A Fight to the Death: Two Catalog Search Interfaces Battle it Out

Cristina Tofan, Eastern Kentucky University
Todd King, Eastern Kentucky University

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/cristina_tofan/5/
Two Catalog Search Interfaces Battle it Out

A Fight to the Death

Todd King  Cristina Tofan
Systems Administrator  Web Specialist
Eastern Kentucky University Libraries
The need for a new interface

Getting started = learning curve

Has that card catalog feel

Opac not aged well
The battle begins

Encore “oooooo”

WorldCat Local “aaaaaa”
Usability planning

Students
(individual sessions, “think-aloud” protocol)

Faculty
(focus group)

TEST WITH:

Staff
(tasks, brown bag)

Different groups, Different approaches

Jakob Nielsen: “The best results come from testing no more than 5 users and running as many small tests as you can afford.”

http://www.useit.com/alertbox/20000319.html
Usability w/ Students

Pre-test
(demographics, library instruction, used catalog before?)

Session
(8 tasks)

Post-test
(assessment of each interface)

Data collected in Google forms

Free food + [whatever] = ☺
Students: questions

1) Is the book “Pyres” available for checkout?
2) Does the library have the journal, “Physical Geography”? If it does, what years are held in print, and what issues are available online?
3) Find an article on the death penalty.
4) Does the library own Macbeth on DVD?
Usability w/ Faculty

Focus Group

Lunch
Free food + intellectual discussion = ☺

Observe Activity

Show Interfaces

Open-ended activity: just try them out

Laptops
Usability with Staff & Web Visitors

We know catalogs!

“Brown Bag” w/ staff to introduce the interfaces

Gave them tasks to try on their own

Collected feedback in Google form

Discussed results at follow-up brown bag

Just passing through

Visitors to our website

Online feedback form (surveymonkey this time)
Encore – positive

New design
Nice touch

Tags by library & user

Just gimme one box

Articles, too
I didn’t search Bikini, honest

Encore – negative

Where articles? oh ...

Available or not? Click again?

No Advanced Search?

That’s not SFX!
WorldCat Book Results

Pyres
Author: Derek Nikitas

Find a copy online
Check for online access at your library
Get More at EKU

Find a copy in the library
Please visit your library to get this item.

EKU Libraries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Call number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MAIN COLLECTION</td>
<td>0.1 Lost 09/18/2009</td>
<td>PS35914.A64 P57 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Call number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MAIN COLLECTION</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>PS35914.A64 P57 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Call number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITY ARCHIVES Special Collections</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>PS35814.A64 P57 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Had to click again
WorldCat Journal Search

Search results for 'physical geography' limited to EKU Libraries

Refine Your Search

Results 1-10 of about 3,399 (20 seconds)

Select All Clear All Save to: [New List] ▼ Save

1. The Encyclopaedic dictionary of physical geography
   by Andrew Goudie; et al
   Book
   Language: English
   Publisher: Oxford, OX, England ; New York, NY, USA : Blackwell, 1
   Held by: EKU Libraries
   View all editions and formats

2. Physical geography.
   Journal, magazine : Periodical
   Language: English
   Publisher: Silver Spring, MD : V.H. Winston & Co. [1960-]
   Held by: EKU Libraries
   View all editions and formats

3. Physical geography
   by Michael P McIntyre
   Book
   Language: English
   Publisher: New York; Ronald Press Co. [1968]
   Held by: EKU Libraries
   View all editions and formats

Two of the same title – what now?
Elec. Holdings not very obvious

WorldCat Journal Results

Physical geography.
Publisher: Silver Spring, MD : V.H. Winston, ©1980-

Find a copy online.
Check for online access at your library

Get More at EKU

Links to this item
EKU Libraries (0)
No Links were found

Other libraries (2)
Show all links from other libraries (2)

Find a copy in the library
Please visit your library to get this item.

EKU Libraries
Get It In the library

1 copies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Call number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Found the print
WorldCat Journal Results - Online

Didn’t make it this far
Results of Usability

**Students**
(19 students)
Books: Encore > WorldCat
Articles: WorldCat > Encore
Overall: WorldCat >> Encore *

**Faculty**
(20 faculty)
Books: WorldCat >> Encore
Articles: WorldCat >> Encore
Overall: WorldCat >> Encore

**Staff**
(17 responses)
Books: WorldCat > Encore
Articles: WorldCat >> Encore
Overall: WorldCat > Encore

We liked WorldCat ... we think
The Backend

Encore
- Export records from Voyager
  - Locations?
  - Suppressed Records?
- Format the files for Encore
  - Different record format
  - Display holdings info?
- Import records to Encore
- Automate daily updates
  - Additions
  - Changes
  - Deletions
- No Admin module
- Patron load for login
- Hosted own server – own backups
- “Turnkey”?

WorldCat Local
- Complete Customization Form
  - Make search groups
  - Change colors
  - Add links
  - Wanted more changes, but not avail.
- Integrating SFX, ILLiad, Z39
- Any probs in WorldCat are here
  - OCLC Numbers
  - Batch Load – confusing way to fix it
## Decision (no win by knockout)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Books</th>
<th>Journals</th>
<th>SFX</th>
<th>ILL</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Lists</th>
<th>Tags</th>
<th>Search</th>
<th>Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encore</td>
<td>1 clk</td>
<td>1 clk</td>
<td>2 clks</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes *</td>
<td>Ok</td>
<td>Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCL</td>
<td>1 clk</td>
<td>1 clk</td>
<td>2 clks</td>
<td>3 clks</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes *</td>
<td>Ok</td>
<td>Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WC</td>
<td>2 clk</td>
<td>2 clk</td>
<td>2 clks</td>
<td>3 clks</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Ok</td>
<td>Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opac</td>
<td>Imm.</td>
<td>Imm.</td>
<td>1 clk</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- show status & call #
- # clicks to get there
- Cell txt
- ability to do these
- general quality stmt

Compared major features of all products and how good/bad they were at important tasks

* Encore also has a star-rating system
* WCL can have patron reviews
And the winner is ...

... it’s a draw (i.e. neither)
What now?

- Use current Opac: tweak it/upgrade it
- Get “WorldCat Local Quick Start”
- Continue usability studies
- “Wait and See”

---

cristina.tofan@eku.edu
todd.king@eku.edu