

Andrews University

From the Selected Works of Jerry A. Moon

Fall 1997

Book Review of The Essential Carlstadt: Fifteen tracts, by Andreas Bodenstein

Jerry A. Moon, *Andrews University*



Available at: https://works.bepress.com/jerry_moon/8/

Philistines (191-193), and Arameans (194-201). The Ammonites, Moabites, and Edomites combined are treated in four and a half pages (202-206).

For the settlement of Israel, Fritz describes in Chapter 9 three current models, those of conquest (Albright), peaceful infiltration (Alt), and peasants' revolt (Mendenhall), stating that "none of these 'models' covers all the details afforded by the literature and archaeology" and calling for "some modification of the models so far employed" (137-138). But he does not refer to the current Israeli school that has revived the models of Alt and Noth. Finkelstein's standard work, *The Archaeology of the Israelite Settlement* (Jerusalem: Israel Exploration Society, 1988) is not mentioned in the footnotes. The volume might have benefited from reference to numerous monographs by textual scholars, including those of G. Ahlström, *Who Were the Israelites?* (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1986); N. P. Lemche, *Early Israel* (Leiden: Brill, 1985); *Ancient Israel: A New History of Israelite Society* (Sheffield: JSOT, 1988); Coote and Whitelam, *The Emergence of Early Israel in Historical Perspective* (Sheffield: Almond, 1987); R. B. Coote, *Early Israel: A New Horizon* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990); R. Neu, *Von der Anarchie zum Staat* (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchner Verlag, 1992). These references are essential in directing the reader to current literature if not in providing an up-to-date synthesis of the problem of Israelite emergence.

Further bibliographical references in other chapters might have included important monographs such as P.R.S. Moorey's *A Century of Biblical Archaeology* (Philadelphia: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1990); P. de Miroschedji's edited volume on the Early Bronze Age, *L'Urbanisation de la Palestine à l'age du Bronze Ancien* (Oxford: British Archaeological Reports, 1989), and Palumbo's recently published dissertation, *The Early Bronze Age IV in the Southern Levant*, *Contributi e Materiali de Archeologia Orientale III* (Rome: Universita degli Studi de Roma "La Sapienza," 1990). These works represent the current state of the art for both periods. Moreover, Hübner's 1992 work in German on the Ammonites should have been included in Chapter 10.

The bibliographies for individual chapters are conveniently divided topically for further reference. This allows the reader to study particular aspects of interest. The book also provides 42 figures and 26 photographs illustrating pottery, other finds, sites, and construction techniques of various architectural elements in exceptional quality. A subject and place index would make the volume more accessible. Despite this and other caveats mentioned above, this volume provides a refreshingly concise and readable introduction that encourages reference to more extensive works listed in its bibliographies and supplemented here.

30574 Cantabarry Dr. #19/201
Roseville, MI 48066

MICHAEL G. HASEL

Furcha, E. J., trans. and ed. *The Essential Carlstadt: Fifteen Tracts by Andreas Bodenstein (Carlstadt) from Karlstadt*. Classics of the Radical Reformation, no. 8. Waterloo, Ontario: Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1995. 449 pp. Cloth, \$49.95 U.S.; \$71.25 Can.

Andreas Bodenstein von Carlstadt (1486-1541), a Wittenberg colleague of Luther's, left Saxony, endured several years of fugitive wanderings, found

employment in Zwinglian Zurich, and closed his career as a Professor of Old Testament at the University of Basel, 1534-1541. His writings influenced the early Anabaptist movement. Some 87 of Carlstadt's publications are known (399, n. 8), but except for those included in Ronald Sider's *Karlstadt's Battle with Luther*, only scattered excerpts have been previously translated into English. This volume is the first to present in English a representative "cross-section" of Carlstadt's writings (20). Following conventional English usage and Carlstadt's own preference, *The Essential Carlstadt* spells its author's name with a "C," but refers to the town of his birth with a "K" (406, n. 4).

E. J. Furcha, professor of church history at McGill University, has translated and/or edited several volumes on sixteenth-century radical reformers including Schwenckfeld, Zwingli, Hans Denck, and Sebastian Franck. His introduction offers a brief biographical sketch, a historiographic summary of Carlstadt scholarship, and an assessment of Carlstadt's significance (17-24).

The fifteen publications may be grouped in six categories: autobiographical tracts, eucharistic tracts, Lutheran reform polemics, radical reform polemics, spirituality, and Reformed orthodoxy. Under the rubric "autobiographical," the book includes four documents. No. 1, *Tract on the Supreme Virtue of Gelassenheit* (1520), declares Carlstadt's allegiance to the new evangelical ideas and his rejection of the medieval church. While this tract contains some theological analysis of *Gelassenheit* ("yieldedness"), a term that was to become a salient motif of Anabaptist theology, it does not do so in as much depth as does No. 6, *The Meaning of the Term "Gelassen."* More striking than Carlstadt's theology in document No. 1, is his evident nervousness, even fear and trembling, for the potential consequences of the stand he is taking. He clearly recognizes the likelihood of martyrdom (31-32), and "beg[s]" his family and friends not to "hurt and afflict" themselves because of the "temporary shame, the tribulations and anxiety that surround me on all sides" (31). No. 5, *Circular Letter by Dr. Andreas Bodenstein from Karlstadt Regarding His Household*, opens with a letter announcing Carlstadt's engagement to marry Anna Mochau on January 20, 1522 (130). Appended to the letter is the minutes of a meeting of the "vicars, doctors, and priors" of the Augustinian cloister in Wittenberg, who have decided to release from monastic vows any of the brothers wishing to leave the cloister and "live . . . according to evangelical teaching" (131). No. 7, *Reasons Why Andreas Carlstadt Remains Silent for a Time and on the True, Unfailing Calling*, belongs to the Orlamunde pastorate. Carlstadt implies that fulfilling his pastoral calling is a higher priority than seeking a wider audience through publishing. In No. 14, *Apology . . . Regarding the False Charge of Insurrection*, the fourth tract of autobiographical significance, Carlstadt seeks to exonerate himself from charges that he sided with the peasants in the revolt of 1524-25. This piece is notable for several personal anecdotes about road encounters with armed and hostile serfs during the Peasants War. Also unique about this tract is the inclusion of a Preface by Luther attesting his belief in Carlstadt's sincerity and probable innocence regarding the charge of collusion with the peasants.

A second category includes three of Carlstadt's eucharistic tracts: No. 2, *Regarding the Worship and Homage of the Signs of the New Testament*; parts of No. 13, *Several Main Points of Christian Teaching . . .*; and No. 11, *Dialogue . . . on the*

Infamous and Idolatrous Abuse of the Most Blessed Sacrament of Jesus Christ. The *Dialogue* is cast as a dramatic conversation between Gemser, a Roman Catholic priest; Victus, a biblicist evangelical; and Peter, a peasant. The repartee is clever, often biting, and serves as the didactic vehicle for an incisive exposé of the prevailing theological fault lines. Furcha deliberately limited the sample of eucharistic and sacramental tracts in this volume because he and Calvin A. Pater are preparing a second volume devoted entirely to Carlstadt's eucharistic writings.

A third category of writings might be termed Lutheran reform polemics. Document No. 3, *Regarding Vows* (48 pp., the longest in Furcha's compilation), shows from Old Testament passages that monastic vows are unbiblical and contrary to God's will, hence invalid and not binding. No. 4, *On the Removal of Images and That There Should Be No Beggars Among Christians*, marshals biblical support for two actions of the Wittenberg city council. The second part is a call for social justice. Carlstadt argues from Deut. 15:4, 9 that a truly Christian society will prevent begging by supporting the truly destitute, requiring work from those "strong and capable of working," and by providing job training and financial assistance to help workers get started in a trade. No. 5, already mentioned, also fits this category of reform polemics from Carlstadt's Wittenberg period.

In contrast with the Lutheran reform polemics stand three other booklets that may be termed radical reform polemics, documenting Carlstadt's estrangement from Luther. No. 10, *Whether We Should Go Slowly and Avoid Offending the Weak in Matters Pertaining to God's Will*, takes up one of the most vexing of Carlstadt's differences with Luther, the question of retarding the pace of reform in order not to alienate those with "weak consciences," particularly the conservative princes. Carlstadt urges that "God's will has been revealed to us by sheer grace and in order that we might become wise, knowledgeable, and discerning—mark this well, through yieldedness [Gelassenheit]" (256). In other words, the benefits of God's word—wisdom, knowledge, and discernment—do not come to those who do not yield obedience to it. "The deed must always and immediately follow understanding" (255). No. 11, *Dialogue or Discussion Booklet on the Infamous and Idolatrous Abuse of the Most Blessed Sacrament of Jesus Christ*, has already been noted above. No. 13, *Several Main Points of Christian Teaching Regarding Which Dr. Luther Brings Andreas Carlstadt Under Suspicion Through False Accusation and Slander*, is Carlstadt's rebuttal to Luther's *Against the Heavenly Prophets* (1524). For 37 pages Carlstadt protests the unfairness of Luther's charges. Indeed, Luther does appear to have wrongly associated Carlstadt with Thomas Müntzer, an association Roland Bainton called "both unjust" of Luther and "unfortunate" for Carlstadt (*Here I Stand*, last pages of chapter 15).

A fifth category of Carlstadt's writings may be grouped under the heading of spirituality. These come from Carlstadt's pastoral tenure at Orlamunde (1523-1524). Document No. 6, *On the Meaning of the term "Gelassen,"* already cited, exerted a lasting influence on the Anabaptist Movement. No. 9, *Regarding the Two Greatest Commandments: The Love of God and of Neighbor, Matthew 22*, is "one of Carlstadt's most impressive expressions of true spirituality" (Furcha, 229). No. 8, *The Manifest, Singular Will of God, The Nature of Sin* (43 pp., the second longest in this collection), offers a perceptive, multiplex exposition of God's eternal will and his permissive will, over against the human will—a conflict that is resolved

only through yieldedness.

No. 12, *Regarding the Sabbath and Statutory Holy Days* (317-338), was very popular, being issued in four original editions (from Jena, Augsburg, Strasbourg, and Constance) as well as at least three known reprint editions. Of the booklet's 13 sections, seven address the basic theology and spirituality of the Sabbath rest, five describe aspects of how the Sabbath should be celebrated or may be desecrated (318), one considers "Which Day of the Week Must be Celebrated" (333-334), and one is a polemic against "Designated Feast Days for Saints and Angels," (336-337).

No. 15, *On the Incarnation of Christ* is Carlstadt's farewell sermon to his Zurich congregation in 1534, on accepting the professorship at Basel. It contains traces of the warm, emphatic spirituality seen in the earlier works, but is more notable for its "orthodox Christology" (387).

In general, *The Essential Carlstadt* shows the solid editorial workmanship typical of the Classics of the Radical Reformation series. Each selection is preceded by a brief introduction. Page references to the original are inserted in brackets, and critical comments on the text, translation details, secondary sources, and historical context are incorporated in endnotes.

One inconsequential mistake occurs in the Introduction (24). The observation is made that apart from document 12 and parts of 14, this work has omitted Carlstadt's writings on the sacraments. That should read document 11 and parts of 13, and seems to overlook document 2, which deals extensively with the Lord's Supper as a sacrament (40-50). Also, the bibliography includes some significant secondary sources, but omits Freys/Barge, a frequently cited source in the editorial introductions and endnotes.

A "Scriptural Index" (some 1500 entries), a "Name and Place Index," a "Subject Index," and a foldout map of "Electoral Saxony during Carlstadt's Time," complete this well-designed volume, which offers a significant contribution to Carlstadt studies in English.

Andrews University

JERRY MOON

Gerrish, B. A. *Continuing the Reformation: Essays on Modern Religious Thought*. Chicago and London: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1993. xv + 283 pp. Cloth, \$54.00.

Continuing the Reformation is a refreshing addition to the respectable list of books and articles Gerrish has produced on similar themes over the past several decades. Like one of his previous volumes, *The Old Protestantism and the New: Essays on the Reformation Heritage* (Univ. of Chicago Press, 1982), the present title brings together various materials provided earlier in lecture form. In fact, this new book may, in Gerrish's own words, "well be described as a sequel" to that earlier publication (ix). However, the present volume displays an improvement in cohesiveness, thanks to the author's painstaking editorial efforts to bring the chapters together into a better-integrated and logically sequenced pattern.

The central pivot for the discussion is what Luther, Melancthon, and other major sixteenth-century Protestant Reformers considered as the paramount religious concern: righteousness by faith. How this central theme became modified through the subsequent centuries by varying religio-philosophical viewpoints on