

Columbia Law School

From the Selected Works of Hon. Gerald Lebovits

2012

NY Residential Landlord-Tenant Law & Procedure—2012-2013 (5th ed. 2012)

Gerald Lebovits



Available at: https://works.bepress.com/gerald_lebovits/220/

**New York Lawyers'
Practical Skills Series**

New York Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Michael B. Terk, Esq.

2012–2013

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits*
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Michael B. Terk, Esq.

2012–2013

* The authors of this fifth (2012–2013) edition thank Victor S. Faleck, Esq., for his co-authorship of the second (2009–2010) and third (2010–2011) editions and Dan M. Blumenthal, Esq., for his co-authorship of the first (2008–2009) edition. For their research on the fourth (2011–2012) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits's judicial interns Daphne Bareket (Florida International), Alison Genova (Fordham), and Hailey B. Render (Syracuse). For their research on the third edition, the authors thank then-New York Law School students Deena M. Crimaldi and Alana Sliwinski. For their research on the second edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits's judicial interns P. Alex de Richemont (Harvard), Mariella Soussou (Fordham), and Mary Jane Yoon (Columbia). For their research on the first edition, the authors thank Mary Ann Amodeo, Esq., Judge Lebovits's court attorney Alexandra Standish, Esq., and Judge Lebovits's judicial interns Alana Wrublin (Fordham), Victor J. Brubaker (New York Law School), and Stephanie L. Torre (New York Law School). For writing the section on the Buffalo Housing Court and for providing the Buffalo Housing Court forms, the authors thank former Buffalo City Court judge, and now Supreme Court justice, Henry Nowak and now-retired court attorney/referee Mark Doane, Esq. For writing the section on the Justice Courts, a section new to the fifth edition, the authors also thank Town of Bethlehem Justice Ryan Donovan and 2012 Albany Law School graduate Katelyn Primono.

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2012
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-375-X
Product Number: 416912

DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.

Damon P. Howard is a founding partner of Ephron-Mandel & Howard, L.L.P., located in New York City. His experience ranges from commercial litigation, including actions for injunctive and declaratory relief, to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and the Tulane University Law School and received his early training as a litigator as an intern for the U.S. Attorney's Office, Civil Division. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey and Louisiana.

HONORABLE GERALD LEBOVITS

Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. He currently presides in Civil Court. Previously, he presided in Criminal Court and Housing Court, where he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher, he is a lecturer-in-law at Columbia Law School and an adjunct professor at Fordham University School of Law and New York University School of Law. Previously, he was an adjunct professor at St. John's University School of Law and New York Law School. Active in the New York State Bar Association, he is a past co-chair of the Association's Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings, has authored the *Bar Journal's* Legal Writer column since 2001, and has published 19 articles in the Association's *New York Real Property Law Journal*. He graduated from the Ottawa (LL.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

MICHAEL B. TERK, ESQ.

Michael B. Terk is an associate with David Rozenholc & Associates, where he practices primarily landlord-tenant and real estate litigation. Prior to joining David Rozenholc & Associates, he practiced landlord-tenant law as an associate at two other New York firms. Mr. Terk regularly represents clients in New York State Supreme Court, New York City Civil Court (both residential and commercial parts), and before administrative agencies such as the New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR). He also represents clients at the appellate level and has written briefs in connection with precedent-setting Appellate Term and Appellate Division cases. Mr. Terk is admitted to practice law in New York and Massachusetts. He is a member of the New York County Lawyers' Association, the New York State Bar Association, and the Nassau County Bar Association. He received his J.D. from the Hofstra University School of Law and his B.A. from Brandeis University. He first began landlord-tenant litigation while still in law school, providing free legal representation to low-income tenants in Nassau County District Court under a student practice order, as part of Hofstra Law's Community Legal Assistance Corp.-Housing Rights Clinic.

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	The Tenancy	2
	A. Market Rentals	7
	1. The Parties	9
	2. The Premises	12
	3. Rent.....	13
	4. Default	13
	5. Legal Fees Provisions.....	15
	6. Recording of Leases	17
	B. Rent Regulation	17
	1. Rent-Controlled Premises.....	18
	2. Rent-Stabilized Premises.....	21
	a. Rent Stabilization Overview.....	21
	b. Tenants' Rights Under Rent Stabilization	23
	c. Exemptions From Rent Stabilization.....	25
	3. Rent-Overcharge Claims	28
	4. Succession Rights.....	31
	5. Preferential Rents	33
	C. Public Housing.....	34
	D. Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing.....	36
	1. The Voucher Program	36
	2. Project-Based Section 8.....	41
	E. Cooperatives and Condominiums.....	41
	1. Cooperatives Generally	41
	2. Cooperative and Condominium Conversions.....	43
	3. Condominiums	45
	4. Cooperative and Condominium Summary Proceedings in New York City	45
	5. Subsidized/Regulated Cooperatives Under the Private Housing Finance Law ...	45
	a. Housing Development Fund Companies	45
	b. Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing)	46
	F. Lofts	47
	G. Single-Room Occupancies (SROs).....	49
III.	Tenancy Protections.....	50
	A. Housing Discrimination.....	50
	B. Warranty of Habitability	52
IV.	Conveying the Tenancy	56
V.	Summary Proceedings	58
	A. Introduction to Summary Proceedings	58
	1. Overview	58
	2. The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings	61
	a. Pleadings.....	61
	b. Governing Procedural Statutes	62
	c. Counterclaims and Jury Waivers.....	62
	d. Attorney Fees and Costs	62
	e. Types of Summary Proceedings	63

B.	Holdover Proceedings	63
1.	Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants	64
2.	Grounds for Holdover Proceeding Against Tenants—Breach of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy	66
a.	Unauthorized Sublets	66
b.	Pets	69
c.	Alterations	71
d.	Security Deposit	72
e.	Broker’s Fee	72
f.	Specified Use or Purpose	72
3.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Wrongful Acts of Tenants and Nuisance	73
a.	Nuisance	73
b.	Hoarding	75
c.	Chronic Late Payment of Rent	75
d.	Access	76
e.	Destruction of the Premises	77
f.	Illegal Occupancy	77
g.	Illegal Use	78
4.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units	81
a.	Non-primary Residence	81
b.	Owner’s Use	84
c.	Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution	87
d.	Demolition	88
e.	Withdrawal From the Rental Market	89
f.	Eviction Plan	89
g.	Failure to Renew	89
h.	Profiteering	90
5.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants	90
a.	Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure	90
b.	Licensee Proceedings	91
c.	Squatters	93
d.	Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises	93
e.	Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale	94
f.	Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement	94
g.	Employer-Employee Proceedings	94
h.	Occupant After Termination of Life Estate	95
i.	Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry	96
6.	Predicate Notices	96
a.	Overview	96
b.	Notice to Cure	96
c.	Notice of Termination	97
d.	Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail	104

7. Notice of Petition and Petition	105
a. Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties	105
(1) Issuance of the Notice of Petition	105
(2) Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition	105
b. Contents of the Petition	108
(1) General Requirements.....	108
(2) Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered	109
(3) Statement of the Parties' Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered	109
(4) Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws	110
(5) Verification of the Petition	111
(6) Liberalization of Pleading Requirements	112
(7) Alternative Pleadings.....	112
(8) Inquests	113
C. Nonpayment Proceedings	114
1. Proper Parties.....	114
2. Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding	114
3. What May Be Recovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding	114
4. Rent Demands	116
a. Overview	116
b. Contents of the Rent Demand.....	117
c. Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties.....	119
d. Oral vs. Written Rent Demands.....	119
e. Compliance With the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.....	120
5. Notice of Petition and Petition	121
6. Defaults.....	122
7. Spiegel Law	123
8. Bankruptcy	123
D. Answering a Summary Proceeding.....	124
E. Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings.....	128
F. Disclosure in Summary Proceedings	131
G. Rent Deposits/ <i>Pendente Lite</i> Use and Occupancy.....	133
H. Stays, Warrant, Cures	134
1. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings	134
2. Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings.....	136
a. Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings.....	136
b. Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease	138
(1) Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease	138
(2) Failure to Give Access.....	138
(3) Nuisance.....	138
(4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings.....	139
(5) Public Policy Against Forfeiture of Tenancies in New York	139

(6) Non-Residential Tenants and Tenants Outside the City of New York.....	139
(7) Prevailing Landlords' Entitlement to Attorney Fees	140
3. General Powers to Stay Warrants in Summary Proceedings.....	140
4. Stay of the Proceeding Itself Before or After Judgment	140
I. Service of Process in Summary Proceedings.....	142
1. Overview of "Traverse" in Summary Proceedings	142
2. Service Requirements.....	142
3. Challenging Service.....	146
4. Process Server Rules and Regulations in the City of New York	147
a. Overview of Rules	147
b. Licensing Requirements/Process Servers and Process Server Agencies ...	147
c. Mandatory Posting of Bonds	148
d. Record-Keeping Requirements.....	148
e. GPS Technology	149
f. Judicial Actions and Proceedings/Claims for Improper Service/ Traverse Hearings.....	149
g. Exemptions	149
J. General and Affirmative Defenses to Summary Proceedings	149
1. Overview	149
2. Traverse/Service	150
3. Lack of Multiple Dwelling Registration in New York City	150
4. Lack of a Proper Certificate of Occupancy	151
5. Failure Accurately to State Regulatory Status and Comply With Rent Laws...	152
6. Omitting or Misstating Required Elements of the Petition	152
7. Lack of Proper Predicate Notice/Rent Demand Notice.....	152
8. Predicate Notice Vitiating/Tenancy Reinstated	153
9. Retaliatory Eviction.....	153
10. A Laches Defense in a Nonpayment Proceeding	153
11. Conditions.....	155
12. Actual Eviction/Constructive Eviction.....	155
13. Statute of Limitations	156
14. Succession Rights.....	156
K. Alleging a Respondent's Military Status	157
L. Competency of Parties to a Landlord-Tenant Proceeding, Including the Unrepresented, Non-English Speakers, and Those Needing Guardians <i>Ad Litem</i>	159
M. Settlements in Landlord-Tenant Summary Proceedings	161
N. Enforcing Warrants of Eviction and Orders of Possession.....	166
O. Post-Eviction Relief	166
VI. Landlord-Tenant Actions and Proceedings Other Than Nonpayment and Holdover Proceedings.....	169
A. Ejectment Actions.....	169
B. HP Proceedings.....	171
C. Article 7-A Proceedings.....	177
D. Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City	178

E.	Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings	179
1.	Overview	179
2.	Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession.....	179
3.	Criminal Penalties	181
4.	Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL § 853	181
5.	Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations	181
F.	Foreclosure Proceedings	182
G.	<i>Yellowstone</i> Injunction Actions	188
H.	Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants	190
VII.	Abandonment and Surrender of Possession.....	190
VIII.	Courts That Award Possession of Real Property	192
A.	Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in Which Geographic Locations	192
B.	Supreme Court	193
C.	The New York City Civil Court	193
D.	New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties).....	196
E.	City Court	197
1.	The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court	197
a.	History	197
b.	Code Violation Actions	198
	(1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving Model— District-by-District Scheduling	199
	(2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons.....	199
	(3) Arraignment	200
	(4) Use of Interlocutory Orders	201
	(a) Orders to Vacate	201
	(b) Demolition Orders	202
	(c) Receiverships.....	202
	(d) Case-Specific Orders	202
	(5) The Funding Calendar	203
	(6) Sentencing.....	203
c.	Evictions	206
	(1) Accessibility.....	206
	(2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants.....	207
	(3) Linkage	207
	(4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed	207
	(5) Stipulations	208
	(6) Mandatory Mediation	209
	(7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings.....	209
	(8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting.....	209
	(9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee	209
	(10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court	210
	(11) Attorneys Signing Petitions	210
	(12) Control of Out Dates.....	210
	(13) Evictions in Section 8 Tenancies	211
	(14) Conclusion	211
2.	City Courts Outside Buffalo and the City of New York	212

F.	Justice Courts	212
1.	Overview	212
2.	Eviction Proceedings Specific to Town and Village Courts in Upstate New York	213
3.	Justice Courts: Jurisdiction and Venue.....	214
4.	Notice of Petition.....	215
5.	Petition.....	215
6.	Service	216
G.	Surrogate’s Court	216
H.	County Courts	217
I.	Federal Courts.....	217
IX.	Appeals	218
X.	Conclusion	221
Appendix 1	Buffalo Housing Court—Duties of Housing Court Liaisons.....	223
Appendix 2	Script for Arraignments.....	225
Appendix 3	Order for Access	229
Appendix 4	Order to Vacate	231
Appendix 5	Order Appointing Receiver	233
Appendix 6	Funding Calendar Application for Rehabilitation of Property.....	237
Appendix 7	Addendum to Petition for Non-title Owners.....	239
Appendix 8	Memorandum, Decision and Order re: Eviction (Buffalo Housing Court)	241
Appendix 9	Stipulation	245
Appendix 10	Referral to Department of Health for Habitability Inspection	247
Appendix 11	Request for Extension of Time for Issuance or Execution of Warrant of Eviction	249
	Residential Landlord-Tenant Forms Index	253
	Table of Authorities	425
	About the Authors.....	471

RESIDENTIAL LANDLORD-TENANT LAW AND PROCEDURE—FORMS

INDEX OF FORMS*

I.	Predicate Notices	
	A. Notice of Non-Renewal	257
	B. Notice of Termination	259
	C. Notice to Cure	260
	D. Ten-Day Notice to Quit.....	261
	E. Thirty-Day Notice of Termination	262
	F. Three-Day Rent Demand	263
II.	Petition	
	A. Holdover Petition	265
	B. Nonpayment Petition	269
III.	Notices of Petition	
	A. Notice of Petition (Holdover—City Courts Outside NYC)	273
	B. Notice of Petition (Holdover—District Courts).....	274
	C. Notice of Petition (Holdover—NYC)	275
	D. Notice of Petition (Nonpayment—City Courts Outside NYC)	277
	E. Notice of Petition (Nonpayment—District Court).....	279
	F. Notice of Petition (Nonpayment—NYC)	281
IV.	Affidavits of Service	
	A. Affidavit of Service Pursuant to RPAPL § 735 (Nonmilitary Affidavit)	283
	B. Affidavit of Service by Conspicuous Place Service	285
	C. Affidavit of Service by Mail	286
	D. Affidavit of Service by Personal Delivery	287
	E. Affidavit of Service by Substituted Service.....	288
	F. Affidavit of Service of Petition and Notice of Petition (Personal/Substituted/Conspicuous)	289
	G. Service Other Than by Personal Delivery	291
	H. Affidavit of Service of Order to Show Cause and Affidavit in Support (LT)	292
	I. Affidavit of Service of Judgment With Notice of Entry	293
V.	Non-Military Affidavits	
	A. Affidavit of Military Investigation	294
	B. Non-Military Affidavit of Investigator.....	295
	C. Request for Military Status	297
VI.	Verifications	
	A. Attorney Verification Pursuant to RPAPL § 741	298
	B. Verification (Corporation).....	299
	C. Verification (Individual).....	300
	D. Verification (Partnership).....	301
	E. Verified Petition in Support of Order to Show Cause	302
VII.	Answer	
	A. Landlord/Tenant Answer in Person	303
	B. Notice of Appearance and Answer With Counterclaim (Holdover Proceeding)....	304

* All of the forms contained in this monograph are included on the forms CD accompanying this publication.

	C. Notice of Appearance and Answer With Counterclaims (Nonpayment Proceeding)	306
	D. Answer in Writing and Verification	309
	E. Answer in Person and Verification	311
VIII.	Application to Waive Court Fees	
	A. Affidavit in Support of an Application to Commence an Action as a “Poor Person” and to Waive Court Fees.....	313
	B. <i>Ex Parte</i> Order Granting Leave to Proceed as a “Poor Person” and to Waive Court Fees	315
	C. Affidavit in Support of an Application to Proceed as a Poor Person and to Waive Court Fees (Civil Court)	316
	D. Affidavit in Support of an Application to Proceed as a Poor Person and Authorizing the State to Pay the Costs for the Production of a Stenographic Transcript	317
IX.	Article 7-A Proceeding	
	A. Notice of Petition for Deposit of Rents Pursuant to Art. 7-A.....	319
	B. Verified Petition to Appoint Administrator Pursuant to Art. 7-A	321
X.	Inspections	
	A. Inspection of Premises	323
	B. Housing Inspection	324
	C. Request for the Report of Resource Assistant Premises Visit	325
	D. Tenant’s Request for Inspection.....	326
XI.	HP Proceedings	
	A. Affidavit in Support of Order to Show Cause to Restore to Calendar for a Compliance Hearing for the Assessment of Civil Penalties	327
	B. Affidavit in Support of Order to Show Cause to Restore to the Calendar	329
	C. Judgment for Civil Penalties	330
	D. Order to Show Cause Directing the Correction of Violations (HP Action).....	331
	E. Order to Show Cause Directing the Correction of Violations	333
	F. Order to Show Cause to Restore to Calendar for a Compliance Hearing for the Assessment of Civil Penalties	335
	G. Verified Petition in Support of Order to Show Cause Directing the Correction of Violations.....	337
XII.	Motion to Dismiss	
	A. Affidavit in Support of Motion to Dismiss	339
	B. Notice of Motion to Dismiss Proceeding.....	341
	C. Affidavit in Opposition to Motion	343
XIII.	Reply Affidavit	
	A. Reply Affidavit.....	345
XIV.	Pro Se	
	A. Order to Show Cause to Permit a Represented Party to Appear in Person (Pro Se)	347

XV.	Withdrawal of Funds	
	A. Affidavit in Support of an Order for Withdrawal of Funds	349
XVI.	Subpoenas	
	A. Subpoena to Testify.....	351
	B. Subpoena for Records	353
	C. Affidavit in Support of a Requisition for an Order for the Examination of Subpoenaed Records and Order for the Examination of Subpoenaed Records...	355
XVII.	Guardian <i>Ad Litem</i>	
	A. Order Appointing Guardian <i>Ad Litem</i>	356
	B. Guardian <i>Ad Litem</i> Request Form.....	357
	C. APS Housing Court Referral Form.....	358
XVIII.	Transfer Order	
	A. Transfer Order.....	361
XIX.	Order to Produce	
	A. Order to Produce	362
XX.	Contempt	
	A. Order of Commitment to Punish for Contempt	363
	B. Warrant to Punish for Contempt	364
	C. Order to Punish for Contempt.....	365
	D. Order to Show Cause to Punish for Contempt of Court	367
	E. Order to Show Cause to Punish for Contempt (Punishable by Fine and/or Imprisonment)	369
	F. Affidavit in Support of Motion to Punish for Contempt of Court	371
XXI.	Interpreter Request Form	
	A. Interpreter Request Form	373
XXII.	Consumer Affairs Report	
	A. Report to the Department of Consumer Affairs of a Hearing on the Sufficiency of Service	374
XXIII.	Fair Debt Collection Letter	
	A. Fair Debt Collection (FDCPA) Letter	375
XXIV.	Stipulation of Settlement	
	A. Stipulation of Settlement (Holdover—Providing for Vacatur)	376
	B. Stipulation of Settlement (Holdover; Providing for Cure— Breach of Lease)	377
	C. Stipulation of Settlement (Nonpayment Proceeding With Final Judgment).....	379
	D. Stipulation of Settlement (Nonpayment Proceeding Without Final Judgment).....	381
	E. Stipulation of Settlement Form (Civil Court)	383
	F. Surrender Agreement 1	385
	G. Surrender Agreement 2	389
	H. Surrender Agreement 3	393

XXV.	Judgment	
	A. Judgment Upon Tenant’s Failure to Answer (Outside NYC)	399
	B. Decision and Judgment (of Decision/Order/Judgment).....	400
XXVI.	Vacating Default	
	A. Affidavit in Support of Application to Vacate Default	401
	B. Order to Show Cause to Vacate Default Judgment and Warrant	403
XXVII.	Supporting Affidavits to Vacate Judgment	
	A. Affidavit in Support of an Order to Show Cause to Vacate a Judgment Based Upon Failure to Answer, to Permit the Filing of a Late Answer and to Place the Case on the Calendar	405
	B. Affidavit in Support of an Order to Show Cause to Vacate a Judgment Based Upon (a) Failure to Appear (b) Failure to Comply and to Restore to the Calendar	406
XXVIII.	Warrants	
	A. Marshal’s Notice of Eviction	407
	B. Warrant Requisition Form.....	408
	C. Request for Warrant	409
	D. Request for Final Order and Issuance of Warrant.....	410
	E. Warrant.....	411
XXIX.	Restore to Possession	
	A. Order to Show Cause to be Restored to Possession and for Damages After Unlawful Eviction	413
	B. Order to Show Cause in Lieu of Notice of Petition to Restore to Possession	415
	C. Verified Petition in Support of Order to Show Cause for Restoration to Possession	417
	D. Affidavit in Support of an Order to Show Cause to Restore to Possession	419
XXX.	Transcript	
	A. Request for Audio Record	420
XXXI.	Appeal	
	A. Notice of Appeal	421
	B. Notice of Transmittal of Transcript.....	422
	C. Notice of Settlement of Transcript.....	423