Extract from Sanford Levinson, Framed: America’s Fifty-One Constitutions and the Crisis of Governance (Oxford University Press 2012), citing Prakash-Tillman exchange

Seth Barrett Tillman

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/seth_barrett_tillman/272/
Framed

AMERICA'S
FIFTY-ONE CONSTITUTIONS
AND THE
CRISIS OF GOVERNANCE

SANFORD LEVINSON

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS
There is also the practical point, emphasized by the Amars, that a speaker would have to resign from the House if he or she became president even for a day (while, say, the president underwent surgery). That surely makes little sense, but it is required by another arcane but important part of the Constitution of Settlement, the Incompatibility Clause that prevents members of Congress from service as officers of the United States. However, Seth B. Tillman has argued, counterintuitively, that the president and vice president are not such officers, precisely because “officers” are those who owe their office to presidential appointment. Presidents and vice presidents are elected, not self-appointed, at least save for a future Gerald Ford who is, like an ordinary "officer," nominated by a sitting president to fill a vice-presidential vacancy.

These discussions, as with those surrounding the Twenty-fifth Amendment, might sound “academic” in the pejorative sense, but they point to possibilities that could certainly roll our politics should they occur. Tillman, for example, has suggested that placing succession only in cabinet officials would leave the United States vulnerable if something happened to both the president and vice president prior to the confirmation of a newly elected president’s cabinet. This is, to be sure, an extraordinarily unlikely possibility, but anyone who has lived through the last decade, with such events as September 11, Hurricane Katrina, major earthquakes, and two devastating tsunamis should be aware that low probability is not impossibility. One might well believe that a function of a well-designed Constitution is to provide firewalls against even very low-probability events. We shall have further opportunity to discuss problems posed by “continuity in government” in the final chapter on emergency powers.

One should mention a final conundrum with regard to the peculiar office of the vice presidency as constructed by the U.S. Constitution: in which branch is the vice president actually located? Vice President Cheney raised this mind-bending question during his own term of office, when he argued that he was either a member of both branches or, in some sense, of neither. After all, the one and only duty assigned to the vice president by the Constitution is to preside over the Senate (with a vote in case of a tie), which would suggest that the correct answer to the conundrum is "the legislature." On the other hand, the vice president is selected by the very same electors charged with choosing the president. And, especially in recent
NOTES

11. Section 4: “Whenever the Vice President and a majority of either the principal officers of the executive departments or of such other body as Congress may by law provide, transmit to the President pro tempore of the Senate and the Speaker of the House of Representatives their written declaration that the President is unable to discharge the powers and duties of his office, the Vice President shall immediately assume the powers and duties of the office as Acting President.”
12. Thereafter, when the President transmits to the President pro tempore of the Senate and the Speaker of the House of Representatives his written declaration that no inability exists, he shall resume the powers and duties of his office unless the Vice President and a majority of either the principal officers of the executive department or of such other body as Congress may by law provide, transmit within four days to the President pro tempore of the Senate and the Speaker of the House of Representatives their written declaration that the President is unable to discharge the powers and duties of his office. Thereupon Congress shall decide the issue, assembling within forty-eight hours for that purpose if not in session.
13. If the Congress, within twenty-one days after receipt of the latter written declaration, or, if Congress is not in session, within twenty-one days after Congress is required to assemble, determines by a two-thirds vote of both Houses that the President is unable to discharge the powers and duties of his office, the Vice President shall continue to discharge the same as Acting President; otherwise, the President shall resume the powers and duties of his office."
17. Ibid., 459.
18. Ibid., 462.
19. Ibid., 466.
21. Again, see Kalt, Constitutional Cliffhangers.
INDEX

Story, Joseph, 38, 253
Straus, David, 338–339, 341–342
Succession in Office Act, 226, 236
Sullivan, Kathleen, 14
Sundquist, James, 236, 237
Sunstein, Cass, 326
Supreme Court of the United States, 37, 165, 203, 248
access, 283
appointment to, 252–253
judicial review, power of, 266, 267–285
judicial review contrasted with judicial supremacy, 270–275, 364
length of term, 257–259
opinions of, 259–260
political identity of judges on, 260–261, 268
size of, 249–252
Sukank, Ron, 374
Sutherland, George, 365
Sepien, George, 110
Tanner, Roger Brooke, 203, 208, 369
Tea Party, 2, 15, 45, 337–338
term limits for legislators
(see "duration in office")
Thatcher, Margaret, 176, 209
Thomas, Clarence, 233
ticket-splitting, 237–239
Tiebout, Charles, 304–305
Tillman, Seth Barrent, 227
Tocqueville, Alexis de, 125
Tower, John, 204
Tracy, Utah, 224
triennalism, 164
Truman, Harry, 169, 200, 222, 223
Tribdes, George, 134, 135
Tyler, John, 204, 222, 223
unanimity requirements for decisionmaking, 352–353

unpolarization, 385–391
of California 5
of United States 5, 10–11
unincamerlism, 100, 140, 144
unitary executive, 239–244
United Nations Convention Against Torture, 378

Van Buren, Martin, 225
Venezuela, Juan, 140
veto powers of presidents and governors, 164–174, 177
vice presidency, need for, 222–223
Virginia Resolves of 1798 and Report of 1799, 307, 322
Voting, qualifications for, 101–102, 192

Wallace, George C., 9
Webb, Max, 324
Weinberger, Caspar, 199
Whiskey Rebellion, pardon of participants in, 198
White, Byron, 259
White, James Boyd, 364
White, Samuel, 224
Whitmore, Sheldon, 138
Wilde, Oscar, 390
Wilson, James, 58, 167
Wilson, Woodrow, 82, 190, 199, 200, 219, 375
Wood, Gordon, 70, 81, 121, 392

Yom Kippur, fixed date of, 20
Young, Ernest, 417 n. 13
Zaitoun, Fares, 11–12