Spring June 5, 2016

Notebook I Plato's Apology

Edward H Campbell
Plato,
Apology
May 2016
To M. M. Bakhtin

In bona optimo,
Semper invidiam metueo.

Campbell ted@gmail.com
Bozeman, MT
May 2016
PLATO'S APOLOGY

The Apology of Socrates of Alopece

A New Translation, with Text, and Commentary

By E. H. Campbell

Draft 1A, May 2016

But I, on the other hand, in fact, forget myself a little by nearly these, because they were speaking in such a plausible way.

Adv. m. nom. sing. self

Adj. m. 1st pl. impf. act. ind.

Adv. m. gen. sing. of me, of self.

They were speaking in such a plausible way.
The Apology

17a  ἦν δὲ ὡς ὑμεῖς, ὃ ἀνθρώπος Ἀθηναίος,

κατακλυσμός ὡς ἐγὼ ἐμῶν κατακλυσμόν,

οὐκ οἶδα: ἐγὼ δ' οὖν καὶ ἀνθρώπος ὑποστάσσω,

καὶ ὑπὸ ἐμοῦ ἐμαυω ἐπειδὴ ἦμεν,

καὶ ἐμοὶ περὶ ἀνθρώπων οὐδέποτε.

and in fact

On the one hand (μεν)

that (οὖν), you (ὑμεῖς)

O Athenian when (ὡς ἀνθρώπος Ἀθηναίος)

were affected (κατακλυσμός),

by (ὥς), the accusers of mine (ἐγὼ ἐμῶν)

κατακλυσμόν (ὑπὸ... κατακλυσμόν ἐμῶν).

I knew not (οὐκ οἶδα),

But I, on the other hand (ἐγὼ δ' ἦν)

myself,

and in fact (ὁμώς καὶ) about them (ὑμῖν...

excuse), I had forgotten, I used to

say, speak a little about them, so persuasively.
most of all

most of all you had been deceived not by me

by me

their lies, so as to declare to you

And (but)
Meet of all
Meet I stood in amazement
I was astonished
by their unvarying lies, they said that I must not to say that

the thing in it

it must not be deceived by me.

But most of all out
by their unvarying lies
most of all I was amazed at the one in
in which they said (as spoken)

warned & exhorted to me

they were saying because so as (in the manner)
you would not be deceived by me

partic. and indeed, and further.

and yet

Plato

[17v]

Kurai o ánges yé wás étos éitev

ótí

Exéforá wó xóro ús Éukrátide

úr

μψ υ ενώ εκτάκητηε.

Strengthened
Kekre

Adv. unceased

true, really, actually, in reality

Adj. in. sing

god pl. pre. act. ind.

Adv. m. sing; not one

and yet

they have uttered not one word of

truth.

The Dialogic Imagination

M. M. Bakhtin

p. 8

In addition, the experts have not managed to isolate a single definite, stable characteristic of the novel.

p. 11

I find three basic characteristics that fundamentally distinguish the novel in principle from other genres: (1) its stylistic three-dimensionality, which is linked with the multi-linguage consciousness realized in the novel; (2) the radical change it effects in the temporal coordinates of the literary image; (3) the new zone opened by the novel for structuring literary images, namely the zone of maximal contact with the present (with contemporary reality) in all its openness.

p. 11-12

In another work I have already investigated the first stylistic peculiarity of the novel, the one resulting from the active polyglossia of the new world.

p. 12

Polyglossia had always existed (it is more ancient than pure, canonized and monoglossia), but it had not been a factor in literary creation; an artistically conscious choice between languages did not serve as the creative energy of the literary and language process.

(19x) we should now (Ἀναλάβωμεν οὖν) take up.

this accusation (τίς ἐν κατηγορία)
from the beginning. (Ἐξ ἀρχῆς)
It is (ἕστιν)
from this (Ἐξ ὧς)

(19p) whether indeed (ὅπως)
my slander came to be (ὅταν ὁ θησαυρὸς ἔστωσεν)
and (καί)

Meletius having faith (Πιστεύων Μελετίου) wrote this writing (Ἐγγράφατο τὴν γραφὴν τοῦτον) against me (με)
The period of national languages, coexisting but closed and deaf to each other, comes to an end. Languages threw light on each other: one language could, after all, see itself only in the light of another language.

Aesonian - (Ἀέσωνιανότης) (Aesop's) verse being a triple rhythm consisting of three feet followed by a spondee or a trochee (Aesopian)

Cantilenas - a lyrical vocal or instrumental melody in a composition.

Fumilatores - a supplement attached to the political section of French newspapers.

In ancient literature it is memory, and not knowledge, that serves as the source of power for the creative impulse.

In the era of Hellenism a closer contact with the heroes of the Iliad epic cycle began to be felt; epic is already being transformed into novel ... When the novel becomes the dominant genre, epistemology becomes the dominant discipline.

Plato - Apology

173 viag. Dervou ὑπὸς λέγειν. being such a powerful speaking

you had been that one in which I used to speak as to warn you
to be completely deceived
decide to be to warn you to be cautious

But that one of their, of their many, in which they said I used to speak so as to warn you

one whom I have not been deceived by me,

But that one of them that one in which that I used to say that being such a powerful speaker you should beware speaking such a powerful speaker, you should not be completely deceived by me,

being such a powerful speaker, for being such as you should not be completely deceived by me.
I myself should be
might be
to speak
speaking
when
not in any way
whatsoever should I myself be speaking mightily

when

terrible, fearful, dire, mighty, powerful

Tet, since as

Plate

Apology

that, because

or even

to begin with
forthwith

not to have been

for anything

that

for it had been (was not)
shameful (disgraceful) / which to
begin with they shall be
refuted by me in
that matter.

Whenever (EITEC SAV)
but not (nym)^

in any way whatsoever (OTWOTCIV)

they shall be refuted
forthwith by me

EPIXOY

ΕΙΠΟΝ ΕΕΕΛΕΓΧΩΤΟΚΑΤΕ

EITEC SAV

ΕΤΕΕΟΤΟΚΩ

ΣΕΝΟΙ ΑΓΓΕΛΨΙ

ΕΠΟΥΑΙ

ΣΑΡΑΜ ΑΙΟΝ

17B

οι σφαγεὶν οικοδομᾶτοι
And if on the other hand they saying that if I should agree should agree them if in fact am a rhetor.

εἰ μὲν γὰρ τοῦτο λέγοντος, ἐμμονεύω, ἐν ἔσιμης οὐ καὶ τούτως εἶναι ρήσεως.
Oů μεν οὖν Μή Δέλ, ὥσπερ
Ἀθηναῖοι, Κεκατείχθεντες γέλους,
ὡσπερ οι τούτοις, (175) ἡμιασία τε καὶ
ὀνόματον οǐδε, Κεκατείχθεντες

**Plato**

**Apology**

Oůςοι μὴν ὁσόν, ὥσπερ εἰς ἔργοι, ὃ
τε ἢ οὐδὲν ἀληθές (Ἐσφαλμός), ὑμεῖς
δὲ μονοίκοι ὑπὸ τίνος τῷ Ἀθηναῖο

Of me

**They say they argue**

**I have said**

On the other hand

**These men in fact,**

**even as I speak,**

either that which is true

or nothing true, and you

accept from me.

I shall hear the whole truth.
But you shall hear things spoken without plan which shall have hit the mark.
O Athenian men, how you, on the one hand, were affected by my accusers I know not, but I, on the other hand, had most certainly forgotten myself a little, since I used to speak so persuasively about them, and as yet they have said, so to speak, not one true thing. But most of all out of the same made me stand in awe of their very many lies was that one in which they said that I used to speak in such a way so as to warn you not to be completely deceived by me, as if to speak of being clever.

If I say that Protagoras or anyone else is an "awfully" wise man, he asks me if I'm not ashamed of calling that which is good "awful." (Scévov) As a term of praise and then he explains to me that the term "awful" is always taken in bad sense. (Protagoras, 3916)

The Dialogic Imagination  
M. M. Bakhtin

p. 15 The epic past is called the "absolute past" for good reason... It is walled off absolutely from all subsequent times.

p. 16 To destroy this boundary is to destroy the form of the epic as a genre... It is as closed as a circle; inside it everything is finished already over... Therefore also look on conclusions and finality, depriving itself, so to speak, of all rights and potential for a real continuation.

Let us move on to tradition.

Important here is not the fact that tradition is the factual source for the epic... Epic discourse is a discourse handed down by tradition... and does not permit an individual, personal point of view or evaluation.

p. 17 Epic Distance

p. 18 The three characteristics of the epic positioned by us above are, to a greater or lesser extent, also fundamental to the other high genres of classical ancient antiquity and the Middle Ages. (p. 13)
(1) absolute past (2) national tradition
(3) absolute epic distance,

The Epic genre was destroyed by polyglotism.

This absolute fusion and the consequent unfreedom of the subject was first overcome only with the arrival on the scene of an active polyglotism and interillumination of languages (and then the epic became a semiconventional, semi-serenely genre).

These events and heroes receive their value — and grandeur, precisely through this association with the past, the source of all authentic reality and value.

We must not forget that "absolute past" is not to be confused with time in our exact and limited sense of the word; it is rather a temporally valorized hierarchical category.

It is impossible to achieve greatness in one's own time. Greatness always makes itself known only to descendants, for whom such a quality is always located in the past (it turns into a distanced image); it has become an object of memory and not a living object that one can see and touch.

The Dialogic Imagination  M. M. Bakhtin

One may, and in fact one must, memorialize with artistic language only that which is well, of being remembered, that which should be preserved in the memory of descendants; an image is created for descendants, and this image is projected on to their sublime and distant horizon.

This idealization of the past in high genres has something of an official air.

The novel, however, is associated with the eternally living element of unofficial language and unofficial thought (holiday forms, familiar speech, profanation).

The dead are loved in a different way.... Language about the dead is stylistically quite distinct from language about the living.

p.13 1st edition
All these genres, permeated with the "serio-comical," are authentic predecessors of the novel.

At all novelistic works of antiquity, the term "novel" was, therefore, attached to the Greek novel alone.

Socratic dialogue

Even where the past or myth serves as the subject of representation in these genres, there is no epic distance.

It is precisely laughter that destroys the epic, and in general destroys any hierarchical (distancing and valorized) distance. As a distanced image, a subject cannot be comical; to be made comical, it must be brought close.

The plane of comic (humorous) representation is a specific plane in its spatial as well as its temporal aspect. Here the role of memory is minimal; in the comic world there is nothing for memory and tradition to do. One ridicules in order to forget. Laughter means abuse, and abuse could lead to blows.

The Dialogic Imagination

Basicallly, this is uncomniing: that is, the removal of an object from the distanced plane, the destruction of epic distance.

What takes place is a comic Akt in the Contemporary operation of dismemberment.

What reigns supreme here is the artistic logic of analysis, dismemberment, turning things into dead objects.

We possess a remarkable document that reflects the simultaneous birth of scientific thinking and of a "new artistic prose" model for the novel. These are the Socratic dialogues.

Apostrophes

Margo - fool

Characteristic also is the ambivalent self-praise in the Socratic dialogues. I am wiser than everyone, because I know that I know nothing.

Gene - type, or category
dialogue - 26k dialogos: the expression of an author's ideas by means of dialogue between two or more characters (Dialogism)

Diallogos of discourse

After all, the boundaries between fiction and non-fiction, between literature and non-literature and so forth are not laid up in heaven.

The novel may thus serve as a document for gauging the lofty and still distant destinies of literature, future unfolding.

p. 35 The epic and tragic hero is the hero who, by his very nature, must perish. Popular heroes, on the contrary, never perish.

p. 39 Therefore, the novelization of other genres does not imply their subjection to an alien canon; on the contrary, novelization implies their liberation from all that serves as a brake on their unique development.

p. 47 The language of the novel is a system of languages that mutually and ideologically indistinguishable each other.

p. 50 The basic tasks for a stylistics in the novel are therefore: the study of specific images of languages and styles; the organization of these images; their typology (for they are extremely diverse); the combination of images of languages within the novelistic whole; the transferences and switchings of languages and voices; their dialogical interrelationships.

In the prehistory of novelistic discourse one may observe many of these heterogeneous factors at work. From our point of view, however, two of these factors prove to be of decisive importance: one of these is laughter; the other, polyglossia (Ezra Pound). The most ancient forms for representing language were organized by laughter—these were, originally, jesting, more than the ridiculing of another's language and another's direct discourse. Polyglossia and the indistinguishability of languages associated with it elevated these forms to a new artistic and ideological level, which made possible the genre of the novel.
Parody

p 51  One of the most ancient and widespread forms for representing the direct word of another is parody.

p 52  All these parodies on genres and generic styles ("languages") enter the great and diverse world of verbal forms that ridicule the straightforward, serious, serious word in all its generic ways: genres. This world is very rich, considerably richer than we are accustomed to believe.

generic - (Lat. genus) characteristic of a class or group of things.

p 55  It is as if such mimicry tips the world away from its object, discloses the two, shown that a given straightforward generic word - epic or tragic - is recorded, broadcast, incapable of exhausting its object; the process of parodying forces us to experience those sides of the object that are not otherwise included in a given genre or a given style.

parody - imitation of a particular writer, artist, or genre with deliberate exaggeration for comic effect.
Are Athens objecting to the fact that Socrates is not an orator?

Are they trying to force him to become one in court?

Are cases in the Athenian courts decided on merit of oratorical skill as opposed to the merit of the case?

καὶ ἐν ἱκορᾷ ἐπὶ τῶν στατηρίων,

[in the agora at the money-changer tables]

καὶ ὃς καὶ ὃς ἐκρήκτος ἦλθεν,
Now this is the first time I've gone up to a Court of justice having come to be seventy years old.

Here is: 

*I ἴδου ἵνα ἔτυχῃ ἔν αὐτῷ. *

ηὗρος ἢ
unskilled

Ignorant, hold

Speaking, style.

*Εξει γὰρ οὐκετῶς.

gt it leas it
The Dialogic Imagination
M. H. Bakhtin

Parodic travesty: literature

too contradictory and heteroglot to be fit into a high and straight-forward genre. The high genres are monotonous, while the "south dome" and genres akin to it retain the ancient binary tone of the word.

The direct and serious word was revealed, in all its limitations and insufficiency, only after it had become the laughing image of that word... but it was by no means discredited in the process.

Mistaken in contradiction discredited.

Socrates because Socrates was neither an object of history nor of myth; nor of literature; but a living breathing man.

The dead image of Hercules,
Olympian, or Homer, Cannot (be warmed by a force).

* The satyrs\#blame the travesty works the play-

> 19th book of Athenaeus - phallopores and the diekaiotes (miners)
The Dialogic Imagination

M.M. Bakhtin

p. 57

It is worth remembering that the most primitive mime, that is, a wandering actor of the most banal sort, always had to possess, as a professional minimum, two skills: the ability to imitate the voice of birds and animals, and the ability to mimic the speech, facial expressions, and gesticulation of a slave, a peasant, a procurer, a scholastic, a pedant, and a foreigner.

p. 57

Parodied genres do not belong to the genius that they parody; that is, a parodied poem is not a poem at all.

all these forms are unified by virtue of their shared subject: language itself.

p. 59-60

Each separate element in it—parodic dialogue, scenes from everyday life, boulevards, etc.—is presented as if it were a fragment of some kind of unified whole. I imagine this whole to be something like an immense novel, multi-generic, multi-styled, mercilessly critical, soberly mocking, reflecting in all its fullness the heteroglossia and multiple voices of a given culture, people, and epoch.

p. 60

These parodic—travestying forms prepared the ground for the novel in the very important, in fact decisive, respect. They liberated the object from the power of language in which it had hitherto been entangled as if in a net; they destroyed the homogenizing power of myth over language; they freed consciousness from the power of the direct word, destroyed the thick walls that had imprisoned consciousness within its own discourse, within its own language.

A new mode developed for working creatively with language

p. 61

Only polyphony, fully free of consciousness, from the standpoint of its own language and its own myth of language, axiologically: (value, value, value) the study of value

p. 63

Roman literature at the outset was characterized by bilingualism. Three souls lived in the breast of Catullus... Greek, Osco, and Roman.
everything new is born out of the death of something old.

Two myths perish simultaneously: the myth of a language that presumes to be the only language, and the myth of a language that presumes to be completely unified.

Martial - "palestra Roma" (foot's cap)

Cento (Latin, patchwork), a poetic compilation made up of passages selected from the work of great poets of the past.


Parody has grown sickly; its place in modern literary literature is insignificant. We live, write, and speak today in a world of free and democratized language; the complex and multi-levelled hierarchy of discourses, forms, images, styles that used to permeate the entire system of official language and linguistic consciousness was swept away by the linguistic revolutions of the Renaissance.

The Dialogic Imagination M.M. Bakhtin

Virginia Hare

Helen Waddell, The Wandering Scholar (New York, 1929)

This is an extraordinarily learned work, stuffed with an incredible quantity of references, quotations from all possible authorities of the ancient world including some that never existed; in a number of cases, even the quotations themselves are parodic.

There is a description, for example, of a scholarly discussion lasting two weeks on the question of the vocative case of ego, that is, the vocative case of "I." Latin as a whole, Virgilius Grammaticus' work is a magnificent and subtle parody of the formalistic-grammatical thinking of late antiquity. It is grammatical Satyrnia, grammatica syllogica.

Characteristiclly, many medieval scholars apparently took this grammatical treatise completely seriously.
This is an already fully developed, intentionally dialogized bilingual (and sometimes trilingual) hybrid.

The very attempt of the Renaissance to establish the Latin language as all its classical purity inevitably transformed it into a dead language.

The Letters of Obscure People (Hellenic-Latin hybrid).

Chronotope - time-space

We will give the name chronotope (literally "time-space") to the intrinsic connectedness of temporal and spatial relationships that are artistically expressed in literature.

The Dialogic Imagination

Three basic types of novels developed in ancient times, and there are consequently three corresponding methods for artistic treatment: making time and space in these novels - in short, there were three novelistic chronotopes.

Heliadones, Achtiopico

Achilles Tatius, Lucippe and Cithofer

Chariton, Chares and Calliabo

Xenophon, Ephesiaca

Longus, Daphnis and Chloe

In these novels we find a subtle and highly developed type of adventure-time

Syncretism - the amalgamation of different religious, cultural, or school of thought

It goes without saying that such adventure-time lacks any childish, everyday, cycladic - such as might have introduced into it a temporal order and inherent indices on a human scale, tying it to the repetitive aspects of natural and human life. No matter where one goes in the world of Greek romance, with all its countries...
and cities, its buildings and works of art, there are no indications of historical time, no identifying traces of the era.

Quotidian - ordinary, mundane

extra-temporal hiatus - in this kind of time, nothing changes; the world remains as it was, the biographical life of the heroes does not change, their feelings do not change, people do not even age.

"Suddenly" and "just at just that moment"

"Suddenly" and "just at just that moment" best characterize this type of time.

Simultaneity and chance rupture.

Should something happen a minute earlier or a minute later, that is, should there be no chance simultaneity or chance disjunctions in time, there would be no plot at all, and nothing to write a novel about.

The Dialogic Imagination - M. M. Bakhtin

p. 94 There are no internal limits to this increase. For all the days, hours, minutes that are ticked off within the separate adventures are not limited into a real time series, they do not become the days and hours of a human life. These hours and days leave no traces, and therefore, one may have as many of them as one likes.

All moments of this infinite adventure-time are controlled by one force - chance.

Fate - (Tyche, Luck)

p. 95 All these "suddenly" and "at just that moment," cannot be foreseen with the help of analysis, study, wise forethought, experience, etc., alone. Such things are better understood through fortune-telling, omens, legends, charmed predictions, prophetic dreams and premonitions.

p. 97 motifs: meeting/parting (separation), loss/acquisition, search/discovery, recognition, re-identification and so forth. Inter alia, constellations elements into plots, not only of novels of various eras and types, but also into literary works of other genres: epic, dramatic, even lyric.
Chronotope (χρόνος τόπος) - time-space

- motif of meeting

[Handwritten note: in any meeting, the temporal marker (at one and the same time) is inseparable from the spatial marker (in one and the same place).

The inseparable unity of time and space markers (a unity without a merging) gives to the chronotope of meeting an elementary, almost mathematical character.

The adventure chronotope is thus characterized by a technical, abstract connection between space and time, by the irreversibility of moments in a temporal sequence, and by their interchangeability in space.

-p.98 The importance of the chronotope of the road in literature is immense; it is a rare work that does not contain a variation of this motif.

-p.100 The motif of meeting is one of the most universal motifs, not only in literature (it is difficult to find a work where this motif is completely absent) but also in other areas of culture and in various spheres of public and everyday life.

-p.101 The world of the Greek romance is an alien world; everything in it is indefinite, unknown, foreign.

Handwritten note: ineluctable - not to be avoided
Lucas, Theory of the Novel (1920)

Ian Watt, The Rise of the Novel (1957)

Lucien Holmanz, Toward a Sociology of the Novel (1975)

Rene Girard, Deceit, Desire and the Novel (1961)

(I) Romance (adventure novel) (Cicero and Cletophon)

(II) Adventure novel of everyday life (The Golden Ass)

Mixture of adventure-time with everyday time

(I) Metamorphosis

(II) The course of novel corresponds to actual novel

In ancient times, the idea of metamorphosis underwrote an extremely complex and multi-branched path of development. One of the branches on this path is Greek philosophy.

Another branch would be the entire development of the idea of metamorphosis (transformation) in ancient mysteries, especially the Eleusinian Mysteries. In the later stages of their development, these ancient mysteries increasingly succumbed to the influence of oriental cults, which had their own specific forms of metamorphosis.

The original forms of the Christian cult would be included in this line of development.

The Dialogic Imagination

M. M. Bakhtin

p. 12

A third branch would be the continuing presence of transformation motifs in orally popular folklore.

And finally, a fourth branch is the development of the idea of metamorphosis in literature proper.

p. 115

Metamorphosis or transformation is a mythological sheath for the idea of development—but one that unfolds not so much in a straight line as a spirally defined type of temporal sequence.

Replied: A specific genealogical series unfolding a distinctive sequence of shifts in ages and generations (the myth of the five ages: Golden, Silver, Bronze, Heroic, and Iron), an irreversible teleogenetic sequence of metamorphosis in nature, including the cyclical series of metamorphosis in nature for grain and an analogical series of metamorphosis in the vine of a grape.

Ovid

Apuleius, The Golden Ass
Metamorphosis serves as the basic for a method of portraying the whole of an individual's life. In its most important moments of crisis, it shows how an individual becomes other than what he was.

There is no evolution in the strict sense of the word; what we get, rather, is crisis and rebirth.

In early Christian crisis hagiographies, belonging to this type, we also have as a rule only two images of an individual, images that are separated and aligned through crisis and rebirth: the image of the sinner (before rebirth) and the image of the holy man or saint (after crisis and rebirth).

As a rule (towards) purification through suffering.

But these moments shape the definitive image of the man, his essence as well as the nature of his entire subsequent life.

What is emphasized here is Lucius' individual guilt, which delivered him over to the power of chance ("blind fate").

The Dialogic Imagination M. M. Bakhtin

Thus, the entire adventure sequence must be interpreted as punishment and redemption, guilt → punishment → redemption → blissfulness.

This entire sequence is grounded in individual responsibility.

The most characteristic thing about this novel is the way it fuses the course of an individual life (at its major turning points) with this actual spatial course of road — that is, with his wanderings. Thus is realized the metaphor "the path of life."

Thus, this novelistic chronotope of the road is specific, organic, and deeply infused with folkloric motifs.

The concreteness of this chronotope of the road permits everyday life to be localized within it.

Lucius is a private man, Socrates a public one.

The public man always lives and acts in the world, and each moment of his life, in principle and in essence, will avail...
itself to being made public. Public life and private life are by their very essence open, visible, and audible.

Lucius is voyeuristic.

"How's it going?" Not too bad. I'm still alive.

Every day on this side is a good day."

Is it? Some people are counting on going to a better place. That guy over there, planning evidently, on going to a worse one.ocrates said he didn't know.

The literature of private life is essentially a literature of looking about, of over-hearing "how others live." Self-revelation. Apology.

The significance of legal--criminal categories in the novel, and the various ways they are used—as to specific forms for uncovering and making private life public—is an interesting and important problem in the history of the novel.

"In fact, just as if I happened to be in fact, just as if in this (EYV), in that manner also, just as (like) (LOTTERP), in that manner also, just as if I happened to be in that manner.

In fact, just as if in this (EYV), in that manner also, just as if I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be. I happened to be.
καθενος ὡς τυχεῖν (certainly it is just as if)

As a matter of fact, (as if)
it is as if (καθενος ... ὡς τυχεῖν)
I happened to be, (as if I used to be) (καθενος ὡς τυχεῖν)
being a foreigner, (καθενος ὡς τυχεῖν)

Of course (ὅτι τινά),
you used to agree (καθενος ὡς τυχεῖν)

since I used to be a stranger.

I suppose you would agree with me, if, in speaking the language and in the manner,
they who raised me used to speak.

and spoke (τά καταστάσεις)
by whom (καθενος)
by the custom (τά καταστάσεις)
I had been raised
they used to speak (καθενος)
(καθενος)
by whom (καθενος)
I had been raised
(καθενος)
I should be permitted to speak, since it is equally worse whether it be for the worse or for the better.

Plate

Apology

Kai σή καί θέως ἐπετύχω ὑμῶν

Σέκας,

1st sing. pres. m/p end

Σέω, to beg something from someone

I beg of you this just thing at least

1st sing. pres. act. ind/ subj. Sokew

when when

when

when

so I should at least expect this for me
for it is the same excellence that of a judge and an orator to speak truths:

And it is the same thing to contemplate and to hold (focus) the mind with it.

whether I speak great things or not.
Thereafter, then, Hecapion. So much for...

ἔτεις, δέ προς ταῦτα ἠκρότητα καὶ  
τούτος (188) ἠκρότητα.

hand with respect to the latter things.

and the latest men.

'Εμοὶ γὰρ Τολύχος Ἀνθρώπου ἐστὶν ἐστὶν  
Πρὸς ὑμᾶς ἔτι.

for most of my accusators have become with respect to you.

first things

accusing me with lies

and the first accusators.
Kαί περ, έντεν καὶ τούτων δεσμώς;

They are clever

and though

Plato

καὶ Πολυδωρῶν τίτλων (πολλά λέγει ἐκατ.
καὶ οὐκέν ἐλθῆς λέγοντες;

and long ago

already many years

and saying not one thing true

καὶ εἰσὶ χρονίων ἐφαυλεῖς

καὶ οὐκέν ἐλθῆς λέγοντες;

cous, οὐκέν ἐλθῇς λέγοντες,

those men

I am very afraid of those men

I am very afraid of those men

more than (am) anytune

more than (am) anytune
And they used to accuse me.

Adv. neut. sing. & 

Thus: there is this 
Socrates, a wise 
man

adj. neut. sing. &

not forgotten

m. rom. pl. 
those men

terrible man

They used to take your care... many of you a child to 

mislead you
These men of Athens,
spread the rumour
that my accusers...
So then there are those many accusers and have accused already accused many times.

for they themselves held that hearing things philosophically investigated not acknowledging the gods.
Some of you being children and boys
young men
unfairly accusing
without any defense
and yet (still)
at that age
your word
most exceedingly trusted
speaking to your
speaking to you (έχοντες τίπος ὑμᾶς)
in that
you most exceedingly trusted
Plato

184c  'O de πάντως ἀληθέστερον ὅτε οὐδὲ

ἐπὶ (188) οὐδεμίαν οἶδαν ἐκ τῶν ἔρωτών

ἐκδηλῶσας καὶ ἐκτιθέντος

πρὸς ἀκτ. ἁρμ. ὦ, ὧν to know

ἀπὸ ἀκτ. ἁρμ. ὦ ἐκτίθη to name

mention

and without lesson

for anything

the names of themselves

to have known

and had mentioned

but had not mentioned their names.
All the same, let it on the one hand be, in a way pleasing to God, and, on the other hand, according to custom, be persuasive and defensive. Now we should take up this accusation from the beginning, it is from this whither indeed my slander came to be and Meletus having faith wrote this writing against me. Well, what indeed is the slandering they are saying?

Whereas there certainly is need to know the oath of the accusers well: "Socrates is a wrongdoer and a busybody seeking after things under the Earth and in the skies and makes the weaker argument stronger and teaches the same things to others."

The Dialogic Imagination

M. M. Bakhtin

p. 126 The philosophy of the third person in light of private life. This is the philosophy of a person who knows only private life and devotes it alone, but one who does not participate in it, who has no place in it — and therefore sees it in sharp focus as a whole in all its nakedness, playing out all its roles but not fusing his identity with any one of them.

p. 127 The only cyclical time known to ancient literature was an idealized, agricultural, everyday time, one interwoven with the times of nature and myth (the basic stages of its development are Hesiod, Theocritus, and Virgil).

Phasis – relating to or preoccupied with vitality.

incultability –
Ancient Biography and Autobiography

p130 At the heart of these ancient forms lies a new type of biographical time and a human image constructed to new specifications, that of an individual who passes through the course of a whole life.

(I) Plutonic: the Apology and Phaedo
At its heart lies the Chronotope of "the life course of one seeking true knowledge."

p131 Socrates' life course, as it is revealed to us in the Apology, is a public and rhetorical expression of the same metamorphosis.

(II) Rhetorical autobiography and biography

- Erotemes - glowing and warmly enthusiastic praise.

The form of the encomium also determined the first autobiography of ancient times, the advocacy speech of the Attic orator Isocrates.

This real-life Chronotope is constituted by the public space (the agora).

The Dialogic Imagination

p132 Here the individual is open on all sides, he is all surface, there is in him nothing that exists for his sake alone, nothing that could not be subjected to public control and evaluation. Everything here, down to the last detail, is entirely public.

For the classical Greek, every aspect of existence could be seen and heard. In principle (in essence) he did not know an invisible and mute reality.

All this - that is, his entire life - could exist only if manifested externally, in audible or visible form. Plato, for example, understood thought as a conversation that a man carries on with himself (the Theaetetus, the Sophist). The concept of silent thought first appeared only with the mystics, and this concept had its roots in the Orient.

p135 To be exterior meant to be for others, for the collective, for one's own people.

In following epochs, man's image was distorted by his increasing participation in the mute and invisible spheres of existence. He was literally drenched in muteness and invisibility. And with...
All these men there is have no way out

And how great does the jealousy and slander assay gape
you were persuaded and these men having been persuaded persuaded others.
in fact you thought

In fact you saw fit
does not speak it though

just as I say

be resolved I say

you therefore be resolved I say

2nd pl. act ind think, deem worthy

Certainly in fact

AELWΩZE ΟÙV KAI οίμαζ, οίμηπε ἔξω

Lεψαλ ΣΙΣΕΔΥΣ ΜΟΥ ΗΟΥ ΚΩΝΣΕΡΑΟΥΣ

XVΣΟΒΕΡΧΣ

1st nom. pl. just as, like

2nd nom. pl. just as, like

in fact you thought

just like I say

In fact you saw fit
does not speak it though

just as I say

be resolved I say

you therefore be resolved I say

But necessity

and to some degree nobody

to answer

to shadow

defending myself

Plato

188 ἀλλ' ὄνσαξ οὐκ ὀκακεῖν οὐσίατι

ἐπερρύχθη οἵτιονον τοὺς μεν αἰττολογούμενον οὐ ΚΑΙ

Ἐλέγχειν ἡ ἙΙΔΟΣ ὁ ΑΤΤΙΚΟΠΟΙΕΙΝΟΥ.

προς. act. inf.

ὥστε ἀλλότρια

my accounts have become two-fold

double, two-fold

my accounts

just as as

nobody

just as as

like

just as as

nobody

just as as

nobody

m/f. acc. pl. unskilled

my m/f. acc. pl. unskilled
The Dialogic Imagination

M. M. Bakhtin

p.135

them entered loneliness. The personal and detached human being — 'the man who exists for himself' — lost the unity and wholeness that had been a product of public origin. Once having lost the popular chronotope of the public square, his self-consciousness could find an equally real, unified whole chronotope; it therefore broke down and lost its integrity. It became abstract and idealistic.

p.136

In the prodigies, that is, in the auguries of a man's fate — his separate acts and undertakings as well as his life as a whole — individualized and personal elements indiscernibly fuse with state and public elements.

The state takes no steps without having first read the omens.

p.137

And furthermore, consequences of self in this context is not revealed to some general "someone," but rather to a specific circle of readers, the readers of one's works.
entelechy (Aristotle) —

(1) energetic biography (energía) — the full existence, the essence of a man is realized not by his condition, but by his activity, his active force ("energy"). This energy manifests itself as the unfolding of his character in deeds and statements.

The manifestations themselves constitute the character's being.

The greater the power of self-expression, the fuller the being.

Therefore human life (bios) and character may no longer be portrayed by means of an analytical enumeration of the character's logical qualities of the man (his vices and virtues).

One must portray him by means of his deeds, his speeches and other expressions of the man. (Plutarch)

Character is predetermined and may be disclosed only in a single definable direction: historical reality itself, in which the disclosure of character takes place, serves merely as a means for the disclosure, it provides in words and deeds a vehicle for those manifestations of character: but historical

The Dialogic Imagination  M. M. Bakhtin

reality in deprived of any determining influence on character as such, it does not shape or create it, it merely manifests it. Historical reality is an arena for the disclosing and unfolding of human characters — nothing more.

(II) analytic biography

what governs from the outset is the whole of the character (Suetonius).

In the area of autobiography as well, we get in ancient times only the beginning of the process by which a man and his life become private. New forms for the autobiographical expression of a singular self-consciousness were therefore not developed.

modifications

(1) the ironic: Horace, Ovid, Propertius

(2) drawing-room rhetoric: Cicero’s letters to Atticus

(3) the personal: Cicero’s, Consolation, & Horatius; later on Augustine, Boethius, and Petrarch. Seneca’s letters, Marcus Aurelius, To Myself.
This is a new relationship to one's own self, to one's own particular "I"—with no witness, without any concessions to the voice of a "third person," whoever it might be.

Historical Inversion and the Folktale Chronotope

This distinctive feature manifests itself preeminently in what might be called a historical inversion. The essence of this inversion is found in the fact that mythological and artistic thinking locate such categories as purpose, ideal, justice, perfection, the harmonious condition of man and society and the like in the past.

To put it in somewhat simplified terms, we might say that a thing that could never and in fact must only be realized exclusively in the future is here portrayed as something out of the past.

In order to endow any ideal with authenticity, one had only conceive of it as once having existed in the "natural state" in some golden age, or—perhaps existing in the present but somewhere at the other end of the world, east of the sun and west of the moon, if not on earth then underground, if not underground then in heaven.

There is a greater readiness to build a superstructure for reality (the present) along a vertical axis of upper and lower than to move forward along the horizontal axis of time.

Another form that exhibits a like relationship to the future is eschatology. Here the future is emptied out in another way. The future is perceived as the end of everything that exists, as the end of all being.

The fantastic in folklore is a realistic fantastic: in no way does it exceed the limits of the real.

Such a fantastic relies on the real—possibilities of human development—possibilities not in the sense of a program for immediate practical action, but in the sense of the needs and possibilities of men, those eternal demands of human nature that will not be denied. These demands will remain forever, as long as there are men; they will not be surprised, they are real, as real as human nature itself, and therefore sooner or later they will force their way into full realization.
to, towards

καὶ ὅσιοι

Selv ἔπος ἐκέκρυσ

προύστομ με ἀπολογισθ σου

dot m/p sing

éστη ἐκέκρυσ

that person

2nd pl. act. pass.

subj. expec

to suppose, imagine

there is need

to need

to the ones

who first accused me

first

and you should have thought

been imagined

Plato

18d ἔτερος μεν τοὺς ἐπικαθηγοροῦντας,

ἔτερος ἐσί (18ε) τοὺς τιμῶν οὓς ἐξις

ἐξέσῳ,

m. acc. pl.

act. act. part

καθηγοροῦντας

Adv.

long ago

on the one hand

there are many present

accusers. On the other

there are those long ago.
Well! there is need for a defense. (one to defend)
O men of Athens,
and one must attempt to deliver (defend)
for you the that slander for you
in what they had much time in what
this
is little time

Well! O men of Athens, there is a need for a defense
and one must attempt to deliver one to you
for your slander (κακάν... τίνος ἀθάνατον) and one must attempt to deliver one to
that in which you had much time in merely a little time.
if it were better
both for you
and for me,
and it has been
made more difficult
for me

and yet which
is makes it
more difficult
for me

Certainly
I might be willing (might wish)
for this to be become so

on the one hand, I might certainly wish it
to thus be

Plato
Apologetics

19α

Certainly
I might wish
So be it.

On the one hand, so be it in name, a manifest, pleasing to God.

All the same, let it be, on the one hand, pleasing to God and, on the other hand, persuasive and defensive, according to custom.

But I think it to be difficult and it is not altogether the sort of thing taken lightly.
Harold North Fowler, 1966

In Aristophanes' comedy, a satyr being carried about these, proclaiming that he was walking on air and uttering a great deal of other nonsense, about which I know nothing, either much or little. And I say this, not to cast discredit upon such knowledge, if anyone is wise about such matters (may I never have to defend myself against Merton on so grand a change as this)—but I mean of those have nothing to do with these things.

Harmonieworth (1984)

It runs something like this. You have seen it play the play the play. Socrates, who does not know about these things, is walking on air, and uttering a great deal of other nonsense about things of which I know nothing whatsoever.

B. Jones (1982)

Such is the nature of the accusation: it is just what you have yourselves seen in the Comedy of Aristophanes, who has introduced a man whom he calls Socrates, going about saying that he walks on air, a talking a great deal of nonsense concerning matters of which I do not pretend to know either much or little.

F. J. Church (1945)

That is what they say. And in the Comedy of Aristophanes you yourselves saw a man called Socrates walking in a basket and saying that he walked on air, and sputtering a great deal of nonsense about matters of which I understand nothing at all.

The Dialogic Imagination

H. M. Bakhtin

pp. 156-157

Dante

He structures a picture of the world remarkable for its architecture—a world that has its life and movement tensely strung along a vertical axis: nine circles of Hell beneath the earth, seven circles of Purgatory above them and above that ten circles of Paradise. Below, a rude materiality of people and things; above, only the light and the voice. The temporal logic of this vertical world consists in the sheer simultaneity of all that occurs (or "the coexistence of everything in eternity"). Everything that on earth is divided by time, here, in this vertically, coalesces into eternity into pure simultaneous coexistence.

Only under conditions of pure simultaneity... can there be revealed the E T U R I... meaning of "that which was, and which is, and which shall be."

p. 158 After Dante, the most profound and consistent attempt to erect such a verticality was made by Dostoevsky.
Εἴρνυ: ἐν οἷς ἀνεξίτηλοι πράσαν ὅσιοι καταρρίφοντες, ὅποιος ἂν κατηρήσῃ τὴν ἀνυμοστίαν τὴν ἀναγνώσας αὐτῶν:

1. ἐκ ἀρκετοῦ πάντως σκηνοθέτου
2. ὅσιοι κατηρήσῃ τὴν ἀνυμοστίαν
3. ἀνεξίτηλοι πράσαν ὅσιοι

**Plato**

19a. Ἀνεξίτηλοι πράσαν ὅσιοι κατηρήσῃ τὴν ἀνυμοστίαν τὴν ἀναγνώρισας αὐτῶν

**Apology**

New we should take up this accusation from the beginning.

εἰς ὅσιον πράσαν ὅσιοι κατηρήσῃ τὴν ἀνυμοστίαν.
The Dialogic Imagination

M. M. Bakhtin

In the Middle Ages, this literature of the Negroes of society, features three prominent types. Not merely significant for the historical development of the European feudal. These figures are the rogue, the clown, and the fool. Of course, they are not merely sense and board figures; both classical antiques the ancient Orient were familiar with them. If one were to drop a historical sounding lead into these artistic images, it would not touch bottom in any of them - they are that deep.

The rogue, the clown, and the fool create around themselves their own special little world, their own chronotope.

These figures carry with them into literature first a total connection with the theatrical trappings of the public stage.
with their role, and outside this role
they simply do not exist.

Hypocrisy and falsehood characterize all human
relationships. The healthy "natural" functions
of human nature are fulfilled, so to speak.
Only in ways that are contraband and savage,
because the reigning ideology will not sanction
them. This introduces falsehood and duplicity
into all human life. All ideological forms,
that is, institutions, become hypocritical
and false, while real life, denied any ideological
directives, becomes crude and bestial.

Prosac - Prosac allegorization

The Rabelaisian Chronicle

Gargantua and Pantagruel
Harold North Foote, 1926

[90] And I affirm on oath, most of you who are present, and I shall, and all of you who are present, that no one of you who are present, or any one, shall be heard me talking much or little about such matters. And from this you will perceive that such are also the other things that the rashmade say about me.

But if it be true that there are such as are too base to say anything about me, there are many who are not.

Hornchurchworth (1954)

What is more, I call upon the greater part of you as witnesses to my statement, and I appeal to all of you who have ever listened to me talking—and there are a great many to whom this applies—to clear your neighbors' minds on this point. Tell them another whether any one of you has ever heard me discuss such questions briefly or at length, and then you will realize that the other popular reports about me are equally unreliable.

B. Jowett (1892)

Very many of those here present are witnesses of the truth of this, and to them I appeal. Speak then, you who have heard me, and tell your neighbors whether any of you have ever heard me hold forth in a few words or in many upon such matters. You have their answer. And from what they say of this part of the charge you will be able to judge of the truth of the rest.

F. D. Church (1948)

Almost all of you are witnesses of this. I beg all of you who have ever heard me discussing, and they are many, to inform your neighbors and tell them if any of you have ever heard me discussing such matters at all. That will show you that the other common statements about me are false as this one.

The Future of an Illusion

Sigmund Freud

p.5 The less a man knows about the past and the present, the more insecure must prove his judgment of the future.

p.4-5 Human civilization, by which I mean all those respects in which human life has raised itself above itself its animal status and differs from the life of beasts.

p.6 It includes on the one hand all the knowledge and capacity that men have acquired in order to control the forces of nature and exact its wealth for the satisfaction of human needs, and, on the other hand, all the regulations necessary in order to adjust the relations of men to one another and especially the distribution of the available wealth.

p.7 An individual man can himself come to function as wealth in relation to another one, in so far as the other person makes use of his capacity for work, or chooses him as a sex object.

p.8 It seems rather that every civilization must be built up on coercion and renunciation of instinct.
One has, I think, to reckon with the fact that there are present in all men destructive and therefore anti-social and anti-cultural, trends and that in a great number of people these are strong enough to determine their behavior in human society.

This psychological fact has a decisive importance for our judgment of human civilization.

The Future of an Illusion

Fried

The first step is to distinguish between privations which affect everyone and privations which do not affect everyone but only groups, classes, or even single individuals. The former are the earliest.

We have found to our surprise that these privations are still operative and still form the kernel of hostility to civilization.

There are a class of people, the neurotics, who already react to these frustrations with anti-social behavior. Among these instinctual wishes are those of incest, cannibalism, and lust for killing.

It is in keeping with the course of human development that external coercion gradually becomes internalized; for a special mental agency, man's super-ego, takes it over and excludes it among its commandments.

There are countless civilized people who would shrink from murder or incest but who do not deny themselves the satisfaction of their drives, their aggressive urges or their sexual lusts, and who do not hesitate to injure other people by lies, fraud, and calumny, so long as they can remain unpunished for it.
Saying things and walking on air and talking a lot of other nonsense
Kai οὐκ ἦτο ἀκατάστασιν λέγειν εἰνήν
cadaquē eticētjum,

thus

the
knowledge
such as that
(this)

and Ίδενγα
I say this.
not to disparage
knowledge such
as this

and ὑπογείες
I say these.
not to make small
knowledge such

about which
neither small nor big

I shall
not by any means

If this is anyone wise about such matters

so far (καοράτοι)

not by any means

if anyone is wise about such matters

for otherwise for me

not that I would wish to avoid Meletus' judgment on account of those things

Omen of Athens

otherwise there is nothing it is to me

Apology

εἰς τὰς Περὶ τῶν τοιούτων μορφὰς

about such matters

P. Plato
As you know, you ever heard how great is my dialogue?

And I think furthermore (selfishly) produce the many of you and I shall hold you other to account to teach and to show.
Περί (ζῶν οὐκότως) διαλέγομεν

Of this kind of dialogue?

καὶ ἐκ τούτου γνώσιμον διαλέγομεν
καὶ εἰς τὸ πόλεμον
συνεργόν τον διὰ τὸν θρόνον

 сотι γραφεν ζων έμοι και οι πόλεοι
λέγοντεν

And from this
you shall learn
that the such
things are otherwise
and if

And these are
many of you
such as these
now you show
one another
if ever either
small or big
it was heard
anyone of you

Any point out, (imp) indicate show

If anyone of you
has ever heard
anything either
either a little
or a lot
from one

Apology
Plato
196 - Τολούχος δὲ γιὰ τάν οὖ τοιούτος εἶναι—

ἡμίκρον οὐδὲ μέγαν ἢ κατοικεῖν ἕκαστον μίμον

Εμοί

2nd pl. prec. act
ind & praes, point out, (imp) indicate show

Anything like that
is in apposition
w/ διαλέγομεν
when it seems to one to be
a beautiful thing
if someone might be so great
to teach men
like Thales,
Pythagoras of Samos,
and Hippasus of Elis.

for it is otherwise
and that nothing like
these other things
and in no way, if
you have heard such things,
and I teaching you
men for wages and
of transacting for money,
in no way is that true.

when at least at any rate

Apology

otherwise
plato

added yap oūè τούς οὗδεν οὗδεν εστεν,
οὗδε γ' ει τας βραχύκοιτε ιπς εγὼ
to teach
3rd sing. pres./imp.
act. -ειν
2nd sing. pres.
m/p ind
30 kei

otherwise
and not
nothing

Etēc kei tōutō de moj dōke kekōv
Eννέα, ει τε τις oδα σκεπή

Otherwise

et. might be

like

3rd sing. pres./imp.
act. -ειν

otherwise

and not

nothing

by Plato

196
Protagoras

Plato

309a I know that you have been chasing the prime of youth—the prime of youth of Alcibiades.

he had got a beard like a man— and he is a man... But I thought he was still very charming.

(b) What of his beard? Are you not of Homer's opinion, who says: "Youth is most charming when the beard first appears?" (Hied, XXYV, 348)

(c) For surely you cannot have discovered a fairer look elsewhere than he is.

Yes, much fairer.

And is not the wiser always the fairest?

(d) Any rather, with the wearest of all living mean, if you are willing to accord that title to Protagoras.

310a I suppose that he will make a Sophist of me?

(α) You are going to commit your soul to the care of a man whom you call a Sophist. And yet I should think you know what a Sophist is: and if not,
then you do not even know to whom
you are committing your soul and whether
the thing to which you commit yourself
be good or evil.

(d) In what branch of wisdom is the Sophist
knowledgeable?

The proceeds over the art which makes men
eloquent.

313a Well, but are you aware of the danger which
you are running in submitting your soul
to him?

314a There is a far greater risk in buying
knowledge than in buying food and drink.

(b) You cannot buy knowledge and carry it
away in another vessel; when you have
paid for it you must receive it into
the soul and go your way, either greatly
harmed or greatly benefited.

(d) And I think that the doorkeeper
doorkeeper, who was a reason-and who
was probably annoyed at the gait instead
of the Sophists, must have heard us.

(b) Protagoras

Plato

315b He was like Orpheus, charming them with his voice;
and they followed his spell.

Nothing delighted me more than the spectacle
of this chorus and the punctilious care they
took never to get into Protagoras'. But
whenever he and those who were with
him turned back, then the band of 

(c) Fortunate, parted regularly on either side,
wheeling around, and took their places behind
him in perfect order.

After him, as Homer says, "I lifted up my eyes
and saw" (Odyssey, XI. 601)

(d) Also "my eyes behold Tantalus" for Proclus
the class was at Athens, too (Odyssey, XI. 58a)

316a I was very anxious to hear what Proclus
was saying, for he seems to me to be
an all-wise and inspired man.

(c) Thank you, Socrates, for your consideration of
me. For certainly a foreigner finding his
way into great cities, and persuading the
flower of youth in them to leave the
company of others, kinmen or strangers,
old or young, and live with him, under
the idea that they will be improved by
This association with him, ought to be very cautious. Great jealousies are aroused by his proceedings, and he is the subject of many enmities and conspiracies. Now the art of the sophist is, as I believe, of great antiquity, but in ancient times those who practiced it, fearing this odium, veiled and disguised themselves under various names. Some under those of poets, as Homer, Hesiod, and Simonides; some of the mystic initiates and prophets, as Orpheus and Musaeus.

Protagoras

Young man, if you associate with me, on the very first day you will be in a position to return home a better man than you came, and better on the second day than on the first, and better every day than you were on the day before.

Socrates

I do not at all wonder at hearing you

Protagoras

318b Say this: even at your age, and with all your wisdom, if anyone were to teach you what you did not know before, you would become better, no doubt.

(d) When you say that on the first day on which Protagoras associates with Protagoras he will return home a better man, and on every day will grow in like manner—in what, Protagoras, will he be better, and about what?

(c) If he comes to me, he we will learn only that which he comes to learn.

319a Is your meaning that you teach the art of politics, and, that you promise to make men good citizens?

That, Socrates, is exactly the profession which I make.

you possess a noble art, indeed, if you really do possess it. Yet I will freely confess to you, Protagoras, that I have a doubt whether this art is capable of being taught.

Protagoras - the executive committee of the Council of Five Hundred.
it is possible for them

if they want

to have dealings with

any of their fellow citizens.

3rd pl. their fellow citizens

3rd pl. their
citizens

it is possible

3rd sing. pre.

act. past.
say

Boule

so wish

Apology

Τοις κυρίων γυμνά Εκκορως, τίς τειχεῖς, οίκος τε.

Εὐτώς λαβὼν εἰς ἐκκορωσίαν τοὺς πολέμους

τούς θεοὺς

οἰκονόμοι τῶν

of the many

the young men

each of these men.

O men, do go in. 

he goes into
[The people and that I make money by it, that is not true either. Although this also seems to me to be a fine thing, if one might be able to reach people, as Georgias of Lemnai and Proclus of Cos, and Hippocrates of Ephes, for each of these men, gentlemen, is able to go into any of the cities and persuade the young men, who can associate for nothing with whomsoever they wish among their own fellow citizens,

These men (COUTOUS & PIECBOUCO) persuade these men (EKEVUW) to have sexual intercourse (TAS OUVEUWAS) with a teacher.

These men (COUTOUS) persuade these men (PIECEBOUCO) for themselves to have sexual intercourse with a teacher, giving money and being grateful besides.

shaving left for them (APOLICKEVEUS OPIICCU) to have dealings (OUVEVU).

They give money (XEBUKOD OPEBOCRA) and are grateful besides (XBEIC TROHEKEVINER).

[Diagram of words and connections, possibly showing grammatical relationships or analytic notes.]

They persuade those people for sexual intercourse to give them money to keep the company with them, and to be grateful besides.
Ἐπεὶ ὁ Ποσειδώνα καὶ Ἀθηνᾶς τῷ Ἰππόκαρν ἐνδέχεται τοὺς εἰς Ἰούλιον τοὺς τετέλεσθε σωφρονεῖται πλὴκτον ἐκ Ἵλιδον τούτον οἱ ἄλλοι, Καλλία τῷ Ἰπποκάρνῳ τοῦ τετέλεσθε οὐν ἀντικείμενον—καὶ τῶν ἀντίκειμεν ἦν εἰς ἴσου. "Εἰ μὲν σοι τῷ τείχῳ ἡμῶν ἐγείροντο, εἰς ἀντίκειμεν ἐπιτάσσετο λαβεῖν καὶ μαθήσονται δὲ ἠμέλλεται σύνων καὶ ἑαυτῷ ἐπέβαλλε τῷ ἐκαστῷ

---

368  Conj.  after that, since, when.
369  Adj.  name.  nom.  sing.  other another.
370  Adj.  name.  nom.  sing.  Pouschi.
371  Adj.  thither.  thither.
372  Prs.  ἤπερχομολογεῖν.  acc.  sing.  of did.  ἦν.
373  1st sing.  ἑπετείχερα.  mid.  past.  ind.  to perceive by the mind, understand. hear, learn.
374  name.  acc.  sing.  ἤπερχομελολογείπα.  pass.  part.  of ἤπερχομολογεῖν.  to be at home, live at home; come home from foreign lands.
375  1st sing.  προπροφέρεται.  acc.  ant.  mid.  prep.  to meet by chance, meet with, fall in with a person.
376  name.  nom.  sing.  name.  acc.  part.  of ἤπερχομολογεῖν.  to come or go to.
377  name.  dat.  sing.  of ὁμολογεῖν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
378  name.  dat.  pl.  of ἤπερχομολογεῖν.  master of one's craft, expert.  ἠσπαζόμενος.
379  Adj.  neut.  pl.  of ἐκαστός.  more, larger.
380  Conj.  or, than.
381  Adj.  name.  nom.  pl.  of ἀκούομεν.  all together, all at once; the whole.
382  Carls aion τοῦ Ἑλληνικοῦ.
383  Adj.  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to perceive.
384  1st sing.  ant.  mid.  of ἀκούομεν.  to perceive, to question.
385  ἀκούομελολογεῖπα.  pass.  ant.  of ἀκούομελολογείπα.  to be at home, live at home; come home from foreign lands.
386  name.  dat.  sing.  of ἐκαστός.
387  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to be at home, live at home; come home from foreign lands.
388  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
389  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
390  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
391  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
392  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
393  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
394  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
395  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
396  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
397  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
398  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
399  name.  acc.  sing.  of ἀκούομεν.  to complete, accomplish, and generally, to execute, perform.
them found cities; but when they were gathered together, having no art of government, they dealt unjustly with one another.

* Zeus sent Hermes to mankind and Zeus commanded him to distribute justice and reverence to all.

(d) "To all," said Zeus, "I should like them all to have a share; for cities cannot exist if a few only have a share in justice and reverence, as in the arts. And further, make a law by my order, that he who has no part in reverence and justice shall be put to death, for he is a plague of the state."

323b They say that all men ought to profess justice, whether they are just or not, and that a man is out of his mind who says anything else. Their notion is that a man must have some degree of justice, and that if he has none at all he ought not to be in human society.

(c) They do not conceive this virtue to be given by nature, or to grow spontaneously, but to be a thing which is taught, and which comes to a man by taking pains. No one would instruct, no one would teach or

Plato

329a If you will think, Socrates, of what punishment can be for the soul that is worldly, you will see at once that in the opinion of mankind virtue may be acquired.

(b) He punishes for the sake of prevention, hereby clearly implying that virtue is capable of being taught.

327d Eurybius and Phrynichus

(e) Do you not yourself believe that what is studied, and the reason is that all men are teachers of virtue, each one according to his ability.

328a there would be no difficulty in finding a teacher of those who are wholly ignorant.

(b) I give my pupils their money's worth and seven more, as they themselves confess. And therefore I have introduced the following mode of payment. When a man has been my pupil, if he so desires he pays me.
price, and if he does not, he has only to go into a temple and take the oath of the value of the instruction, and he pays no more than he declares to be their value. (Cf. Anax. Fellw, Hetos Nights 5.10)

328d When the truth dawned upon me that he had finished, not without difficulty, I began to collect myself.

(c) I used to imagine that no human care could make men good.

337c several times while you were speaking, justice, and self-control, and piety; and all these qualities were described by you as if they could be lumped together into one thing, we namely, virtue.

Tell me exactly whether virtue is one whole, of which justice and self-control and piety are parts; or whether all these are only names of one and the same thing.

* They are all parts of one whole.

331a Do you maintain that one part of virtue is unlike another?

(c) Let us assume, if you will, that justice is pious and that piety is just.

331a Impartiality is not the same as equality.

Plato

332c that which is done in the same way is done by the same; and that which is done in opposite way, by opposite?

333d Some men are self-controlled, and yet unjust?

335a I have heard, I said, that you can speak and teach others to speak about the same things at such length that words never seem to fail, or with such brevity that the one could use fewer of them.

336b Discussion is one thing, and making an oration is quite another.

Alcibiades: Our friend Socrates admits that he cannot make a speech—in this he yields the palm to Protagoras.

(c) Now if Protagoras will make a similar admission, and confess that he is inferior to Socrates in argumentation, argumentative skill.

(c) Impartiality is not the same as equality.
for a met
with a man
who has more
money on
Sophists than
all the others.
Combined, Callias
son of Hippocrates

"Etetei kai liphos (ανηποτε) ecce Tithias"
"εναντια των εκ των Παρια"#
εσται
εσται
έστοις

Apology

And I heard that (πέραν τού θυσίου)
After that
there was another wise
man, a Persian,
Alexio has arrived (ευ... ἐμεθύμονε)
from foreign lands.
We would title them, have to have seized them and having seized a man (kai μετ' οὐρανος-θεος oys) do set over them intending to make them honor the honorable and good.

So I questioned this man, for he has two sons himself. And I said "O Callias, if your two sons had behaved (turned out to be) come to be puppies or calf.

Plato

2ος ζωτον ουν αναγομαι - ηκοτον γαρ "Η καλλίν, ην δ' εξω, "Ει μεγ ουν τε ου ετή ημών αμο-καυ

Eγενετονυ, 1ος σιγ. αετ. mid. ind. ανεπομμενον question

3ος dual act. mid ind. εγκαταμενον question

m acc. sing 3 ουτος
And there is also another wise man here, a Perian, who I learned was in town; for I happened to meet a man who has spent more on sophists than all the rest, Callias, the son of Hippocrates; and so I asked him—"Callias," said I, "if your two sons had happened to be two colts or two calves, we should be able to get and hire them for them an overseer who would make them

Harmonium, 1954

There is another expert too from Paros who I discovered was here on a visit; I happened to meet a man who has paid more in sophists' fees than all the rest put together.

— I mean Callias, the son of Hippocrates. So I asked him—

— He has two sons, you see—Callias, I said, if your sons had been colts or calves, we should have no difficulty in finding and engaging a trainer to perfect their natural qualities.

P. Jovett, 1892

There is at this time a Persian philosopher residing in Athens, of whom I have heard, and I came to hear him in this way:

— I came across a man who has spent a world of money on the sophists, Callias, the son of Hippocrates, and knowing that he had sons, I asked him: "Callias," said I, "if your two sons were foals or colts, there would be no difficulty in finding a trainer probably, who would improve and perfect them.

F. J. Church, 1948

And I believe that there is another wise man from Paros residing in Athens at this moment. I happened to meet Callias, the son of Hippocrates, a man who has spent more money on sophists than everyone else put together. So I said to him (he has two sons), "Callias, if your two sons had been foals or colts, we could have hired a trainer for them who would have trained them to excel in doing what they are naturally capable of: he would have been either a groom or a farmer.

Protageoras

331b. A stem is a sincere conviction of the hearers' souls, but praise is often an insincere, verbal expression of men uttering falsehoods, contrary to their conviction.

(d) Convention is the tyran of mankind and often compels us to do many things which are against nature.

338b. The inferior or worse ought not to preside over the better.

(c) You cannot have anyone who is wiser than the Equinox.

Protageoras

Protageoras, though very much against his will, was obliged to agree that he would ask questions.

Protageoras

337a. Skill in poetics is the principal part of education.

340a. I must appeal to you, like the river Scamander in Homer, who, when beleaguered by Achilles, summons the demigods to aid him, saying: "Brother dear, let us both together stay the force of the hero." (Iliad, XX, 308).
340b Being is not the same as becoming

340c On the one hand, it is difficult for a man to become good. For the Gods have made virtue the reward of toil. But on the other hand, when you have climbed the height, then, to return to retain virtue, however difficult the acquisition, is easy.

(Worke and Lazen, 264c)

χειρενος - difficult = evil (341b)

Σιρον - awful

341c He (Simonides) blames Pittacus for saying, "It is evil to be good."

343a Seven Wise Men of Athens

Thales, Pittacus, Bias, Solon, Cleobulus, Mycon, Chilon (Plutarch put Periander in the place of Mycon)

Protagoras

343a All these were lovers and emulators and disciple of the culture of the Socraticians, and anyone may perceive their wisdom was of this character, consisting of short memorable sentences, which they collected and they met together and dedicated in the Temple of Apollo at Delphi, as the first fruits of their wisdom, the far-famed inscriptions which are all in all men's mouths: "Know thyself," and "Nothing in excess."

(b) Socratician brevity was the style of ancient philosophy.

Pittacus: "Difficult it is to be good."

(c) One who is already prostrate cannot be overthrown, and only he who is standing upright, but not he who is prostrate, can be laid prostrate, so the force of circumstances.

(d) Can only overpower him who at some time or other has resources, and not him who is at all times helpless.

"The good are sometimes good and sometimes bad." (Of Vespasian, Memorabilia I 11.20)

Aυτος ο νομος ουδε μεν θατοχ ου θατοχ.
But the bad does not become bad; he is necessarily always bad.

All who do evil and base things to them against their will.

Etvénmu - approve.

Do not imagine, Protagoras, that I have any other interest in asking questions of you but that of clearing up my own problems as they arise.

"When two go together, one sees before the other." (Cf. Tithæ, X. 224)

Are wisdom and self-control and courage and justice and piety five names which denote the same thing?

All these qualities are parts of virtue, and that four out of five are to some extent similar, and that the fifth of them, which is courage, is very different from the other four.

To live pleasantly is good, and to live unpleasantly evil.

Plato

359d There are some pleasant things which are not good, and that there are some painful things which are not evil, and that there are some which are, and that there are some which are neither good nor evil.

352b Now the rest of the world are of opinion that knowledge is but a powerful, deadly, commanding thing.

(d) I, above all other-men, am bound to say that wisdom and knowledge are the mightiest of human things.

353a Do you think them evil for any other reason, except because they end in pain and loss not in other pleasures?

Religious centres around the infliction of pain upon its followers.

354c Do you not pursue pleasure as a good and avoid pain as an evil?

356c Do not objects of the same size appear larger to your sight when near, and smaller when at a distance.
Now suppose doing well to consist in doing or choosing the greater, and in not doing or in avoiding the less, what would be the saving-principle of human life? Would it be the art of measuring or the power of appearance? Is not the latter that deceiving art which makes us wander up and down and take at one time the things of which we repent at another, both in our actions and in our choice of things great and small?

Would not mankind generally acknowledge that the art which accomplishes this result is the art of measurement?

352d men err in their choice of pleasures and pains, that this, in their choice of good and evil, from defect of knowledge.

They err, not only from defect of knowledge which, as you also agreed earlier in the discussion, is called measuring. And you are also aware that the erring act which is done without knowledge is done in ignorance.

And this inferiority of a man to himself is merely ignorance, as the superiority of a man to himself is wisdom.

Protagoras

353c And is not ignorance the having false opinion and being deceived about important matters.

(d) To pursue what one believes to be evil rather than what is good is not in human nature.

fear or terror is the expectation of evil

359c do cowards go where there is nothing to fear, and the brave where there is much to fear?

(d) yet the brave man and the coward alike go to meet that about which they are confident.

360c ignorance of what is and is not fearful is cowardice.

(d) the knowledge of that which is and is not fearful is courage.

At this point he would no longer nod assent, but was silent.

Finish the argument by yourself, he said.

(e) It is contentious of you, Socrates, to make me answer.

Plato
My only object, I said, in continuing with my questions has been the desire to ascertain facts about virtue and what virtue itself is.

Socrates, who were saying earlier that virtue can ascertain what cannot be taught, contradicting yourself now by your attempt to prove that all things are knowledge, including justice, and self-control, and courage— which tends to show that virtue can certainly be taught.

I am not of a base nature, and I am the last man in the world to be envious. I cannot but applaud your energy and your conduct of an argument. As I have often said, I admire your above all the men I meet, and far above all men of your age, and I dare say that I would not be surprised if you were to become one of those who are distinguished for their wisdom.