
Gerald Lebovits

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/gerald_lebovits/
New York Lawyers’ Practical Skills Series

Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Dov Treiman, Esq.

2017–2018
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Introduction</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II. The Tenancy</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Market Rentals</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Parties</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Premises</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Rent</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Default</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Legal-Fees Provisions</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Recording of Leases</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Rent Regulation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Rent-Controlled Premises</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rent-Stabilized Premises</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Rent Stabilization Overview</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Tenants’ Rights Under Rent Stabilization</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Exemptions From Rent Stabilization</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Rent-Overcharge Claims</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Succession Rights</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Preferential Rents</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Public Housing</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Voucher Program</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Project-Based Section 8</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Cooperatives and Condominiums</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Cooperatives Generally</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Cooperative and Condominium Conversions</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Condominiums</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Cooperative and Condominium Summary Proceedings in New York City</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Subsidized/Regulated Cooperatives Under the Private Housing Finance Law</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Housing Development Fund Companies</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing)</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Lofts</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Hotels and Single-Room Occupancy Buildings (SROs)</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Tenancy Protections</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Housing Discrimination</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Warranty of Habitability</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Conveying the Tenancy</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction to Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Pleadings</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Governing Procedural Statutes</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c. Counterclaims and Jury Waivers ............................................................. 77

d. Attorney Fees and Costs .......................................................................... 78

e. Types of Summary Proceedings .............................................................. 78

B. Holdover Proceedings .................................................................................. 78

1. Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants ....................................................... 80

2. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Breach
   of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy ................................................ 81
   a. Unauthorized Sublets ........................................................................... 81
   b. Pets ........................................................................................................ 85
   c. Alterations ............................................................................................. 87
   d. Security Deposit .................................................................................. 88
   e. Specified Use or Purpose .................................................................... 89

3. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Wrongful
   Acts of Tenants and Nuisance .................................................................... 90
   a. Nuisance .............................................................................................. 90
   b. Hoarding ............................................................................................. 91
   c. Chronic Late Payment of Rent .............................................................. 92
   d. Access .................................................................................................. 93
   e. Destruction of the Premises ................................................................. 94
   f. Illegal Occupancy ................................................................................ 94
   g. Illegal Use ............................................................................................ 95

4. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate
   Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units .................................................. 98
   a. Nonprimary Residence ....................................................................... 98
   b. Owner’s Use ....................................................................................... 101
   c. Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution ......................................... 105
   d. Demolition .......................................................................................... 106
   e. Withdrawal From the Rental Market .................................................... 107
   f. Eviction Plan ...................................................................................... 107
   g. Failure to Renew ................................................................................ 107
   h. Profiteering ....................................................................................... 108

5. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants .............................. 109
   a. Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure ......................................... 109
   b. Licensee Proceedings ......................................................................... 110
   c. Squatters ............................................................................................. 111
   d. Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises .......... 112
   e. Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale .............. 112
   f. Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement ............................................. 112
   g. Employer-Employee Proceedings ....................................................... 112
   h. Occupant After Termination of Life Estate ......................................... 114
   i. Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry ............................................. 114

6. Predicate Notices .......................................................................................... 114
   a. Overview ............................................................................................ 114
   b. Notice to Cure .................................................................................... 115
   c. Notice of Termination ....................................................................... 116
   d. Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail ................................................. 124
7. Notice of Petition and Petition........................................................................ 124
   a. Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties ........................................ 124
      (1) Issuance of the Notice of Petition ..................................................... 124
      (2) Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition ............... 125
   b. Contents of the Petition.......................................................................... 128
      (1) General Requirements...................................................................... 128
      (2) Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered ..................... 129
      (3) Statement of the Parties’ Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered .................................................................. 130
      (4) Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws .................................... 131
      (5) Verification of the Petition .............................................................. 132
      (6) Liberalization of Pleading Requirements ........................................ 132
      (7) Alternative Pleadings....................................................................... 132
      (8) Inquests ............................................................................................ 133
C. Nonpayment Proceedings...................................................................................... 134
   1. Proper Parties.......................................................................................... 135
   2. Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding...................................................... 135
   3. What May BeRecovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding ............... 135
   4. Rent Demands............................................................................................ 137
      a. Overview............................................................................................... 137
      b. Contents of the Rent Demand.................................................................. 138
      c. Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties ................................................................................. 140
      d. Oral vs. Written Rent Demands........................................................... 140
      e. Compliance With the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act ..................... 141
   5. Notice of Petition and Petition........................................................................ 142
   6. Defaults........................................................................................................ 143
   7. Spiegel Law................................................................................................. 144
   8. Bankruptcy.................................................................................................. 145
D. Answering a Summary Proceeding ....................................................................... 145
E. Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings ................................ 149
F. Disclosure in Summary Proceedings.................................................................. 153
G. Rent Deposits/Pendente Lite Use and Occupancy ........................................... 155
H. Stays, Warrant, Cures ...................................................................................... 156
   1. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings ............. 156
   2. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings ................. 158
      a. Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings ................................................................................. 158
      b. Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease ............................................. 160
         (1) Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease ........................................ 160
         (2) Failure to Give Access .................................................................... 160
         (3) Nuisance.......................................................................................... 160
         (4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings ................................................................. 161
A. Ejectment Actions ................................................................. 197
B. HP Proceedings ................................................................. 199
C. Article 7-A Proceedings ........................................................ 205
D. Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City ............... 206
E. Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings ................. 207
   1. Overview ........................................................................ 207
   2. Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession.......................... 207
   3. Criminal Penalties.................................................................. 209
   4. Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL § 853 .................................. 209
   5. Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations .................................. 209
F. Foreclosure Proceedings ....................................................... 210
G. Yellowstone Injunction Actions .............................................. 216
H. Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants .................................. 219
VII. Abandonment and Surrender of Possession ..................................... 219
VIII. Courts That Award Possession of Real Property ............................... 221
   A. Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in
      Which Geographic Locations .................................................. 221
   B. Supreme Court .................................................................. 222
   C. The New York City Civil Court ............................................. 222
   D. New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties) .......... 226
   E. City Court .......................................................................... 227
      1. The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court .................................. 227
         a. History ........................................................................ 227
         b. Code Violation Actions .................................................. 228
            (1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving
                Model—District-by-District Scheduling ......................... 228
            (2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons ................................... 229
            (3) Arraignment .............................................................. 230
            (4) Use of Interlocutory Orders ........................................ 231
               (a) Orders to Vacate ..................................................... 231
               (b) Demolition Orders .................................................. 232
               (c) Receiverships ......................................................... 232
               (d) Case-Specific Orders .............................................. 232
            (5) The Funding Calendar .................................................. 233
            (6) Sentencing ................................................................. 233
         c. Evictions ....................................................................... 236
            (1) Accessibility .............................................................. 236
            (2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants ................. 237
            (3) Linkage ................................................................... 237
            (4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed .............. 237
            (5) Stipulations ............................................................... 238
            (6) Mandatory Mediation ................................................ 239
            (7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings ....................... 239
            (8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting .................... 239
            (9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee ................. 239
            (10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court ...... 240
(11) Attorneys Signing Petitions ............................................................. 240
(12) Control of Out Dates........................................................................ 240
(13) Evictions in Section 8 Tenancies ..................................................... 241
(14) Conclusion ....................................................................................... 241
2. City Courts Outside Buffalo and the City of New York ...................... 242
   (1) Binghamton City Court ............................................................... 242
F. Justice Courts ...................................................................................... 244
   1. Overview ....................................................................................... 244
   2. Eviction Proceedings Specific to Town and Village Courts in
      Upstate New York ........................................................................... 245
   3. Justice Courts: Jurisdiction and Venue .......................................... 245
   4. Notice of Petition .......................................................................... 246
   5. Petition ......................................................................................... 247
   6. Service ......................................................................................... 248
G. Surrogate’s Court ............................................................................... 248
H. County Courts .................................................................................... 249
I. Federal Courts ..................................................................................... 249
IX. Appeals............................................................................................... 250
X. Conclusion........................................................................................... 255

Appendix 1 Duties of Housing Court Liaisons ......................................... 257
Appendix 2 Script for Arraignments ....................................................... 259
Appendix 3 Order for Access ................................................................. 263
Appendix 4 Order to Vacate ................................................................. 265
Appendix 5 Order Appointing Receiver .................................................. 267
Appendix 6 Response to Violation Notice/Request for Rehabilitation Funding Assistance ..... 271
Appendix 7 Petition Addendum ............................................................... 273
Appendix 8 Memorandum, Decision and Order ...................................... 275
Appendix 9 Stipulation .......................................................................... 279
Appendix 10 Referral to Department of Health for Premises Violations .... 281
Appendix 11 Request for Extension of Time for Issuance or Execution of a Warrant
      of Eviction ...................................................................................... 283

Residential Landlord-Tenant Forms Index ............................................. 287
Table of Authorities ............................................................................... 469
About the Authors .................................................................................. 519
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors of this tenth edition thank Jeffrey R. Metz, Esq. for his co-authorship of the ninth edition (2016–2017); Michael B. Terk, Esq., for his co-authorship of the eighth (2015–2016), fifth (2012–2013) and fourth (2011–2012) editions; Peter K. Diskint, Esq., for co-authorship of the seventh (2014–2015) and sixth (2013–2014) editions; Victor S. Faleck, Esq., for his co-authorship of the third (2010–2011) and second (2009–2010) editions; and Dan M. Blumenthal, Esq., for his co-authorship of the first (2008–2009) edition. For their research on the sixth (2013–2014) edition, the authors thank Peter Kane, Esq., and Nancy Hassell of the Appellate Term, First Department, and law students Ian Steinberg (Cardozo) and James Steiner (New York Law School). For their research on the fourth (2011–2012) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Daphne Bareket (Florida International), Alison Genova (Fordham), and Hailey B. Render (Syracuse). For their research on the third (2010–2011) edition, the authors thank then-New York Law School students Deena M. Crimaldi and Alana Sliwinski. For their research on the second (2009–2010) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns P. Alex de Richemont (Harvard), Mariella Soussou (Fordham), and Mary Jane Yoon (Columbia). For their research on the first (2008–2009) edition, the authors thank Mary Ann Amodeo, Esq., Judge Lebovits’s court attorney Alexandra Standish, Esq., and Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Alana Wrublin (Fordham), Victor J. Brubaker (New York Law School), and Stephanie L. Torre (New York Law School). For writing the section on the Buffalo Housing Court and for providing the Buffalo Housing Court forms, the authors thank former Buffalo City Court judge, and now Supreme Court justice, Henry Nowak and now-retired court attorney/referee Mark Doane, Esq. For writing the section on the Justice Courts, the authors also thank Town of Bethlehem Justice Ryan Donovan and Katelyn Primono, Esq.
HONORABLE GERALD LEBOVITS

Hon. Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. An acting Supreme Court justice in New York County, he serves as the president of the New York State Association of Acting Supreme Court Justices. He previously presided in Civil Court, for which he was the president of the Board of Judges of the New York City Civil Court; Criminal Court; and Housing Court, for which he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher for 32 years, he is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Columbia Law School, Fordham University School of Law, and New York University School of Law and was an adjunct at St. John’s University School of Law and New York Law School. Active in the New York State Bar Association, for which he has lectured at many Continuing Legal Education programs, he is a past Co-chair of the Association’s Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings, has authored the Bar Journal’s Legal Writer column since 2001, and has published 30 articles in the Association’s journals, 19 of them in the Association’s New York Real Property Law Journal. A Canadian native, he graduated from the Ottawa (L.L.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

Justice Lebovits dedicates this book to his soulmate and love, New York County Supreme Court Justice Margaret A. Chan.

DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.

Damon P. Howard is a founding partner of Ephron-Mandel & Howard, L.L.P., located in New York City. His experience ranges from commercial litigation, including actions for injunctive and declaratory relief, to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and the Tulane University Law School. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey, and Louisiana.

DOV TREIMAN, ESQ.

Dov Treiman chairs Adam Leitman Bailey, P.C.’s Landlord-Tenant Civil Litigation Practice and is a partner at the firm.

Mr. Treiman was in private practice for 15 years before devoting his principal time to collecting, editing, writing, and publishing materials in landlord-tenant law. His writings include articles in the New York Law Journal, the New York State Bar Association Real Property Law Journal, the New York State Bar Association Journal, and the Landlord-Tenant Practice Reporter.

Treiman is the Founding Editor and Contributor of numerous articles to the Landlord Tenant Monthly (4 volumes); Editor and Commentator, The Housing Court Reporter (24 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman’s Commentaries (3 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Chronological Annotator (3 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Plaintiff-Defendant Tables (2 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Digest (7 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman’s New York Landlord Tenant Statutes Annotated (3 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman’s Rent Stabilization Code Annotated (3 volumes); Editor and Author, Treiman’s Trial Manual; Editor and Principal Author, Treiman’s Encyclopedia and Dictionary (2 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman’s Leading Cases (2 volumes); Editor, Public Documents of the DHCR; Editor, the Loft Board Reporter (18 volumes); Editor, the New York City Administrative Law Reporter (3 volumes); and Editor, Landlord Tenant Appellate Reporter (7 volumes).
Of these, the most important is the Housing Court Reporter. For some 30 years, it was the standard work used by all New York City courts and landlord-tenant practitioners to search through some 50,000 cases for applicable precedents.

Mr. Treiman has also written several books on non-legal topics.

Mr. Treiman is a sought-after lecturer on landlord-tenant subjects. He has served as the principal consultant on landlord-tenant matters to the New York Times. Mr. Treiman is the chair of the Apartment Law Insider’s Board of Advisors.