We Are The Evidence: Critical Reflection as Personal Evidence

Rick A Stoddart
We Are The Evidence

Critical Reflection as Personal Evidence
So...

**What do you want to do with your LIfe?**

(Perhaps the hardest systematic Literature Review ever)
What do you want to do in your Library?
Librarians are the personification of librarianship

As such, evidence of effective library practice is embodied in librarians, in the lives they lead, and in the actions they take.

This paper/presentation will explore how critical reflection informs meaningful and purposeful library practice through creating new forms of personal evidence.

This personal evidence can then be incorporated into evidence-based decisions and individual library practices...
Part 1: Background For Presentation
Part 2: Evidence-Based Practice as Reflection
Part 3: Reflection as Evidence-Based Practice
Part 4: reflection and Library Practice
Part 1: Background for Presentation
(or... putting the "I" in This Presentation)
Dr. Rick Stoddart
Research can (and should) change lives. If the sole outcome of your research is a peer-reviewed paper... you are doing it wrong.
Vocabulary

- Reflection
- Critical Reflection
- Autoethnography
- Currere
"(Reflection is) the process of creating and clarifying the meaning of experience (present or past) in terms of self (self in relation to self and self in relation to the world). The outcome of the process is changed conceptual perspective."

Critical reflection (sometimes called Analytical reflection)

“(Analytical Reflection) ... a systematic approach to revisiting experiences or situations, questioning motivations, attempting to pinpoint the reason why they experienced a situation in a particular way, and contemplating how this might impact on future practice.”

Writing as inquiry
Auto-ethnography

“(autoethnography) should be ethnographic in its methodological orientation, cultural in its interpretive orientation, and autobiographical in its content”

Chang 2008


From: https://flic.kr/p/FEA1h

Autoethnography

A genre of "memoir" that follows ideas of "objectivity."
It is regressive -- progressive analytical -- synthetical. It is therefore temporal and conceptual in nature, and it aims for one cultivation of a developmental point of view that is-trans-temporal-and trans-conceptual. From another perspective, the method is the self-conscious conceptualization of the temporal, and from another, it is the viewing of what is conceptualized through time. So it is that we hope to explore the complex relation between the temporal and the conceptual. In doing so we disclose their relation to the self in its evolution and education.

Pinar (1975)


1. REGRESSIVE
   Analysis of one’s intellectual biography

2. PROGRESSIVE
   Description of one’s imagined future

3. ANALYTICAL
   Psychoanalysis of one’s phenomenologically described educational present, past, and future

4. SYNTHESIS
Part 2
Evidence-Based Practice as Reflection (or Highlighting the “I” in EBLIP)
“Throughout these stages there is not only room for humanities research, there is a distinct need for a humanities approach to be incorporated. In the beginning stage of Articulate, one asks, “what do I already know” and places the question or problem in a wider context. While there may be a very specific question to be answered at this point in time, it is valuable to explore the wider issues and understand the many other questions that arise in conjunction with the problem to be addressed. It is here where we may incorporate professional knowledge and the wider concerns and principles of the profession into our thinking about the problem.”

Heidi Jacobs, & Denise Koufogiannakis. (2014). Counting what Cannot be Counted: Bringing the Humanities to EBLIP. Evidence Based Library and Information Practice, 9(3), 110-120.
“Question generation also enables a period of reflection. Is this the information I am really looking for? Why I am looking for this information? Is there another option to pursue first?”

Davies 2011

“The key issue is that using evidence and reflecting on it are both needed to move both decisions and practice forward. The context of each situation will determine what evidence is used, and each practitioner needs to determine what form of reflection is best for them and find an approach that fits into their practice.”

(pg. 72-73)
Evidence-Based Practice

Articulate

Adapt

Assemble

Agree

Assess

What do I already know?

What local evidence is available?

What does the literature say?

What other information do I need to gather?

What did I learn?

How does the information I have apply to my context?

MAKE A DECISION

Evidence-Based Practitioner Questions
(Koufogiannakis/Brettle 2016)

Evidence-Based Cycle (Booth 2009)
Evidence-Based Practice

MAKE A DECISION

What do I already know?

Articulate

What local evidence is available?

Descriptive
Quantitative
(Frequency / Average)

Assemble

What does the literature say?

Meta-Analysis / Systematic Review

Assess

What other information do I need to gather?

Correlational / Regression Analysis
Quasi-experimental
Experimental

Adapt

What did I learn?

Agree

How does the information I have apply to my context?

Evidence-Based Practitioner Questions
(Koufogiannakis/Brettle 2016)

Research Methods
Part 3: Reflection as Evidence-Based Practice (or putting the “I” in Evidence)
Types of Evidence in Reflection

“... aesthetic, moral, and personal, as well as empirical knowledge.”

Chang (2013) notes that the researcher’s personal experiences are the primary source of data in autoethnography. Researchers “draw from autobiographic data such as memories, memorabilia, documents about themselves, official records, photos, interviews with others, and ongoing self-reflective and self observational memos”

Type of Evidence in Autoethnography

Three types of “data” typically used in autoethnography: field notes, personal documents, and interviews.

Anderson and Glass-Coffin (2013)

Types of Evidence in Currere

1. REGRESSIVE
   Analysis of one’s intellectual biography

2. PROGRESSIVE
   Description of one’s imagined future

3. ANALYTICAL
   Psychoanalysis of one’s phenomenologically described educational present, past, and future

4. SYNTHESIS
Part 4 Practice
(or Highlighting the “I” in Practice)
Donald Schön

“Reflection-in-action”

“Reflection-on-action”

Practical Level

University of Idaho

Start

April/May
Apply Assessment Measures

Summer
Data Analysis and Reflection

September 15th Report
• Post findings/actions for past year assessment

Reflect on previous report

October 1st Report
• Update learning outcomes, tools & benchmarks for next year assessment

Reflection-on-Action

August
• Faculty discussion and assessment report (findings and actions)

April/May
• Apply assessment measures

Reflection-in-Action

Summer
• Data analysis and reflection
Motivations & Biases

- Innovation
- Empower
- Equity
- Curiosity
- My boss made me...
- Access
- Diversity
- Authenticity
- Social Justice
- Quality Improvement
USE Critical reflection to focus not just on the WHAT/HOW but also the WHY
My mission
Social Justice

"justice in terms of the
distribution of wealth, opportunities,
and privileges within a society"

How do I do this?

How do all make sense of this?
Re-search, Re-write, Re-read, Re-view, Re-reflect
So... What do you want to do with your life? (Currere)

I think now if I had known libraries were in my future, I might have gone to library school... and everything would now be different. But I didn't and it isn't. But, here's the thing... working in libraries and being a librarian is exactly what I want to do. I love my job and I love being a librarian. I can't imagine what it would be like to not be a librarian. Instead of counting the days to retirement, I realized that I should be enjoying every day, doing what I love to do. If that is wakefulness, then I think I found it. I hope I have learned to be more in the moment and take everything from that moment. It was something of an epiphany and truly turned my attitude about work around. (Evelyn)
Evidence based practice is not only acting when there is good evidence. Enhancing our professional judgements via a career built on analytical reflection, will provide knowledge that goes a long way towards making difficult decisions a little bit easier.

-Koufogiannakis 2010
Research is Critical Reflection

Critical Reflection is Research

Evidence-Based Practice

- Articulate
- Adapt
- Assemble
- Agree
- Assess


Jacobs, H. & Koufogiannakis D. (2014). Counting what Cannot be Counted: Bringing the Humanities to EBLIP. *Evidence Based Library and Information Practice, 9*(3), 110-120.


Conversation...