# Online Supplement-George Mwangi et al (2023).pdf 

Ryan S. Wells

## Online Supplement

## Racial equity in transfer incentive policies: A critical mixed methods analysis

Authors:

- Chrystal A. George Mwangi
- Patricia Feraud-King
- Ling Chen
- Miguel Tejada
- Caryn Brause
- Kat J. Stephens
- Jamina M. Scippio-McFadden
- Jeffrey Edelstein
- Ryan S. Wells

Correspondence: cgeorgem@gmu.edu
Article: $\quad$ Racial equity in transfer incentive policies: A critical mixed methods analysis
Published: Community College Review, 2023

Table S1. Weighted means and standard errors of policy-relevant variables, for Latinx students only, by race (presented as percentages) ( $\mathrm{n}=1560$ )

|  | Amer. <br> Indian/Alaska <br> Native | Asian | Black/African- <br> American | More than one <br> race | Native <br> Hawaiian/Pacific <br> Islander |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Full-time student | $35 \%(0.05)$ | $33 \%(0.13)!$ | $44 \%(0.07)$ | $33 \%(0.07)$ | $36 \%(0.08)$ |  |
| Under age 24** | $98 \%(0.01)$ | $88 \%(0.08)$ | $94 \%(0.03)$ | $96 \%(0.03)$ | $91 \%(0.05)$ | $40 \%(0.02)$ |
| Delayed enrollment | $28 \%(0.05)$ | $41 \%(0.12)$ | $37 \%(0.08)$ | $45 \%(0.09)$ | $33 \%(0.09)$ | $43 \%(0.02)$ |
| Developmental education | $56 \%(0.05)$ | $67 \%(0.12)$ | $63 \%(0.07)$ | $50 \%(0.09)$ | $52 \%(0.08)$ | $54 \%(0.02)$ |
| GPA>3.0 | $42 \%(0.06)$ | $56 \%(0.1)$ | $62 \%(0.07)$ | $54 \%(0.09)$ | $47 \%(0.08)$ | $55 \%(0.03)$ |
| Continuous enrollment | $75 \%(0.05)$ | $75 \%(0.12)$ | $68 \%(0.07)$ | $80 \%(0.07)$ | $72 \%(0.06)$ | $75 \%(0.02)$ |
| Associate attainment | $11 \%(0.04)!$ | N/A | $7 \%(0.03)!$ | $7 \%(0.04)!!$ | $10 \%(0.04)!!$ | $8 \%(0.01)$ |
| STEM major | $11 \%(0.03)$ | $23 \%(0.14)!!$ | $11 \%(0.04)!$ | N/A | $13 \%(0.05)!$ |  |

*p $<.05 ;{ }^{* *} \mathrm{p}<.01 ; * * * \mathrm{p}<.001 ; \mathrm{N} / \mathrm{A}=$ suppressed due to possible identification concerns, in accordance with the NCES restricted data license agreement.
$!=$ standard error is between 30 and 50 percent of the estimated mean value, indicating an unstable estimate
$!!=$ standard error is greater than 50 percent of the estimated mean value, indicating a very unstable estimate
NOTE: Numbers are rounded to the nearest 10 in accordance with the NCES restricted data license agreement. Some totals may not agree due to this rounding. SOURCE: U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics, 2012-14 Beginning Postsecondary Students (BPS:12/14).

Table S2. Weighted means and standard errors of policy-relevant variables, by gender, disability, and first generation status (presented as percentages)

| Latinx Students ( $\mathrm{n}=1560$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 39\% (0.03) | 40\% (0.03) | 37\% (0.05) | 40\% (0.02) | 38\%* (0.02) | 50\%* (0.05) |
| Under age 24 | 89\% (0.02) | 88\% (0.03) | 84\% (0.05) | 89\% (0.02) | 88\% (0.02) | 90\% (0.03) |
| Delayed enrollment* | 37\%* (0.03) | 45\%* (0.03) | 31\% (0.06) | 41\% (0.03) | 40\% (0.03) | 42\% (0.05) |
| Developmental education | 56\% (0.02) | 54\% (0.03) | 56\% (0.06) | 55\% (0.02) | 55\% (0.02) | 59\% (0.05) |
| GPA>3.0 | 53\% (0.03) | 55\% (0.03) | 46\% (0.07) | 54\% (0.02) | 53\% (0.02) | 60\% (0.05) |
| Continuous enrollment | 74\% (0.02) | 75\% (0.03) | 77\% (0.04) | 74\% (0.02) | 74\% (0.02) | 78\% (0.04) |
| Associate attainment | 8\% (0.01) | 7\% (0.01) | 10\% (0.04)! | 8\% (0.01) | 8\% (0.01) | 9\% (0.03)! |
| STEM major | 5\%*** (0.01) | $17 \% * * *(0.02)$ | 12\% (0.03) | 10\% (0.01) | 10\% (0.01) | 13\% (0.03) |
| American Indian / Alaska Native Students ( $\mathrm{n}=220$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 52\%*** (0.07) | $22 \% * * *(0.04)$ | 34\% (0.12)!! | 38\% (0.05) | 39\% (0.05) | 27\% (0.11)! |
| Under age 24 | 94\% (0.02) | 97\% (0.02) | 97\% (0.02) | 95\% (0.02) | 95\% (0.02) | 99\% (0.01) |
| Delayed enrollment | 28\% (0.07) | 33\% (0.08) | 21\% (0.12)!! | 32\% (0.05) | 31\% (0.05) | 26\% (0.13)! |
| Developmental education | 53\% (0.07) | 57\% (0.07) | 83\%*** (0.06) | 50\%*** (0.05) | 51\%* (0.05) | 78\%* (0.09) |
| GPA>3.0 | 53\% (0.07) | 35\% (0.08) | 32\% (0.12)! | 46\% (0.06) | 47\% (0.06) | 28\% (0.13)! |
| Continuous enrollment | 75\% (0.06) | 73\% (0.08) | 56\% (0.13) | 77\% (0.05) | 75\% (0.05) | 69\% (0.15) |
| Associate attainment | 14\% (0.05)! | 5\% (0.04)!! | N/A | 11\% (0.03) | 11\% (0.03) | N/A |
| STEM major | 4\%*** (0.02)! | 28\%*** (0.07) | 27\% (0.17)!! | 13\% (0.03) | 9\%*** (0.03)! | 54\%*** (0.14) |
| Asian Students ( $\mathrm{n}=350$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 55\% (0.07) | 48\% (0.08) | 47\% (0.18)! | 52\% (0.05) | 51\% (0.06) | 53\% (0.08) |
| Under age 24 | 90\% (0.04) | 92\% (0.03) | 97\% (0.03) | 91\% (0.03) | 89\% (0.03) | 89\% (0.03) |
| Delayed enrollment | 40\% (0.06) | 49\% (0.07) | 51\% (0.12) | 44\% (0.05) | 44\% (0.05) | 46\% (0.08) |
| Developmental education | 53\% (0.07) | 56\% (0.06) | 54\% (0.12) | 54\% (0.05) | 56\% (0.06) | 51\% (0.08) |


| GPA>3.0 | $74 \%$ (0.05) | 60\% (0.06) | 71\% (0.09) | 66\% (0.05) | 67\% (0.05) | 66\% (0.07) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Continuous enrollment | 85\% (0.04) | 87\% (0.03) | 80\% (0.09) | 86\% (0.03) | 85\% (0.03) | 88\% (0.05) |
| Associate attainment | 7\%* (0.02) | N/A | N/A | 5\%*** (0.01) | 5\% (0.01) | N/A |
| STEM major | $7 \% * * *(0.03)$ ! | 28\%**** (0.06) | N/A | 19\% (0.04) | 18\% (0.04) | 20\% (0.05) |
| Black Students ( $\mathrm{n}=1290$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 55\% (0.03) | 50\% (0.04) | 51\% (0.06) | 53\% (0.03) | 52\% (0.03) | 58\% (0.05) |
| Under age 24 | 81\%* (0.02) | 72\%* (0.03) | 68\%* (0.06) | 78\%* (0.02) | 74\%** (0.02) | 87\%** (0.03) |
| Delayed enrollment | 46\% (0.03) | 51\% (0.03) | 56\% (0.06) | 47 (0.03) | 49\% (0.03) | 44\% (0.05) |
| Developmental education | 62\% (0.03) | 58\% (0.03) | 75\%** (0.05) | 57\%** (0.02) | 60\% (0.02) | 58\% (0.05) |
| GPA>3.0 | 53\% (0.03) | 48\% (0.03) | 51\% (0.06) | 50\% (0.02) | 49\% (0.02) | 57\% (0.05) |
| Continuous enrollment | $71 \%$ (0.03) | 73\% (0.03) | 71\% (0.06) | 72\% (0.02) | 72\% (0.02) | 74\% (0.05) |
| Associate attainment | 8\% (0.01) | 8\% (0.01) | 9\% (0.03)! | 8\% (0.01) | 8\% (0.01) | 8\% (0.02) |
| STEM major | 4\%*** (0.01) | $16 \%$ *** (0.03) | 11\% (0.03) | 9\% (0.01) | 9\% (0.01) | 12\% (0.03) |
| Multiracial students ( $\mathrm{n}=340$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 49\% (0.05) | 46\% (0.06) | 40\% (0.09) | 48\% (0.04) | 46\% (0.04) | 50\% (0.08) |
| Under age 24 | 89\% (0.03) | 90\% (0.04) | 82\% (0.08) | 91\% (0.03) | 88\% (0.03) | 93\% (0.04) |
| Delayed enrollment | 33\% (0.05) | 43\% (0.07) | 48\% (0.11) | 36\% (0.05) | 42\% (0.05) | 23\% (0.08)! |
| Developmental education | 52\% (0.05) | 57\% (0.06) | 51\% (0.10) | 55\% (0.05) | 54\% (0.05) | 57\% (0.07) |
| GPA>3.0 | 66\% (0.05) | 55\% (0.06) | 64\% (0.09) | 60\% (0.04) | 64\% (0.04) | 50\% (0.08) |
| Continuous enrollment | 80\% (0.05) | 83\% (0.05) | 95\%* (0.03) | 80\%* (0.04) | 80\% (0.04) | 86\% (0.07) |
| Associate attainment | 12\% (0.03) | 12\% (0.04)! | 14\% (0.07)! | 12\% (0.03) | $8 \% *$ (0.03)! | $22 \% *$ (0.06) |
| STEM major | 6\%** (0.02)! | $22 \% * *(0.05)$ | 27\% (0.10)! | 12\% (0.03) | 15\% (0.03) | 11\% (0.05)! |
| Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islander students ( $\mathrm{n}=130$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 44\% (0.10) | 35\% (0.09) | 56\% (0.21)! | 39\% (0.07) | 40\% (0.07) | 37\% (0.16)! |
| Under age 24 | 92\% (0.04) | 92\% (0.06) | 97\% (0.03) | 92\% (0.04) | 90\% (0.05) | N/A |
| Delayed enrollment | 29\% (0.10)! | $33 \%$ (0.10)! | N/A | 31\% (0.08) | 30\% (0.07) | 38\% (0.18)! |


| Developmental education | $71 \% * *$ (0.09) | $33 \% * *(0.09)$ | 55\% (0.19)! | 50\% (0.07) | 53\% (0.07) | 41\% (0.19)! |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| GPA>3.0 | 47\% (0.11) | 60\% (0.07) | 44\% (0.20)! | 54\% (0.07) | 49\% (0.07) | 74\% (0.12) |
| Continuous enrollment | 81\% (0.08) | 72\% (0.08) | 84\% (0.10) | 75\% (0.06) | 73\% (0.07) | 88\% (0.07) |
| Associate attainment | 9\% (0.05)!! | $7 \%$ (0.04)!! | N/A | 8\% (0.03)! | 8\% (0.04)! | N/A |
| STEM major | N/A | 23\%** (0.08)! | N/A | 13\% (0.05)! | 12\% (0.05)! | N/A |
| White students ( $\mathrm{n}=4970$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Woman | Man | Disability | No Disability | First Gen | Non-FirstGen |
| Full-time student | 47\% (0.02) | 46\% (0.02) | 44\% (0.04) | 47\% (0.01) | 47\% (0.01) | 47\% (0.02) |
| Under age 24 | 81\% (0.01) | 79\% (0.02) | 77\% (0.03) | 81\% (0.01) | 77\%*** (0.01) | 88\%*** (0.01) |
| Delayed enrollment | 45\%* (0.02) | 51\%* (0.02) | 52\% (0.03) | 47\% (0.01) | 50\%*** (0.02) | 42\%*** (0.02) |
| Developmental education | 52\%** (0.02) | 45\%** (0.02) | 52\% (0.04) | 48\% (0.01) | 50\%* (0.01) | 45\%* (0.02) |
| GPA>3.0 | 62\% (0.02) | 58\% (0.02) | 54\% (0.03) | 61\% (0.01) | 59\% (0.01) | 62\% (0.02) |
| Continuous enrollment | 77\% (0.01) | 78\% (0.02) | 80\% (0.02) | 77\% (0.01) | 77\% (0.01) | 78\% (0.02) |
| Associate attainment | 12\% (0.01) | 12\% (0.01) | 6\%*** (0.01) | $13 \% * * *(0.01)$ | 11\%* (0.01) | 14\%* (0.01) |
| STEM major | $7 \%$ *** (0.01) | $21 \% * * *(0.01)$ | 13\% (0.03) | $13 \%$ (0.01) | 13\% (0.01) | 15\% (0.02) |

* $\mathrm{p}<.05 ; * * \mathrm{p}<.01 ; * * * \mathrm{p}<.001 ; \mathrm{N} / \mathrm{A}=$ suppressed due to possible identification concerns, in accordance with the NCES restricted data license agreement.
$!=$ standard error is between 30 and 50 percent of the estimated mean value, indicating an unstable estimate
$!!=$ standard error is greater than 50 percent of the estimated mean value, indicating a very unstable estimate
NOTE: Numbers are rounded to the nearest 10 in accordance with the NCES restricted data license agreement. Some totals may not agree due to this rounding. SOURCE: U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics, 2012-14 Beginning Postsecondary Students (BPS:12/14).

