Self-Defence in Criminal Law

Boaz Sangero
CONTENTS

Author's Note vii
Acknowledgements ix

INTRODUCTION 1

1 THE RATIONALE OF PRIVATE DEFENCE 11
  1.1 The Distinction between Justification and Excuse 11
  1.2 The Distinction between an Offence and a Defence 19
  1.3 The Rationale of Private Defence from a Historical Perspective 30
  1.4 Private Defence as an Excuse 36
  1.5 Private Defence as a Justification 40
    1.5.1 General; and the right to life 40
    1.5.2 The Aggressor's Culpability as the Crucial Factor 44
    1.5.3 The Test-Case of the Innocent Aggressor 49
    1.5.4 The Autonomy of the Attacked Person as the Crucial Factor 60
    1.5.5 Protection of the Social-Legal Order (In Addition to Protection of the Legitimate Interest of the Person Attacked) 67
    1.5.6 Balancing Interests and Choice of the 'Lesser Evil' 73
    1.5.7 The Right of the Person Attacked—Against the State—to Resist Aggression 77
    1.5.8 Additional Approaches 81
      1.5.8.1 General 81
      1.5.8.2 Punishment of the Aggressor 82
      1.5.8.3 The Duty of the Attacked Person Towards Society 83
      1.5.8.4 Random Chance 84
      1.5.8.5 The Attack as a Sufficient Factor 85
      1.5.8.6 Personal and Limited Justification 87
      1.5.8.7 The Consent of the Aggressor 88
      1.5.8.8 'Moral Specification' and 'Factual Specification' 89
      1.5.8.9 Theories of Justification (In General) and the 'Object Theory' (In Particular) 89
  1.6 The Proposed Rationale 90
    1.6.1 General 90
    1.6.2 Cases that Should not be Included within the Justification of Private Defence 91
    1.6.3 The Proposed Rationale 93
2 PRIVATE DEFENCE: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS 107
   2.1 General 107
   2.2 Private Defence in English and American Law 108
      2.2.1 The English Law 108
      2.2.2 The American Law 112

3 THE ELEMENTS OF PRIVATE DEFENCE 117
   3.1 General 117
   3.2 The Scope of Application of the Defence 117
   3.3 Which Values may be Justifiably Defended? 122
   3.4 The Source of Danger and the Character of the Attack 128
      3.4.1 General 128
      3.4.2 The Scope of the Attack 131
      3.4.3 Resistance to Illegal Arrest 132
      3.4.4 The Consent of the Victim 137
      3.4.5 Holding Property by Force with a Bona Fide Claim of Right 138
      3.4.6 An Attack by Omission 139
   3.5 The Severity of Danger 140
      3.5.1 General 140
      3.5.2 The Probability of the Occurrence of Danger 142
   3.6 The Necessity Requirement 143
      3.6.1 General 143
      3.6.2 Considerations in the Evaluation of Necessity and Secondary Requirements Derived from Necessity 147
      3.6.3 The Suitable Rule 150
   3.7 The Immediacy Requirement 150
      3.7.1 General 150
      3.7.2 The Content of the Immediacy Requirement 153
      3.7.3 Resistance to the Immediacy Requirement 157
      3.7.4 The Issue of Human Traps 163
   3.8 The Proportionality Requirement 166
      3.8.1 General 166
      3.8.2 The Content of the Proportionality Requirement 173
      3.8.3 The Nature and Significance of the Proportionality Requirement in Anglo-American Law 176
      3.8.4 Deadly Defensive Force 178
      3.8.5 A Threat by the Attacked Person to Use Force 186
      3.8.6 Mutual Influences between Defensive Force and Punishment? 188
   3.9 The Duty to Retreat 192
      3.9.1 General 192
3.9.2 A Theoretical Examination in Light of the Rationale of Private Defence 193
3.9.3 The Duty to Retreat in Anglo-American Law 198
3.9.4 Special Cases 202
  3.9.4.1 Attacks in the Dwelling 202
  3.9.4.2 Attacked Person is a Law Enforcement Officer 202
  3.9.4.3 Agressor who is Not Responsible 203
  3.9.4.4 Circumstances of Self-Defence Caused by Own Fault 203
  3.9.4.5 Defence of Another Person 205
3.9.5 Proposals for Reform 205
3.9.6 The Suitable Arrangement for the Issue of Retreat (In Light of the Rationale of Private Defence in General and The Principle of Proportionality in Particular) 207
3.9.7 Duties in Addition to the Duty to Retreat 215
3.10 The Mental Element 217
  3.10.1 General 217
  3.10.2 The Requisite Mental Element in Light of the Distinctions between Justification and Excuse, and between the Definition of the Offence and Justification 218
  3.10.3 The Requisite Mental Element in Light of the Rationale for Private Defence 226
  3.10.4 The Mental Element as Reflected in Comparative Law 227
  3.10.5 The Content of the Requirement for a Mental Element: Awareness versus Purpose 231
  3.10.6 An Impossible Attempt? 235

4 INTERNAL DISTINCTIONS IN PRIVATE DEFENCE 239
  4.1 General (and Self-Defence) 239
  4.2 Defence of Another Person 240
    4.2.1 General 240
    4.2.2 The Defence of Another Person and the Classification of Private Defence as a Justification 241
    4.2.3 The Defence of another Person and the Rationale of Private Defence 243
    4.2.4 Defence of Another Person in Anglo-American Law 245
    4.2.5 Summary 250
    4.2.6 A Duty to Rescue 251
  4.3 Defence of Property 252
    4.3.1 General 252
    4.3.2 Repossession of Property 257
  4.4 Defence of Another Person’s Property 263
  4.5 Defence of the Dwelling 266
Contents

4.5.1 General 266
4.5.2 Definition of 'The Dwelling' 273
4.5.3 Resistance to Dispossession of the Dwelling and Repossession of the Dwelling after Dispossession 275
4.5.4 Putative Defence of the Dwelling 277
4.5.5 Conclusions 277

5 ADDITIONAL ISSUES IN PRIVATE DEFENCE 279

5.1 General 279
  5.1.1 External Issues 279
  5.1.2 General Issues 280
  5.1.3 Special Issues 281

5.2 Putative Private Defence 282
  5.2.1 General 282
  5.2.2 The Mistaken Inclusion of Putative Private Defence within Actual Defence 283
  5.2.3 The Reasonability Requirement 285
  5.2.4 A Mistake that Stems from a State of Intoxication 293
  5.2.5 A Mistake of Law 294
  5.2.6 Unreasonable Mistakes—Full Criminal Responsibility? 295

5.3 Deviation from the Conditions of Private Defence 296
  5.3.1 General 296
  5.3.2 The Australian Case Law 298
  5.3.3 The English Case Law 302
  5.3.4 The American Case Law 304
  5.3.5 Existing and Proposed Legislation 306
  5.3.6 The Proposed Arrangement 307

5.4 Situation of Private Defence Caused by the Actor Bearing Guilt 310
  5.4.1 General 310
  5.4.2 Examination in Light of the Rationale for Private Defence 312
  5.4.3 'Solutions' that do not Solve the Problem 315
  5.4.4 The Case of the 'The Grand Scheme' 316
  5.4.5 Arrangements in Different Legal Systems 318
  5.4.6 The Israeli Case Law 323
  5.4.7 The Actio Libera in Causa Doctrine 327
  5.4.8 Establishment of a Specific Offence as an Alternative Arrangement? 337

5.5 The Defensive Action of Battered Women 339
  5.5.1 General 339
  5.5.2 The Conditions of Private Defence and the Issue of the Battered Woman 342
Contents

5.5.3 Expert Testimony Regarding 'The Battered Woman Syndrome' 345
5.5.4 The Rationale of Private Defence and the Issue of the Battered Woman 348
5.5.5 The Suitable Solution for the Issue of the Battered Woman 350

EPILOGUE: THE PROPOSED LAW 355

Bibliography 361
Index 369