Illinois Wesleyan University

From the SelectedWorks of Christopher Callahan

Winter 2002

Hybrid Discourse and Performance in the Old French Pastourelle

Christopher Callahan, Illinois Wesleyan University



Hybrid Discourse and Performance in the Old French Pastourelle

Christopher Callahan

When the pastourelle appears in French in the late twelfth century, some forty years after Marcabru's pioneering "L'autrier jost una sebissa," it is distinguished from its Occitan predecessors¹ by two discursive features that have both made its typological classification a delicate issue² and assured its longevity. The French pastourelle was first of all a pioneer in the mixing of social registers. Its characteristic confrontation between aristocratic narrator and shepherdess intersects both thematically and temporally with Andreas Capellanus's De amore, and the two reflect, as Michel Zink has argued, preoccupations which were peculiar to France. Indeed, the pastorela did not acquire, or seek to imitate, its French counterpart's passion for staging socially transgressive amorous encounters. As the following examples illustrate, the social disparity between the two protagonists is a cornerstone of the pastourelle. Even when the shepherdess cedes to the manipulations of her suitor, she is usually careful to remind him that he and she are not of the same station.

Signor, ne moi gabez; bien sai, prou troberaz fenne cui ameraz, plus riche et meuz vestie My lord, don't mock me; I am certain you will find many A woman to love Who is richer and better dressed.

Anonymous, c. 1190 (Paden, p. 60)

Bien m'aves or essaie, Mais poi i aves conquis; mainte autre en aves proie, ne l'aves pas ci apres n'encor ci ne le lairois. You have tried your best with me, But little have you gained. Many another have you wooed; You didn't learn how here, Nor will you stop it here.

Simon Authie, "Quant le dous estes define," 1220S (Paden, 130)

Belle, vostre amor vous quier S'auroiz de moi riche ator. Elle respont: Tricheor sont mes trop li chevalier. Melz aim Perrin mon bergier que riche honme menteor. Pretty one, I beg you for your love, I will dress you in fine clothes.
She answered: Knights are always So deceitful.

I love my shepherd Perrin more Than any lying rich man.

Thibaut de Navarre (1201-1253), "L'autrier par la matinee" (134)

It is this power struggle across class and gender lines that is the driving force of the pastourelle, and is more significant than the actual outcome of the encounter. An examination of the entire pastourelle corpus permits a broader understanding of the pastourelle than as a single-minded celebration of rape⁶: the suitor is successful in only one-half of the extant pastourelles, and as it

evolves, the pastourelle becomes subsumed by concerns of lyric performance to the extent that the latter eclipses the original struggle.

This evolution is rooted in the pastourelle's narrative structure. As has long been recognized, ⁷ the pastourelle is characterized by a significant interweaving of narrative and lyric. It is a commonplace that the narrator is first attracted to the shepherdess by her singing. This song, which establishes dramatically the conventional topoi of spring, nature and the awakenings of love, is quoted, as a couplet or a single line, in 25 percent of the extant pastourelles. But this lyric element is considerably more extensive than a simple topical opener: 70 percent of the surviving poems contain some kind of refrain, uttered either by one of the characters or by the narrative voice. Many of these refrains, furthermore, are identifiable as dance refrains. This feature frames the pastourelle in its collective, performative context and signals the intimate link between the lyric element in the pastourelle and its preoccupation with social portraiture. The pastourelle is distinguished from its Old Occitan cousin and forebear by two fundamental features. Where there is a genuine mix of social groups, there is also a genuine mix of genres, and this is the formula that has made the pastourelle so effective as a poetic form. The pastorela, which showcases courtly shepherdesses or real ladies, is a purely narrative poem, lacking the lyric element that is woven into

the French poem. The entire performative dimension, which makes the pastourelle resonate for us as theatre, is indeed absent. Occitan lyric has left us no objective pastourelles: we witness no rustic celebrations, possess nothing which could lead to an Occitan equivalent of the Jeu de Robin et Marion.

Though the pastorela is more highly crafted linguistically, and more formally structured, than the pastourelle, it is also, as a result of its poetic choices, "plus guindee, plus figee, plus aristocratique, plus courtoise" than its French-language counterpart. The most important feature of the Occitan pastorela, as Bec states, 9 is the match of wits between the protagonists, and indeed, the wit and pert replies of the pastora in Marcabru's "L'autrier jost una sebissa" (Paden, 36) set the tone of refinement that remained with the Occitan pastourelle throughout its history. From this point on, in fact, the denouement of the encounter and entreaty is also set: the shepherdess is never actually seduced, and indeed, is not actually a shepherdess. She is rather the social equal of the narrator, or is raised to his status rhetorically; as such, to push past her refusal would be decidedly uncourtly. We thus witness a movement quite the opposite of that found in the later, French, pastourelle. Rather than finding the girl unconditionally accessible because of her membership in the lowest class, Marcabru's protagonist tries to raise her to his level, calling her a "toza de gentil afaire" (girl of noble estate), by insisting that her father must be a knight and her mother quite a "corteza vilana." In further flattery, he claims that her great beauty was a fairy's gift. For her part, she questions whether he is really of the knightly class, and suggests that he belongs rather behind a plow (vv. 40-43):

Mas tals se fai cavalgaire C'atrestal deuria faire Los set jorns de la setmana But some people act as knights Who should do likewise Seven days a week

i.e., "retrayre al vezoich et a l'arayre" (return to the bill-hook and plow). We actually have a double movement: the girl proves her "nobility" by matching her suitor reply for reply, while diminishing his social status through taunts. She is successful in discouraging his designs by her

wit, and both his deference to her and her denigration of him have leveled the social differences between them. He is now forced to entreat her love as with any other lady, and must risk being refused.

In Marcabru's "L'autrier a l'issida d'abriu" (Paden, 40), the narrator is attracted to the singing of both a shepherd and shepherdess ("auzi la voz d'un pastoriu / ab una mancipa chantar"). When he finds her and requests her love, addressing her as "pastorella," we find that her rustic companion has conveniently disappeared: Robin or Gautier is not waiting within earshot, club in hand and mastiff tugging at the leash. She refuses his advances, as she is troubled and thoughtful about something. Questioned as to what, she makes this astonishing reply: "S'aissi es vers cum auch comtar, pretz ejovens etjois dechai/c' om en autrui no.is pot fiar" (If what I hear is true, merit and youth and joy are in decline, And one cannot trust others). This reply plucks both suitor and listener so abruptly out the pastoral decor, setting them squarely at court, that the debate has no chance to progress further. The poem draws to a close with her explanation that powerful noblemen cannot trust the servants in whose care they pl ace their wives. Many a cuckold, she declares, is made of such arrangements, and many a child of doubtful parentage raised as a result. As the poem runs only six stanzas, with the fourth one missing, and the narrator makes no reply to the girl, we can presume that the poem is incomplete. Even in this fragmentary state, however, it is plain that the poem is only tangentially rooted in pastoral tradition. This forestdwelling harbinger who warns the protagonist so starkly does not resemble the shepherd girls of either the pastorela or the pastourelle, but rather a fairy or seer. That her companion should leave her so abruptly, not to be seen or alluded to again, suggests furthermore that she could not have been in any real danger from her knightly suitor.

In Marcabru's "A la fontana del vergier" (Paden, p. 42), finally, all pretense of wooing shepherd girls is dropped, and the encounter takes place in a garden--an enclosed space and thus a courtly topos, and with a donzela, the daughter of the lord of a castle. With this poem, we are entirely removed from the discourse and characteristic setting of the later northern pastourelle, and it is tempting to argue that Marcabru is at best a tangential source of inspiration it. The poem opens with the customary allusions to nature and spring. But the audience is immediately advised that this particular encounter will be unusual. We are informed that the girl does not desire his company, though this commentary is entirely extra-narrative, no exchange having yet occurred between the two. Our caution in approaching this orchard, with its fountain and castellan's daughter, is entirely justified, for in stanza three the ground dramatically shifts under our feet. We are clearly no longer in a pastourelle, but in a chanson d'ami cum crusade song. The maiden, weeping, addresses reproaches to Jesus and curses to King Louis VII for having deprived her of her beloved, and barely acknowledges the narrator, whose attempts to console her she deflects.

Of the six remaining pastorelas composed in the twelfth or first quarter of the thirteenth century, Cadenet's "L' autrier lonc un bosc fulhos" (Paden, 66) resembles Marcabru to the greatest degree. Again, a social leveling takes place between the two protagonists, as in a discussion about love between the narrator and with a shepherd, the rustic singer appears more courtly than his nightly interlocutor. The poem opens with the expected encounter with a shepherd who sings a lament, addressing Love in courtly terms. He and his "amia" have been greatly hurt by "lauzenjadors," and, as befits a true lover, his greatest grief is at her pain. In the ensuing discussion, the shepherd's "mal d' amor" is portrayed as genuine, while the aristocratic suitor, accused by the shepherd of only playing at love, does not refute the charge. This reversal of roles, which is

arguably a defining characteristic of the pastorela, is further reinforced when the shepherd refers to his beloved with a characteristic senhal--"midons," and the narrator makes the surprising remark that he would prefer his lady's husband to beat her, as such would encourage her infidelity.

A similar conversation is staged in Gui d'Ussel's "L'autre join, cost' una via." Shepherd and narrator are well acquainted in this poem, and the shepherd is pleased at the arrival of his interlocutor, to whom he will be able to complain about his ill treatment at the hands of Love. The narrator addresses him formally as "vos" and gives him a lesson on patience and humility worthy of a preaching friar, but is interrupted by the arrival of the shepherd's beloved. The shepherd speaks to her in courtly terms:

Bella, si anc jorn fos mia, Ses par d'autre prejador, Er no.us quier autra ricor... Tro que la.m fassatz major. Pretty one, if you were ever mine Without favoring any other suitor, I now ask you no other favor Until you should grant me a greater wish.

She pledges her loyalty to him, and the narrator, excluded from the exchange, is obliged to make an exit. We are far from the rough and tumble of the French pastourelle.

Gui d'Ussel and Giraut de Borneilh offer us, in a single poem each, an encounter cum entreaty, which begins to suggest the more conventional French poem, but in which events do not progress beyond dialogue.

In both, the narrator shares his sorrow at not being well treated by his lady, and he and the shepherdess promise mutual affection, as it will cheer them both up. In a charming twist on this conversation, Gavaudan offers an encounter in which the narrator and shepherdess are former companions who have been separated through the machinations of an evil person--a lauzengier par excellence, though not called such in the text. Another pastorela of Gavaudan features a much sharper-tongued shepherdess whose well-turned arguments give her control of the situation. But as she comes to realize that she is in no physical danger from her interlocutor, she agrees to exchange troths and the poem closes with this verbal pact. In each of these poems, then, there is no hint of sexual violence, indeed no overt request for sexual favors of any kind. The pastorela, with its leveling of social differences and the resulting absence of aggression between its protagonists, and its narratologically simple text, appears to be a parallel, though ostensibly earlier, development, but is not a direct precursor of the French pastourelle. The influence can indeed run in the opposite direction, as is visibly the case in an anonymous thirteenth-century Occitan poem, "Quant escavalcai l'autrier" (Paden, 96). In this poem, the names Robezon and Audeta, belonging to the girl's absent companions, appear. This is not only the only instance in which characters are named in the Occitan pastourelle, but the epithet Robin appears to have traveled south. The poem seems to be a conscious mixing of northern and southern motifs, for the suitor addresses her more aggressively than do Occitan suitors in general, and she just as aggressively repulses his advance. The poem is too conscious of the game it is playing, as it tries to balance two irreconcilable styles of pastourelle. By way of seduction, he compliments her, not on her looks or lineage, but on her verbal acuity: "Tosetta de bella faizon, ben savec dir votra raison. Laissaz ester questo sermon" (Prett y little girl, vou know how to express your thought well. But drop this talk) She answers him by saying that though she

was not raped, she has been quite roughly handled ("s'eu forcada non son, tant malament m'avez oi assallida"), thus alluding to the all-too frequent, and by then well-known, outcome of the northern poem. The poem comes down, finally, on the southern side of the question: he offers her entire family pardons (as he is disguised as a friar) if she will accede to his request, but admits his hurry and departs without pressing the issue. This poem goes farther than any other in its imitation of the northern pastourelle style, and is asking, with its peculiar mixture of north and south, whether the rude northern style could indeed gain acceptance in the south. That it is unique among pastorelas answers the question very clearly.

The influence of the pastorela is distinctly visible in one of the earliest French pastourelles, Pierre de Corbie's "Pensis corn fins amourous" (ca. 1190). Pierre's poem reproduces both the rustic setting and courtly tone found in the contemporary pastorelas of Giraut de Bornelh, Gui d'Ussel and Cadenet, and features a sophisticated discussion about love between the narrator and Robin. Though not a practitioner of courtly doctrine (as both shepherd and shepherdess can be in the pastorela), Robin shows awareness of its tenets and adopts its vocabulary as he seeks to console his interlocutor. But even as Pierre's poem features a courtly philosopher in rustic disguise, it also contains eight separate refrains that function now as dialogue now as internal commentary, and thus mark a break with Occitan tradition.

At its inception, then, even before it assumes its characteristic guise as a poem of anticourtliness, the French pastourelle is a lyric-narrative hybrid. The lyric elements, borrowed from more popular forms such as caroles and chansons de toile, ¹⁰ bespeak a conscious injection of non-aristocratic lyric forms into aristocratic narrative, ¹¹ and it is very likely this which fostered in turn the socially complex subject matter of the pastourelle. For in the poems of Jean Bodel, only slightly later than Pierre de Corbie, the two elements--social and discursive hybridity--are already firmly in place. Bodel's "Contre le douz tens novel" (Paden, 68), while containing a single-line refrain, "dorenlot ae!", which echoes rustic revelry, bespeaks a stage of experimentation in the pastourelle which looks both back to Marcabru and forward to Deschamps. For in refusing the narrator's suit, the shepherdess voices an unexpected complaint: that the recent war with the French has forced her to postpone her wedding. She asks her mounted intruder in stanza 4 if he is not one of the enemy, and threatens, as the poem draws to a close, to assimilate him to the "trecheor et foi mentis et gent parjure" (deceivers, oath breakers, and perjurers) who will all be shamefully disinherited. The narrator is placed in a double bind here: he boasts like a Fleming, in which case nothing he says can be trusted. On the other, if he is French, he is assimilated to the close-encamped enemy army, and can expect no sympathy. 12 Though there is an attempted seduction here, in contrast to "A Ia fontana del vergier," it is thwarted by the intrusion of the political agenda; with this earliest political pastourelle, a genre which flourished in the fourteenth century, the classic Old French pastourelle has not yet come into full flower. It is with the adoption of the fiction of the aristocratic voice, as occurs in Bodel's other extant pastourelle "L'autrier quant chevauchoie" that the barrier to cross is established, the bonds of courtly restraint assumed, in order to then be transgressed.

The lyric element in the pastourelle, constituted by the plainte and single, repeated, or multiple refrains, affects it in two fundamental ways. This is the first genre to integrate narrative and lyric as integral to its plot, and as such is a forerunner of lyrico-narrative romance. The pastourelle's refrains, which can function as dialogue, as interior monologue, as plot, and as extra-textual

commentary, ¹³ are true lyric insertions, and with its fascination for mixing of registers and for staging lyric performance, the pastourelle prepares the ground for some of the most significant narratological innovations of the thirteenth century. The enormously popular vogue of romances with lyric insertions begins, of course, in the late 1220s with Jean Renart's Roman de la rose ou de Guillaume de Dole (ca. 1230), ¹⁴ and the pastourelle plays a direct, indeed constitutive, role in the development of the vernacular motet. In the case of the pastourelle itself, the refrain appears to be responsible for the development of the objective pastourelle, ¹⁵ whose innate theatricality, as is mentioned above, is fully realized in the Jeu de Robin et Marion.

There is a direct relation, secondly, between the presence of refrains, ¹⁶ the function of the refrains within the lyric-narrative mix, and the way customary plot of encounter and attempted seduction is played out. Though the total number of poems in which the girl's honor is safeguarded is nearly equal to the number in which the narrator achieves some measure of success, refrains mark two-thirds of the pastourelles in which seduction occurs. On the other hand, only half of those poems in which the shepherdess successfully rebuffs the attentions of the narrator feature refrains. Thus among the fifty-five instances where the man gains the upper hand, thirty-seven contain refrains and eighteen do not, while among the fifty-one instances where the girl retains the upper hand, twenty-six contain refrains and twenty-four do not. The lyric-narrative mix of the pastourelle functions, in short, to promote its expected d6nouement, ¹⁷ a fact which merits closer attention. The touse appears better able to hold her ground when the medium is speech than when it is song. Though she may display the wit of the courtier, she of course lacks a courtier's training, and skill at lyric poetry, particularly in a debate format, is one area in which she must be at a distinct disadvantage. The narrator thus takes advantage of her because the rural setting and her social station remove any barriers, but he is able to dominate her by means of musical and verbal skills, which reinforce the social and gender disparity between them. He is only partly successful at robbing her of her speech, but usually succeeds when he can rob her of her song, her means of self-expression which, as we remember, was a catalyst for the entire encounter. He is attracted to her through her lyric lament, which marks her as an exotic, "primitive" other. This in itself makes her fair game, and he is best equipped to erase her opposition when he uses the powerful, "cultivated" tool of courtly lyric.¹⁸

This correlation must nonetheless be nuanced, as distinct types of refrain exist which, as closer examination reveals, each have their own effect on the narrative. Refrains in Old French lyric, while variable in form and function, are quite narrowly defined as quoted lyric material. Many have been identified in other sources, even in other pastourelles, as is illustrated by the refrain "(bele) douce mere De / gardez moi ma chastete," which occurs throughout Raoul de eauvaisis's "Quant la seson nouvele" and after the fourth stanza of Penn d'Angicourt's "Au tens nouvel." Both poems date from circa 1250, and neither is the probable source of the quoted material, as the meter and rhyme scheme of the latter do not match those of its surroundings in either case. From a metrical standpoint, refrains are usually linked to the surrounding material via the rhyme scheme, while in terms of syllable count, the refrain sometimes matches the surrounding poem and sometimes does not. As a general rule, the shorter the refrain, the better it is knit to the body of the narrative. In multi-line refrains, the match is less effective, as not all of the rhyme words of the refrain find a rhyme within the verse, but the level of craft, particularly in pastourelles with variable refrains, is remarkable. It is easy to believe, in many instances, that the refrain was composed, or at least modified, to fit its narrative context. There is considerable question, in fact, about the identification of all refrains as adapted from an outside source. If, as Everist argues, ¹⁹

fully half of the refrains catalogued by Gennrich²⁰ and van den Boogaard²¹ are indeed unique, by what criteria may they be considered borrowed, and thus refrains at all? Cognizant of the validity of this objection, particularly as it applies to the refrains found in motets, I will concentrate on refrains either that are indeed found elsewhere in the pastourelle repertoire, or which are so disruptive that they must be considered as interpolated. In the remainder of this essay, I will distinguish between pastourelles featuring multiple refrains and those containing a single, repeated refrain. Each of these types shows its own peculiar relation between lyric insertion and narrative frame, and its own peculiar effect on the development of the plot, and the eventual shape of the pastourelle itself.

Multiple Refrains

The most innovative pastourelles are those with multiple refrains, used both to introduce the shepherdess to listener and narrator, and as part of the dialogue between the two. For pastourelles that quote the girl's song also use a borrowed refrain to voice the narrator's entreaty and/or her refusal. The opening lyric is usually spoken in solitude and traditionally expresses either sorrow at having lost Robin or simply love pangs. In either case, this lyric expression constitutes an invitation to the narrator. Variations on this theme include continued lyric expression on the girl's part once she has spotted him, thus deliberately inviting his attentions, or her expressed fear of him, as in Raoul de Beauvais's (ca. 1250) "Quant la seson renouvele" (Paden, 182) in which she exclaims, noting his approach, "Douce mere De, gardez moi ma chastee!" (Sweet mother of God, protect my chastity!). Presumably she, like her audience, was an informed consumer of pastourelles.

Pierre de Corbie's "Pensis com fins amourous," described above, contains eight different refrains. In each case, the refrain mirrors precisely the previous statement, and recapitulates, in a lyric interlude, the wisdom that has just been dispensed. The refrains are every bit as appropriate to the narrative as are the lyric insertions of Guillaume de Dole, and render public a discussion, which, within the theatrical conventions of medieval poetry, was private. They are related to the narrative poem, moreover, exactly as are the refrains of objective pastourelles, and one easily imagines them performed chorally, appended to a narrative performed solo. Jean Erart's "Les le brueill" (Paden, p. 170) also contains multiple refrains that comprise a portion of the characters' lyric performance. The shepherdess's three refrains serve to clarify her position vis-a-vis the narrator: the first time ("Se je chant j'ai bel ami, j'ai m'amour assenee"), to discourage his approach, the second time ("Ce ne doit on mie faire, S'amor doner et retraire"), to reinforce lyrically her commitment to Robin, the third time ("Amis, vostre demoree me fera faire autre ami!"), to indicate the shift in her relation to Robin, as she begins to waver in her resolve. The first refrain contains a single line of her song, which was already reported narratively in the opening of the poem. It is sandwiched between the two lines of the refrain and translates very effectively her anxiety about what may happen. She is determined to continue singing as if nothing were amiss, but also needs to express categorically, as the refrain permits, her unavailability. Her mixed performance/protest of fidelity has an immediate and opposite effect.²² His response to her expostulation closes the stanza, which is unusual, as the refrain is overwhelmingly the last element in a stanza, and is furthermore brutally to the point: "Touse, laissiez Robin." The refrains have the purpose here of prolonging discussion, for they stand on their own as proverbs yet summarize the preceding argument. The effect is extended rhetorical

effort, on his part to convince her and on her part to dissuade him, and the final refrain rings with an air of rhetorical truth that establishes the eventual outcome of the encounter much less ambiguously than the simple narrative.

It is striking that in this poem and certain others, particularly the anonymous pastourelle "Quand je chevauchoie" (Paden, 286), the refrains can stand on their own, independently of the narrative frame. They do not constitute a coherent song, but neither do the collected insertions in a hybrid lyrico-narrative romance. Rather, the four refrains of this poem function as a rubric for the stanza they complete, and pithily summarize the narrative in four short bursts of lyric.

- 1. Nus ne doit les le bois aler sanz sa compaignete
- 2. N'atouchiez pas a mon chainse sire chevalier
- 3. Dame qui a mal mari, s'el fet ami n'en fet pas a blasmer
- 4. S'aim trop melz un pou de joie a demener

 Que mil marz d'argent avoir et puis plorer

- 1. No one should go along the woods without his dear companion
- 2. Don't touch my shift sir knight
- 3. A lass who has a bad husband, if she takes a lover doesn't deserve to be blamed
- 4. And I'd much rather have' a little fun than have a thousand silver marks and weep

They are thus a kind of shorthand for the poem, which gives us a new perspective on the lyric passages of a work like Guillaume de Dole. Turning around Renart's statement that the narrative was designed to trigger remembrance of the lyric repertoire of his day, we can say that the lyric refrains can be retained by the singerpor ramenbrance de l'estoire.

Whereas in each of the poems discussed above, the refrains parallel the exchange between the two characters and in fact are forms of address, other refrains address the listener or have no clear audience. The anonymous thirteenth century poem "Quand pre verdoient, que chantent oisel" features such refrains. These are woven into the stanza, are of a single line, and with two exceptions, are nonsense syllables. In all cases, the refrains are introspective, and suggest the narrator humming ditties to himself. They set a frivolous tone, and in two instances, constitute asides to the audience, as the refrain comments on the girl's beauty and on her lack of fear of him: "Va doura, la douce" and "Va de la doutance."

These examples offer us a vital window into the culture of performance of the pastourelle (and indeed of medieval lyric as a whole). While the courtly celebrations depicted in Guillaume de Dole make us informed observers of lyric performance, the pastourelle's multiple refrains engage us in that performance. Those refrains in particular which function as narratorial interventions, bring alive an audience which was an active and enthusiastic participant in the poem's staged conflict and make us part of it. The discursive sophistication of these pastourelles contributes measurably to the success of the male protagonist's (con)quest, then, and their charm does not manage to dispel the sense of disquiet which this communal, jocular approach to sexual predation raises in modem audiences. That it must have raised something of the same sense in medieval audiences is visible in the precedence which pastourelles with single refrains assumed in the latter part of the thirteenth century. For in these poems, the theatri cal dimension of the

genre appears to take precedence over the conflict, and shift the focus away from it such that the girl is able to defend herself. We understand through these poems that the theatrical aura and sense of audience is not in itself responsible for the classic outcome, for this sense increases in the pastourelles with single refrains, yet in 75 percent of them, the suitor is deflected without so much as a kind word from his potential victim. How does the single refrain function to achieve this result?

Single Refrains

In the single refrain poems, the refrain is entirely appropriate to only one of the stanzas, while in the remainder, its relation is more tangential. It functions there, in its repetition, as an icon of the shepherdess' determination not to be swayed by his arguments. By stubbornly repeating her initial declaration of love--for Robin or in general, she refuses to listen to his arguments or engage him in a lyric jousting match, which, as multiple refrain pastourelles show, she is likely to lose. By this means, she avoids being silenced. She preserves the voice to which the narrator was initially attracted, not allowing it to be subsumed in his, and in the process preserves her honor. Two anonymous songs, "De Saint Quatin a Cambrai" (Paden, 228) and "Heu main matin jueir alai" (Paden, 392) illustrate this admirably. The first features, in three stanzas, a brief encounter with the shepherdess singing, as a refrain, "En non Deu,j'ai bel amin, coente etjolif, tant soie je brunete" (In God's name, I have a handsome friend, charming and attractive, though I be dark-haired).²³ She is focused on Robin and scarcely listens to the narrator's entreaty. By a meta-discursive parry--"mon pastour Robin ke fiencie l'a. Joie en ai, si en chanterai cette chansonnete" ([vv. 30-31] I am promised to my shepherd Robin. He makes he happy, so I'll sing this little song), she holds up her ditty as a shield to deflect his attentions, and the poem ends there. One could argue that this poem is somehow abbreviated; as the suitor is habitually not successful until stanza 5 at least, it may simply be that the remainder of the adventure is missing. This interpretation of the repeated refrain holds, however, when one examines the second poem. The latter piece does contain five stanzas, and though the shepherdess' refrain is much more erotically charged here: "Les mamelettes me poignent/je ferai nouvel amin" (My breasts are tingling / I will take a new lover), the suitor has no more success than in the previous poem. Though she has left Robin t hree days hence, she declares she will remain faithful to him, and successfully repulses her interlocutor. The curious twist found at the close of this poem, that the narrator is grateful for her refusal, shows this poem to be the most successful effort, in a movement, which has been visibly building in these theatrical pastourelles, to shift the locus of power of the traditional pastourelle. This shepherdess is a worthy counterpart to Marion of Adam's Jeu in that her song expresses that she is indeed in love, but that her feelings are not an invitation to anyone who happens to eavesdrop. She has displaced the male narrator's desire, which is conventionally expressed in her opening song, and replaced it with her desire alone. She is amorous but not lascivious, and is free to be inaccessible to her narratorial suitor. The narrator's declaration: "Kant je l'oij boin grei, l'an sal si la laixal chantant ansi" ([v. 37-38] When I heard her I was grateful, and I left her singing this way) suggests that he has been rewritten in her image, thus subverting the conventional power structure of the pastourelle.²⁴

The pastourelles with single repeating refrains are also, significantly, simpler in structure than pastourelles with variable refrains. To the extent that the refrains are frivolous and theatrical in quality, and this is particularly true of pastourelles that evolved as ballettes, they assume dominance over narrative development. The failure of the suitor's request and girl's successful

refusal owe as much in these poems to the refrain's impedance of the plot as they do to the lyric ditty's ability to deflect the narrator in his purpose. For the refrains in these cases organize the narrative, and both by their frivolity and by the proportions they assume they eclipse the plot itself.²⁵ In the anonymous thirteenth century "L' autrier chivachoi leis un boix" (Paden, 264), the refrain occupies fully half of each stanza, and clearly stands in the suitor's way:

Teirelire un don, Robeson, Musairs viennent et musairs vont, teirelire un don tridon

Fools come and fools go

She is singing her nonsense in order to make fun of Robin, but is also annoying the narrator with her frivolous rhyme, for he offers her his love only on condition that she stop singing! She acquiesces to his offer, but proposes that they sing her ditty together; it is not surprising that the narrative does not progress beyond this point. 26 Likewise, the anonymous pastourelle "J'antrai en lai rewelette" (Paden, 272) contains a refrain, composed in large part of nonsense syllables, which has all the flavor of musical comedy. It is constructed as a question/reply launched by the information divulged in the third line of each stanza. The poem states in stanza one, for example, that the beguine encountered is dressed in a blue tunic (cotte parcete). The rhetorical question is posed: "Pers?", and then bandied playfully about--Non! Pers, Dieu! Pers ci! Pers, pers, pers, pers, leading directly into the refrain. This refrain, offering narrative, likely choral, commentary on the characters, tracks first a male, then a female, through a field of lilies of the valley. She has refused his love without seeing first what gifts he has to offer, and though the narrative stops there, the final refrain pivots on the word "folle," which constitutes both her commentary on his promise, and narrative commentary on her, as she then sets off after him; her curiosity has apparently overcome reticence. The absorption of the refrain by the narrative voice breaks new narratological ground in the pastourelle, bringing the genre closer to the pastourelle motet, in which the narrative portion of the poem is reduced to a minimum and its functions partly appropriated by the lyric/dialogic portion.²⁷

The correlation observed between a single repeated refrain and the confounding of the suitor's purpose is supported by the example of three pastourelles in which the narrator does manage to overcome resistance. In each instance, the shepherdess maintains her refusal, repeating her refrain until, in the last stanza, he overcomes her by force. Her change of heart, or at least her acquiescence to the change of situation, is then signaled by a new refrain. Thus, in the first poem (Paden, 246), the refrain "Ai, ai, ai, j'ai a cuerles malz dontje morrai!" gives way in the final stanza to "Ai, ai, ai, ai, j'ai senti les malz dontje guerrai"; in the second (Paden, 268), "En mi, en mi, en mi / laice, je n'ai point d'amin!" becomes "En mi en mi, en mi / laice, bone amor m'ocist"; and in the third (Paden, 302), "James n'aimerai home de cuer gay!" changes to "Je vos amerai touz jors de cuer vrai!"

This shift of focus away from conflictual encounter toward the pastourelle as theater has its origins, as Joel Blanchard cogently argues, ²⁸ in the objective pastourelle, with its "dorenlot" type dance refrains. In a poem such as Jean Erart's early thirteenth century "Au tens pascor" (Paden, 178), the narrator witnesses a scene of pastoral revelry in which the nonsense refrain: cibalala duriaus duriaus, cibalala durie is intended to imitate Gui's bagpipes. That it also assumes metaphorical status as a representation of general merriment is apparent following the

deterioration of that initial joyous mood. Perrin, who has been roughed up by his companions when a jealous quarrel erupts, now "n'a talen q'il die 'cibabala duriaus" ([vv. 73-75] has no desire to sing cibalala, etc.).

From such settings, in which refrains symbolize instrumental accompaniment and generalized rustic revelry, they become absorbed into classic pastourelles and assume choral functions. In Ernoul de Gastinais's "Por conforter mon corage" (Paden, 206), each stanza is punctuated, after the third-to-last and second-to-last verses, just before the variable refrain, by two occurrences of "Aeo!" which appear to be a shorthand for the shepherd girl's music making.²⁹ Though we are then informed that the shepherdess sings the ditty quoted at the end of each stanza, the first refrain she utters is, atypically, about herself and in the third person: "Je voi venir Emmelot par mile vert bois" ([vv. 23-25] I see Emmelot coming Through the green wood). Though purportedly sung by her, this refrain is more logically voiced by Robin from offstage, as occurs in some of the Robin and Marion motets. 30 For it expresses an omniscient point of view, and appears to set us in a classic pastourelle opening. As the girl does arguably utter these words, however, we find ourselves in very different surroundings: she herself is performing a pastourelle, and the doubling of narrative and lyric voices strongly suggests that we are witnessing not just a pastoral encounter, but a collective performance of a pastoral encounter. When understood as a rondet de carole, the curious expostulations "a e o!" and the refrains are transparently voiced by the dancers, who both recount the drama and double as characters in it.

Stronger evidence for this type of choral participation is found in an anonymous thirteenth-century pastourelle "L'autrier chevauchai pensis" (Paden, 228), in which the first refrain is patently more than just the shepherdess's lyric lament. For this expostulation "He amis, li biaus, li doz, trop m'aveis obliee" (Hey, fair sweet friend, long have you forgotten me) is introduced by an exhortation to a group: "Chanteis, respondeis tuit, ke bien fust elle nee" (Sing, answer all of you, for it is lucky she was born). At the end, furthermore, after he has had his way with her, we find a formulaic lament which, addressed to Robin in other pastourelles, ³¹ is expressed about him, by an omniscient voice: "Robins alt trop demoreit a la belle reveoir" ([vv.51-52] Robin waited too long to see his sweetheart again). Further evidence of pastourelles performed as caroles is visible in Jean Erart's "Dales Loncpre u boskel" (Paden, 174), which features a recurring line that can be interpreted as a stage direction. The ref rain is introduced in the first two stanzas by the formula "Et la bele tout ensi enprint a chanter" (And the pretty girl began to sing in this way) and afterwards by "adont recomence ensi la bele a chanter" (Then the pretty girl again began to sing this way). In no other poem is such an organizing device used, and it has the unmistakable ring of a cue for choral entrance.

While this evolution away from the plot of the pastourelle to focus on performance is characteristic of the single refrain pastourelle, it is not limited to it. I close with a multi-refrain example, which shows the theatrical pastourelle at its apogee. In the anonymous thirteenth-century poem "De Mes a friscor l'autre jor" (Paden, 256), the refrains patently come from various sources and contradict both the narrative frame and one another. When the narrator encounters the shepherdess, she is, rather expectedly, making a garland and singing. Though dark hair was no impediment to the fortunes of the shepherdess of the anonymous "De Saint Quatin a Cambrai" (see above), in this case it patently is, for she laments in the first refrain (vv. 9-11):

suis enmi laisette, et si n'ai point d'amin I am, alas, poor me And I have no lover

Henceforth, the refrain doubles the dialogue of each stanza; stanza two voices the suitor:

Amerouzement me tient por vos, dame li malz ke je sant The pain I feel Holds me lovingly for you, Lady

while the refrain of stanza three echoes the girl's reply. His interest in her seems to have effected a miracle, for to his entreaties, she now declares:

Jolie ne suis je pais mais je suis blondette et d'amin soulette Pretty I am not
But I am blond
And lonely for a friend

Her original defect has been altered into plainness, as she must still have an objection with which to fend him off.

That this poem is a ritualized patchwork of stock lyric elements, removed from the threatening "reality" of the classic pastourelle, is also plainly visible in the mix of registers.³² For though the girl is a shepherdess, encountered in the green wood where one would expect her, the narrator/protagonist addresses her in the second and fourth refrains, as "dame" and as "douce dame." His flattery has the desired effect, but as she has been raised by him to a higher status, her response is a single kiss, as befits a lyric lady. The result is a genuinely lyrico-narrative poem in which the characters address each other with snatches of well-known songs, entertaining both audience and each other, and seem to establish, in the process, a basis for equality.³³

This theatricalized discourse, with its reassertion of the female voice, can lead to the frankly parodic--as in the mid thirteenth century "L'autre jour en un jardin" (Paden, 118), in which the young girl encountered in an orchard pursues, knocks down, and has her way with the narrator (perhaps a cleric)--or can showcase characters from other lyric genres. Thus, in an anonymous thirteenth-century poem, the "jone pucele" keeping her sheep "lonc une fontenelle," mastiff close at hand for fear of Isengrim, is named ... Belle Aelis! No longer just a character in a Chanson de toile, or flattened onto a rondeau refrain, she now stars in her own pastourelle. Aelis sings, moreover, in courtly terms--"Je li ai tout mon cuer doneit / si n'en ai point aveuc moy"--a song which fleshes out motifs glimpsed in the carole repertoire, thus underscoring the pastourelle's predilection for public performance. That the passage from pastourelle to play was recursive is most plainly visible in the Jeu de Robin et Marion. Marion's opening lines: "Robins m'aime, Robin m'a demandee, si m'aura" appear as refrains in two earlier pastourelles, one anonymous and one by Penin d'Angicourt, already discussed, and Robin's cry of alarm "He, on emene Marote!" recurs in a Robin and Marion motet from the same period.

As is true in the motet repertoire, the narratives in these highly theatrical pieces appear to be fashioned to fit the refrains rather than the reverse; their presence thus shapes both creative process and product. The hybrid nature of the pastourelle has permitted it to evolve. From a transgressive, anti-courtly narrative, where the lady was removed from her pedestal, and given

a voice, but only as a woman, it became an experimental laboratory for all types of lyric poetry currently practiced, in the process undermining the very power relationships with which it was originally concerned. We see played out, in addition to the expected encounters between noblemen and shepherdesses, wooing of ladies in gardens and of nuns, pastourelles which become malmariees, pastourelles featuring characters from the rondet de carole, pastourelles whose creative play with the intermix of lyric and narrative intersects with lyrico-narrative romance and leads directly to the stage.³⁴ This narratological complexity makes the French pastourelle one of the most significant experiments in medieval lyric.

In contrast to this, the pastorela never evolved significantly once its parameters were established with Marcabru. Indeed, there is a glaring hiatus in pastorela production during the pastourelle's most productive period. The pastorelas of Guiraut Riquier, which are significant in that they give the shepherdess a genuine voice and an individuality that is recognizable over time, ³⁵ do not mark a new direction for the Occitan pastourelle. Neither they nor the poems of Joan Esteve explore the lyrical-narrative mix, which is integral to the French genre, and they are careful not to transgress the refusal of the shepherdess. Only Gautier de Murs, among Occitan poets, features a scene similar to and perhaps in imitation of, his French contemporaries. In this example, we are well on the way to the bergerette, which the pastourelle becomes in its popular survival, for the knightly narrator has become the king's son, and in her own defense, the girl hits, scratches and bites him-- graphic albeit realistic details o mitted from other such narratives. Furthermore, when Robin whacks him across the back, as does happen in French pastourelles, he unexpectedly draws his sword, but is then prevented from taking revenge by the large crowd which has gathered. For Gautier de Murs and Joan Esteve, then, the encounters are dominated by violence or end in exhortations to chastity, setting a very different tone from the pastourelle.³⁶ To the extent that the assessment of the pastorela found in the Leys d'Amors reflects the effects of the Inquisition on lyric poetry in the south, ³⁷ it is entirely understandable that Occitan poets were not able to see past the story line of the pastourelle to appreciate its narrative potential. The latter's roots in lyric-narrative experimentation assured, however, its flexibility and longevity. Though both pastorela and pastourelle eventually emerge as bergerette, this takes place much earlier in the case of the pastorela. The pastourelle, for its part, was assured several more centuries at the forefront of poetic fashion. As motet voice, as farce, as moralizing pastorale, and in its final manifestation with Christine de Pizan, it retained throughout the Middle Ages its hybrid lyrico-narrative character, exerting its charms on medieval and modem audiences alike.

Notes

- ¹ The French language poem will be referred to throughout as the pastourelle, while its Occitan counterpart will be designated as pastorela.
- ² Pierre Bec, La lyrique française au moyen-age vol I (Paris: A. & J. Picard), 120.
- ³ The pastourelle plays out exactingly, and endlessly, the scenario described by Andreas in book II of chapter I, whatever Andreas's true intention may have been. See Paolo Cherchi, Andreas and the Ambiguity of Courtly Lave (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994) for the argument that Andreas's treatise was a polemic against courtly love rather than a promotion of its doctrines.
- ⁴ For Zink, La pastourelle (Paris: Bordas, 1972), 64-75, the northern poem is rooted in a more thoroughly ecclesiastical and rigidly hierarchical society than the less feudalized world of the south. Though the pastourelle's need to transcend the moral strictures of church and court, and of courtly love itself, may not have been a formative element in Troubadour poetry, the dichotomy between domna andfemna was already clearly articulated by Bernart de Ventadom and is fully developed in the pastourelle. As the antithesis of the silent, venerated lady, the vocal, grasping, libidinous, shepherd girl arguably constitutes a poetic effort to control the lady by removing her from any social context where her will can hold sway. As this essay will argue, the pastourelle's very structure permitted its female protagonist to escape the strictures of its original program, and shift the balance of power to a limited extent.
- ⁵ Quotations are taken from William D. Paden, The Medieval Pastourelle 2 vols. (Garland, 1983); translations are my own.
- ⁶ For Kathryn Gravdal, Ravishing Maidens. Writing Rape in Medieval French Literature and Law (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991), 104-21, the pastourelle supports contemporary rape law in depriving women of any voice or legal recourse. While in legal terms this is undeniable, the shepherdess herself proves remarkably resourceful in voicing opposition, on her own terms, to the objectifying viewpoint of the male narrator. The most discursively complex pastourelles thus succeed in undermining the roles established by the roving narrator/protagonist.
- ⁷ Bee (1977, vol. I, 120) defines the poetic structure of the Old French pastourelle as tripartite, containing "I) Ia rencontre amoureuse; 2) le debat amoureux; 3) la plainte amoureuse (lyrique)."
- ⁸ Bee, (1977, vol. I, 122). The absence of the cruder gender struggle, for which the social dimension of the pastourelle is a foil, does not diminish in any way the literary value and charm of the pastorela.
- ⁹ "Limportant est le duel oratoire des deux interlocuteurs, la finesse et la subtilite de leurs repliques, posees souvent dans l'abstrait et d'une facon presque independante du contexte situationnel" (1977), 122).
- ¹⁰ Bec, (1977), Zink, (1992).
- ¹¹ I am purposefully avoiding the "origins" debate, and enthusiastically subscribe to Pierre Bee's terms aristocratisant and popularisant, which for the present time have neutralized what had become a sterile argument.

- ¹² For Joel Blanchard, La pastorale en France aux [XIV.sup.e] et [XV.sup.e] siecles (Paris: Champion, 1983), 64-66, the shepherdess's criticisms express the Artesian bourgeoisie's dissatisfaction with Philip Augustus for his current state of excommunication, on the one hand, and blame of the Flemish nobility, on the other, for the current conflict with Paris. Significantly, as an expression of the burgher point of view, the encounter with the shepherdess is a mere pretext for the diatribe, and the traditional motifs are not sustained beyond the opening stanzas of the poem.
- ¹³ See Maureen Boulton, The Song in the Story (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press), 1993.
- ¹⁴ The dissimilarity, of course, is that while the narrative frame can exist independently of its lyric interpolations, in the pastourelle (see Michel Zink, "Suspension and Fall. The Fragmentation and Linkag of Lyric Insertions in Le roman de la rose and Le roman de la violette," Durling, ed., Jean Renart and the Art of Romance (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1997), 104-21 and Sylvia Huot, From Song to Book. The Poetics of Writing in Old French Lyric and Lyrical Narrative Poetry (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1987), 106-25), the lyric lament and refrains are intricately woven into the tale and cannot be excised without mutilating the poem. This is less true of course of recurring refrains, particularly of the dorenlot type, than of variable refrains, but the former provide vital clues to the performance of the pastourelle.
- ¹⁵ The dorenlot-type refrain, in particular, could have retained the role it played in the rondet de carole, thus making of the pastourelle a dance song: see Mark Everist, French Motets in the Thirteenth Century (Cambridge University Press, 1994), 54- 66. This is particularly plausible in the case of the objective pastourelle, with its focus of pastoral revelry, as it then becomes a mimesis of what it portrays.
- ¹⁶ The increasing use of refrains was driven, according to William Paden, "Reading Pastourelles," Tenso 4 (1988): 1-21, by the Puy d'Arras, whose organized competitions almost certainly witnessed the staging of Adam de la Halle's pastoral farce soon after the poet's death in Italy ca. 1288.
- ¹⁷ Only nineteen pastourelles play out the brutality of Andreas Capellanus's prescription in chapter II: "But if perchance you should be attracted to such women (i.e., peasants), be sure to move their hearts with abundant praise, and if you find a suitable place, do not hesitate to take what you were seeking and violently embrace it". While the lyric element conspires to reinforce the social hybridity of the genre, it also tempers its transgressive violence by making it a kind of game.
- ¹⁸ This connection between song and social/gender disparity, and its longevity, are engagingly explored in Nancy A. Jones, "The Rape of the Rural Muse: Wordsworth's 'The Solitary Reaper' as a Version of Pastourelle," Higgins and Silver, eds., Rape and Representation (New York: Columbia University Press, 1991), 263-77.
- ¹⁹ Everist, French Motets, 1994, 56-66.
- ²⁰ Das altfranzosische Rondeau und Virelai im 12. und 13. Jahrhundert Summa musicae mcdii aevi to (Langen bei Frankfurt: n.p., 1963).
- ²¹ Rondeaux et refrains du [XII.sup.e] siecle au debut du [XIV.sup.e]: collationnement, introduction, et notes, Bibliotheque françaisc et romane, D: 3 (Paris: Klincksieck, 1969).
- ²² Sings a variant of the Belle Aeliz motif: "Doete (!) est main levee," which likely served, despite her best intentions, to encourage him. As a familiar ditty from the dance sang repertoire, it would have suggested her readiness to engage in such frivolity.

- ²³ This is not the only allusion in the pastourelle repertoire to the medieval ideal of beauty expressed by a character who deviates from it.
- ²⁴ Means by which women in Old French literature must appropriate male discourse to their own purposes, thereby partially undermining conventions in order to speak in their own voices, is the subject of E. Jane Burn's Body Talk. When Women Speak in Old French Literature (Philadephia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993).
- Focusing on pastourelles with repeating refrains, Susan M. Johnson, "The Role of the Refrain in the Pastourelles a refrain," Cummins, ed., Literary and Historical Perspectives on the Middle Ages (Morgantown: West Virginia University Press, 1982), 78-92, notes: "In a sense, the explanation of the refrain is the goal of the poem, and it puts an end to the plot. The refrain and the understanding of its meaning become a principal object of the poem." (81)
- Poem is entirely consistent with Jane Burn's analysis (sec note 23) in that the shepherdess's song becomes a tool of power by which she can control the man. The flourishing of this type of theatrical pastourelle thus can be viewed as an effort to allow the genre's female protagonist to repossess her voice/song and rewrite the male-dominant poem in vogue. This is entirely consistent with the processes at work in the Jeu de Robin et Marion, and constitutes a significant step in the evolution of the pastorale as it came to be practiced in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.
- ²⁷ The pastourelle text usually occupies just one of the motet parts and the narrative frame, if there exists one, is often established in one of the other voices. Narrative material from the pastourelle is then either excised or integrated into dialogue. Though the majority of poems presented in this section cannot be dated with accuracy, one, "Heu main matin jueir alai" can be placed in the late thirteenth century, contemporary with the collections of pastourelle motets. See Hans Tischler, The Montpellier Codex (Madison: A-R Editions, 1973), fascicles II--III, as well as Wyndham Thomas, Robin and Marion Motels (Devon: Antico Edition, 1985), 2 vats.
- ²⁸ See Blanchard, op. Cit., 17-45.
- ²⁹ Similarity of this sequence of vowels to the enigmatic AOI which punctuates the laisses of the Oxford Roland is unmistakable.
- ³⁰ It is reminiscent of motets such as "L'autrier m'esbatoie I Demenant grant joie" in which the same refrain--"G'irai toute la valee avec Marot"--occurs in both triplum and duplum, yet is narratively appropriate in only one of the voices.
- ³² Again, we find here reflections of motet writing, which as a matter of course juxtapose dissimilar registers. Mo27, for example, from fascicle II of the Montpellier codex, features a Marian hymn in the quadruplum, a courtly song in the triplum, and a pastourelle in the duplum, alt set above the tenor FLOS FILIUS. In this case, the courtly rhetoric and the contradictory refrains are features of a single poem, which, as happens in the pastourelle motet, is no longer purely a pastourelle.
- ³¹ See also "Robin cui je doi aimer / tu pues trop bien demorer," found in Jean Erart's "Dales loncprc u boskel" (Paden, 174) as well as his "Les le brueill" (Paden, 170).
- ³³ Jane Bums argues in "The Man behind the Lady in Troubadour Lyric," Romance Notes 25/3 (1985), 254-70 for interpreting lyric performance as a space which blurs gender boundaries and can voice women as strong characters surpassing their male counterparts in resourcefulness, a model born out by heroines such as Nicolete and Silence.

- ³⁴ I have not discussed here the religious pastourelle where devotion to Mary replaces attraction to Marion, except insofar as the motet voices devotional texts and pastourelles simultaneously, but it does of course exist, in France as much as in post-Inquisition Occitania.
- ³⁵ His six pastourelles feature encounters with the same shepherdess over a period of twenty years.
- ³⁶ In Esteve's other pastourelle, he achieves his purpose, but only because she fully acquiesces. There is no hint of violence, and he has not used flattery or made false promises. The genre as practiced by the French was likely considered too coarse, and this pastourelle along with the others recalls Jean Audiau's assessment (1923, xvi-xvii) that "meme la campagne, les troubadours sont restes, de leur plein gre, des poetes de salon. Ils ant eu mains le bauci de peindre Ia vie des champs que celui de depayser leurs theories pour mieux en juger les effets."
- ³⁷ Significantly, the author of the Leys selected the most parodic, repugnant piece to exhibit as exemplary of the genre: the anonymous "Porquiera: which Audiau published at the end of his collection.