

## National University of Ireland, Maynooth

---

From the SelectedWorks of Seth Barrett Tillman

---

March 15, 2005

### Extract from Meese, Spalding, and Forte's The Heritage Guide to the Constitution citing Lawson-Tillman exchange on Article I, Section 7, Clause 3

Seth Barrett Tillman, *None*



SELECTEDWORKS™

Available at: [http://works.bepress.com/seth\\_barrett\\_tillman/61/](http://works.bepress.com/seth_barrett_tillman/61/)

form  
mi-  
writing  
ol

# THE HERITAGE GUIDE TO THE CONSTITUTION

Edwin Meese III  
Chairman of the Editorial Advisory Board

David F. Forte  
Senior Editor

Matthew Spalding  
Executive Editor

Several researchers also supported the project, working with Dr. Forte at Cleveland-Marshall College of Law: Catherine Bozell, Max Dehn, Otto Elkins, John Friedmann, Siegmund Fuchs, Sara Govrik, Krista Kaleps, Sara Menefee, Terrell Menefee, Susan Owens, Joseph Patituce, Stephen Tylman, and Steven Vargo.

On several occasions a number of scholars, some of whom are also contributors, were consulted as advisors or as outside readers on particular essays: Herman Belz (The University of Maryland), Roger Clegg (Center for Equal Opportunity), Stephen J. Darmody (Shook, Hardy & Bacon, L.L.P.), Steven J. Eagle (George Mason University School of Law), John Eastman (Chapman University School of Law), Joel Finer (Cleveland-Marshall College of Law), Rick Garnett (Notre Dame School of Law), Deborah Geier (Cleveland-Marshall College of Law), Arthur Hellman (University of Pittsburgh School of Law), Nelson Lund (George Mason School of Law), Phillip Muñoz (Tufts University), Kevin O'Neill (Cleveland-Marshall College of Law), Stephen Safranek (Ave Maria School of Law), Steven Steinglass (Cleveland-Marshall College of Law), Adam Thurschwald (Cleveland-Marshall College of Law), and Seth Tillman (Clerk, United States Court of Appeals, Third Circuit).

*The Heritage Guide to the Constitution* was made possible by two self-made entrepreneurs and generous philanthropists. Born in Italy, Henry Salvatori founded the Western Geophysical Company, one of the most successful oil-exploration and contracting enterprises in the world. B. Kenneth Simon was a marine during the Second World War before founding and building a thriving business called All-Pak to distribute, design, and contract the manufacture of packaging materials. Later in life, both dedicated their time and considerable fortunes to strengthening the underpinnings of American liberty and constitutionalism. That dedication continues because of endowments they created at The Heritage Foundation.

David F. Forte  
Matthew Spalding

*Legislative Subpoenas Under the Orders, Resolutions, and Votes Clause*, 83 Tex. L. Rev. 1373 (2005)  
Seth Barrett Tillman, *A Textualist Defense of Article I, Section 7, Clause 3: Why Hollingsworth v Virginia Was Rightly Decided, and Why I N S v Chadha Was Wrongly Resolved*, 83 Tex. L. Rev. 1373 (2005)

**Significant Cases**

*Hollingsworth v Virginia*, 3 U.S. (3 Dall.) 378 (1798)  
*I N S v Chadha*, 462 U.S. 919 (1983)

**See Also**

Article I, Section 7, Clause 2 (Presentment Clause)  
Article V

**Suggestion for Further Research**

CONGRESSIONAL QUARTERLY'S GUIDE TO CONGRESS  
(4th ed. 1991)

Gary Lawson, Comment, *Burning Down the House (and Senate): A Presentment Requirement for*

See Also  
Article I, Section 7, Clause 2 (Presentment Clause)  
Article V (Prohibition on Amendment: Slave Trade)  
Article V (Prohibition on Amendment: Equal Suffrage in the Senate)

#### Suggestions for Further Research

RICHARD B. BERNSTEIN, *AMENDING AMERICA: IF WE LOVE THE CONSTITUTION SO MUCH, WHY DO WE KEEP TRYING TO CHANGE IT?* (1993)  
Richard B. Bernstein, *The Sleeper Wakes: The History and Legacy of the Twenty-seventh Amendment*, 61 *FORDHAM L. REV.* 497 (1992)  
ROBERT A. GOLDWIN, *FROM PARCHMENT TO POWER: HOW JAMES MADISON USED THE BILL OF RIGHTS TO SAVE THE CONSTITUTION* (1997)  
Edward Harnett, *A "Uniform and Entire" Constitution; or, What if Madison Had Won?*, 15 *CONST. COMMENT.* 251 (1998)

John O. McGinnis & Michael B. Rappaport, *Our Supermajoritarian Constitution*, 80 *TEX. L. REV.* 703 (2002)  
Henry P. Monaghan, *We the People(s): Original Understanding, and Constitutional Amendment*, 96 *COLUM. L. REV.* 121 (1996)  
Seth Barrett Tillman, *A Textualist Defense of Article I, Section 7, Clause: Why Hollingsworth v. Virginia Was Rightly Decided, and Why I N S v. Chadha Was Wrongly Resolved*, 83 *TEX. L. REV.* 1373 (2005)  
JOHN R. VILE, *THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDING PROCESS IN AMERICAN POLITICAL THOUGHT* (1992)

#### Significant Cases

*Hollingsworth v. Virginia*, 3 U.S. (3 Dall.) 370 (1790)  
*Hawke v. Smith*, 253 U.S. 221 (1920)  
*National Prohibition Cases*, 253 U.S. 350 (1920)  
*Dillon v. Gloss*, 256 U.S. 368 (1921)  
*Leser v. Garnett*, 258 U.S. 130 (1922)  
*United States v. Sprague*, 282 U.S. 716 (1931)  
*Coleman v. Miller*, 307 U.S. 433 (1939)

#### Prohibition on Amendment: Slave Trade

... no Amendment which may be made prior to the Year One thousand eight hundred and eight shall in any Manner affect the first and fourth Clauses in the Ninth Section of the first Article...

(ARTICLE V)