Land Use Regulation (2d ed.)

Stewart E Sterk
Eduardo M. Penalver
Sara C Bronin

Available at: https://works.bepress.com/bronin/20/
UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES®

LAND USE REGULATION

SECOND EDITION

STEWART E. STERK
H. Bert and Ruth Mack Professor of Law
Benjamin Cardozo School of Law, Yeshiva University

EDUARDO M. PEÑALVER
Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law
Cornell Law School

SARA C. BRONIN
Professor of Law and Faculty Director, Center for Energy and Environmental Law
University of Connecticut School of Law

FOUNDATION PRESS
The publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice, and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

University Casebook Series is a trademark registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

© 2011 by THOMSON REUTERS/FOUNDATION PRESS
© 2016 LEG, Inc. d/b/a West Academic
444 Cedar Street, Suite 700
St. Paul, MN 55101
1-877-888-1330

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-1-62810-129-4
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface .............................................................................................................................. iii

Table of Cases .................................................................................................................. xv

Chapter One. Introduction ................................................................................................. 1

I. Why Regulate Land Use ............................................................................................ 1
   A. Efficiency Concerns ............................................................................................. 1
   B. Aesthetic Concerns ............................................................................................ 2
   C. Community Concerns ......................................................................................... 3

II. Regulating the Regulators ....................................................................................... 6
   A. Who Are the Regulators? ................................................................................... 6
   B. Planners and Planning ....................................................................................... 6
      1. Some History and Theory ............................................................................. 6
      2. Planning on the Ground: The Role of Plans and Planners in the Regulatory Process ........................................................................................................................................... 7
   C. The Political Economy of Land Use Regulation ................................................. 9

III. The Doctrinal Starting Point: Village of Euclid ...................................................... 11

   Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co. .................................................................... 12

   Notes and Questions ............................................................................................... 19

Chapter Two. Zoning Basics ............................................................................................ 23

I. The Zoning Enabling Act ........................................................................................... 23

II. The Zoning Ordinance or Its Equivalent ............................................................... 23
   A. Division into Districts ....................................................................................... 24
      1. Use Restrictions ........................................................................................... 24
      2. Area & Bulk Restrictions ........................................................................... 24
      3. Height Restrictions ...................................................................................... 25
      Problems ........................................................................................................ 25
   B. The Zoning Map .............................................................................................. 26
   C. Administrative Provisions .............................................................................. 27

III. Variances ............................................................................................................... 28

   Sasso v. Osgood ................................................................................................... 29

   Notes and Questions ............................................................................................. 35

IV. Tools for Increasing the Flexibility of Zoning Ordinances .................................... 39
   A. Special Exceptions or Conditional Uses ......................................................... 39
      Petition of Skeen .............................................................................................. 40
      Notes and Questions ........................................................................................ 43
      917 Lusk, LLC v. City of Boise ......................................................................... 45
      Notes and Questions ........................................................................................ 49
      Chrismon v. Guilford County .......................................................................... 51
      Notes and Questions ........................................................................................ 56
## Table of Contents

B. Incentive Zoning................................................................. 59  
   East Midtown Rezoning: Looking for Extra Zoning Rights?  
      They're for Sale.......................................................... 61  
      Notes and Questions.................................................. 62  
C. Transferable Development Rights............................................ 63  
   Selling the Sky: Katz’s Delicatessen and the Sale of Air Rights......................................................... 64  
   Notes and Questions...................................................... 67  
V. Accessory Uses........................................................................ 67  
   Matter of New York Botanical Garden v. Board of Standards and Appeals .......................................................... 67  
   Notes and Questions......................................................... 73  
VI. Zoning Amendments............................................................... 75  
VII. Non-Conforming Uses.......................................................... 76  
   Cleveland MHC, LLC v. City of Richland.................................. 76  
   Notes and Questions......................................................... 79  
   Trip Associates, Inc. v. Mayor and City Council of Baltimore........ 80  
   Notes and Questions......................................................... 87  
   Modjeska Sign Studios, Inc. v. Berle....................................... 88  
   Notes and Questions......................................................... 92  
VIII. New Urbanist Zoning.......................................................... 93  
    Questions............................................................................. 96  
IX. Review Problems..................................................................... 97  

### Chapter Three. Beyond Zoning: Large Developments, Historic Properties, and Aesthetics  

I. Regulating Large Developments.................................................. 99  
   A. Special Zoning Techniques.................................................. 99  
      1. Floating Zones and Planned Unit Developments .................. 100  
         Campion v. Board of Aldermen of the City of New Haven .................. 102  
         Notes........................................................................... 108  
      2. Cluster Zoning............................................................... 110  
         Nexum Development Corp. v. Planning Board of Framingham .................. 111  
         Notes and Questions..................................................... 114  
   B. Subdivision Regulation.......................................................... 115  
      Andrews v. Planning and Zoning Commission of the Town of Wallingford .................. 117  
      Notes and Questions......................................................... 120  
   C. Site Plan Review.................................................................. 129  
      Derry Senior Development, LLC v. Town of Derry.................. 129  
      Notes and Questions......................................................... 134  
II. Historic Preservation.............................................................. 135  
   A. Designation....................................................................... 136  
      Billy Graham Evangelistic Association v. City of Minneapolis .................. 136  
      Notes and Questions......................................................... 146
Chapter Four. Developer Challenges: State Law ........................................... 171
I. Municipality Has Exceeded Its Powers ................................................. 171
   A. State Preemption of Municipal Powers ........................................... 172
      City of Springfield v. Goff .......................................................... 172
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 175
   B. Extent of Municipality’s Delegated Powers ....................................... 176
      City of Ocean Springs v. Homebuilders Association of
      Mississippi ................................................................................ 176
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 181
      Note on Special Assessments ...................................................... 183
   C. Unlawful Exactions .......................................................................... 184
      520 Victor Street Condominium Ass’n v. Plaza ................................. 184
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 189
II. Vested Rights ......................................................................................... 190
   A. Establishing Vested Rights ................................................................ 190
      Metro Dev. Comm’n of Marion County v. Pinnacle Media, LLC ... 190
      Geisler v. City Council of Cedar Falls ........................................... 196
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 200
   B. Determining the Scope of Vested Rights ........................................... 202
      New Castle Investments v. City of LaCenter ................................... 202
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 207
   C. Terminating Vested Rights ................................................................ 208
      Fountain Village Development Co. v. Multnomah County ............. 208
      Notes and Questions .................................................................. 212
III. Zoning Estoppel ................................................................................... 213
    West End Citizens Association v. District of Columbia Bd. of
    Zoning Adjustment ........................................................................ 213
    Town of West Hartford v. Rechel .................................................... 217
    Notes and Questions .................................................................. 222
IV. Public Policy ......................................................................................... 223
    Gangemi v. Zoning Board of Appeals of the Town of Fairfield ....... 223
    Notes and Questions .................................................................. 227
V. Vagueness ............................................................................................. 228
    Kosalka v. Town of Georgetown ..................................................... 228
    SP Star Enterprises, Inc. v. City of Los Angeles ............................. 230
    Notes and Questions .................................................................. 232

Chapter Five. Developer Challenges: Federal Law .................................... 235
I. Takings .................................................................................................. 235
   A. Historical Background ................................................................... 235
Mugler v. Kansas ................................................................. 235
Pennsylvania Coal Co. v. Mahon ........................................... 239
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 243
B. Theoretical Perspectives ................................................ 244
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 246
C. *Penn Central* Balancing ................................................ 247
Penn Central Transportation Co. v. New York City ................. 247
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 258
D. Per Se Rules ................................................................... 262
Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council ............................... 262
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 271
Note on Judicial Takings ..................................................... 273
E. Notice (and the Denominator Problem, Revisited) ............. 275
Palazzolo v. Rhode Island ..................................................... 275
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 284
F. Moratoria ..................................................................... 286
Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional
Planning Agency .............................................................. 286
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 297
G. Unconstitutional Conditions: Limiting Municipal Power to
Exact Benefits from Landowners .......................................... 299
Nollan v. California Coastal Commission ............................... 300
Dolan v. City of Tigard .......................................................... 305
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 315
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 325
H. Remedies .................................................................... 327
First English Evangelical Lutheran Church of Glendale v.
County of Los Angeles ....................................................... 327
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 335
Problems ....................................................................... 337
I. Ripeness and Limitations on Access to Federal Court ...... 338
Williamson County Regional Planning Commission v.
Hamilton Bank ................................................................... 339
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 343
San Remo Hotel, L.P. v. City and County of San Francisco..... 345
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 351
J. Property Rights Legislation ............................................... 353
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 357
Question ....................................................................... 359
II. The Due Process Clause ................................................. 359
United Artists Theatre Circuit, Inc. v. Township of Warrington . 360
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 365
Town of Rhine v. Bizzell ....................................................... 367
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 373
III. Discrimination Claims: Equal Protection and the Fair Housing
Act .............................................................................. 375
A. Discriminatory Line-Drawi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hernandez v. City of Hanford</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. “Class of One” Claims</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village of Willowbrook v. Olech</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loesel v. City of Frankenmuth</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Discrimination Against Racial and Ethnic Minorities</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban Neighborhood Regeneration and the Phases of Community Evolution</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After World War II in the United States</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village of Arlington Heights v. Metropolitan Housing Development Corp.</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs v. Inclusive</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communities Project, Inc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Discrimination Based on Disability</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinnamon Hills Youth Crisis Center, Inc. v. Saint George City</td>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Discrimination Based on Family Composition</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moore v. City of East Cleveland</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Free Speech Claims</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Sign Regulation</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Metromedia Case</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. City of Ladue v. Gilleo</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reed v. Town of Gilbert</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions—Billboard Regulation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions—Residential Signs</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Adult Use Regulation</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Renton v. Playtime Theaters, Inc.</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Los Angeles v. Alameda Books, Inc.</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Religious Freedom Claims</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westchester Day School v. Village of Mamaroneck</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elijah Group, Inc. v. City of Leon Valley</td>
<td>481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Chapter Six. Neighbor Challenges to Municipal Land Use Decisions ................................................................. 487  
I. Standing ......................................................................................................................................................... 487  
   Matter of Sun-Brite Car Wash, Inc. v. Board of Zoning and Appeals ...................................................... 488  
   Notes and Questions ............................................. ................................................................................... 491  
II. Neighbor Challenges to Zoning Amendments .......................................................................................... 493  
   A. Conformity with a Plan ........................................ .................................................................................. 494  
      Griswold v. City of Homer ................................................ .......................................................... 494  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 498  
   B. Failure to Comply with Statutory Procedures ...................................................................................... 501  
      Wally v. City of Kannapolis ........................................ ............................................................... 501  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 505  
   C. Spot Zoning ................................................ ...................................................................................... 506  
      Little v. Winborn ........................................................ ............................................................... 506  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 510  
   D. Standard of Review ................................................ .............................................................................. 512  
      1. The Traditional (and Majority) Approach ........................................................ ......................... 512  
         DiRico v. Town of Kingston ........................................ ............................................................... 513  
         Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 516  
      2. The Change/Mistake Rule ........................................ .............................................................. 517  
         Clayman v. Prince George's County ........................................ .................................................. 517  
         Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 521  
      3. Are Zoning Amendments Legislative or “Quasi-Judicial”? ....................................................... 523  
         Fasano v. Board of County Commissioners ........................................................ ...................... 523  
         Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 530  
         Problem ........................................................ ...................................................................................... 533  
   III. Neighbor Challenges to Administrative Determinations ............................................................... 533  
   Bontrager Auto Service, Inc. v. Iowa City Board of Adjustment .............................................................. 534  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 543  
   IV. Environmental Review ................................................ .............................................................................. 545  
   Chinese Staff and Workers Association v. City of New York ............................................................... 549  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 553  
   Bakersfield Citizens for Local Control v. City of Bakersfield .............................................................. 554  
      Notes and Questions ................................................ ............................................................................ 564  
      Problem ........................................................ ...................................................................................... 567  
   
   Chapter Seven. Development Problems .................................................................................................... 569  
   Problem One: Exurban Subdivision ......................................................................................................... 569  
   Problem Two: Suburban Multi-Family Housing ....................................................................................... 593  
   Problem Three: Urban Redevelopment I .................................................................................................. 607  
   Problem Four: Urban Redevelopment II .................................................................................................. 625
# Table of Contents

**Chapter Eight. Private Restrictions on Land Use and the Rise of Common Interest Communities** ........................................ 655

I. Introduction ........................................................................ 655
   A. Nuisance ........................................................................ 655
   B. Covenants ....................................................................... 656

II. The Mechanics of Creating a Common Interest Community .......... 658
   A. The Declaration ................................................................ 658
   B. The Bylaws of the Community Association ......................... 659
   C. The Plat Map .................................................................... 659
   D. The Deed .......................................................................... 660
   Notes and Questions .............................................................. 660

III. The Power to Levy Assessments ................................................ 662
    Parker v. Figure “8” Beach Homeowners’ Association, Inc......... 663
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 666

IV. Private Architectural Controls .................................................. 669
    Valenti v. Hopkins .................................................................. 670
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 675
    Note on Standard of Review More Generally ......................... 677
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 678

V. Governance: Adapting to Change ............................................... 679
    Weldy v. Northbrook Condominium Association, Inc .............. 680
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 685
    Woodside Village Condominium Association, Inc. v. Jahren .... 688
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 695

VI. Public Policy Limits on Private Restrictions .................................. 697
    Committee for a Better Twin Rivers v. Twin Rivers Homeowners’
     Association .................................................................... 697
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 706

VII. Business Improvement Districts .................................................. 711
    Notes and Questions .............................................................. 712

**Chapter Nine. The Problem of Scale in Land Use Lawmaking** ........ 715

I. Municipal Formation and the Fragmented Metropolis ..................... 716
   Notes and Questions .............................................................. 718
   Village of Barrington Hills v. Village of Hoffman Estates ........ 720
   Notes and Questions .............................................................. 723

II. Approaches to the Problem of Scale .............................................. 725
   A. Getting Local Governments to Think Sublocally ................. 725
      Notes and Questions .............................................................. 727
   B. Getting Local Governments to Think Regionally .................. 727
      1. Obligations to Account for Regional Impacts in Zoning
         Decisions ......................................................................... 727
         Associated Home Builders of the Greater Eastbay, Inc. v.
         City of Livermore ............................................................. 727
         Notes and Questions .............................................................. 734
Table of Contents

2. The *Mt. Laurel* Doctrine ........................................... 738
   Southern Burlington County N.A.A.C.P. v. Township of
   Mount Laurel .................................................... 738
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 738
   Southern Burlington County N.A.A.C.P. v. Township of
   Mount Laurel (Mt. Laurel II) .................................. 747
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 747
3. Anti-Snob Zoning Statutes ........................................ 756
   Problem .......................................................... 758
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 759
C. Creating Regional Governance ................................. 760
   1. Regional Governments ....................................... 760
   2. Special Use Districts ........................................ 761
      Wrestling with MUDs to Pin Down the Truth About Special
      Districts ......................................................... 761
      Questions ....................................................... 762
D. Pouring New Wine into Old Wineskins ....................... 762
   1. City-County Consolidation ................................ 762
   2. State Land Use Regulation ................................ 762
      Rudd v. Malheur County ..................................... 763
      Notes and Questions .......................................... 768
   3. Federal Involvement in Land Use Planning ............... 768
      a. Coastal Zone Management Act ............................ 769
      b. Urban Renewal .............................................. 769
      c. Transportation Policy ..................................... 770
      d. Environmental Statutes ..................................... 771
      Rancho Viejo, LLC v. Norton ................................ 773
      Questions ....................................................... 781
E. Land Use Law and Climate Change ............................ 781
   Cleveland National Forest Foundation v. San Diego
   Association of Governments .................................... 783
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 791

Chapter Ten. Local Government as Market Participant ...... 793
Kelo v. City of New London .......................................... 794
Notes and Questions .................................................. 803
Centene Plaza Redevelopment Corp. v. Mint Properties ....... 806
Notes and Questions .................................................. 809

Index ......................................................................... 813