promotion and tenure review and decisions. The politics within colleges often remove objectivity of the review and introduces subjective judgements that damage professional reputations and progress of individual faculty members. Do departmental, college and university politics constitute ethical issues when it affects promotion and tenure? Are there ethical issues related to politics and tenure regarding approval and work with students doing disserations?

- **Journal and Meeting Review Process**: The timing of the review process can negatively affect faculty careers. Are reviewers and journals that take extraordinarily long review violating ethical standards? Likewise, are reviewers who fail to give their best effort in the review process violating ethical standards?
• **Student Evaluation and Grading**: How much subjectivity should be used grading and evaluating student projects and course activity? Can there be a college, university or academic standard that is accepted by everyone?

• **Culture**: What are the cultural dimensions of ethical behavior? Whose standard is appropriate? Is there a different, ‘acceptable’ standard for intellectual property for different regions around the world?

• **Selection of Service Assignments**: Many faculty now incorporate service or experiential learning exercises in their courses. Judgements must be made by the faculty member about which projects to accept or reject. Are there ethical dimensions about the selection process that need to be considered?

• **Teaching Effort**: The reward/promotion standards at most colleges and universities typically focus upon research productivity. Promotion and tenure is grounded upon publications and sets a much lower standard for classroom performance. What are the ethical/moral issues surrounding faculty teaching effort?

• **Resource Allocation**: Are there ethics issues surrounding the allocation of resources on campuses and systems of higher educational systems? Are there ethical issues in higher education around the state polical systems and lobbying for allocations?

• **Assumptions of Entitlement and Privilege**: Faculty and administrators sometimes feel entitled and privileged in various areas, including in their own classrooms. Do these assumptions have ethical implications?

• **The Ethic of Caring**: Some work is now being published on the ethic of caring versus just the ethic of justice and fairness. Some argue that if the ethic of justice and
fairness is not combined with an ethic of caring (particularly in the higher educational environment) that we need to rethink ethics in general. These and a host of other situations create moral dilemmas for university faculty. We contend that ethical analyses and policies must move beyond issues surrounding publication. Failure to consider the breadth and complexity of the ethical contexts within which faculty and administrators operate may perpetuate and exacerbate the problems we need to address and solve.

Proposed Facilitator and Panelist Members

I plan to serve as a facilitator for this session. I (Susan R. Madsen) am an Associate Professor of Management at Utah Valley State College. I presented/facilitated successful sessions at the Academy of Management in Atlanta (2006) on 1) “Leadership in Higher Education” and 2) “Faculty Ethics: Challenges, Issues, and Solutions.” The prior year, Scott Hammond and I facilitated a session in Hawaii on “Strategic Faculty Development.” All of these issues and perspectives are important to this emerging conversation regarding our own ethics in higher education. I have also published and presented on other higher education issues (e.g., strategic faculty development, leadership development). In addition, while recently interviewing 10 women university presidents across the country, I collected (and have now analyzed) some data on their perceptions of ethics among faculty and administrators in educational institutions.

The following individuals have agreed to attend the WAM conference in Missoula and participate in this session if this session is accepted:

1. Dr. James H. Davis is an Associate Professor of Management and the Director of the Gigot Center for Entrepreneurial Studies at the University of Notre Dame. Professor Davis has been with Notre Dame since 1991. He received his Ph.D. in corporate strategy from the
University of Iowa, M.B.A. from Idaho State University, and M.Ed. and B.A. from Brigham Young University. Since 1998 he has been the director of the Gigot Center for Entrepreneurial Studies. He teaches courses in strategic planning, change management, entrepreneurship and international management. He received the Notre Dame College of Business M.B.A. Outstanding Professor of the year award in 1996, 1998, and 1999. He was awarded Outstanding Professor by Purdue University’s German International School of Management Administration in 2001. He was named the 2002 Inspiration Teacher of the Year for Notre Dame’s executive programs. He received a Kaneb award for outstanding undergraduate teaching in 2003. His research on trust was awarded “the most influential management research 1995-2000” by the Academy of Management.

Professor Davis has designed and taught executive development workshops to a wide range of corporations and trade associations throughout the world. Professor Davis is the Chairman of the Corporate Strategy and Governance Division of the Strategic Management Society. In that capacity he designs and facilitates international conferences and research groups for practicing managers and academics. Dr. Davis is a director on the boards of the Indiana Venture Center, Michiana Venture Network, the Small Business Development Center’s Collegiate Council, the South Bend Resources and Technology Corporation and the South Bend Emerging Business Forum. His research interests and publications are in the areas of corporate governance, strategic decision-making, and trust and strategic alliances. He has articles that have appeared in many publications including the Strategic Management Journal, the Academy of Management Review, Journal of Applied Psychology, and International Journal of Value-Based Management. He serves on the editorial board for the Academy of Management Review, Journal of Venture Capital, and Business Horizons.
2. **Rev. Oliver F. Williams**, C.S.C., Ph.D., is currently the Director for the Center of Ethics and Religious Values at the University of Notre Dame and an Associate Professor of Management in the Mendoza College of Business. He received his PhD from Vanderbilt University, and his expertise is in pastoral theology, Catholic social thought, business ethics, and business, government and society. His current research focuses on restoring public trust in business. Dr. Williams was selected to be one of the three founding Directors of the Foundation for the United Nations Global Compact (with Sir Mark Moody-Stuart, CEO of Anglo American and James Kearney, Partner, Latham and Watkins). He was elected to the Board of Directors of King's College, Pennsylvania, May 2004. He has (and continues to do so) served as an advisor on ethical issues to various cabinet-level officials in the government of South Africa. He is also a member of the Board of Trustees, St. Augustine's, The Catholic University of Southern Africa. Very positive reviews of his book *Economic Imperatives and Ethical Values* have appeared in *The Christian Century*, *Global Focus*, *Ethics and International Affairs*, *Business and Society*, *Business Ethics Quarterly*, *Business and Society Review*, and the *Journal of Macromarketing*. He is widely published in scholarly journals on the topic of ethics, including in Academy of Management journals and the *Journal of Business Ethics* and *Business and Society Review*. Reverend Williams also served for eight years as an Associate Provost at Notre Dame. He brings a wonderful background in ethics as well as practical leadership experience in higher education.

3. **Dr. Reba Keele** has a width and depth of experience in all segments of higher education that allows her to use her discipline of organizational behavior to look at the industry as a true system. Her current focus is the difference between espoused ethics of organizations contrasted to their values in action. At Brigham Young University she taught educational values, ethics, classes in change management, power and empowerment, and personal career
management. She served as the director of the honors program, and received the Karl Maeser Award, given to those faculty who are considered the very best teachers in the University. She developed an academic first year experience that required true multi-disciplinarity and true team teaching. This program received national recognition. She also developed orientations for international graduate students. From 1981-1987 she served as a regent for the Utah System of Higher Education, the governing board for all public post-secondary education. This included 9 colleges ranging from community colleges all the way to two Research I universities. In addition, Applied Technology Centers began during those years. For her entire term she was a member of the executive committee and chair of the curriculum and roles committee. Nine new presidents were selected in those years.

Reba was a Kellogg Leadership Fellow, a visiting professor in women's health at Duke University, and a visiting professor at Purdue University, where she studied systems theory through the lens of family therapy. She serves and has served on many non-profit boards, and is recognized as a skilled facilitator of groups needing to find common ground. In 1991 she went to the University of Utah to become the founding dean of undergraduate education. There she developed another award winning academic first year program called LEAP, supervised the Honors program and continued to encourage competency assessment across campus. She was instrumental in creating the designation of a rigorous Service Learning Scholar for graduation and transcripts. She was instrumental in finally getting a policy through the faculty senate to cover issues of faculty-student relationships. In 1997 she stepped down into the David Eccles School of Business where she created an orientation program for transfer students which greatly improved retention. She received the Marvin J. Ashton Award, for being the best teacher in the School that year. The Utah Academy of Arts and Sciences gave her the Willard J. Gardner award.
for a lifetime of contributions to the understanding and teaching of organizational behavior. She has been a senior faculty member for leadership and management in the HERS program (held at Wellesley and Bryn Mawr) since 1989 and has built on the learning from the participants there to create unique integrative materials.

4. **Dr. Scott C. Hammond** is an associate professor of business management at Utah Valley State College and currently the assistant academic vice president in the Office of Academic Affairs. A nationally known consultant and speaker, Scott has published over 30 academic articles with current research in dialogue, management education, and faculty development. In the summer of 2006 Scott created two video case studies at Johnson & Johnson for McGraw Hill distributed to business schools internationally. He has facilitated over 50 strategic planning processes, with clients including the National Park Service, The Idaho National Engineering Laboratory, The Visiting Nurses Association of America, Johnson & Johnson, Monsanto and others. In the 1980s he worked as a reporter/producer for two Salt Lake Television stations. Some reports aired on Nightline, World News Tonight, and Good Morning America. He is currently host and producer of the Utah Business Boardroom (KUEN-PBS), a Telly Award winning program about Utah Business Entrepreneurs.

Recently Scott consulted for the Department of Electrical Engineering at BYU and the College of Professional Studies, University of San Francisco. Scott has been the lead consultant on best practices in adult learning to Johnson & Johnson Corporation eUniversity (J&J has an annual training budget of 250 million USD). He worked for four years as a development consultant for the Los Alamos National Laboratory, creating training for scientists on career development and diversity. At UVSC he worked with colleagues to create a faculty development program for the School of Business which has been the subject of three presentations at Western...
Academy of Management, The Academy of Management, with forthcoming publication in several academic journals. Recently Scott has published several articles in local newspapers on the value of education with links below:

http://deseretnews.com/dn/print/1,1442,640198451,00.html
http://deseretnews.com/dn/print/1,1442,645194012,00.html
http://www.heraldextra.com/content/view/189692/

5. Dr. Bonner Ritchie is Professor Emeritus of International Organizational Behavior at the Marriott School of Management at Brigham Young University. After completing his B.S. and Ph.D. at the University of California, Berkeley, Bonner was on the faculty of the University of Michigan from 1967-1973. From 1973 until his retirement in 2000, he served on the faculty of the Marriott School at Brigham Young University. He also had visiting professor appointments at Stanford University, the University of California, Berkeley, the University of Southern Europe, BirZeit University (Palestine), the University of Jordan, and the Jordan Institute of Diplomacy. He was a visiting scholar at the Brigham Young University Jerusalem Center for Near Eastern Studies. During 2001-2002 he served as the Interim Dean of the Business School at Utah Valley State College. Bonner’s teaching, research, and consulting activities have been in the areas of leadership ethics and development, organizational change, conflict resolution, organizational philosophy. University programs include the University of Michigan, Stanford University, the University of Texas, the University of Oklahoma, McGill University, the University of California, Berkeley, the University of California, Irvine, and BYU. Corporate programs include General Motors., Ford, General Foods, General Electric, Shell Oil, Exxon, Hewlett-Packard, Pacific Telesis, SBC Communications, Citigroup, the Royal Bank of Canada, and the Arab Banking Corporation. Public and non-governmental organizations he has worked
with include the Navajo Tribe, Save the Children, the Southern Federation of Cooperatives, the Bangkok Metropolitan Authority, the Jordanian government, the Egyptian Society of Human Resource Development, the Canadian Hospital Association, the Palestinian Authority and the Jordan-U.S. Business Partnership. Bonner is co-author of the text, *Organizations and People*, many book chapters and over 50 professional articles. His recent efforts have focused on conflict resolution, leadership and change in the Arab world. Bonner has been involved in the area of ethics throughout his career.

**Conclusion**

We would like to use this session to bring together management and business faculty and leaders interested and passionate about discussing and enhancing ethics in higher education. There is substantial value to offering this session. We are teaching ethics, but do we practice it! As we all know, there are unethical behaviors and decisions make each day within the walls of fine institutions. Instead of talking softly behind closed doors about these issues—it is time to bring them to the surface. We must be examples of ethics if we are to be effective in teaching ethics. An example is a much more powerful teaching tool than any lecture that can be given. This forum can make a difference in the academy.

**Facilitator Contact Information**

Dr. Susan R. Madsen
Utah Valley State College
800 West University Parkway, Mailcode 119
Orem, UT 84058-5999
madsensu@uvsc.edu
Phone: (801) 863-6176
Proposed Reading List
