The Role of the Global Coalition for Africa in Human Resource Development and Capacity Building

Dr. David R. Evans
THE ROLE OF THE GLOBAL COALITION FOR AFRICA IN HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AND CAPACITY BUILDING

WORKING DRAFT
5/17/91

CONSULTANT REPORT
DAVID R. EVANS
MAY 1991
ABSTRACT

This report analyses the education component of the Human Resource Development sector in order to recommend specific activities which take advantage of the capabilities of the Global Coalition for Africa (GCA). The paper looks at four sector-wide options and two sub-sector options, chosen because of the potential benefits from GCA involvement in them.

The four sector-wide options are: 1) Increasing government support for Human Resource Development, 2) Diversifying the Supply of Educational Services, 3) Formulation of National Education Policy, and 4) Rationalization of High-Level Meetings. Of the four the best option for GCA is the first, which enables GCA to use its reputation and access to advocate for human development with national leaders. The sub-sector options discussed are 1) Vocational Education and Skill Training, and 2) Higher Education. Both of these areas need consensus building and coordination of development efforts. GCA could usefully promote both these areas in the second and third years of their program, after having highlighted the critical importance of human development in the first year.

There are four international organizations with which GCA can collaborate as partners: 1) the Task Force of Donors to African Education, 2) the African Capacity Building Initiative, 3) UNDP's National Long-Term Perspective Studies, and 4) UNESCO. GCA needs to establish liaison and mutual understanding with all four, but can be most productive by undertaking joint activities with the Donors to African Education during its first three years. The report outlines three possible levels of GCA involvement in the human development sector.

Two annexes are included: Annex A describes the organization of the Donors to African Education and the activities of their working groups. Annex B contains an analysis of higher education in Africa and the activities of the major donors.

More detailed recommendations for GCA Activities are contained in the accompanying memorandum "GCA Work Program in Human Resource Development and Capacity Building."
The Role of the Global Coalition for Africa in Human Resource Development and Capacity Building

INTRODUCTION

1. Human Resource Development (HRD) cuts across many sectors and is central to the success of investment in other sectors. Education, health, nutrition, population, and the participation of women are all essential aspects of the overall challenge of the development of people. In a very real sense, human development is both the means and the end of economic progress. This report will focus primarily on the potential role of the Global Coalition for Africa (GCA) in education, which is a critical part of the human development task.\(^1\) Other papers address population, and poverty and social policy options for GCA.

2. The education sector is different from other development sectors in several important ways: education is either the first or second largest component of government recurrent expenses - the military being the other; the education system is a major consumer of its own products, with substantial proportions of graduates being employed as teachers; the sector has long lead times, with cycles of four to six years before the impact of changes is felt; education requires a high recurrent to capital cost ratio, which has limited the role of external assistance; and, most important, education is much more than a source of trained people for the economy -- it is a sorting and selection mechanism which determines access to scarce status and economic benefits in society. Because of its selection role, educational policy is intensely political and a source of conflict between competing groups as they strive to maintain or increase access to modern sector employment. Hence recommendations for change or reform of education have two components: a technical aspect and a political aspect. Even modest changes in education from a technical perspective can lead to substantial unrest and even violence if perceived to threaten the access of one or another group. Successful change in education requires public consensus and political acceptability to a degree not necessary in other sectors.

3. Partly because of its visibility and centrality, a great deal of donor and government attention has been given to education, and a wide variety of organizations have emerged which provide advice and assistance in the field of education. The World Bank's "Education in Sub-Saharan Africa" (ESSA) policy study led to the formation of a Task Force of Donors to African Education (DAE) which has worked during the past three years to promote coordination of donors' efforts and policy-oriented reform of education in Africa. Many of activities which GCA will likely undertake in other sectors have already been started in education under the aegis of DAE and its associated working groups (See Annex A for description of DAE and its activities). GCA can collaborate with DAE to strengthen its effectiveness and articulate issues from the education sector to higher levels of government.

4. Basic Education has also been very visible as the result of the World Conference on Education for All (WCEFA) in Jomtien, Thailand in the Spring of 1990. Co-sponsored by virtually every donor working in education in world, the conference marshalled world-wide attention and support to establish the

---

\(^1\) This report is one of a series requested by the Global Coalition for Africa as part of the process of drafting its workplan for first three years.
priority of basic education for all people in the world. The resulting consensus and at least verbal commitment of resources to this task provides an example of the kind of outcome which GCA could promote in other components of human resource development. Follow up activities are underway by the Development Assistance Committee of OECD which is seeking ways in which donors can be more effective in meeting the objectives of EFA and will convene a meeting in 1992 to pursue that goal. The various initiatives for human development culminated at the highest political level at the World Summit for Children, held in New York in September 1990. Attended by 65 heads of state, the Summit set the survival, protection, and development of children as the focal point of international commitment. For Africa, UNESCO is convening a meeting of African Ministers of Education in Dakar in 1991 to discuss ways of implementing the goals of EFA.

5. Concern about developing human resources beyond basic education led to the founding of the African Capacity Building Initiative (ACBI) which emphasizes long-term commitment to the institutions which train the policy analysts and development managers in Africa. While initially focussed on economics and management, the initiative recognizes the essential role played by educational institutions, particularly at the level of higher education, in providing trained people who are essential to development in all sectors, including education. ACBI will be an important component of the overall effort to strengthen HRD in Africa. The activities of GCA in the education sector can complement and strengthen the efforts of ACBI.

6. In short the education sector in Africa is large and complex. However, the challenge of providing quality education for most children in Africa remains problematic and unaccomplished. Much of African education faces the twin problems of under-capacity and a significant decline in the quality of the schools that do exist. The potential role of GCA is substantial, particularly in supporting the coordination and rationalization of the activities of the many donors and in generating increased resources for human development.

THE KEY ISSUES

7. Many of the key issues for the education sector were set out in the Bank’s ESSA document of 1988 and they remain the central concerns for the 1990s. They are: adjustment to contain costs and utilize resources more efficiently, revitalization to improve declining quality at all levels, and selective expansion toward Universal Primary Education and to meet high priority needs at secondary and higher levels. These issues are set within the larger general issue of inadequate spending on human development in Africa in the 1980s. The priority first step for African countries is to develop a national policy framework and strategies for implementation that will provide the basis for educational development and a context for effective donor assistance.

8. The ESSA policy study also highlights the critical role of international aid in determining the pace of progress in African education. Savings from increased efficiency and cost-sharing will improve the effectiveness of education but will not be sufficient to meet the demands for education. The study advocates an increased level of assistance and at the same time changes in the organization and nature of that aid. Assistance should first focus on aid for policy design and then provide increased, longer-term,
and more flexible support for policy reform programs. Support for foreign specialists should largely be replaced by capacity building assistance.

9. In the following discussion two categories of issues will be discussed, those at the sectoral level and above, and those within various sub-sectors of education and capacity building. The sectoral level issues will be discussed first since the leverage of GCA will likely provide the greatest value added at that level. Four options are presented at the sectoral level: expanding human resource expenditures, diversifying the supply of education, formulating national education policy frameworks, and rationalizing high-level meetings of education officials. On the sub-sectoral level, two further options are presented: vocational education and skill training, and higher education. At the end of each option the pros and cons of GCA involvement in that option are summarized. Several other options are mentioned at the end, which might warrant further investigation by GCA.

A. Sectoral Level Issues

10. Human Resource Expenditures. A broader perspective on human resource development (HRD) is articulated in the Bank's "Sub-Saharan Africa: From Crisis to Sustainable Growth" (LTPS) document, which advocates doubling the proportion of GDP spent on human development to 8% - 10% by the year 2000. Human resource development includes basic services of food, nutrition, water and primary health care in addition to education, which accounts for about half of the total. UNDP's "Human Development Report 1990" argues that increasing the share of social spending should be a priority in developing countries at all levels. That report documents the declining expenditure on health and education in relation to GDP, with especially significant drops in Sub-Saharan Africa. UNDP/UNESCO estimate in that report that achieving Universal Primary Education by 2000 will require an additional expenditure worldwide of US$ five billion a year, with much of that allocated to Africa.

11. Such increases will require scrutiny of other parts of government expenditures, and in particular the military which is often as large or larger than education expenditures. Beginning a process of setting some long-term policy goals for military expenditures in relationship to human resource development is a difficult but essential effort. In a recent paper,2/ McNamara suggests a linking of financial assistance through "conditionality" to movement toward "optimal levels" of military expenditures and hence increased availability of resources for human resource development. He goes on to argue that the international community must find ways to reward countries which reduce military expenditures in favor of social sector spending. Because of their political sensitivity, raising these issues will require respected, high-level advocates such as GCA. Failure to reform these expenditure patterns will ultimately jeopardize human resource development in many countries.

12. Public expenditures on education decreased noticeably in the 1980s due to a combination of rapid population growth and economic downturn which resulted in declines in both the proportions of children attending school and the quality of their education. Gradual acceptance of the kinds of financial and structural reforms articulated in the ESSA study will provide an increasingly credible basis for education's claim to increased public resources. But, this claim has to be argued before Ministers of Finance and Development by organizations like GCA which have access and legitimacy. The Ministry of Education in most countries will require assistance from more influential sources if they are to succeed in increasing their resources. (In some countries education's proportion of recurrent expenditure is so high that increases are not feasible and they will have to focus on greater efficiency and diversifying the supply of education.)

13. The LTPS on Sub-Saharan Africa argues cogently that investing in people is both an end and a means - "...healthy and educated human beings are also the principal means for achieving development." Expenditures on human resources are thus as much investments as they are consumption and can be justified on those grounds both for governments and for donors. While many donors have accepted this premise by investing in education, that investment generally has excluded payment of any recurrent or local costs associated with education. Most educational expenditures, especially at the lower levels, have little or no foreign exchange component. The overwhelming majority of expenses are for teachers' salaries and allowances. Until now, most donors have been unwilling to support recurrent expenditures, seeing them as consumption and as an open-ended commitment. Some reconsideration of this is going on in the World Bank as it works on a human resource development strategy paper. Several donors are discussing or trying out new approaches to general budgetary support. The issue of support for recurrent and local costs must be addressed if African education is to meet even the minimal demands for education which most countries are facing.

14. **GCA Involvement in Human Resource Expenditures:**

**Pros:** GCA has the prestige and the access to advocate effectively with core ministries and national political leaders on the importance of increasing investment in HRD activities. Since HRD cuts across the sectors of health, rural development - access to water, agriculture - food security and nutrition, and education, GCA can assist in formulation of integrated plans for the development of people better than sectoral level officials can. GCA is also in a unique position to address issues of the balance of investments between HRD, the military and other sectors.

**Cons:** There has been so much advocacy and publicity on behalf of education that governments have already made major commitments. Some might argue that GCA resources are better used elsewhere.

15. **Diversifying the Supply of Education.** Since independence education in Africa has been an activity of the central government. Initially, government took control to unify a system split among a variety of religious organizations and often divided along racial lines as well. There was a clear need to create a unified school system which reflected the values and goals of each independent African nation. That initiative has evolved into a highly centralized system of management and finance of education at all levels. At
primary level there is some degree of community participation and support, but as a child moves higher in the system, responsibility is seen to shift to the central government. This approach is increasingly unworkable as governments reach the limit of their financial and managerial capabilities to run the system from the central Ministry.

16. In many of the poorer African countries there has been much de facto shifting of the costs of primary education to the parents and the local community. The ESSA policy study advocates increased cost sharing particularly at the university level, but progress toward that has been slow and difficult (See Annex B). Governments generally have continued to operate under the assumption that all levels of education should be centrally controlled and in theory centrally financed. This assumption is now a serious barrier to the further development of education.

17. One obvious component of this issue is privatization of some of the provision of education. Some governments are experimenting with the return of schools to the founding religious bodies, allowing NGOs to open their own schools, and with cautious expansion of private schools. In most of Africa there is little official private education at the primary level and virtually none in higher education, particularly at the university level. To successfully meet the challenge of providing education to their people, African government's will have to move toward a diversification of the supply of education by loosening the government monopoly. By shifting to a facilitating and monitoring role to insure standards and quality, governments can broaden opportunities for participation of the private and NGO sector in the provision of education.

18. A second component is decentralization of both control and finance to local authorities. A number of African countries are experimenting with a deconcentration of management by strengthening district and local education offices and giving them more responsibility for supervision and support of schools. The next step is to begin transferring some decision-making authority including control of financial resources. At the same time this will require strengthening local control of schools and the resources which parents and communities put into the schools - in other words matching authority to the shift in financing which has already occurred in many places. Increased control can lead to increased demand for local accountability in terms of the quality of education being offered and pressures for improvement.

19. Both of these trends will require a shift in the philosophy of the Ministry of Education which in most cases is still committed to a centralized system. Marshalling social opinion and gradually educating Ministries of Education is a process which can only be undertaken at a more general level. GCA could undertake a campaign to highlight these issues, educate leading decision makers about the options available, publicize positive examples from African countries and generally begin to build an awareness of the rationale for change.

---

3/ This topic is discussed under the heading of "Redefining the Role of the State" in a draft paper being discussed by the World Bank. Human Development: A Strategy for the 1990s. May 1991.
20. GCA Involvement in Diversification of the Supply of Education:

Pros: Diversifying the supply of education is a broad topic which is part of the larger issue of moving from supply driven to demand driven mechanisms and the increased use of market forces to provide signals. However the social selection role of education and its political volatility make it unique. GCA has the status to make this issue visible and legitimate it at the highest levels of government.

Cons: This is a diffuse topic that lacks a readily understood focus around which support can be marshalled. It is really a piece of a larger topic of the role of government in society and the extent to which government can and should have a monopoly on the provision of a wide range of public services. Whether one can usefully separate out the provision of education from other human services is not clear. The limited resources of GCA might have more results if applied to more focussed issues.

21. Formulating National Educational Policy Frameworks. Creating an effective process to develop national educational policy is the central recommendation of the ESSA. Without a clear policy framework which sets out national goals, priorities and strategies for reaching them, governments are at the mercy of the donor agencies and their internal priorities and procedures for identifying, designing and funding activities in education. African nations must have an effective means for educational policy development. The technical aspect of educational planning, project design and costing is fairly straightforward. But, educational policy formulation is primarily a challenge of seeking political and social consensus because of its role in controlling access to societal rewards. Setting educational policies is one thing, being able to create a climate of acceptance and support for their implementation is quite another - as many governments have discovered.

22. African countries are seeking improved mechanisms and procedures which have been demonstrated to work in similar settings. Some countries have methods which have been used with a degree of success. Currently a number of countries, including Kenya, Uganda, Madagascar, Tanzania, Mozambique and Cameroon have a range of commissions and working groups which are charged with discussing priorities and addressing key policy issues in education. Other countries like Benin and Lesotho have some experience with collaborative sector work between Government and donors which have created a framework for concerted action in educational development. Many questions about how best to approach the problem remain. Which mechanisms work best to promote more open dialogue and access to policy making, to provide a hearing for diverse perspectives, and to build support, credibility and legitimacy for educational reform policies? What are the strengths and limitations of current approaches? How can donors be more effective in their support of the policy formulation process?

23. Two steps are necessary: (a) research and evaluation to delineate the necessary components of an effective policy formulation process and to identify what the various components contribute to the process, and (b) raising the awareness and access of government policy makers to this knowledge and assisting them in adapting it to use in their national contexts. GCA, working through DAE could play a central role in supporting a process designed to help African governments ultimately put in place effective, ongoing policy
procedures for the education sector. In the long run, one can envision a situation where donors respond to a coherent, well articulated set of policy goals set forth by the national government as the first step in dialogue between donors and governments. This would reverse the current process where donors end up in effect trying to set priorities and design plans themselves in the absence of useable government plans. Such plans would also form the basis for much more tightly coordinated donor support in the education sector and better long-term capacity building for both parties.

24. The already existing practices of national education commissions, hearings, commissioned reports, and public dialogue sets a model which may be relevant to the planned National Long-Term Perspective Studies (NLTPS) being undertaken by UNDP. Not only could the education policy formulation be seen as a sub-part of that effort, but in fact the procedures use may provide an experience base which can inform the NLTPS process as well. GCA can work to provide linkages between educational policy formulation and the NLTPS activities. DAE does not currently provide such coordination since it works only within the education sector.

25. GCA Involvement in National Educational Policy Formulation:

Pros: National educational policy is a key component of overall development policy. By becoming actively involved in supporting the national policy process the GCA can support a critical sector level need as well as promote linkage to the national development plans. GCA can use this as a programmatic link to DAE because the working group on this issue is still seeking funding to begin the study of educational policy formulation.

Cons: The initial steps involve research, country studies, synthesis of the findings, and dissemination - all tasks that would fit well within the concept of a DAE working group and may be a low priority use of GCA staff time. GCA might more effectively come into the process at the stage of dissemination and implementation.

26. Rationalization of High-Level Meetings. The number of active donors working in African education is exemplified by the list at the end of Annex A, which contains only those organizations involved in DAE, although that is most of them. Notably absent from the DAE list are the various Arab foundations and OPEC who are important donors particularly in the Sahelian countries with large Muslim populations. Many of these agencies organize conferences, seminars, workshops, training courses, and study tours to which they invite senior level education officials. The number of such activities is high, and there is no apparent method for either coordinating or monitoring their purposes, content, and scheduling. The value of all this travel and discussion presumably varies greatly depending on the situation and the people involved. Quite possibly the situation has reached the point where the there is "too much of a good thing."

27. Looking at the issue just at the senior level of Minister of Education illustrates the extent of the problem. The following is a partial list of recent or planned activities to which Ministers of Education are invited.
March 1990 - World Conference on Education for All - Thailand
July 1991 - UNESCO Ministerial Meeting - Senegal
Summer 1991 - EDI world-wide Seminar on Higher Education (includes half a dozen African Ministers) - Kuala Lumpur
October 1991 - UNESCO General Assembly (every other year) - Paris
October 1991 - Plenary Meeting of DAE & Meeting of African Ministers - Manchester, England

In addition the Commonwealth Secretariat organizes a Meeting of Ministers of Education every three years (last held in fall 1990), and there is a schedule of meetings for Francophone Ministers of Education as well. (CONFEMEN - Conférence des Ministres de l'Education des pays ayant en commun l'usage du français) Then, there are a much greater number of topical and sub-regional meetings either before or after the higher level meetings, or to address issues which neighboring countries have in common.

28. Of course, the many meetings are really a symptom of an underlying problem - too many development organizations all striving to assist African education while responding to their own agency agendas and the pressure to identify discrete activities in each country which can be seen as their contribution. On one level, DAE helps to promote dialogue and provides a setting where increased cooperation and reduced competition can take place if agencies are ready to take those steps. But on another level, the imperative of institutional survival is strong. Serious negotiations about the future and roles of development agencies requires higher level dialogue and influence than is possible within DAE. Such change will in any case be slow, but GCA could create mechanisms to clearly articulate the problem and start a process of rationalization.

29. GCA Involvement in Rationalization of High Level Meetings:

Pros: GCA would be able to use its region-wide and world-wide leverage to begin influencing the timing, focus and location of fora for central policy issues in education. This role would open the door to a longer term process of rationalization of the roles of the many agencies involved in assistance to African education. (For instance, UNICEF is expanding its role in basic education in significant ways, raising questions of overlap with previous UNESCO roles.) GCA could also address the rising frustration of African Governments and others with "endless talk and studies." There is a feeling that the time is ripe for action, not more organizational process.

Cons: This is a task which UNESCO would normally undertake (An limited example can be found in the EFA 2000 Bulletin put out by the Secretariat for follow-up of WCEFA in UNESCO) although its capabilities have are constrained by its ongoing financial crisis. It also might be seen as an administrative task which would syphon off GCA resources from more critical priorities. Carrying out the compilation and dissemination might also be an appropriate task for the DAE secretariat.
30. Other Sector-Wide Options. Other options may also be worthy of further investigation. Creating and implementing more effective modes of assistance in human resource development is one candidate. Over-use of expensive technical assistance wastes resources and undermines capacity building. Unwillingness to fund recurrent and local costs limits the extent to which donors can help African governments overcome a critical barrier, particularly in basic education. Continuing to improve the effectiveness of policy-linked budgetary assistance is a challenge, particularly in designing the right mix of project and non-project components. GCA could act as a catalyst in promoting dialogue on the impact of various forms of assistance in education and in seeking a clearer consensus on the most effective approaches. Both governments and donors will need to modify their behaviors.

B. Sub-sectoral Level Issues.

31. Vocational Education and Skill Training. In the 1980s support for vocational education and training averaged forty percent annually of multilateral international assistance to education. With a few exceptions, bilateral assistance agencies provide less support in this area than the multilateral organizations. The assistance has mainly contributed to the establishment of public, pre-employment training capacity, which has meant that it reached a very small share of those seeking any form of education. Because of its high unit costs, vocational education cannot be expanded to include large proportions of students.

32. The recent World Bank Policy paper "Vocational and Technical Education and Training" (1991) stresses five actions in this sub-sector.

1) The economic analysis of training should be improved by addressing labor market issues and establishing clear economic rationales for public investments in pre-employment training.
2) Investments in the quality of and access to academic secondary education should replace investments in pre-vocational courses.
3) Training investments should address the policy changes required to create a favorable economic climate for private training and direct measures to stimulate and improve training in the private sector.
4) Investments should include measures to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of public training.
5) Assistance should support the development of a national policy frameworks for training, and encourage broadly-based donor support.

There is increasing donor awareness of the basic premises articulated in the World Bank study, but by no means a strong consensus even within the Bank. There is disagreement among the donors, especially those who have historically been active in the support of vocational and technical education. Many bilateral agencies remain active in supporting traditional approaches to vocational education. The Bank's position represents a significant change of direction from supply-driven, public-sector solutions of the past to one of flexible, demand-driven, and employment related approaches.

33. Yet the intuitively appealing logic that state supported schools should teach pupils vocational skills is so attractive to parents and politicians alike that most government policy is at odds with the Bank's new position. Virtually every country in Africa has a policy of increased vocationalization of education, in some cases all the way down into upper primary school.
Proposals for carpentry, metal working, crafts, and agricultural workshops in every school are common. Many governments have publicly committed themselves to vocationalizing education using traditional approaches to the task. Discussions between donors and governments are frequently at odds over these issues as the donors strive for more cost-effective approaches and the governments seek to maintain their public positions on the issue. The result is usually a compromise which leaves the government policy intact but delays or otherwise limits its implementation.

34. The DAE working group on Vocational Education and Training has recently completed a series of three meetings (in Turin, Togo, and Mauritius) which between them were attended by all the African ministers of education and other ministers with responsibility for skill training. The meetings provided a forum for presentation of effective, new models of vocational training from Africa and a chance for dialogue about the rationale behind new policies being promoted in vocational education. Some progress has been made, but now the dialogue should be broadened as well as being taken to core officials at higher levels who must also understand the issues.

35. In summary, this is an area where there is not only a lack of consensus, but often little common ground on which a discussion can be based. Vocational training is seen as the obvious and inescapable solution to the problem of unemployed school leavers - a logic which governments feel is politically unwise to ignore. Economists and other observers see that the problem of unemployment is not primarily a problem of education and can't be solved by school-based curriculum changes. GCA could seize this set of issues with its linkages to the labor market, to building technical capacity and to enabling technology transfer as one theme for its efforts in African human resource development.

36. GCA Involvement in Vocational Education and Skill Training:

Pros: GCA involvement in this area would be responsive to strong interest expressed at the Gaberone meeting in Spring 1991, and to the importance which the majority of African Governments have placed on vocationalizing the school curriculum. The lack of consensus in both the definition of the problem and how to approach it creates an issue which GCA can address. The high cost of vocational education makes it a priority concern when efficiency and unit costs are of concern. Vocational education also has linkages to the larger issues of technology transfer and building capacity for human resource development.

Cons: This topic is in many ways a sub-sector issue with its own infrastructure of organizations, experts and donors who emphasize this field - including an active DAE working group which has sponsored a series of workshops highlighting the Bank's policy in this area. There are many such issues and GCA's resources might be more effectively used to address sector-wide constraints.

37. Higher Education. Higher education in Africa is at once the most visible, the most politically volatile, and the most expensive in terms of unit costs of all the levels in the educational system. Proportions of government current expenditures on education devoted to higher education are generally in the 20%-30% range, with some countries showing much lower proportions. The pattern for donor assistance shows an even greater prefer-
ence for higher education with an average of 34% of assistance in the first third of the 1980s. The ESSA estimates that assistance to higher education in Africa then amounted to $575 per student in contrast with an assistance level of $1.10 per pupil in primary education. The imbalance is even greater among bilateral agencies, with the notable exception of Swedish aid and more recently USAID, which in the early 1980's devoted over 40% of their assistance to higher education. The proportion for non-concessional aid from the World Bank was about 11% then and is essentially unchanged in the early 1990s.

38. Universities in Africa are in a state of crisis and in some cases in near collapse. (See Annex B for a fuller discussion of higher education) Rehabilitating these crucial institutions is essential, but equally apparent is the inability of governments to sustain them in the form which has characterized them in the decades since independence. University education in Africa for the 1990s and beyond requires reconceptualization. Important policy issues which are crucial for higher education are unresolved, including priorities among the different levels of education, relative rates of growth of university and other forms of higher education, relationships to labor market demands and absorption capacity, priorities of national research and post-graduate education, and the fundamental question of how higher education is to be funded. Compounding the policy issues are many practical problems like low internal efficiency, poor management, troublesome and unclear university - government relations, great difficulty in recruiting and retaining qualified staff, and rapidly deteriorating equipment and physical infrastructure.

39. The problems are so serious and widespread that donors are somewhat at a loss as to the best approaches to the problem. The ESSA policy document lays out some strategies based on financial analysis and there is some consensus on their desirability, although they have proven unusually difficult to implement and in some cases have had high political costs. Donors and governments alike lack any general agreement on the role and mission of higher education in Africa and how to begin a reform process. Many suggestions for change are being discussed including regionalization, designation of centers of specialization, redefining university - government relationships, and creating separate research institutions to house post-graduate programs.

40. Several donors have launched a variety of efforts aimed at defining the problem, articulating solutions, and establishing more effective policies for higher education. Major studies, consultative workshops, and international conferences are planned for the next few years by UNESCO, the World Bank, the Economic Development Institute and the Commonwealth Secretariat. GCA could join this evolving groundswell of effort to redefine and rebuild higher education in Africa. GCA could both assist the coordination and consensus building during this period of activity as well as marshalling support from Ministers of Finance and other leaders when some agreement does emerge.

41. GCA Involvement in Higher Education:

Pros: Much attention is now being focussed on higher education and GCA can ride the momentum which already exists, complementing and strengthening the value of the solutions which emerge. Governments may welcome support and help in reforming Higher education because it is so politically sensitive. Higher education is the source of tomorrow's leaders in Africa and hence is critical to any long-term goals which GCA has.
Higher education also provides obvious opportunities to link GCA with the ACBI initiative.

Cons: So much activity is already going on that GCA can hope to add little to the efforts already under way. Focussing on higher education tends to obscure the structural changes in the education sector which are necessary to promote long-term economic growth and increasing equity. DAE already has an active working group in higher education which in coordination with the Association of African Universities has a planned schedule of activities.

42. Other Sub-sectoral Options. There are a number of other sub-sectors within education which are probably not good candidates for GCA involvement, such as textbooks and learning materials, teacher training, examination reform, and educational administration. All of these are best handled by organizations already operating in the sector. One possible option for GCA might have been Basic Education. However, this topic has been the focus of a very effective world-wide campaign which culminated in the World Conference on Education for All in Thailand in March of 1990.\textsuperscript{4} GCA has little it could add to the efforts which have already taken place to promote the priority of Basic Education. Followup activities are being coordinated by UNESCO in collaboration with governments and other donors. GCA can and probably should take a public position of support, perhaps in the context of advocacy for increasing HRD expenditures.

43. Another option for GCA might be Youth, particularly the large populations of out-of-school and unemployed youth present in many countries. This sub-sector is linked to that of nonformal education, literacy and adult basic education, and for many is a part of the basic education agenda. However, most of the efforts in basic education will end up focussing on primary schools, leaving the youth issue largely unattended. Linkages are also apparent to skills training, informal sector development to generate jobs, and a variety of national youth services as ways of controlling this potentially disruptive group. GCA could help lead a coalition to address this issue, although it is probably of lower development priority than other options already discussed.

MAJOR INTERNATIONAL INITIATIVES IN HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

44. There are three international initiatives under way which should have linkages to any GCA efforts in the HRD sector: the Task Force of Donors to African Education (DAE), African Capacity Building Initiative (ACBI), and UNDP's National Long-Term Perspective Studies (NLTPS) initiative. Of the three, the DAE has been functioning the longest and hence has been the most productive. DAE is also the most comprehensive, encompassing activities in a variety of sub-sectors within education through its working groups. ACBI has just set up its secretariat and is defining its programmatic activities. NLTPS is also just getting under way. All three should be mutually aware of planned activities and seek ways in which to cooperate. GCA could provide the larger umbrella under which they share information and seek common areas of cooperation.

45. **Donors to African Education (DAE).** The DAE now has a membership of approximately 40 donors (See Annex A for details), an advisory board which includes five African Ministers of Education, and is seeking to set up an independent secretariat. The Task Force meets every two years at a time close to UNESCO General Conference. The work of DAE is carried on through a set of working groups, each lead by a particular donor and focussing on a specific topic or task. Donors and African representation participate in the work groups of their choice, and the results are shared at the bi-annual plenary sessions as well as through special workshops, conferences, publications and a quarterly newsletter. The DAE provides the best general structure for GCA to work in the human resource sector because it involves almost all the donors and African governments and because it works across all components of the sector. The structure is flexible, expanding and contracting to respond to changing priorities and demands. Its three year history of operation demonstrates the viability of the idea and the willingness of key players to participate and to provide meaningful financial support.

46. **Capacity Building.** African leaders have a strong interest in increasing the institutional capacity of their countries to produce the human resources required for development and to reduce the dependence on expensive foreign technical assistance. There is a general disillusionment with past efforts to develop capacity which have often been unsuccessful, or if once successful, are no longer working effectively. This broad-based concern covers the whole gamut of higher education institutions as well as more specific vocational and skill training activities at the secondary level. At this point, there is no general framework which either defines the nature of the problem of capacity building nor any consensus on just how donors and governments should go about building and maintaining such capacity.

47. One specific response to this challenge is the recently organized **African Capacity Building Initiative (ACBI)** which has a three-year capitalization from various donors and is currently staffing its secretariat in Harare. The objective of ACBI in its first phase is to build sustainable national capacity for economic policy making and development management. Later on ACBI activities may be broadened to other areas of capacity building. ACBI initially will a) assist countries in carrying out capacity assessment, b) strengthening national institutions based on the assessment studies, c) strengthening regional institutions, and d) creating new centers in existing institutions, probably on a regional basis. In addition ACBI is interested in stimulating demand for policy analysis, promoting an environment where policy analysts can work effectively, and providing regional centers where analysis can continue when a particular national political setting is not conducive to such work. The focus is on producing policy analysts, assisting them in carrying out their work, and promoting understanding and support for the use of the products by governments.

48. The broader demand for capacity building is not addressed by the initial phase of activities of ACBI. The overall problem of capacity building is closely linked to the issue of the role of universities and their linkages to specialized research institutions. If GCA were to get involved in the issue of capacity building, it should be on this more general basis. Working

---

jointly with ACBI, the African Institutional Development and Management section of the World Bank (AFTIM) and perhaps the DAE working group on Higher Education, GCA could start a process of research, sub-regional meetings and ultimately a regional meeting that would both define the nature of the problem of capacity building and try to arrive at some consensus on the roles of donors and governments in building more sustainable and relevant capacity. GCA has a key role because it can serve as a larger umbrella to facilitate coordination among these bodies. The conclusions could be part of a comprehensive policy statement on capacity building analogous to the ESSA policy document in education. The current state of ACBI and its programming suggests that such joint efforts would be more appropriate a year from now, although exploratory discussions could begin sooner.

49. **Long-Term Perspective Studies.** Growing out of the 1989 Long-term Perspective Study, "Sub-Saharan Africa: From Crisis to Sustainable Growth," UNDP is now proposing that each African state undertake a process of producing a National Long-Term Perspective Study (NLTPS) and that these studies be linked with others in the same sub-region of Africa. Current proposals being discussed by UNDP suggest a sequence of several steps: 1) Sub-regional meetings of Planning Ministers in 1991 to lay out designs for the planning process in their individual countries followed by methodological workshops for national teams; 2) Creation of national long-term plans with time horizons of 25 years; 3) Development of ten-year strategic plans, including sectoral level strategies, which would point the way toward the longer term goals; 4) Creation of an Africa-wide network of professionals and research institutions which would carry out ongoing training and maintain the planning capacity created by the exercise; and, 5) Development of a mechanism to promote stronger liaison between the donors and the governments, including a data base and a management information system which would facilitate access to African professionals, production of annual reports and a newsletter, and assistance in mobilizing the resources required for continued national planning.

50. The NLTPS process fits well into the goals of the Global Coalition for Africa and may provide opportunities for cooperation. The emphasis on sub-regional groupings linked to national teams matches GCA's focus on strengthening cooperation and sharing. Potentially these national plans provide an integrated framework within which all development activities should fit, including of course, the human resource development sector. At the moment, NLTPS is in its infancy and lacks tested experience of specific ways to implement the proposed process of national dialogue in developing long-term goals. As it stands, the proposal is fairly general and abstract. GCA might choose to become involved in strengthening the process, generating wider support for it, and helping to raise its priority. In the process GCA could also seek to raise awareness of the critical importance of increased support for HRD.

51. Ironically, it may well be that the education sector can provide a useful process model for creating dialogue and arriving at a degree of consensus on goals. Most African countries have a history of using periodic National Education Commissions to set forth statements of educational policy and goals. The process used by such education commissions could be modified

---

and adopted as part of the NLTPS, either on a sector by sector basis, or for the nation as a whole. Central to the process are methods designed to open up the discussion by soliciting opinions from various groups and individuals within the society. The final commission report, and, in Anglophone countries, the official government White paper generated in response, form the policy framework for the future. GCA could help the NLTPS look at a variety of models leading to a clearer and stronger process for promoting national dialogue on long-term goals.

KEY EXTERNAL DONOR AGENCIES

52. The paragraphs which follow briefly highlight the policy framework and the programmatic thrust of assistance from some of the major donors working in human resource development in Africa. The emphasis is on the education sector, although many donors also work in nutrition, food supply, basic health and access to water - all areas which together with education form essential components of human resource development.

53. International Development Association (IDA) - The World Bank (IBRD). IDA/IBRD has probably the most fully articulated policy framework of any donor for work in African education. The policies are set forth in the ESSA, which was itself the result of a multi-year process of consultation with African education leaders and with other donors. While the IDA/IBRD is not the largest donor to African education, with its new emphasis on policy reform it is the most influential in many countries. The ESSA document has been unusually effective in setting the terms of discussion for educational development in Africa among most of the donors and for many of the governments. Some countries and constituencies are not happy with the policies, but even they are forced to carry on the discussion in the context of the ESSA recommendations. In many ways, the process and the resulting document provide a model for donors and governments in creating policy frameworks in other sectors. In the broader human development area, the Bank is now carrying on an internal process to define its strategy in human development. A statement summarizing their approach should be available by mid to late 1991.

54. Fonds d'Aide et de Coopération (FAC). France is the largest donor to education in Africa, providing a little over one-quarter of all assistance in the early 1980s. The great majority of their aid takes the form of technical assistance - providing teachers and specialists to work in various institutions in Africa. Their assistance goes to Francophone countries and for some of them represents a significant part of their education budget. The French have recently undertaken a review of their education assistance policies. They feel that the emphasis on technical assistance has led to dependence rather than to an increase in institutional capacity, to which they want to give renewed priority in the future. They also seek to improve the linkage between education and the world of work, and want to develop national capacity to do ongoing assessment of educational systems in order to identify priority inputs and improve efficiency.

55. United Kingdom Overseas Development Administration (ODA). The 1970 "Government White Paper on Aid to Education in Developing Countries" highlighted the strategic importance of education for the creation of manpower for national development, and therefore the importance of curriculum reform and strong educational administration. During the 1980's, ODA has placed emphasis on science and technology, and manpower training - focussing on strengthening
key institutions and providing training in policy analysis and administration. Additional support is given for English Language Teaching, technical education, teacher training and curriculum reform, and for the production of materials and books for schools and libraries. The thrust of their education assistance can generally be summed up as building institutional capacity, particularly at the upper secondary and tertiary levels. These efforts are supplemented by a large project-related training and scholarship effort which sends Africans to England and other Commonwealth countries for training.

56. United States Agency for International Development (USAID). Since the mid 1980s USAID activities in African education have, by Congressional mandate, been directed toward basic education. Their policy framework is set out in a 1988 document "The Africa Bureau: Basic Education Action Plan." USAID has or is running basic education assistance efforts in eight sub-Saharan African countries, and will be starting two more a year for the next several years. These programs typically run five years and involve grant funds of thirty to forty million dollars for each country. Funding for African education has substantially increased in the late 1980s and is continuing into the 1990s. USAID has also increasingly moved toward the provision of budgetary assistance under what they term non-project assistance, which provides direct budget support in return for policy reform and implementation of agreed upon activities in education. This form of assistance de-emphasizes technical assistance in favor of government implementation to achieve the desired goals. Their program in each country targets education reform, combines budget support with technical assistance and is usually developed in close collaboration with the World Bank and other donors.

57. Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA). Currently supporting education programs in 11 countries, with education representing 5% of their bilateral development assistance. In Africa they are supporting literacy, primary education programs, and adult literacy programs in five countries. SIDA has a history of giving priority to basic education which predates the EFA efforts. SIDA also provides financial assistance to a number of Swedish NGOs working in African education such as missionary groups, trade unions and cooperative movements.

58. UNDP. The activities of UNDP in developing and supporting NLTPS were discussed in the previous section. Another recent initiative of UNDP is the publication of an annual Human Development Report which analyzes and monitors world-wide progress on human development. The reports present systematic data for nearly all the world's countries in one place and highlight successes and problems. The second edition will be released in late May of 1991. GCA may want to explore ways of associating themselves with that effort to enhance its priority and legitimacy as a central concern of development.

59. UNESCO is currently taking a leading role in the implementation of EFA after the World Conference in Thailand. Their approach involves four steps in which UNDP will assist countries to: 1) prepare a comprehensive human development plan, 2) identify priorities and financial commitments within the budgetary process, 3) develop financial plans and allocation strategies to meet human development needs, and 4) approach donor agencies with specific requests for assistance in this context. UNESCO activities in Africa are set in the context of the policy framework articulated in their "Priority: Africa" program of action for 1990-1995. This framework attempts to do within UNESCO and its fields what GCA hopes to accomplish in a broader context. The program
of action is broad and calls for UNESCO to assist across sub-sectors in
education ranging from literacy, to curriculum content, to textbooks, to
higher education. UNESCO has a regional office in Dakar (BREDA) and has been
active for decades in sponsoring a wide variety of regional organizations,
conferences, exchanges, and documentation on education in Africa. GCA must
certainly have some liaison with UNESCO if it seeks to work in HRD in Africa.

60. African Development Bank (AfDB). Invests in education where its own
staff can identify opportunities and often works within a larger policy
context set by the World Bank, UNDP/UNESCO or other donors. AfDB does not
have strong a policy framework which sets priorities for its education
activity. Has limited staff with expertise in human development so tends to
be a supporting player.

61. European Economic Community (EEC). Similar to the AfDB in that it tends
to be a supporting player without having strong policy imperatives for its
activities in education.

62. UNICEF. Traditionally worked with young children's health and nutrition
and was active in nonformal education. UNICEF is now enlarging and strength­
ening their efforts in basic education by hiring many new education profes­
sionals for the field offices.

63. This very brief overview neglects a number of bilateral donors who are
active in African education. For instance, the Germans, the Swiss, and the
Irish to name only a few have been quite active in vocational and technical
education. If GCA wants to work in a specific sub-sector, then collaborating
with the appropriate DAE working group would reach most of the important
actors. And of course there is an additional set of players in the NGO and
private foundation world. While these tend to be smaller organizations, they
have often played key roles in formulating approaches to problems or in taking
up the slack left by other donors. See Annex B for comments on the role of
private foundations in developing African higher education as an example.

OPTIONS FOR THE GLOBAL COALITION FOR AFRICA

64. The education component of the HRD sector in Africa is large, diverse,
and hosts a very large number of projects and educational development efforts.
The DAE project data base contains over 800 entries for current projects in
African education. Virtually every donor in the world which isn't restricted
to another region, has been or still is active in African education. GCA is
thus presented with a wide choice of possible options for its activities in
the human resource development sector.

65. There are several general strategies which GCA could use to approach
its activities in this sector - each reflecting a different level of priority
and activity in HRD:

a) Minimal Scenario. GCA could take a less active role initially,
content with a strategy to build visibility and to learn about the
sector by co-sponsoring and attending key regional meetings and helping
to generate support for the various existing initiatives like DAE, ACBI
and NLTPS. GCA would be available to step in as critical junctures
appeared and to provide the moral and political influence critical to
the success of one or another key initiatives.
b Moderate Scenario. GCA could concentrate its effort at the highest levels, advocating the priority requirements of HRD with core ministries of Finance, Development or Planning. GCA would serve as bridge between Ministers of Education and higher level policy makers. Using existing meetings of Finance or Planning Ministers, GCA would find ways to involve them in dialogue about issues in HRD and the importance of "investment in people" to the success of activities in other sectors. The focus of GCA would be sector-wide issues of general importance.

c) Involved Scenario. GCA could pick one or more specific themes from within the education sector and make a long term commitment to promoting those issues. That would mean, sponsoring research studies, convening small working groups, publishing papers, and gradually building up to a regional consensus on that topic. In the process GCA would become known as the organization which was taking the lead in that topic area in Africa. The knowledge and capacity to pursue the theme further could ultimately be institutionalized in an appropriate regional organization.

66. GCA must decide how high a priority it wants to place on the Human Resource Development component of its program, in part by comparing its relative advantage in education to other sectors. Education is a complex sector with a long history of involvement by an array of bi- and multi-lateral donors which means that GCA will have to spend time establishing their role and reputation with the various players on the education scene in order to be effective. In the process GCA will come to better understand the strengths and limitations of the various organizations and can better judge where GCA's involvement will be most productive. Several of the new initiatives like ACBI and NLTPS are just beginning and are thus hard to assess as potential collaborators. DAE has more of a track record and is probably the best place to begin.

67. A number of possible actions are listed below, from which GCA can choose. By combining actions, different levels of involvement can be produced, as well as a sequence for the three year workplan. (Specific recommendations are contained in the accompanying memorandum)

1) Publicize GCA interest and support of HRD as a critical area. Disseminate selected documents about HRD and about GCA's plans to Ministers of Education, Finance, Development and Planning.

2) Build visibility and credibility for GCA by attending meetings and listening to African officials. Several upcoming options to meet with Ministers of Education include:
   a) Dakar, July 1991 - UNESCO Ministers of Education meeting. Sets goals for education once every five to ten years. Focus this time on following up on declarations from WCEFA in Thailand.
   b) Manchester, England, October 1991 - Plenary meeting of DAE advisory group and associated meeting of Ministers of Education. Linked to DAE seminar on textbooks.
   c) Spring 1992 - EDI of the World Bank is sponsoring a seminar for African Ministers of Education with a focus on Higher Education. GCA should be visible if it plans to become involved in higher education in future.
3) Work to keep the issue of increased support for HRD on the national agendas of Africa. Sponsor seminars, workshops, or add-on activities at already scheduled meetings of Ministers of Finance, Planning or Development. Develop a process for use at such meetings which promotes open dialogue, discussion of options, provides good examples from other African countries, and provides strategies by which countries can increase support of HRD.

4) Build an ongoing relationship with DAE, currently the best candidate for collaboration with GCA. (Monitor the evolution of ACBI and NLTPS initiative of UNDP for greater possible involvement with GCA in the future.) Help to strengthen African participation in DAE and to further its links with core ministries and national leaders.

5) Choose one or two specific sub-sector issues to pursue in the three year workplan. For instance, have GCA work in higher education in 1993 to take advantage of the gathering momentum in that field. Serve as an umbrella to assist the various donors and governments to move toward consensus and an action plan for rescuing higher education in Africa. Plan a sequence of steps beginning with publications and media, then national and sub-regional meetings, and culminating in an Africa-wide meeting where emerging consensus is ratified and next steps planned. If that works well, choose a second topic, such as vocational education, and pursue that during the third year using a similar sequence of activities.

68. Of course, one option is to do nothing in HRD precisely because so much is being done by others. While this is attractive at first glance, the centrality and political importance of education and human development makes this choice somewhat risky. If GCA judges its comparative advantage in HRD to be relatively low, the best option is probably some version of the minimal scenario outlined above. There is a real crisis in the ability of African governments to sustain their existing educational system, never mind halting the decline in quality and keeping up with the demands of growing populations. GCA can and should play a role in coping with that crisis, although HRD related activities of GCA might be combined with those in population and nutrition in some integrated way.
ANNEX A
The Task Force of Donors to African Education

This annex is adapted in part from an AFTED proposal to strengthen the Task Force of Donors to African Education.¹ That proposal seeks funding to establish an independent secretariat for DAE in order to provide a base which is less closely identified with the World Bank and to insure consistent leadership and support for DAE activities. The existence of the DAE Task Force and its subsidiary working groups provides an organization with which GCA can collaborate in a variety of ways. Because of the strength of DAE, GCA will be able to work effectively with the education sector without having to build further infra-structure. DAE can also facilitate more rapid and effective use of GCA’s influence on key issues in the sector.

Genesis of Donors to African Education

Investing in people is a critical element of the Bank’s strategy for African development as put forward in the Region’s Long-Term Perspective Study (LTPS). The educational aspects of this strategy were laid out earlier in the Bank’s 1988 policy study, "Education in Sub-Saharan Africa." Just as the Global Coalition for Africa (GCA) has grown out of the LTPS of 1989 and the Maastricht Conference of 1990, the Task Force of Donors to African Education (DAE) emerged from the Bank’s earlier discussions with donor agencies and African governments about the proposed policies for education development.

The DAE was founded in January, 1988, at the conclusion of a meeting in Paris convened by the Bank to mark the release of the education policy study. In addition to two Vice-Presidents (Messrs. Jaycox and Rajagopalan) and all of the Bank’s AFR-PHR Division Chiefs, the Paris meeting was attended by representatives of most of the principal donor agencies (multilateral and bilateral) and a number of NGOs and implementing agencies working in African education, as well as a select group of African Ministers of Education (chosen with the support of the full body of Ministers to be their representatives). There was consensus on the principal issues that had been raised in the Bank’s paper and agreement on the general recommendations -- viz, the development of comprehensive country-specific strategies for education and training and better coordination among donors in support of such strategies. A major conclusion of the meeting was the call for the establishment of a standing organization to provide for continued coordination and sharing of information in order that donors could become more effective in supporting African education development. Hence the DAE.

Since that meeting in early 1988, the full Task Force of the DAE has met four times. At the first formal meeting of the group in June, 1988, the 28 original members which now exceeds 40 -- see list at end of this annex -- established nine working groups to address in greater detail some of the key policy issues identified in the Bank’s paper. The working groups, which vary in size from four agencies to as many as sixteen, have convened meetings since then to discuss substantive policy issues and have launched and supported a variety of research undertakings relating to these issues. The accomplish-

¹/ "Strengthening the Task Force of Donors to African Education" a proposal submitted to the Special Grants Program by AFTED in April, 1991.
ments of the smaller working groups are reviewed at the less frequent meetings of the larger Task Force. The Netherlands, Norway, USAID, and Germany have provided substantial grants to support African participation at these working group meetings and to permit participation of five African Ministers of Education at each meeting of the Task Force.

The Task Force now meets once every other year at the time (around October) of the General Conference of UNESCO, so as to take advantage of the presence of many African Ministers of Education together in one place. To these special meetings of the Task Force, referred to as plenary meetings, all of the Ministers are invited. A plenary meeting was held in October 1989 with 22 African Ministers in attendance, and another is scheduled for this coming October. The next meeting is scheduled for October, 1991 in Manchester, England.

Accomplishments of the DAE

Following three years of steadily expanding effort, the DAE now offers a framework within which to address substantive problems of educational development in Sub-Saharan Africa. As would be expected, the DAE working groups have set tasks for themselves that are, in some cases, very ambitious and, in other cases, rather more modest, and the groups have progressed at differing rates. While the frequency of meetings has varied among the working groups, in all cases the emphasis has been on holding meetings only as required and on using meetings to chart or monitor progress on work programs addressing the relevant substantive issues. These work programs are conducted through commissioned studies and in-house agency reviews. A number of reports have been produced under the sponsorship of individual working groups. Some groups have convened major meetings to disseminate findings to other agencies and African policymakers. The working groups’ efforts are intended to translate the Bank’s general strategy, as articulated in the policy study, into concrete actions, and already they have influenced significantly the policies of African governments and donor agencies.

Specific accomplishments include the following (the name of the lead agency for each working group is given in parentheses):

(1) Working Group on Examinations (HEDCO-Ireland). Has completed a 14-country study which includes for each country a costed action plan to improve its examination system. These plans were discussed at a meeting in Ireland of the Ministers of Education from all 14 countries. Follow-up work, including preparation of examination components of Bank-financed projects, is being made possible by secondment to AFTED by the Irish government of a specialist on examination reform.

(2) Working Group on Vocational Education and Training (ILO). Has built on Bank-wide work in this area by PRS. Members of the working group participated in a Ministerial policy forum on VET in Turin, and this has been followed up by African regional seminars held in Lomé (for Francophone policymakers, December 1990) and Mauritius (for Anglophone, April 1991).

(3) Action Group on the Donors Information System (DIS) (World Bank, AFTED, with Rockefeller Foundation funding). Because the mandate of the
agencies that have helped to build the DIS was clear from the start, this group has been called an action group, as distinct from a working group. With a staff member sitting in AFTED, which has served this and other secretariat-type functions (see below), the DIS already boasts a database of over 1,200 activities (projects, programs, and sector studies) funded by 25 agencies. By sharing of the information among donors, this system is being used to identify activities (and the agencies and individuals responsible for them) in a particular country (e.g., Zambia) or in a particular sub-sector or topic (e.g., higher education or female participation).

(4) Books Sector Working Group (ODA, with funding from EEC, the Bank, CIDA, SIDA, the Government of Quebec, and ODA itself). Has sponsored six comprehensive country case studies (covering authorship, publishing, printing, distribution, and utilization, as well as library development), and has produced recommendations for recipient governments and donors to consider when formulating and implementing book development activities. Will convene a meeting of the larger DAE membership to consider these recommendations in Manchester, England, in October, 1991.

(5) Higher Education Working Group (World Bank, AFTED, with Ford Foundation and other funding). Has met twice and will re-convene in Dakar in June. Has completed an issues paper on higher education and (through the Association of African Universities) a study of successful cost-saving measures initiated by African institutions themselves. Has commissioned new analyses of university governance and of efforts to diversify funding sources. Staff work for this group is provided by a senior analyst seconded from and fully supported by the Ford Foundation for two years.

(6) Action Group on the Exchange of Sector Studies (UNESCO). Has collected over 100 sector studies completed on 40 African countries by 15 DAE agencies. Is creating a database that will allow this information to be disseminated so that duplication is avoided.

(7) Working Group on Statistics (SIDA). Has developed a proposal that would provide for UNESCO's Statistics Office to assist in the improvement of education statistics and information systems in Sub-Saharan Africa. The UNESCO proposal is under revision with help from the Bank, USAID, and especially SIDA, which has indicated a willingness to fund much of the five-year, two-million dollar project.

(8) Working Group on the Teaching Profession (Commonwealth Secretariat). Has completed reviews of donor support to the profession and of current efforts to train school heads in the region. Members of the working group will meet with African officials in Zimbabwe in late April to plan research and program activities.

(9) Working Group on the Mobilization of Resources (World Bank, AFTED). A principal recommendation of the Bank's policy study was that countries in Sub-Saharan Africa develop country-specific and regional strategies for the future of education in the Region and that, wherever appropriate, donors provide the necessary financial and technical assistance to facilitate the development of such strategies. When the DAE was
established, the French Government volunteered to lead this working group, but when staffing changes in FAC resulted in little action on the part of this group, AFTED assumed responsibility. A USAID- and GCA-supported consultant is currently based in AFTED for six months and is drafting, inter alia, a discussion paper to guide future work on this topic.

These were the nine original working/action groups. To respond to differing and changing interests among donor agencies, four new groups have been identified since the DAE was set up in 1988. (Other groups, as they fulfill their terms of reference, are expected to disband.) At the plenary meeting of the DAE in 1989, two new groups were added, and their work is already well underway:


(11) Working Group on Female Participation (Rockefeller Foundation). Has met two times to identify the critical issues and delineate the focus of the Group. Has obtained commitments from a number of donors to support a proposal of the African Academy of Sciences (AAS) to mount a small grants program for research on gender issues in education. AFTED is developing a regional study on this issue as part of its contribution to the group's efforts. The working group is meeting again in April to secure financial commitments and to finalize plans for the small grants program.

At the DAE Task Force meeting in Vienna in July, 1990, another two groups were proposed -- a Working Group on Basic Education to be led by UNESCO, and a Working Group on the Evaluation of Education Systems to be led by the French. The future status of these two groups will depend on the initiative taken by the lead agencies and on the extent of interest on the part of other donor agencies.

Among donor agency personnel and African policymakers involved with the DAE as official representatives of their own agencies and ministries, and among others (such as individuals in the Association of African Universities, the African Academy of Sciences, and the British Council) who have worked on specific projects under the aegis of the DAE, there is significant support for the DAE concept and for the way it has been implemented. The DAE has demonstrated that bilateral and multilateral agencies can move beyond their traditional and narrowly determined priorities and cooperate closely to assist the development of education in Africa.

In sum, much has been accomplished by the DAE in a relatively short period of time, and the demand for the services of the DAE network has grown among all of the donor agencies, NGOs, and African governments involved. The Task Force has succeeded in its first three years because it fulfills an obvious need, and because the Bank, through AFTED, has been willing to contribute the necessary leadership and staff time to make it work.
Annex A - Description of DAE

- African Development Bank (AfDB)
- Austria (Federal Ministry of Foreign Affairs)
- Belgium (Administration Generale de la Cooperation)
- Bernard Van Leer Foundation
- Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)
- Carnegie Corporation
- European Economic Community (EEC)
- Commonwealth Secretariat
- Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA)
- Finnish International Development Agency (FINNIDA)
- Ford Foundation
- France: Ministry of Cooperation
- Germany: Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation (BMZ),
  German Foundation for International Development (DSE), and
  German Agency for Technical Cooperation (GTZ)
- Gulbenkian Foundation
- International Development Research Centre (IDRC)
- International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP)
- International Labour Organization (ILO)
- Ireland: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and
  Higher Education for Development Cooperation (HEDCO)
- Italy: Ministry of Development Cooperation (DGCS)
- Japanese International Cooperation Agency
- The Netherlands: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and
  Ministry of Education and Science, and
  The Netherlands' Universities' Foundation for
  International Cooperation (NUFFIC)
- Norway: Ministry of Development Cooperation
- Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)
- Pew Charitable Trusts
- Rockefeller Foundation
- Sasakawa Peace Foundation
- Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA)
- Swiss Development Cooperation (SDC)
- United Kingdom, Overseas Development Administration, (ODA)
- United Nations' Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF)
- United Nations' Development Programme (UNDP)
- United Nations' Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA)
- United Nations' Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)
- United Nations' Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO)
- United States' States Agency for International Development (USAID)
- The World Bank (IDA/IBRD)
The Need for a New Model of University Education in Africa

Crisis in African Universities. The decline in resources for education in the past decade has hit higher education particularly hard. Trevor Coombe in his report on higher education in Anglophone Africa says "The damage sustained by under-resourcing the universities during the years of economic decline...has been massive and in some areas debilitating." The 1989 meeting of the Association of African Universities (AAU) focussed on the crisis in African Universities and the problems with relationships between donors and universities. Particularly endangered are post-graduate programs which in many cases have effectively ceased to operate. In a study of graduate training in economics in Africa sponsored by the African Economic Research Consortium, Jeffrey Fine says bluntly that "Advanced training in economics appears, with some notable exceptions, to have collapsed in Sub-Saharan Africa."

Important policy issues are unresolved such as priorities within the education sector as a whole, the rate of access to higher education, the relative rates of growth of university and non-university systems, labor market absorption of graduates, priorities of national research and post-graduate education, and of course, sources of funding for higher education. Compounding the policy issues are many practical issues like low internal efficiency, poor management, difficult university - government relationships, lack of virtually every kind of input, great difficulty in recruiting and retaining qualified staff, and rapidly deteriorating equipment and physical infrastructure.

On the donor side there is some general consensus about overall policy directions, but it is largely financial in nature - mostly relating to cost sharing and reducing unit costs for higher education - and implementing these policies so far has proven very difficult in most countries. Attempts to reform financing of higher education have led to demonstrations, violence - in April 1991 Mali's Minister of Education was killed by students protesting fee increases - and not infrequently the temporary closing of universities. These policies are sometimes perceived by African Universities as a campaign against university education in favor of basic education. Donors do not have any general plan as to what higher education in Africa should be or do, and of course each university and country has its own ideas about the appropriate role for higher education in development. There is an emerging awareness that the structure and function of universities as they have been in the past may no longer be a sustainable option in the future, but there is great reluctance to abandon the model which is felt to have been relatively successful in the past twenty years.

Regionalization. The intuitive logic of regionalization with accompanying designations of centers of specialization (rather than centers of excellence which implies a negative quality comparison with other institutions) is very appealing to donors and outside observers. For a variety of reasons it is less appealing to African Universities and Governments, not the least of which are memories of unsuccessful attempts in the past like the University of East Africa and UBLS. Those who know the most about the local situations and in some cases have studied the issue (For example, AERC's study of options for post-graduate degrees in Economics) are also concerned about the possible impact on the quality of staff in universities which are not designated in
particular fields and hence on their teaching and research in that field. Yet the constraints of fiscal feasibility are overpowering and rationalization of offerings within a region cannot be wished away. Part of the challenge is to identify and create practical incentives for countries to actively cooperate in such regional schemes.

One successful example of regional cooperation is provided by an agreement on centers of specialization in Agricultural Studies in Southern Africa. Each of the participating Universities has agreed to specialize in a particular sub-field within agriculture. The accord was reached under the auspices of the Special Programme for African Agricultural Research (SPAAR), the Southern African Centre for Cooperation in Agricultural Research (SACCAR), in cooperation with the Deans of Faculties of Agriculture from the nine SADCC countries. Similar action ought to be possible in other sub-regions, particularly in high-cost subjects which require expensive equipment and scarce staff.

However, there are a number of necessary conditions - such as reliable economic support for the program, mutual recognition of degrees, easy mobility of students and their associated bursaries across national lines, ready solutions to foreign exchange problems, and freedom from interference by national governments - which are essential to make such agreements work. Knowing what the necessary conditions are and seeing that they are put in place will be essential if sustainable regionalization is to take place. As a preliminary step in the quest for this knowledge, the AAU is currently sponsoring a study of ten West African Universities to provide the basis for discussion about cooperation and specialization.

Government - University Relations. A central motif in the dialogue about African Universities is their relationship to the national government. Universities seek more fiscal and programmatic autonomy in order to seek solutions to the crisis, to experiment and innovate with programs, to control their size, and to manage their personnel more effectively. Yet, universities sometimes fail to confront the conflict between their desire for autonomy and their almost complete dependence on the government for their funding. In practice, governments often make key administrative appointments, intervene in management practices, and alter the size of entering classes with little consultation with university leadership. Since Universities are often the source of expressions of discontent with government policies, the government can and does intercede, sometimes forcefully, in putting down demonstrations by sending police or army units onto campus. These difficult issues have undermined the sense of autonomy and responsibility at the university and have often had a detrimental effect on the quality of education. Moreover, until governments and their universities reach some consensus on the mandate of the university in the national context, reform efforts are likely to encounter mixed results at best.

Research Institutions. The critical need for high-level technical training in specialized fields as well as research grounded in Africa has led to the founding of separate research institutes in some cases. A debate is continuing as to whether such research institutions should be the site for specialized post-graduate training programs, or whether such programs should be based in universities with linkages through internships and research fellowships to the separate research institutions. Examples of both approaches exist. While there is certainly room for greater pluralism in the conduct and dissemination
of policy-related research, some consensus is essential to attempts to identify regional centers of specialization in various subjects.

**Key Organizations and Activities in Higher Education**

African Universities participate in a diverse array of sub-regional, regional and supra-regional organizations, associations, and linkages. Some of the better known organizations are listed below.

a. **Association of African Universities (AAU).** AAU is an association of about 100 universities with a secretariat based in Accra. There are more Anglophone members the AAU does include Francophone members. The AAU is supported by member subscriptions and various donors. The association holds general conferences - the last one in Cairo in 1989 - and undertakes research on issues of interest to its members.

b. **l'Association des Universités Partiellement ou Entièrement de Langue Français (AUPELF).** A world-wide association of french speaking universities whose secretariat has been in Quebec, but may be moving to Paris. AUPELF is linked to another organization, l'Université des Réseaux d'Expression Français (UREF) which may subsume AUPELF in the future. Together they provide a variety of linking services including documentation, exchange of students and researchers, and support of training and research.

c. **African Network of Scientific and Technological Institutions (ANSTI).** Nine cooperating universities each run a specialized program and coordinate activities in their field on behalf of the consortium. Coordination takes place through a management committee of ANSTI. The secretariat is based in Nairobi at the UNESCO Regional Office for Science and Technology for Africa (ROSTA).

d. **African Regional Post-graduate Programme in Insect Science (ARPIS).** Ten universities have formed a consortium on whose behalf the International Centre of Insect Physiology and Ecology (ICIPE) hosts students doing thesis research. This is an example where universities have joined with a specialized research institute to strengthen the practical and research components of a degree program.

e. **Association of Eastern and Southern Universities (AESAU).** One of several regional associations of universities. Rotating presidency currently with University of Zambia. AESAU has been relatively inactive since 1988.

f. **Association of Commonwealth Universities (ACU).** An example of a supra-regional association, in this case over 330 universities in the English-speaking Commonwealth, including nearly 200 in developing countries. The association is part of the education activities of the Commonwealth Secretariat.

g. **International Association of Universities (IAU).** A world-wide association of about 600 universities from 120 countries which was formed in 1950 and has recently undergone a process of revitalization. Its central Bureau is in UNESCO House in Paris. IAU and UNESCO jointly support an Information Centre on Higher Education and publish a bulletin
and a journal on Higher Education Policy. IAU played a major role in creating TRACE (See below), a higher education information network to support evaluation of academic credentials required for mobility of students and staff.

This is a small sample of the many such organizations, but serves to indicate the diversity and complexity of associations. Not included in this list are a variety of information networks, research and documentation centers and other kinds of linkages. Examples of these would include:

AAS - African Academy of Sciences
AERC - African Economic Research Consortium
CAMES - Conseil Africain et Malgache de Education Supérieure
CODESRIA - Council for Development of Economic and Social Research in Africa
COREVP - Conference of Rectors, Vice-Chancellors and Presidents of Universities in West Africa
ESAURP - Eastern and Southern African Universities Research Programme
OSSREA - Organization of Social Science Research for East Africa
SADIS - Southern African Documentation and Information System
PADIS - Pan-African Documentation and Information System
TRACE - Trans Regional Academic Mobility and Credential Evaluation

Nigeria with 160,000 students and 30 universities is a system unto itself with its own set of internal associations and linkages which to some extent parallel external associations. In addition there are myriad discipline-based associations which link departments and individual faculty members in the same discipline. Just compiling a master list of associations and linkages for Sub-Saharan Africa would be a challenging research task. Going further to assess the functions, viability, and usefulness of the organizations for Africa in the 1990s would be a valuable but time-consuming task. There may be at least partial existing inventories with agencies like UNESCO or one of the associations of universities which could form the basis of such an effort.

Donor Organizations and Activities

The challenges faced by higher education in Africa, and elsewhere, have been given high priority in the research and policy development activities of a number of international organizations working in education in Africa.

» The Population, Human Resources, Education and Employment (PHREE) Division of the World Bank has recently begun a three year process of research and consultation which will culminate in an institutional policy paper on higher education.

» The Economic Development Institute (EDI) of the World Bank is sponsoring an international seminar for Ministers of Education in Kuala Lumpur this year, to be followed by a regional seminar in Africa in the Spring of 1992. The focus of both meetings is higher education.

» UNESCO is in the middle of a series of consultations on "higher Education and the Changing Needs of Society" which will form the basis of a UNESCO Publication in 1992. This process will lead to a policy paper on higher education in the 21st century. UNESCO is
considering a meeting of Ministers of Education in Africa in 1992 to discuss the report. In early 1991, UNESCO launched a major initiative known as UNITWIN to pair up universities worldwide through twinning networks.

In 1987 UNESCO organized a Regional Advisory Committee on Higher Education in Africa, which subsequently planned an ambitious program of activities for the 1987-1991 period. UNDP funding was not available and that program was begun on a reduced basis by UNESCO's regional office in Dakar (BREDA).

The International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) in Paris is cooperating with the UNESCO effort by carrying out a worldwide study of innovations in university management.

The Commonwealth Secretariat initiated the Commonwealth Higher Education Support Scheme (CHESS). CHESS will initially focus on developing management of higher education and making available information and advisory services in management. Other donors will be encouraged to fund projects within the framework of CHESS.

This partial listing of activities demonstrates impressively the extent to which issues in higher education are currently dominating the policy development agenda of the major multi-lateral agencies. Complementing these research and policy efforts are several other donor sponsored activities.

The most recent meeting of the higher education working group of the Donors to African Education was held in Accra in December of 1990 in collaboration with AAU. At that meeting both universities and donors recognized a continent-wide institutional crisis that had long been ignored. The meeting focussed on the critical role of donors in higher education and some of the problems with current forms of support. The working group will be meeting again in Dakar in June, 1991 to look at university management and the task of strengthening post-graduate programs, including the issue of regional cooperation.

The picture of donor activities would be incomplete without the mention of the many NGOs, particularly private foundations which have historically been instrumental in the development of African Universities. From the United States Ford, Carnegie and Rockefeller were all active in the 1960's and 1970's in support of institution building at selected African Universities. Their efforts were complemented by support from a variety of British, Dutch and other European foundations. Recently Ford and Rockefeller have begun a process of reassessment of their roles in support of higher education after having been less active in that field during the 1980s. The report by Trevor Coombe cited at the beginning of this annex was commissioned by Ford and Rockefeller. The International Development Research Centre (IDRC) in Ottawa has supported research for many years and is currently carrying out an assessment of research capabilities of African Universities.

Options for the Global Coalition for Africa

There is a widespread lack of consensus on the role and function which universities can realistically play in the future of Africa. Many are in a crisis situation and can't continue without substantial new inputs and probably a restructuring of their purpose. If the government isn't clearly in
support of the university mission then the chances for reforms are not promising. Consensus should be sought first within national contexts so that society, the government and the university all share a common concept of the mission of universities and higher education. That foundation can then form the basis for reforms at the national and the regional level. Helping to support a process on the national level would be a good initial step for GCA in concert with other organizations.

GCA could choose to facilitate a process of dialogue and to support mechanisms from which a consensus among donors, governments and universities could emerge about the appropriate role of universities in Africa in the future. Indicative questions for the discussion would include:

- Training for what? - given that the public service is largely full and the labor market is growing slowly and changing in its needs.
- What is the Research role for universities in Africa? How does that relate to the role of centers of specialization and non-university research institutions?
- What is the role of the University in the process of political pluralization? Does that role have some limits?
- Should University education be fully subsidized? If not, how does one proceed toward diversification of financing of universities?
- What are appropriate standards of quality for the universities?
- Should higher education continue with the elite model of the past, or should it become more of a mass education option?

Because of the high level of activity in this sub-sector by the major donors, GCA must find an entry point if it wishes to support the development of a new consensus and assist in coordinating support for activities called for by that consensus. Discussions with DAE and its working group, UNESCO, and perhaps EDI prior to its seminar in spring of 1992 should be undertaken to identify ways in which GCA can help to bring together these many initiatives in the field of higher education in Africa.

To work in higher education GCA can choose an already scheduled meeting, such as the EDI policy seminar in Harare in the spring of 1992 and get directly involved. One option is co-sponsoring the meeting and using that as a vehicle to introduce GCA and its agenda in higher education to the Ministers of Education. A more ambitious option is to schedule some sub-regional workshops or other activities prior to the Harare meeting in collaboration with the DAE working group on higher education or jointly with one or more of the associations of African universities. A third option, is to choose a specific theme within higher education and begin a process of commissioning studies and research, followed by sub-regional meetings, publications and a sequence of activities which builds a reputation as the key player on that issue. This third option is probably more appropriate for one of the higher education organizations in Africa, although GCA could become an active catalyst, sponsor and fund raiser for the process and share in the reputation which results.
Selected References on Higher Education in Africa


