Learning from Variation and Change: The 2016 Release of the National Health Security Preparedness Index

Glen P. Mays, University of Kentucky

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/glen_mays/245/
Learning from Variation and Change:
The 2016 Release of the National Health Security Preparedness Index

Glen Mays, PhD, MPH
Scutchfield Professor of Health Services & Systems Research
University of Kentucky
Why a Preparedness Index?

Increase awareness & understanding of preparedness as a shared responsibility of multiple sectors in government and society

- Identify strengths and vulnerabilities
- Track progress
- Encourage coordination & collaboration
- Facilitate planning & policy development
- Support benchmarking & quality improvement
- Drive research & development
A Brief History

2012
- **Collaborative Development**: Partnership led by CDC, ASTHO and >25 collaborating organizations

12/2013
- **1st Release**: Initial model structure and results
  - 5 domains and 14 subdomains
  - 128 measures

12/2014
- **2nd Release**: Revised model and results
  - 6 domains and 18 active subdomains
  - 119 retained + 75 new = 194 measures
  - 75% of retained measures have updated data

1/2015
- **Transition to Robert Wood Johnson Foundation**
  - Validation studies and revision to methodology & measures

4/2016
- **3rd Release**: Revised model and results
  - 6 domains & 19 subdomains
  - 65% measures retained, 12% respecified, 8 new additions =134
  - 90% of retained measures have updated data from 2nd release
2016 Methodological Enhancements

- **Consolidation**: reduce correlated, redundant & noisy measures
- **Composition**: expand social, environmental economic indicators of preparedness & resiliency
- **Grouping & weighting**: use empirical methods for internal consistency, discriminant power
- **Scaling**: reflect distributional properties
- **Comparisons**: address accuracy and uncertainty
- **Trending**: apply new methods/measures retrospectively
2016 Changes in Measure Set

- 42 measures eliminated due to data periodicity >3 years
- 29 measures eliminated due to poor construct validity
- 22 measures respecified to improve construct validity
- 8 newly added measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>2014 Alpha</th>
<th>2016 Alpha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health security surveillance</td>
<td>0.377</td>
<td>0.712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community planning &amp; engagement</td>
<td>0.382</td>
<td>0.631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incident &amp; information management</td>
<td>0.455</td>
<td>0.734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare delivery</td>
<td>0.354</td>
<td>0.596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countermeasure management</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>0.654</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental/occupational health</td>
<td>0.546</td>
<td>0.749</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Construct Validity

Current Index Structure and Methodology

- 134 individual measures
  - Weighted average
- 19 subdomains
  - Weighted average
- 6 domains
  - Weighted average
- State overall values
  - Unweighted average
- National overall values

- Normalized to 0-10 scale using min-max scaling to preserve distributions
- Imputations based on multivariate longitudinal models
- Empirical weights based on Delphi expert panels
- Bootstrapped confidence intervals reflect sampling and measurement error
- Annual estimates for 2013, 2014 and 2015
Health Security & Preparedness

**Foundational Capabilities**

- Environmental & Occupational Health
- Countermeasure Management
- Healthcare Delivery
- Healthcare Delivery
- Environmental Monitoring

**Domains**

- Incident & Information Management
- Environmental & Occupational Health
- Community Planning & Engagement
- Healthcare Delivery
- Surveillance & Monitoring

**Subdomains**

- Incident Management & Multi-Agency Coordination
- Legal & Administrative Protections
- Management of Volunteers for Emergency Response
- Protections for Children & At-Risk Populations
- Cross-Sector Planning & Coordination

NOTE: numbers indicate Delphi expert panel weights.
1. National preparedness trended upward in most functional areas during 2013-15, except in environmental health and healthcare delivery.

Preliminary Results: Not for Quotation or Attribution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>+3.6%</td>
<td>+7.5%</td>
<td>+1.9%</td>
<td>+1.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Security Surveillance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Planning and Engagement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+8.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incident &amp; Information Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare Delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countermeasure Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental &amp; Occupational Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-4.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Preparedness improved in most states during 2013-15, but significant geographic differences remain.
3. Improvements in preparedness occurred across the U.S. in both above-average and below-average states. However, some below-average states continued to lose ground.
4. Gaps in preparedness between the highest and lowest states are large and persistent, and they have increased in environmental health and in healthcare delivery.
Caveats and cautions

- Imperfect measures & latent constructs
- Missing capabilities
- Timing and accuracy of underlying data sources
Next Steps

- Now: state preview period
- 2016 Public Release on April 26
  www.nhspi.org
- National convening to showcase uses: Fall 2016
- Continued work to incorporate advances in measurement: ASPR, CDC, NIH, AHRQ, HP2020
- Additional analysis to understand causes and consequences of change
National Advisory Committee Members | 2015-16

1. Tom Inglesby, (Chair) UPMC Center for Health Security
2. Robert Burhans, Emergency Management Consultant
3. Anita Chandra, RAND
4. Ana-Marie Jones, Collaborating Agencies Responding to Disasters
5. Eric Klinenberg, New York University
6. Jeff Levi/Dara Lieberman, Trust for America’s Health
7. Nicole Lurie, Assistant Secretary for Preparedness and Response
8. Stephanie Lynch, Caddo Parish (LA) Commissioner
9. Suzet McKinney, Chicago Department of Public Health
10. Stephen Redd, CDC Office of Public Health Preparedness & Response
11. Richard Reed, American Red Cross (through 2/2016)
12. Martin Jose Sepulveda, IBM Corporation
13. Claudia Thompson, NIH National Institute of Environmental Health Sci.
14. John Wiesman, Washington State Secretary of Health
For More Information

National Program Office

Supported by The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation

Glen P. Mays, Ph.D., M.P.H.  glen.mays@uky.edu

Email:  NHSPI@uky.edu
Web: www.nhspi.org  www.systemsforaction.org
Journal: www.FrontiersinPHSSR.org
Archive: works.bepress.com/glen_mays
Blog: publichealtheconomics.org

Systems for Action

National Coordinating Center
Systems and Services Research to Build a Culture of Health