Summer 2011

Critical Decisions in Research: design, practice, and analysis

Imran Anjum Chaudary

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/imran_chaudary/9/
Critical Decisions in the Research Design and Practice

Imran Anjum Chaudary
Initial challenges for a researcher

--- Finding an Issue ---

- Is worth researching
- Lends itself to being researched
- Is sufficiently challenging
- Can be completed within the appropriate time
- Is not subjected to any serious constraints
- Is doable
Critical Decisions in the Research Design and Practice
The review of the literature to refine and ground the study

• The context

• Questions never asked:
  - What are Pakistani teachers’ challenges and their learning needs as teachers of adults?
  - What perspectives do they offer about the current professional development opportunities?
  - What problems do they face in accessing professional development?
  - What are the characteristics of professional development that can suit their learning needs?
Critical Decisions in the Research Design and Practice
Preliminary Research

My Issue

• Framing my research question
  - Teachers of adults in Pakistan
  - Professional development and design
  - Pedagogic knowledge, skills and disposition

Designing for better pedagogy: a case study of professional development of teachers of adults in Pakistan.

+ HOW and WHAT
of adults in Pakistan currently experienced, and what changes, if any, should be made?
In search of method and design

1. ONTOLOGY
2. EPISTEMOLOGY
3. METHODOLOGY
4. METHODS

- My research paradigm: Qualitative
- My research approach: Case study
- My methods: Semi-structured interviews
- Purpose: Explorative

QUALITATIVE, ETHNOGRAPHIC, CASE STUDY
My study sites and participants

Overseas research

- **Country:** Pakistan
- **Region:** mainly Punjab
- **Cities:** Lahore, Gujranwala and Islamabad
- **Participants:** College and Uni
Teachers

• Triangulation
Research Ethics

- My relation with participants
- Voluntary participation
- Confidentiality
- Anonymity
- Human interaction
- Disengagement from the field
- PLS and consent form
### On The Ground Fieldwork

Snow-ball technique; Informed consent form; Event schedule & venue; contingencies; Log of data-gathering event; Transcription; Member checking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Archival Deidentification</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Interviewer</th>
<th>Transcriber</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LII M Ali, Sairan</td>
<td>Teacher of adults</td>
<td>Imran A C</td>
<td>Shahida Imran</td>
<td>Imran A C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typist</td>
<td>Date/Time/Length/Place of interview</td>
<td>Date of transcription</td>
<td>Language of interview</td>
<td>Transcription edited with the participant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imran A C</td>
<td>23/01/09; 07:30 PM; 46 m; AEO</td>
<td>28/01/09</td>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>29/01/09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data analysis technique

• Miles and Huberman’s (1994) framework for data analysis:
  - data reduction
  - data display
  - drawing conclusions
Q1: As a teacher/teacher educator/designer, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom in conducting PD of teachers/designing PD?

Challenges are many. Rather I will put it this way that challenges are always with teachers and I wish that those who are making policies they should come and stand in a classroom to see what the reality is actually. So some of the challenges which our teachers of adult including the face are firstly, large classes and below average students. Because of this, teachers are inclined to teaching them the basics otherwise the body survives. Secondly, lack of motivation among students and lack of reading habit among students as well as teachers. When teachers don’t read why their students will read. Thirdly, students expect that the teachers have to tell everything and the result is spoon feeding the part of teachers and not teaching the part of students. These are some of the problems we face in our classroom. Furthermore, there are other constraints too - like time, syllabus and a lot of checking work. These constraints no doubt consume all of your energy. Now how to cope with them? There are no arrangements in our institutions that could tell teachers or support them to figure out some reasonable solutions. I would rather say that there is an absence of the training concept in Pakistan. Teachers always need support and guidance about their daily teaching practice and about the problems arising out of it. You must be surprised to know that for a person to be appointed as a primary school teacher he or she is required to have B Ed qualification. Therefore, there is a necessity for pre-service training program so the teachers will learn and the same is happening. Also, teachers don’t read themselves perhaps because they are over-burdened. They only follow text books and don’t introduce other reference materials to their teaching. Furthermore, there is another point that I would like to mention which indirectly contributes towards complicating the situation - that is related with teachers’ low salaries and benefits. When teachers are unhappy, how could they use full of their potentials in teaching. So that is the situation here in Pakistan.

Q2: In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?

Very rarely, may be after a year or two, few people are invited to some training in the form of a three-day workshop or maximum a week-long. As a common practice, trainers give them lectures and how much participants learn from such training is entirely different story. I have never seen any sign of improvements in the teaching of those who have attended such training programs. But in our own institution, there are no such training opportunities available. Teachers who want to improve, they do learn from their own teaching by reviewing it themselves. Some of our faculties do it together to have discussions on the different issues related to our field but mostly people here dislike discussions. They can talk on politics, religion, and sex but where any intellectual talk initiated, they would not feel comfortable with and may excuse and leave even. I think mostly teachers here don’t have this urge to increase their knowledge; they don’t read to improve their concepts, they simply rely on textbooks to teach - because that is easy for them and they are more comfortable with - and this type of education is not quality education. Presently there are no opportunities at house or out house. So I believe, to enhance the quality of teaching, training must be compulsory for everybody. Nobody should be allowed to join this profession unless they have proper pre-service teaching qualifications. Secondly, once a person is in, there should be regular training opportunities or arrangement for them and it should be made compulsory for everybody without discrimination. Do you know here in our colleges and universities, the training opportunities are available only for a chosen few, who have good relationships perhaps with the department head or dean. Not everyone is nominated to go and attend. So every time, same one or two persons are nominated and they go and avail these opportunities. So I was saying make teacher training compulsory for everyone. You see, for the training of bureaucrats, there are proper academies; same way there must be training centers of a very good quality for the teachers too. Initially trainers from good foreign universities should be invited to impart training like for cricketers you hire foreign coach, why not for teachers too. You have good relationships perhaps with the department head or dean. And teachers is the key not in quality education, therefore, measures must be taken to coach them, empower them so that he could contribute and do justice with what he is doing. And let me tell you everybody wants to seek training - because I myself, whenever I ask my colleagues about whether we should have teacher training opportunities, they always say, yes. So there is a huge difference between the teaching skills of a trained and an untrained teacher. Training can in a way make your job easy and systematic and more effective too.
### Deconstructed data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Archival #</th>
<th>Participant Type &amp; Code</th>
<th>Interviewer</th>
<th>Transcribe</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CITE-MAQ1</td>
<td>Teacher of adults</td>
<td>Imran A/C</td>
<td>Shabana Lanas</td>
<td>Imran A/C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Q1:** As a teacher/teacher educator/designer, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom/in conducting PD of teachers/designing PD?

- Large classes and below average students
- Lack of motivation among students, and lack of reading habits among students as well as teachers
- Students expect that teachers have to tell everything and the result is spoon feeding on the part of teachers and not learning on the part of students
- Syllabus and a lot of checking work
- Teachers' low salaries and benefits
- There are no arrangements in our institutions that could tell teachers or support them to figure out some reasonable solutions.
- No pre-service training, they have no in-service training teachers don't read themselves perhaps because they are overburdened

**Q3:** In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?

- Very rarely, may be after a year or two, few people are invited to some training in the form of a three day workshop or maximum a week long

---

In our own institution, there are no such training opportunities available.

Presently there are no opportunities in-house or out-house.

Teachers who want to improve, they do learn from their own teaching by reviewing it themselves.

Some of our friends do sit together to have discussions on the different issues related to our field but mostly people not unlike discussions.

I think mostly teachers don't have this urge to increase their knowledge; they don't read to improve their concepts; they simply rely on guidebooks to teach - because this is easy for them and they are more comfortable with.

Whenever I ask my colleagues about whether we should have teacher training opportunities, they always say, yes.

---

As a common practice, trainers give them lectures and how much participants learn from such training is entirely different story I have never seen any sign of improvements in the teaching of those who have attended such training programs (Khusi-2).

---

Do you know that in our college, and universality, the training opportunities are available only for a chosen few, who have good relationships perhaps with the department head or dean. Not everyone is nominated to go and attend. So every time some one or two percent are nominated and they go and avail those opportunities (Khusi-2).

---

And teacher is the key unit in quality education, therefore, measures must be taken to coach him, empower him so that he could contribute and do justice with what he is doing (Khusi-2).

So there is a huge difference between the teaching skills of a trained and an untrained teacher. Training can in a way make your job easy and systematic and more effective too (Khusi-2).

---

Q3: What do you consider to be the purpose of attending professional development programs?

- Long term effects
  - It should aim to make people autonomous learners and it should
and Practice
Reconstructed data

Q1: As a teacher/teacher educator/designer, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom/in conducting PD of teachers/designing PD?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Large classes and below average students; lack of motivation among students, and lack of reading habits among students as well as teachers. Students expect that teachers have to tell everything and the result is spoon feeding on the part of teachers and rote learning is the part of students. Time, syllabus, and a lot of checking work. Teachers' low salaries and benefits. There are no arrangements in our institutions that could tell teachers or support them to figure out some reasonable solutions. No pre-service training, they have no in-service training. Teachers don't read themselves perhaps because they are overburdened. You must be surprised to know that for a person to be appointed as a primary school teacher, he or she is required to have B Ed qualification but for teachers in tertiary education, no such condition or requirement is there. If you have done masters in your respective filed you can be appointed as lecturer without seeking any prior training about how to teach etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q2: In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Very rarely, may be after a year or two, few people are invited to some training in the form of a three-day workshop or maximum a week long. In our own institute, there are no such training opportunities available. Presently there are no opportunities in-house or out-house. Teachers who want to improve, they do learn from their own...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q3: What do you consider to be the purpose of attending professional development programs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Long term effects. It should aim to make people autonomous learners and it should give people this feeling that - yes, I have improved professionally. The training should be linked with what teachers will do in their classes - ultimately after teachers these students who are going to be benefited. And teachers is the key unit in quality education, therefore, measures must be taken to coach him, empower him so that he could contribute and do justice with what he is doing (Khushi-2). So there is a huge difference between the teaching skills of a trained and an untrained teacher. Training can in away make your job easy and systematic and more effective too (Khushi-2). So transformation should be the aim of a good professional development (Khushi-10).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q4: Q22:31; S36:33
Edited Data

Q1: As a teacher educator, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom in conducting PD for teachers/desigining PD?

- Large classes and below average students (Khushi-1).
- Lack of motivation and learning among students (Khushi-1).
- Lack of teaching skills among teachers (Khushi-1).
- Students expect that teachers have to tell everything and the result is spoon feeding on the part of teachers and silent learning on the part of students (Khushi-1).
- Constraints: time, syllabus and a lot of marking work (Khushi-1).
- Teachers' low salaries and benefits (Khushi-1).
- No arrangements for our institutions that could tell teachers or support them to figure out some reasonable solutions to our problems (Khushi-1).
- No pre-service training; they have no in-service training (Khushi-1).

Q2: In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or likely to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?

- Very rarely, maybe after a year or two, only few people are invited to some training in the form of a three-day workshop or maximum a week long.
- Presently there are no in-house opportunities (Khushi-3).
- Teachers who want to improve, they do learn from their own teaching by reviewing it themselves (Khushi-1).
- Some of our friends sit together to have discussions on the different issues related to our field but mostly people here dislike discussions (Khushi-2).
- I think mostly teachers here don't have this urge to increase their knowledge, they don't really want to improve their concepts; they simply rely on guidebooks to teach because that is easy for them and they are not encouraged to do otherwise (Khushi-2).

Q3: What do you consider to be the purpose of attending professional development programs?

- Long-term effects (Khushi-3).
- It's supposed to make people autonomous learners and it should give people this feeling that - yes, I have improved professionally (Khushi-3).
- It should be linked with what teachers will do in their classes ultimately (Khushi-3).
- Professional development so that they could contribute and do justice with what she is doing (Khushi-2).
- It should make teachers' job easy and systematic and more effective too (Khushi-2).
- Transformation should be the aim of good professional development (Khushi-10).

Q4: Please comment on the last/current teacher professional development that you have attended or attending. What did you like or dislike about it and why?

Dislike
- Aim and the objectives of workshops were not at all clear to anybody (Khushi-4).
- Inability to answer participants' questions related to their day-to-day practice and problems (Khushi-4).
- Transfer of knowledge only (Khushi-6).

Like
- Interactive and learner-centered (Khushi-4).
- Group work and reflectivity (Khushi-4).

Q5: To what extent do the available PD programs focus on teachers' own experiences and their needs, both professional and personal?
• Miles and Huberman’s (1994) style grid: preparing a matrix
• Miles and Huberman’s (1994) style grid: insert columns and rows for 6 respondents and 11 questions
• Miles and Huberman’s (1994) style grid: put respondents across the top and questions along the side.
• Miles and Huberman’s (1994) style grid: enter salient segments of text in the style grid
Colour coding

Dominant - 5 to 6

Major - 4

Half - 3

Minor - 2

Unforeseen - 1
- Miles and Huberman's (1994) style grid: colour code responses as their occurrence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 1: Do your studies or make assumptions? (1)</th>
<th>Colour</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, they are part of the research process.</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, they are not part of the research process.</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 2: Why do you consider this group as important?</th>
<th>Colour</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The group is crucial for understanding the research context.</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The group is not important for understanding the research context.</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 3: How effective are the instruments for the research process?</th>
<th>Colour</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very effective</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not very effective</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Miles and Huberman's (1994) style grid: colour code responses as their occurrence.
Initial categories for further analysis

- Dealing with Passive Learners
- Lack of Support
- Inadequate Professional Development
- Inequitable Access
- Lack of Self-Access Materials
- Absence of Leadership
- Largely Unrelated to Their Needs and Experiences
- No Involvement

- Information Based Design
- Engagement with Peers
- Generic Teaching Skills
- Self Direction
- Linked with Change in Teachers’ Practice
- Linked with Change in Students’ Learning
- Local Control

- Collaborative and Experiential Learning
- Evaluation Focus
- Reflective and Experiential
- Rejection of Top-Down Transmission
- Holistic Learning
- Teachers as Main Stakeholders
- Coherent Policy

Colour coding:
- Dominant - 5 to 6
- Major - 4
- Half - 3
- Minor - 2
- Unforeseen - 1
Analysis of the categories to surface themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emerging Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Unhappiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. School-based provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Social learning as the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Critical Decisions in the Research and Practice

#### Analysis of the categories to surface themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dealing with Passive Learners</td>
<td>Information Based Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Support</td>
<td>Engagement with Peers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate Professional Development</td>
<td>Generic Teaching Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequitable Access</td>
<td>Self Direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Self-Access Materials</td>
<td>Linked with Change in Teachers’ Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of Leadership</td>
<td>Linked with Change in Students’ Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Largely Unrelated to Their Needs and Experiences</td>
<td>Local Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Involvement</td>
<td>Coherent Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration in Experiential Learning</td>
<td>Evaluation Focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective and Experiential</td>
<td>Rejection of Top-Down Transmission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holistic Learning</td>
<td>Teachers as Main Stakeholders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Note:** The table above represents the analysis of critical decisions in research and practice, focusing on themes that emerge from the data. The themes are categorized into various aspects such as dealing with passive learners, lack of support, inadequate professional development, inequitable access, and more. Each category is linked to specific themes that highlight areas of focus, such as information-based design, engagement with peers, and generic teaching skills. These themes are further broken down into sub-themes, illustrating a comprehensive approach to understanding the critical decisions in research and practice.
pedagogy
4. Personalised
generic teaching skill formation
5. Evaluation
Reporting the Findings

4.1.1 Challenges, Support and Professional Development Access (Questions 1, 2, and 7)
- Dealing with Passive Learners
- Lack of Support
- Inadequate Professional Development
- Inequitable Access
- Lack of Self-Access Materials
- Absence of Leadership

4.1.2 Professional Development Needs, Relevance, and Preferences (Questions 4 and 5)
- Largely Unrelated to Their Needs and Experiences
- No Involvement
- Information Based Design
- Engagement with Peers

4.1.3 Purpose of Professional Development (Questions 3 and 10)
- Generic Teaching Skills
- Self Direction
- Linked with Change in Teachers’ Practice
- Linked with Change in Students’ Learning

4.1.4 Characteristics of Effective Professional Development (Question 6)
- Local Control
- Collaborative and Experiential Learning
- Evaluation Focus

4.1.5 Forms of Professional Development and Their Relevance (Question 8)
- Reflective and Experiential
- Rejection of Top-Down Transmission

4.1.6 Achievements As a Result of Professional Development (Question 9)
- Holistic Learning

4.1.7 Final Comments (Question 11)
- Teachers as Main Stakeholders
- Coherent Policy

Lack of Self-Access Materials
Lack of self access materials as one of the major problems in accessing professional development was an overwhelming response of interviewees (5 out of 5). They accentuated the need of having latest books, relevant research journals, internet service, and printing facility within their own set-ups to keep them up-to-date in their fields and also to seek daily professional improvement.

Absence of Leadership
Non-cooperative and unappreciative administration was another major concern among most of the respondents (4 out of 6) when they spoke of the barriers in their way to professional development. Instead of building, sustaining, and communicating the school’s culture, ‘indifferent, unsupportive, and conventional leadership’ were the feelings reverberating across their responses. They stated that their administrations: “… don’t appreciate, encourage or support” (Bilal-7), and “after training we go back and try to replicate it, they set us aside and say, ‘you have had enough twenty four days fun, get back to teaching now’” (Surria-1),

ecid
Discussion and Presentation results

1. School-based provision

2. Social learning as the pedagogy

3. Social learning as the pedagogy

4. Personalised generic teaching skill formation, and

5. Evaluation
This case study allowed the participants to speak for themselves.

The results of this case study were reported in the voices of both, the participants and the researcher:

- The consolidated narratives and quotes were reported in the voice of participants, and
- summaries of individual experiences in the voice of the researcher.
Answering the research question

How are professional development opportunities for teachers of adults in Pakistan currently experienced, and what changes, if any, should be made?

All of the study participants expressed their displeasure and disapproval of the currently available professional development practices. They considered them as sporadic and incongruent with their classroom experiences, development needs, and the contexts. They explored, in detail, their professional challenges and needs, supports and resources, and their perceptions of the professional development which they considered can be more suitable to their needs and their contexts. Therefore, based on my research, I have concluded that the professional development practices for teachers of adults in Pakistan need to be reformed. These reforms should draw on the following points:

1. To develop and grow, and to improve student learning, teachers need professional development opportunities that are continuing, school-based, and which support learning through reflection and in other experiential ways.

2. Teachers need to improve personalised generic teaching skills, and, to do so, they need to work closely with their colleagues to benefit from
individual, as well as social, aspects of their professional work.

3. School-based provision of professional development opportunities needs to be evaluated on a regular basis to make it more effective, rewarding and sustainable for the schools, the teachers, and the students.