International Human Rights Law

Douglas L Donoho
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Douglas Lee Donoho

with contributions by James Wilets
International Human Rights Law

Douglas Lee Donoho
Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University
Shepard Broad College of Law

With Contributions by James Wilets
Professor, Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad College of Law
Chair, Inter-American Center for Human Rights

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina

NOVA Southeastern University
Law Library
Contents

Introduction and Preface xv

Chapter 1 • What Are International Human Rights? 1
  A. Introduction 1
  B. Historical Antecedents: World War II & the Holocaust 1
    1. The Limited Scope of International Law Prior to World War II 1
    2. The Catalyst for Change: World War II Atrocities 3
      a. Adolf Hitler to His Army Commanders, August 22, 1939 3
      b. Testimony of Hermann Graebe at Nuremberg (German 3
         engineer with the Jung, A.G., Construction Company) 3
      c. Visual Reminders of the Holocaust 5
    3. The Complex Nature of “Rights” As a Legal Concept 5
      a. Western Liberal Premises 6
      b. A Broader International Perspective on the Nature of Rights 8
    4. Putting It Together: The Founding Premises of International 10
       Human Rights
    5. The Grim Reality: “Never Again” Or “Again and Again”? 12

Chapter 2 • Basic Principles of International Law Relevant to Human Right 13
  A. Introduction 13
  B. General Characteristics of the International Legal System 14
  C. Sources of International Law: Treaties, Customary International Law 16
     and General Principles of Law
    1. Overview 16
    2. Treaties (“Conventional Law”) 17
      a. General Characteristics 17
      b. Rules on Formation — Consent, Signature & Ratification 19
      c. Reservations 20
      d. Interpretation 25
      e. Dispute Resolution and Remedies for Breach 29
      f. Withdrawal, Termination or Denunciation 32
      g. Derogation of Obligations 33
3. Customary International Law
   a. General Characteristics
   b. Customary International Law & Human Rights:
      The Contested “Modern” View
   c. Remedies for Violations of Customary Human Rights Obligations
4. Jus Cogens
D. Review Questions

Chapter 3 • What Rights Are Humans Entitled to Under
International Law?  
A. Introduction & Overview
B. Treaty Based Human Rights
   1. U.N. Charter
   2. The “International Bill of Rights”
      a. Universal Declaration of Human Rights: The Blueprint
      b. The 1966 Covenants
   3. Post-Covenant Developments: The Evolving Network of
      Global Human Rights Treaties
C. Customary International Human Rights

Chapter 4 • International Rights as Domestic Obligations
A. Introduction and Overview
   1. Incorporation: Traditional Distinctions between Monism and
      Dualism
B. The Critical Role of Incorporation: Domestication of International
   Norms
C. Incorporating Human Rights Obligations into Domestic Legal Orders:
   The Contrasting European and U.S. Examples
   1. The Shining European Example
   2. The Not So Shiny Example: The United States’ Failure to
      Domesticate International Obligations
      a. Constitutional Framework
      b. Doctrine of Self-Executing Treaties
      c. Legal Status of Treaties within the U.S. Hierarchy of Laws
      d. Self-Execution and Human Rights Treaties Ratified by the
         United States
      e. Growing Movement Toward Domestic Implementation by
         Other Nations?
      f. The Domestic Legal Status of Customary International Law
      g. The Interpretation Angle: The Charming Betsy Doctrine
D. Treaties within U.S. Domestic Law: Case Study of Capital
   Punishment & the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
   1. Interpretation of the 8th Amendment and the Execution of Juveniles
   2. Violations of the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations
Chapter 5 • Civil Liability as a Method of Domestic Enforcement of International Human Rights

A. Introduction & Overview

1. The “Domestication Gap”: U.S. Failure to Incorporate International Human Rights Treaties

2. Invoking Customary International Human Rights in the United States Courts

B. Methods of Domestic Enforcement of International Human Rights in the United States Generally

1. Overview

2. Civil Suits in American Courts for Foreign Human Rights Violations: ATS & TVPA Litigation Against Individual Foreign Defendants

   a. Facts: CASO QUEMADOS

   b. Statutory Resources

   c. Case Law: Suits against Foreign Government Actors for Violations of Human Rights

3. The Corporate Alien Tort: ATS Litigation against Multinational Corporations

   a. Background & Overview

   b. Kiobel, Extraterritoriality & ATS Claims: What Remains?

   c. Interpretation and Application of Kiobel

   d. Bucking the Kiobel Tide?

   e. Response of Legal Commentators to Kiobel

   f. Common Defenses to ATS and TVPA Claims

   g. Putting It All Together: The Aftermath of Sosa and Kiobel, Claims & Defenses

4. Filartiga-Style Actions Overseas: The Case against Henry Kissinger

5. Domestic Enforcement of Human Rights against U.S. Government Actors

   a. Overview

   b. Civil Suits against U.S. Public Officials for Domestic Violations of Human Rights: A Shocking Lack of International Protections?

   c. The Case for Domestic Accountability of U.S. Officials for Actions Overseas

   d. Domestic Accountability for Human Rights Violations in the War on Terror?

Chapter 6 • Using Domestic Criminal Prosecutions to Enforce International Human Rights

A. Introduction and Overview

B. International Law Limits on Domestic Jurisdiction and the Rise of Universal Jurisdiction

C. Prosecuting Human Rights Crimes in the United States
1. Current U.S. Statutes Criminalizing International Human Rights Violations 
   a. Genocide 171
   b. Torture 172
   c. Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers 173
   d. War Crimes 174
   e. Human Trafficking 176
2. Institutional Framework 177
3. Case Study: U.S. v. Charles Taylor, Jr. 178
4. Potential Prosecution of American Actors for Human Rights Violations in the War on Terror 
   a. The Case against Bush Administration Officials for Torture 179
   b. The War Crimes Case against the Obama Administration: Use of Targeted Drone Assassinations 180
D. U.S. Immigration Based Civil and Criminal Actions Against Human Rights Violators 185
1. Civil Removal Proceedings 185
   a. Man Linked to Guatemala Massacre Deported 186
   b. Six Nazis Who Will Probably Live Out Their Lives Free in America 188
2. Immigration Related Criminal Prosecutions 189
   a. Ex-Guatemalan Soldier Will Be Sentenced for Lying 189
E. The Pinochet Paradigm: Use and Limits of Universal Jurisdiction to Prosecute Foreign Based Human Rights Crimes Unrelated to the Forum 190
1. Overview 190
2. The Decision: Regina v. Pinochet Ugarte 190
3. The Aftermath: Exportation of the Pinochet Paradigm Outside of Spain 197
4. The Case of Henry Kissinger 201
   a. Henry and the Case for Universal Jurisdiction 202
   c. Henry Could Be Wrong 207
F. Domestic Prosecutions Outside of the United States 209
1. Overview 209
2. Former Leader of Guatemala Is Guilty of Genocide against Mayan Group 212

Chapter 7 • International Promotion and Enforcement Under the United Nations Charter Based System 215
A. Introduction & Overview 215
B. Human Rights in China: The Suppression of Uyghur & Tibetan Minorities 218
   1. Generally 218
2. Author Nurmuhemmet Yasin 219
3. Professor Ilham Tohti 220
4. China’s Uighurs — Islamic Extremists or Oppressed Minority? 221
C. Principal U.N. Institutions and Their Role in the Protection of Human Rights 221
1. The United Nations Generally 222
2. Principal U.N. Institutions 222
   a. General Assembly 224
   b. U.N. Security Council 227
   c. Economic and Social Council 232
d. International Court of Justice (a.k.a. “World Court”) 233
D. Charter Based Institutions And Mechanisms with Dedicated Human Rights Mandates 235
1. Overview & Historical Evolution 235
   b. Organizational Structure of U.N. Human Rights Institutions 237
2. Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights 238
3. Human Rights Council 240
   a. Specific Mechanisms & Procedures of the HRC 241
E. Critiquing the Revamped U.N. Charter Based Human Rights System: Evolution, Expendiency or Just More of the Same? 253
1. Some Well-Deserved Criticisms: Continuing Hypocrisy & Double Standards 253
   a. Tom Kuntz, Libya’s Late, Great Rights Record, NY Times, March 5, 2011 254
d. Frida Ghitis, The Human Rights Council is a Tragic Joke, Miami Herald, 6/25/2010 255
e. Sudan’s Election to ECOSOC 256
f. The Anti-Israel Obsession 257
   a. Patrick Stewart, The Human Rights Council: Give Credit Where Credit Is Due, Counsel on Foreign Relations, The Internationalist, June 1, 2012 258

Chapter 8 • International Promotion and Enforcement of Rights Through the U.N. Treaty Based System 259
A. Introduction & Overview 259
1. The Treaties 260
CONTENTS

2. The Treaty Based Mechanisms: General Characteristics 262
3. Distinctions from Charter Based Mechanisms 265

B. Case Study: Human Rights, Free Speech & the Judiciary in Venezuela 266
   1. General Human Rights Conditions in Venezuela 266
   2. The Case of Judge Afiuni 267
   3. Treatment of Political Opposition Including Leopoldo Lopez 267

C. How Treaty Based Processes Function 267
   1. Periodic State Reports 267
      a. Generally 267
      b. Report Exhaustion & Overlap: Efforts to Coordinate State Reporting 269
      c. Committee Evaluation of Reports, Concluding Observations & Reality 271
      d. Shadow Reports & NGO Participation 287
      e. Other Examples of NGO Shadow Reporting 293

2. Consideration of Individual Complaints and Communications 294
   a. Overview 294
   b. Treaty Based Complaint Procedures: The Process 298
   c. Illustrative Committee Decisions 301
   d. Evaluating the Petition Process 308

3. General Comments 313
   a. HRC General Comment 24 313
   c. GENERAL COMMENT 12 316
   d. ESCRC General Comment 15 and the Right to Water 317

D. Critiquing the U.N. Treaty Based System 319
   1. Is It Really Working to Alter State Behavior? 319
   2. Are There Problems with the Premises? 322

E. U.N. Humanitarian Work and Human Rights 326

Chapter 9  ·  Regional Systems for the Protection of Human Rights: Introduction and Examination of the European System 327

A. Introduction to Regional Systems of Human Rights Protection 327
   1. Overview 327

2. James Wilets, Lessons from Kosovo: Towards a Multiple Track System of Human Rights Protection, 6 ILSA J. Int’l & Comp. L. 645 328

3. Chart of International and Regional Institutions with Significant Human Rights Mandates 331

B. European System for the Protection of Human Rights 332
   1. Overview 332
2. Historical Evolution of the CoE “European System” 334
3. Nuts & Bolts: How the ECtHR Works 337
   a. Problems with Expansion: The Russian Connection 338
   b. The European Roma 339
4. Critical Jurisprudence: ECtHR Case Law 340
   a. Overview 340
   b. Dudgeon v. UK (Northern Ireland) 340
5. Protocol 14 (entered into force June 1, 2010) 351
C. The Increasing Role of the European Union (“EU”) as an Enforcer of Human Rights Norms 353
   1. Overview: Understanding the EU and its Historical Development Culminating in Charter of Fundamental Rights 353
   2. Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA) 355
D. Somewhere Between International Human Rights Law and Domestic Incorporation: The “Federalization of Human Rights Law” 356
E. OSCE: Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe & the “Human Dimension” 363

Chapter 10 • Regional Human Rights Systems: The Inter-American and African Systems 365
A. Introduction & Overview 365
B. Abuse and Exploitation of Children: Street Children, Child Labor & Child Soldiers 366
   1. Overview 366
   2. Street Children 367
      a. Casa Alianza U.K. Network 367
      b. Video Clip — Street Kids in Guatemala 368
      c. From Human Rights Watch: “Easy Targets: Violence against Children World-Wide” 368
      d. Sexual Exploitation of Children 369
   3. Child Soldiers 370
      a. The Truth About Child Soldiers, Professor Mark Drumbl, March 19, 2015 370
      b. Quotes from Child Soldiers (various sources reported at ChildSoldiers.org and Trip Line, Origin Uncertain) 371
      c. Video Clips 372
   4. Exploitation of Child Labor 372
C. The Inter-American Human Rights System 374
   1. The OAS 374
      a. Overview 374
      b. Evolution of the OAS & Its Promotion of Democracy 374
2. Overview of the Inter-American System for Human Rights 375
   a. Brief History of the Inter-American Human Rights System 376
3. Inter-American Commission 377
   a. Overview of the Commission & Its Functions 377
   b. Petitioning the Commission 380
4. Inter-American Court of Human Rights 381
D. Critiquing the Inter-American System 382
E. African System for Human Rights Protection 388
   1. Introduction and Overview 388
   2. Evolution of the African Union 388
   3. African Human Rights System 389
      a. Overview 389
      b. African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights 390
      c. African Court on Human and Peoples’ Rights 392

Chapter 11 • International Criminal Law, Humanitarian Law & Human Rights 395
A. Introduction & Overview 395
B. Historical Antecedents: Nuremberg & Tokyo Trials 398
   1. Nuremberg Trials 398
   2. The Nuremberg Charter 402
   3. Tokyo Trials 404
C. Evolution of International Humanitarian Law: The Geneva Conventions 409
D. Contemporary International Criminal Processes Involving Humanitarian Law and Human Rights 412
   1. Ad Hoc International Criminal Tribunals 412
      a. International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) 412
      b. International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) 420
      c. Case Law From the Ad Hoc Tribunals 421
d. Completion Strategy & Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals 433
E. International Criminal Court (ICC) 434
   1. Overview 434
   2. Statute of ICC 435
   3. Institutional Structure and Process 444
   4. Situations and Cases under ICC Review 444
   5. Evaluating the ICC 446
      b. The ICC Is No Kangaroo Court, Tracy Gurd for the Open Society Blog 447
      c. Can the International Criminal Court Play Fair in Africa? 449
Chapter 12 • Universal Human Rights, Relativism & the Challenge of Diversity 451
   A. Introduction & Overview 451
   B. Global Diversity: Can the Meaning of Rights Be Relative to Cultural, Social or Religious Circumstances? 453
      2. When Culture Collides with International Human Rights Norms: The Case of Sandra Lovelace v. Canada 456
      3. When Culture and International Rights Collide: Female Genital Mutilation 462
         a. Background 462
         b. Does FGM Violate International Human Rights: Perspective of Amnesty International 465
         c. Male Circumcision: Is a Gender Distinction Valid? 467

Chapter 13 • Gender Rights as Human Rights 469
   A. Introduction & Overview 469
   B. The Circumstances of Women That Necessitate Gender Based Rights 471
      1. The Condition of Women World-Wide 471
   C. Religious Law & Women’s Rights 476
      1. Nontract #10, Freedom From Religion Foundation, Inc. 476
      2. Nicholas D. Kristof, Religion and Women, Opinion NY Times, January 9, 2010 477
      3. Sharia Law 478
         b. Pakistan Hudood Laws 479
      4. Jewish Rabbinical Law 480
         a. Women, Religious Law and Religious Courts in Israel — The Jewish Case, by Margit Cohn 480
         b. Mary F. Radford, Inheritance Rights of Women Under Jewish and Islamic Law 483
   D. Cultural Practices 486
      1. “Honor” Killing 486
1. The Women’s Convention And Its Optional Protocol, Empowering Women To Claim Their Internationally Protected Rights, Laboni Amena Hoq 488
F. Relativism & the Public-Private Distinction: Are Women’s Issues Different from Other Human Rights Issues? 491

Chapter 14  •  Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation as Subsets of Gender Rights 495
A. Overview 495
B. Treatment of Sexual Minorities World-Wide 495
C. Potential International Human Rights Law Protections for Sexual Minorities 496
D. Sexual Minorities 501
1. Note to Students from Professor Wilets 501
E. Comparative Law in the Interpretation of the Indian Constitution in the Context of Transgendered Persons 504
1. Notes to Students from Professor Wilets 504
2. In the Supreme Court of India, National Legal Services Authority v. Union of India 505

Index 521