
Gerald Lebovits
NY RESIDENTIAL LANDLORD-TENANT LAW—2015-2016

Authors:
Hon. Gerald Lebovits
New York State Supreme Court

Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Ephron-Mandel & Howard, L.L.P., New York City

Michael B. Terk, Esq.
Rozenholt & Associates

Key Benefits:
• Understand the statutory framework for landlord-tenant summary proceedings.
• Enhance your skills dealing with landlord-tenant disputes.

Product Description:
New York residential landlord-tenant law is daunting to newcomers and the experienced alike, given its patchwork statutory framework, discordant case law, and emotion-laden disputes involving homes, money, and the charged landlord-tenant relationship. This practice guide introduces the fundamentals of residential landlord-tenant law and offers a guide to the procedural mechanics practitioners face in landlord-tenant disputes.

This edition offers practical advice on tenancy, summary proceedings, nonpayment proceedings, illegal lockout/unlawful eviction actions and proceedings, general and affirmative defenses to a residential landlord-tenant proceeding, and includes many forms.

Recent case law has been added throughout the publication. There have also been significant revisions to the commentary, such as the section covering rent stabilization legislation that went into effect in June 2015. Forms have been reviewed and updated as needed. The 2015-2016 release is current through the 2015 New York State legislative session.

Additional Information:
Table of Contents and Author Bios

Also available as an e-book.


Product Code: 416916
Speaker/Author: Hon. Gerald Lebovits, Damon P. Howard, Esq., Michael B. Terk, Esq.
Publisher: NYSBA
ISBN Number: 1-57969-460-8
Media: Book
Edition: 2015-2016
Member Price: $80.00
Non-Member Price: $95.00
Your Price (must be logged in): $95.00

ADD TO CART
New York Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Michael B. Terk, Esq.

2015–2016
Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits*
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Michael B. Terk, Esq.

2015–2016

* The authors of this eighth edition thank Peter K. Diskint, Esq., for co-authorship of the seventh (2014–2015) and sixth (2013–2014) editions; Michael B. Terk, Esq., for his co-authorship of the fifth (2012–2013) and fourth (2011–2012) editions; Victor S. Faleck, Esq., for his co-authorship of the third (2010–2011) and second (2009–2010) editions; and Dan M. Blumenthal, Esq., for his co-authorship of the first (2008–2009) edition. For their research on the sixth (2013–2014) edition, the authors thank Peter Kane, Esq., and Nancy Hassell of the Appellate Term, First Department, and law students Ian Steinberg (Cardozo) and James Steiner (New York Law School). For their research on the fourth (2011–2012) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Daphne Bareket (Florida International), Alison Genova (Fordham), and Hailey B. Render (Syracuse). For their research on the third (2010–2011) edition, the authors thank then-New York Law School students Deena M. Crimaldi and Alana Sliwinski. For their research on the second (2009–2010) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns P. Alex de Richemont (Harvard), Mariella Soussou (Fordham), and Mary Jane Yoon (Columbia). For their research on the first (2008–2009) edition, the authors thank Mary Ann Amodeo, Esq., Judge Lebovits’s court attorney Alexandra Standish, Esq., and Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Alana Wrublin (Fordham), Victor J. Brubaker (New York Law School), and Stephanie L. Torre (New York Law School). For writing the section on the Buffalo Housing Court and for providing the Buffalo Housing Court forms, the authors thank former Buffalo City Court judge, and now Supreme Court justice, Henry Nowak and now-retired court attorney/referee Mark Doane, Esq. For writing the section on the Justice Courts, the authors also thank Town of Bethlehem Justice Ryan Donovan and Katelyn Primono, Esq.
New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client’s or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2015
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-460-8
Product Number: 416916
## CONTENTS

I. Introduction ................................................................................................................. 1

II. The Tenancy ................................................................................................................. 2
   A. Market Rentals ........................................................................................................ 7
      1. The Parties ......................................................................................................... 9
      2. The Premises .................................................................................................... 12
      3. Rent ................................................................................................................. 13
      4. Default ............................................................................................................ 13
      5. Legal-Fees Provisions ..................................................................................... 15
      6. Recording of Leases ....................................................................................... 19
   B. Rent Regulation ..................................................................................................... 19
      1. Rent-Controlled Premises ............................................................................... 20
      2. Rent-Stabilized Premises ................................................................................ 24
         a. Rent Stabilization Overview .................................................................... 24
         b. Tenants’ Rights Under Rent Stabilization ............................................... 25
         c. Exemptions From Rent Stabilization ...................................................... 28
      3. Rent-Overcharge Claims ................................................................................ 31
      4. Succession Rights ........................................................................................... 34
      5. Preferential Rents ........................................................................................... 36
   C. Public Housing ...................................................................................................... 38
   D. Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing..................................................... 40
      1. The Voucher Program .................................................................................... 40
      2. Project-Based Section 8 .................................................................................. 44
   E. Cooperatives and Condominiums .......................................................................... 45
      1. Cooperatives Generally .................................................................................. 45
      2. Cooperative and Condominium Conversions ................................................. 46
      3. Condominiums ................................................................................................ 48
         a. Housing Development Fund Companies ................................................. 49
         b. Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing)............... 49
   F. Lofts ....................................................................................................................... 51
   G. Hotels and Single-Room Occupancy Buildings (SROs) ....................................... 53

III. Tenancy Protections ................................................................................................ 54
   A. Housing Discrimination ......................................................................................... 54
   B. Warranty of Habitability ....................................................................................... 56

IV. Conveying the Tenancy ............................................................................................. 59

V. Summary Proceedings ............................................................................................... 62
   A. Introduction to Summary Proceedings ................................................................ 62
      1. Overview ........................................................................................................ 62
      2. The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings .................................. 65
         a. Pleadings .................................................................................................... 65
         b. Governing Procedural Statutes ................................................................ 66
B. Holdover Proceedings ................................................................. 67
1. Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants .............................................. 69
2. Grounds for Holdover Proceeding Against Tenants—Breach of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy .................................................... 70
   a. Unauthorized Sublets ........................................................................ 70
   b. Pets ...................................................................................................... 74
   c. Alterations ............................................................................................ 75
   d. Security Deposit .................................................................................. 76
   e. Specified Use or Purpose ................................................................... 77
   a. Nuisance .............................................................................................. 78
   b. Hoarding .............................................................................................. 79
   c. Chronic Late Payment of Rent ............................................................... 79
   d. Access .................................................................................................. 81
   e. Destruction of the Premises ................................................................ 82
   f. Illegal Occupancy ................................................................................ 82
   g. Illegal Use ............................................................................................ 83
4. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units .................................................... 86
   a. Nonprimary Residence ....................................................................... 86
   b. Owner’s Use ........................................................................................ 88
   c. Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution ............................................ 92
   d. Demolition ........................................................................................... 93
   e. Withdrawal From the Rental Market .................................................... 93
   f. Eviction Plan ....................................................................................... 94
   g. Failure to Renew ................................................................................ 94
   h. Profiteering ....................................................................................... 95
5. Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants .......................... 95
   a. Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure ......................................... 95
   b. Licensee Proceedings .......................................................................... 96
   c. Squatters ............................................................................................. 97
   d. Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises .......... 98
   e. Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale .............. 98
   f. Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement ............................................ 99
   g. Employer-Employee Proceedings ..................................................... 99
   h. Occupant After Termination of Life Estate ........................................ 100
   i. Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry .......................................... 100
6. Predicate Notices ................................................................................ 100
   a. Overview ............................................................................................ 100
   b. Notice to Cure ..................................................................................... 101
   c. Notice of Termination ....................................................................... 102
   d. Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail .............................................. 110
7. Notice of Petition and Petition.......................................................................................... 110
   a. Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties .................................................. 110
      (1) Issuance of the Notice of Petition .............................................................. 110
      (2) Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition ...................... 110
   b. Contents of the Petition......................................................................................... 113
      (1) General Requirements .............................................................................. 113
      (2) Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered ............................ 114
      (3) Statement of the Parties’ Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered .................................................. 115
      (4) Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws .................................................. 116
      (5) Verification of the Petition ........................................................................ 117
      (6) Liberalization of Pleading Requirements ............................................... 117
      (7) Alternative Pleadings .............................................................................. 117
      (8) Inquests ................................................................................................. 119

C. Nonpayment Proceedings.......................................................................................... 119
   1. Proper Parties...................................................................................................... 120
   2. Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding............................................................. 120
   3. What May Be Recovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding ................... 120
   4. Rent Demands.................................................................................................... 122
      a. Overview .................................................................................................. 122
      b. Contents of the Rent Demand .................................................................. 122
      c. Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties .............................................................................. 125
      d. Oral vs. Written Rent Demands ............................................................... 125
      e. Compliance With the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act ........................... 126
   5. Notice of Petition and Petition........................................................................... 127
   6. Defaults............................................................................................................ 128
   7. Spiegel Law....................................................................................................... 129
   8. Bankruptcy....................................................................................................... 130

D. Answering a Summary Proceeding......................................................................... 130

E. Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings............................. 134

F. Disclosure in Summary Proceedings..................................................................... 138

G. Rent Deposits/Pendente Lite Use and Occupancy ............................................ 140

H. Stays, Warrant, Cures........................................................................................ 141
   1. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings ............. 141
   2. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings .................. 143
      a. Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings ........................................................................... 143
      b. Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease ............................................. 144
         (1) Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease ........................................... 144
         (2) Failure to Give Access .................................................................... 145
         (3) Nuisance ......................................................................................... 145
         (4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings .......................................................... 145

v
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Public Policy Against Forfeiture of Tenancies in New York</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Non-Residential Tenants and Tenants Outside the City of New York</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Prevailing Landlords’ Entitlement to Attorney Fees</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. General Powers to Stay Warrants in Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Stay of the Proceeding Itself Before or After Judgment</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Service of Process in Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Overview of “Traverse” in Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Service Requirements</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Challenging Service</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Process Server Rules and Regulations in the City of New York</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Overview of Rules</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Licensing Requirements/Process Servers and Process Server Agencies</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Mandatory Posting of Bonds</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Record-Keeping Requirements</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. GPS Technology</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. Judicial Actions and Proceedings/Claims for Improper Service/Traverse Hearings</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. Exemptions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>General and Affirmative Defenses to Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Traverse/Service</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Lack of Multiple Dwelling Registration in New York City</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Lack of a Proper Certificate of Occupancy</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Failure Accurately to State Regulatory Status and Comply With Rent Laws</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Omitting or Misstating Required Elements of the Petition</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Lack of Proper Predicate Notice/Rent Demand Notice</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Predicate Notice Vitiated/Tenancy Reinstated</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Retaliatory Eviction</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. A Laches Defense in a Nonpayment Proceeding</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. Conditions</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. Actual Eviction/Constructive Eviction</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13. Statute of Limitations</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14. Succession Rights</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>Alleging a Respondent’s Military Status</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Competency of Parties to a Landlord-Tenant Proceeding, Including the Unrepresented, Non-English Speakers, and Those Needing Guardians Ad Litem</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>Settlements in Landlord-Tenant Summary Proceedings</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>Enforcing Warrants of Eviction and Orders of Possession</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O</td>
<td>Post-Eviction Relief</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>Landlord-Tenant Actions and Proceedings Other Than Nonpayment and Holdover Proceedings</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Ejectment Actions</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. HP Proceedings ..................................................................................................... 179
C. Article 7-A Proceedings ........................................................................................ 185
D. Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City......................... 185
E. Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings ............................. 187
   1. Overview ........................................................................................................ 187
   2. Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession ..................................... 187
   3. Criminal Penalties ........................................................................................... 189
   4. Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL § 853 ................................................. 189
   5. Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations ............................................... 189
F. Foreclosure Proceedings ........................................................................................ 190
G. Yellowstone Injunction Actions ............................................................................ 196
H. Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants ................................................. 198
VII. Abandonment and Surrender of Possession ...................................................... 198
VIII. Courts That Award Possession of Real Property .............................................. 200
   A. Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in
      Which Geographic Locations ............................................................................ 200
   B. Supreme Court ................................................................................................. 201
   C. The New York City Civil Court ....................................................................... 201
   D. New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties) ....................... 204
   E. City Court .......................................................................................................... 205
      1. The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court ..................................................... 205
         a. History ..................................................................................................... 205
         b. Code Violation Actions ........................................................................... 206
            (1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving
                Model—District-by-District Scheduling ............................................. 207
            (2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons ........................................................ 207
            (3) Arraignment ..................................................................................... 209
            (4) Use of Interlocutory Orders ............................................................ 209
               (a) Orders to Vacate ...................................................................... 209
               (b) Demolition Orders ................................................................... 210
               (c) Receiverships ........................................................................... 210
               (d) Case-Specific Orders ............................................................... 210
            (5) The Funding Calendar ..................................................................... 211
            (6) Sentencing ....................................................................................... 211
         c. Evictions .................................................................................................. 214
            (1) Accessibility ..................................................................................... 214
            (2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants .................................. 215
            (3) Linkage ............................................................................................ 215
            (4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed .............................. 216
            (5) Stipulations ...................................................................................... 216
            (6) Mandatory Mediation ...................................................................... 217
            (7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings ....................................... 217
            (8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting ..................................... 217
            (9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee ............................... 217
            (10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court .... 218
            (11) Attorneys Signing Petitions ............................................................. 218
HONORABLE GERALD LEBOVITS

Hon. Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. Currently an acting Supreme Court justice in New York County, he serves as the president of the Board of Judges of the New York City Civil Court. He previously presided in Civil Court, Criminal Court, and Housing Court, where he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher for 30 years, he is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Columbia Law School, Fordham University School of Law, New York Law School, and New York University School of Law and was an adjunct at St. John’s University School of Law. Active in the New York State Bar Association, for which he has lectured at many Continuing Legal Education programs, he is a past Co-chair of the Association’s Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings, has authored the Bar Journal’s Legal Writer column since 2001, and has published 28 articles in the Association’s journals, 19 of them in the Association’s New York Real Property Law Journal. A Canadian native, he graduated from the Ottawa (LL.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.

Damon P. Howard is a founding partner of Ephron-Mandel & Howard, L.L.P., located in New York City. His experience ranges from commercial litigation, including actions for injunctive and declaratory relief, to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and Tulane University Law School. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey, and Louisiana.

MICHAEL B. TERK, ESQ.

Michael B. Terk is an associate with David Rozenholc & Associates, where he practices primarily landlord-tenant and real estate litigation. Prior to joining David Rozenholc & Associates, he practiced landlord-tenant law as an associate at two other New York firms. Mr. Terk regularly represents clients in New York State Supreme Court, New York City Civil Court (both residential and commercial parts), and before administrative agencies such as the New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR). He also represents clients at the appellate level and has written briefs in connection with precedent-setting Appellate Term and Appellate Division cases. Mr. Terk is admitted to practice law in New York and Massachusetts. He is a member of the New York County Lawyers’ Association and the New York State Bar Association. He received his J.D. from Hofstra University School of Law and his B.A. from Brandeis University. He first began landlord-tenant litigation while still in law school, providing free legal representation to low-income tenants in Nassau County District Court under a student practice order, as part of Hofstra Law’s Community Legal Assistance Corp. Housing Rights Clinic.