The History and Historiography of Jyw

A. Taeko Brooks, University of Massachusetts - Amherst
The History and Historiography of Jyw

A Taeko Brooks 白妙子
University of Massachusetts at Amherst
WSWG Note 117 (27 Dec 1996)

Abstract. Non-Sinitic Jyw was located at 35° 35’ N, 118° 50’ E, east of the Lù capital and astride the upper Shū 江 River valley, the major north/south route to the lowlands of eastern Chí. Jyw appears often in the Lù chronicle Chun/Chyōu 督秋 (CC), but it was not one of the great states of the age. I here compare the treatment of Jyw in the CC, which acknowledges it routinely, and in the Dzwó Jwán 左傳 (DJ), which reshapes Jyw into a textbook example of misrule and deserved destruction.

Material. Of 204 occurrences of Jyw in both texts, 80 are in CC and 124 in DJ. The pattern of correspondences is complicated. I distinguish five types, A through E:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>has Jyw</td>
<td>has Jyw</td>
<td>has Jyw</td>
<td>lacks Jyw</td>
<td>no passage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DJ</td>
<td>no passage</td>
<td>omits Jyw</td>
<td>has Jyw</td>
<td>has Jyw</td>
<td>has Jyw passage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8/0</td>
<td>21/0</td>
<td>51/87</td>
<td>0/32</td>
<td>0/5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29 occurrences (Types A-B) are in CC passages without parallel DJ mention; 138 (Type C) are in passages where both texts mention Jyw; 37 (Types D-E) are in passages where DJ has Jyw but CC does not, or CC has no corresponding passage. That is, DJ both adds to and subtracts from the set of CC mentions of Jyw.

Jyw in the CC. The CC entries, whether or not they possess DJ parallels, give a consistent picture. It is roughly this: Jyw was militarily and diplomatically active from the beginning to the end of the period covered by the CC; it was often in conflict with Lù to the west and with Chí 聘 to the north; it expanded at the expense of its weaker neighbors, and was itself pressed militarily by Lù, and also, especially in later CC reigns, by Chí, Jin, and Chu. I take these CC entries to be a contemporary record, and accurate within the CC’s own limits of reportorial propriety.

Types A and B: Jyw is Mentioned Only in CC

The CC mentions of Jyw for which DJ lacks a parallel passage (Type A) include these situations: (1) Jyw attacks another state: 1/4:1 (Chí 楚) and 9/14:5 (Lù). (2) Visit of Lù ruler’s wife: 3/19:4 and 3/20:1. (3) Marriage of Lù ruler’s third daughter to an officer of Jyw: 3/27:5. (4) Death of Jyw ruler: 8/14:1 and 12/14:8, reported as a matter of diplomatic protocol. (5) Lù and Chí together attack Jyw: 7/11:3. These passages show Jyw participating normally in the standard Spring and Autumn interstate activities of war, diplomacy, and intermarriage.

1Omitting DJ 9/23:4, where Jyw is a personal name.
2For the courtly reticence of CC diction, see now Brooks Distancing.

Warring States Papers v1 (© 2010)
The History and Historiography of Jyw

All 21 of the Type B cases, where a DJ parallel passage does not repeat the CC mention of Jyw, are joint actions by several northern states. Of these, 15 are meetings and 5 are military actions. DJ discussions of these events tend to emphasize the role of Jn and to downplay that of the smaller states; they also sometimes stress the role of officers at the expense of rulers. These are major DJ themes. For example, the CC reports in 5/28:8 that the ruler of Lū met with 7 heads of state, including Jyw, and covenanted with them. In the DJ version (5/28:4), the Jōu King is present, confers honors on the Jn ruler, and appoints him leader of the states (衛). It is likely that the DJ story is part of that text’s retrospective construction of a bà or Hegemon theory. In any case, the presence of Jyw is a CC detail which the DJ does not see fit to retain.

Again, CC 9/9:5 records that the Lū ruler joined with 10 heads of state, including the ruler of Jn, the heir of Chi, and the ruler of Jyw, to invade Jvng. In the 12th month of that year these rulers made a special type of covenant: an expression of solidarity (tūng-mvng 閡盟). The parallel DJ 9/9:5 omits this meeting altogether (and with it the mention of Jyw) and mentions only officers of Jn as granting Jvng’s request for peace. A theory that the source used by DJ did not mention this meeting cannot be sustained: the one source which we know DJ used, and which DJ often explicitly quotes, is CC. It would seem that the DJ is here imposing its “officer usurpation” model on CC facts which do not entirely fit that model, and that it is also denying to Jyw any participation in the collective security arrangements of the northern states.

Type C: Jyw is Mentioned in Both CC and DJ

The 87 occurrences of this type may be divided into three groups. (1) DJ is favorable or neutral toward Jyw (9, or 10%). These are usually short and repeat CC information, sometimes with more detail. They are minor events and do not raise issues of interpretation. (2) DJ is ostensibly favorable but adds details which are subtly critical (17, or 20%), such as DJ 1/2:2 and 6/7:7, which feature women in the background of events, a negative trait in DJ; and 8/7:4, where in both texts Jyw participates in a multi-state campaign to relieve Jvng, but DJ adds that Jyw later submitted to Jn. (3) The DJ is openly unfavorable to Jyw (61, or 70%).

The unfavorable aspects of the third group (61 mentions of Jyw in 23 passages) are conveyed by DJ material added to the brief CC entry. These are summarized in the table on the next page. I divide them into “external” passages, where events are seen as from the outside, and “internal” ones, which focus on the personality or actions of the Jyw ruler or his ministers. What is striking about these passages is that the “external” entries tend to occur in the first eight reigns, while the “internal” ones are largely confined to the last three. It is hard not to notice, in the latter category, actions which are typical of the “bad last ruler” of a failing dynasty: dismissal of worthy ministers, lack of proper feeling between father and son, cruelty toward the people, or refusal to follow good advice. In terms of Warring States historiographical rhetoric, they are an indictment of these Jyw rulers, and a prediction of doom for the Jyw state.

3See now Brooks Evolution.
4See now Brooks League.
Internal

6/18:7A Jyw ruler is killed by a son he degraded and people he mistreated

9/31:18 tyrannical Jyw ruler murdered by people
10/1:11 Jyw ruler “threw men away” so Chí instals new ruler
10/5:6 Jyw officer defects with three cities to Lú
10/14:4 Jyw son shows no grief at death of ruler; the people do not follow him
10/14:6 Jyw ruler flees to Chí
10/19:7 Jyw ruler suffers for killing an innocent man
10/22:1 Jyw ruler hated by people, does not heed remonstrance; is defeated
10/23:4 Jyw ruler practices swordsmanship on people; is expelled

External

3/10:4 Chí extinguishes Tán. Tán ruler flees to Jyw
4/2:3 Lú officer flees to Jyw; has intrigue with ruler’s wife
5/1:6 Jyw defeated by Lú
6/8:5 Lú officer follows lady to Jyw
7/4:1 Jyw is unreconciled to Tán, and is attacked by Lú
7/13:1 Jyw makes terms with Jin, and is attacked by Chí
8/9:10 Jyw unprepared; attacked by Chu
9/12:1 Jyw defeated by Lú
9/14:1 Jin seizes Jyw envoy to Chu
9/16:1 Jyw ordered by Jin to return lands; refuses; Jin seizes Jyw ruler
9/23:7 Jyw surprised by attack of Chí [which refuses Jyw bribes]
9/24:6 Jyw attacked by Chí
10/5:7 Jyw makes no preparations and is defeated by Lú
10/10:3 Lú attacks Jyw

• Internal/External Division of Type C DJ Passages Negative Toward Jyw •

Types D and E: Jyw is Mentioned Only in DJ

I now come to DJ passages which add Jyw where CC makes no mention of Jyw, or where there is no CC counterpart passage at all. These are clearly DJ inventions.

In Type D, where DJ mentions Jyw but the parallel CC passage does not, there are 7 cases of people fleeing to Jyw, an event already represented in the material discussed above. The fugitives in these 7 cases come from nearby Lú, Chí, and Lú, or from Jin and the Jōu court. The motives of some of these fugitives are disreputable, and the DJ reader will get the impression that Jyw was a haven for the undesirables of other states.
In DJ 10/4:5, Jyw had conquered but later ill-treated the small state of Dzvng, with the result that now Lu “takes” the chief city of Dzvng. DJ editorializes on the ease of the taking, which it says was an acceptance of the offer of the city to Lu by one of its commanders. We are here asked to believe that Jyw’s mismanagement had first alienated, and then entirely lost, a conquered territory.

The DJ entries without CC counterparts (Type E) include anecdotes of Jyw refusing to strengthen its walls (8/8:8) and losing its trophy vessels to Lu (10/7:7). Again we see Jyw as negligent of its defenses and unable to hold onto its victories.

Types D and E thus add nothing novel, but they do continue the pattern of the previous types. Jyw in the DJ is regularly criticized, and in the later years of Spring and Autumn, it is consistently portrayed as oppressive and incompetent.

In Type D and E passages, the DJ is unconstrained by any CC parallel text, and this material should thus show any DJ bias more directly. It turns out to be very much on the lines of the DJ addenda to CC passages (Type C). That is, in extending CC entries, the DJ is as little constrained by earlier information as when it is writing on its own.

Conclusion

The CC treats Jyw simply as an active member of the Spring and Autumn family of states. In the CC account, Jyw enters into marriage relations with Lu. It has a place at conferences and on the battlefield with (and sometimes against) the northern states. The DJ tends to suppress that record, and in its place to insert material critical of Jyw. In the absence of a CC counterpart entry, DJ simply invents negative material. Part of this hostility may be impatience with the presence of a small non-Sinitic state in the Spring and Autumn record. But most of it seems to stem from a DJ historiographical agenda, in which Jyw figures only as a state doomed to extinction by its own misrule. Historiography has here not functioned to reveal the meaning of the events of history; it has added to, and subtracted from, those events in order to reach a desired meaning. Historiography has triumphed over history.

Works Cited

A Taeko Brooks. The League of the North. WSP v1 (2010) 204-213

5Mwòdž 18 (c0362) says of Jyw: “In the east, there was the state of Jyw. It was a small state among large states. It did not respectfully serve the large states, and they did not like it or favor it. So on the east, Yuwè carved out its richest lands, and on the west, Chi simply annexed it.” This indictment agrees that Jyw’s fate is its own fault. It is also contemporary with much of the negative DJ material (see Brooks Heaven). Jyw was a historiographical problem for the 04th century Sinitic states, a problem which different Sinitic theory texts solved in different ways.