

Western University

From the SelectedWorks of Vivian C. McAlister

January 2011

“Noted Surgeon, Fine Citizen”: The Life of
Archibald E Malloch, MD 1844–1919 by Charles
G. Roland

Contact
Author

Start Your Own
SelectedWorks

Notify Me
of New Work



Available at: <http://works.bepress.com/vivianmcalister/122>

Book Reviews / Comptes Rendus

“Noted Surgeon, Fine Citizen”: The Life of Archibald E Malloch, MD 1844–1919
Charles G. Roland

Osler Library Studies in the History of Medicine, No. 11

Quebec: McGill University and American Osler Society, 2008, ix + 312 p., illus., \$25.00

This book concerns two generations of physicians: Archibald Malloch, his son Thomas Archibald and their famous colleagues Joseph Lister and William Osler. A century ago, they lived through times of great change in medicine and in society. A study of their lives would be instructive for this alone as changes loom large once again. This thoroughly researched and well written book, the last by the late Charles Roland, has even more value because the title’s epithet could as easily be applied to the author, who was both a noted physician and a fine citizen, as it is to Malloch père. From a log cabin in northern Manitoba, via the University of Toronto and the Manitoba Medical College, to general practice in southern Ontario, Roland actually lived the growth of Canada in the 20th century, just as the Mallochs experienced its sometimes painful early development. Roland left Ontario in 1964 to become an editor with the *Journal of the American Medical Association* and later Chair of the Department of Biomedical Communications at the Mayo Clinic. Whether or not it was his fondness for Osler studies that led Roland to McMaster University in 1977, as the first Hannah Professor in the History of Medicine, we cannot say, but the situation was fortunate because it brought him to the home ground of the Mallochs and the Oslers. Roland’s academic career was as noted for its scholarship as he was known for generous collaboration and gentle mentorship, features he shared with the subjects of his book. It is poignant for the reviewers to look upon photographs of Archibald Malloch Sr. in kind old age and see reminders of his sadly missed biographer.

Archibald Malloch (1844-1919) grew up in Brockville, Ontario and attended university in Kingston before going to Glasgow in Scotland to complete his medical education (1867). Canada watched anxiously as large armies demobilized south of its border while its leaders, most of whom were known personally to the Mallochs, set about the task of building a new country. Documentary gaps in Malloch’s story are expertly filled by the author with a comprehensive picture of life at that time just as the description of Malloch’s education at Queens’ University is enriched by the author’s detailed knowledge of medical education and examination during that period. Malloch’s professor of anatomy, Dr. Michael Sullivan, sought to improve the standard required for practice in Ontario. As Chief Examiner, he brought a cadaver on the train from Kingston to Toronto and questioned candidates on material not available in Gray’s textbook.

It is not surprising that Malloch did well in Glasgow or that he quickly came to the notice of Joseph Lister, who was then embarking on his quest to improve outcomes in surgery. Malloch kept detailed records of his year as Lister's houseman. These records and correspondence between Malloch and Lister regarding patient care during Lister's lengthy summer vacation provided the author with excellent source material. In addition to a fine description of Malloch's training, Roland's use of quotations is very effective. Malloch returned to Canada holding a glowing testimonial from Lister. His practice for the next 40 years would follow the principles learned in that year.

Malloch set up in Hamilton just a century before his biographer. Malloch's life is described here in separate chapters detailing his case records, his publications, his medical teaching and his domestic life, respectively. Some readers may prefer a chronological revelation of events to the sectional approach. But each chapter allows Roland to analyze as well as to describe Malloch's activities. Thus, we learn about other Canadian Lister graduates and about other locally prominent doctors in the chapter dealing with Malloch's case records. While 19th-century physicians did not restrict their practices as much as their successors, Malloch did not specialize sufficiently to be known as a pioneering surgeon. It may be for this reason that his influence with respect to the introduction of Listerism into surgery was less evident than Roddick (Montreal), Stewart (Halifax), Grant (Ottawa), and Grassett (Toronto). Despite this, he was a very precise surgeon. He amputated the leg of a colleague, Dr Ingersoll Olmsted, who recalled Malloch's technique many years later in an address to the American Surgical Association.

The chapter dealing with Malloch's publications also discusses the opposition to Listerism by Ontario's prominent Dr Canniff and the debate regarding antiseptic and asepsis. Here the author falls into the old trap of tarring all opponents to Listerism with the same brush. While poor practice persisted in Toronto, such as feeding sutures through the surgeon's buttonhole and parking the scalpel in the surgeon's mouth, other opponents made cogent arguments against blind acceptance of early Listerism. Edward Farrell (Halifax, Nova Scotia) preferred surgical cleanliness to corrosive chemicals. Abraham Groves (Fergus, Ontario), who believed germs to be transmitted by fluids rather than air, preferred to sterilize his equipment rather than use Lister's spray. Despite the vigour of the debate, Roland makes it clear that Malloch's reputation was never threatened, but always enhanced, by his association with Lister.

The chapter devoted to Malloch's domestic life introduces us to two of his six children. Eldest son George died on an Arctic expedition in 1913. Sad as the events were, the detailed description of the voyage seems somewhat out of place here. The rest of the book is taken up with Thomas Archibald Malloch (1887-1953), also known as Archie and distinguished by the author from his father as "T Archie." This part of the story is told in the context of the relationship between the Malloch and Osler families. Again those who prefer the sequential description of events will be frustrated. Osler lived close to Hamilton when Malloch set up practice. They became lifelong friends and died in the same year. Young Archie inherited deafness from his father, caught tuberculosis from his mother and required an arthrodesis for leg length discrepancy as a child. The Mallochs went to Baltimore for his operation where Osler arranged for Halsted

to do it. Despite these setbacks, Archie graduated in medicine from McGill University. At the outbreak of the First World War, Archie was rejected as unfit by the Canadian Army Medical Corps. Osler immediately arranged for him to get a civilian position at a base hospital in France. From there, Archie succeeded in joining the Canadian Expeditionary Force. He would consider the Oslers in Oxford as his family home for the duration of the war. He repaid Osler's favour by intervening on behalf of Osler's son to speed up Revere's transfer from the Canadian Army Medical Corps to a British artillery unit. When Revere was killed, young Archie became a surrogate son for the grieving Oslers. Malloch's health deteriorated in 1918 and Osler helped young Archie receive special permission for home leave to visit his father. Malloch died in August 1919. By then, young Archie was back in Oxford looking after an ailing Osler, who died in December of the same year. Roland tells the story of the intertwining lives of these families well, but at the expense of Malloch's biography. The opportunity to investigate the influence of the father upon the son and vice versa was submerged by the allure of their distinguished friend. Young Archie's life beyond Osler is not described even though, in a manner similar to the author, he forsook clinical medicine to become an eminent medical librarian. Young Archie's career change was likely influenced by his work on *Biblioteca Osleriana*.

The development of medicine in Canada is portrayed here through the lives of two generations of Mallochs and their famous friends. Biography as history risks bias derived from its subject. In this book the author's deep scholarship prevents such distortion. For reviewers from two generations of surgeons practising today, the descriptions ring true and the events resonate with current changes in surgery.

CHLOE MCALISTER *University of Toronto*

VIVIAN MCALISTER *University of Western Ontario*

Different Truths: Ethnomedicine in Early Postcards

Peter A. G. M. De Smet

Amsterdam: KIT Publishers, 2010, 216 p., €34.50

This is a book that one will want to look at, read, then look at again, re-read, and look at more. It will appeal to those interested in medical practices within different worldviews and the controversies that are constant travelling companions today within cross-cultural, multi-cultural, and trans-cultural endeavours. The title *Different Truths* is exceedingly apt and the book's audience is very broad. De Smet has put together an astonishing assemblage of about 270 postcards showing "health-related scenes and representations from societies all over the world." His selection is from among a collection of some 700 he amassed by searching two major postcard auction websites. De Smet adopts the term "colonial postcards" for his collection, as the photographs used to create them were mainly taken in the period 1900-1930 in countries under European colonial rule. In a declared strategy to address today's issues about ethnocentricity and gaze, De Smet does not confine the book to non-Western ways of healing. Postcards are included for medicine practised in Western Europe parallel to those practised in colonial settings.

For each postcard, De Smet provides details such as caption, publisher, additional text, layout of the card's back, postal usage, and documentary use. Yet the five-part book is much more than postcards and descriptors: De Smet discusses the controversies, past and current, that the postcards represent, while also explaining the value they and his book hold. Part 1 (Prelude) and Part 5 (Postscript) are short and all text; they serve well the purposes their titles suggest, with ethnomedicine a topic considered in both. Parts 2-5 contain the vast visual richness of the postcards, plus De Smet's insightful commentary. The background the author brings to this challenging task is as a pharmacist, certified clinical pharmacologist, senior researcher, and university professor working in The Netherlands.

Part 2 (Postcards) is a fascinating discussion about the postcard industry and its history, postcard collections and collectors, and the "us / them" encounters the postcards portray. De Smet tells us that the first picture postcards appeared in the 1870s and the craze for collecting them spanned about 30 years, ending in the second decade of the 20th century. He reveals that as photographs became postcards, it was often the case that images were completely transformed to tell "different truths" than the ones initially depicted.

Part 3 (Practitioners and Practices) emphasizes that different perspectives come into play in the medical practices of different societies. De Smet says "therapeutic differences between (and within) medical systems can be explained, to a substantial extent, by *Different Truths* about underlying causes." This introduction is followed by 13 additional sections, entitled: native concepts of illness; self care; healers around the world; diagnostic methods; native therapies; supernatural methods of treatment; material holders of power; natural methods of treatment; physical methods; herbal medicine; surgery; midwifery; and animal care.

Part 4 (Professionalized Systems) was influenced by Arthur Kleinman's proposition that health care in different societies can generally be divided into the lay sector, folk sector, and professionalized sector. De Smet explores the latter by way of postcards believed to depict various learned traditions. Thus, we find sections on south Asian traditions, east Asian traditions, Western traditions; colonial medicine; colonial public health care; missionary health care; famine and pestilences; and conspicuous symptoms.

The book is large (29.5 cm x 24 cm x 1.5 cm), made from high quality paper, and it is a pleasure to hold. It is thoroughly documented, with 393 notes and hundreds of citations. The preface is written by Sjaak van der Geest, Professor Emeritus of Medical Anthropology, University of Amsterdam. Like the author, he speaks to the controversies that can entangle such a work but concludes that De Smet "grants both the others and ourselves too much respect, attributing them and us too much 'rationality.'" He encourages readers to understand that much of what people do for their health is based on "not-knowing and not knowing that we do not know." The postcards in De Smet's book will enable countless readers to begin a journey of asking themselves about knowing and not-knowing; De Smet's textual guidance and informed commentary are a rich bonus. On the whole, the book should appeal to a broad audience.

Contested Paternity: Constructing Families in Modern France

Rachel G. Fuchs

Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2008, xii + 353 p., US\$55

Contested Paternity is Rachel Fuchs' sixth book and it benefits from a career in research on abandoned children, unwed mothers, illegitimacy and the poor in 19th-century France and Europe. The early chapters are familiar territory for readers of Fuchs' previous books as she outlines the scenario facing the "poor and pregnant" in the 18th and 19th centuries.

Fuchs' chapters take a chronological approach, charting the changes in the definition and idea of paternity as well as the types of paternal proof relied on in court cases over the centuries. Fuchs also pays close attention to the changes in attitude towards unwed mothers, their illegitimate children and in the representations of their relationships with the alleged fathers in the courts and in 19th-century literature and drama. In the 1700s, a mother's word, often through naming the father during childbirth or through the *déclaration de grossesse*, which was required of the unwed mother, was sufficient to identify a father. By the time of Napoleon's Civil Code of 1804, there could no longer be any paternity searches because of the idea that "only marriage makes a father." This concept protected the legitimate children conceived within the conjugal family unit and did not recognize any natural children born out of wedlock. The lack of recognition of paternity outside of marriage was also expressed in Article 312 of the Napoleonic Code stating, "the mother's husband is the father of the child." In the early 1800s and in particular from 1811 with the establishment of state foundling homes, the French nation assumed responsibility for the tens of thousands of children abandoned each year. Nevertheless, as Fuchs recounts, over the course of the 19th century, many unwed mothers sought justice despite the blind spot in the Civil Code. According to Fuchs, these "women acted bravely" and many "smart women" and their lawyers worked around the law and sought damages or reparations from the putative father (p. 70). Women went to court as "victims" and the "fortunate who won their cases took their curtain calls as heroes" (p. 101). A single man who fathered a child might not have to recognize or raise the child, but after landmark cases in 1845 and 1864, he was liable for damages to the mother and to contribute to the costs of feeding, clothing and raising a child to adulthood.

At the turn of the 20th century, it was common for men and women among the urban poor to cohabit before marriage. These relationships known as *concubinage notoire* represent an emerging social pattern that, as Fuchs demonstrates, became apparent in early 20th-century legal decisions and in the new paternity law of 1912. If a man and woman lived together as a couple during the legal time of conception, this cohabitation became grounds for child support. If the mother could show written letters from the father, particularly ones expressing affection or showing evidence of financial assistance with the birth or the wet nurse, she had an even better chance of securing support for her child, especially if the father was a single man. The married man remained untouchable until 1955, when it became possible for mothers to pursue material support for their children.

Fuchs reports few statistics or percentages of the types of *recherches de paternité* and how many unwed mothers or illegitimate children were successful in their

claims for financial support. Instead Fuchs compiles and describes cases after case, or pools together a certain type of case, often pointing out the subtle nuances in the judgments handed down by the court justices—one of the themes she traces in the book.

Readers of the *Bulletin* might be interested in discovering when types of paternal proof of a more medical nature began to circulate in the French courts. Fuchs finds a few cases where physical resemblance or ethnic characteristics shared between the alleged father and the child were considered in the 1920s, but this was still rare (p. 190-92). From the 1930s onwards, blood groups might be used, not to establish paternity, but to eliminate a man as a possible father (p. 192-93, 258-59). And from 1993, DNA testing replaced the circumstantial forms of proof, like evidence of affection and care or cohabitation. Fuchs' interest in these types of proof is part of her investigation into the "divisibility of paternity" into biological or affective fatherhood.

Adoption is one of the recurring themes in Fuchs' book and fits alongside her exploration of emotional or affective attachments between fathers and children. Long discouraged by the French state, from 1804 to 1923, adoption was only permitted between adults and only if the adoptive parent (who could be single) was over 50 years of age and had no children. After the devastation of WWI, the law became more flexible.

For anyone interested in how Fuchs' assessment of paternity, adoption, family and judicial culture fits into current historiography the online H-Net list for French scholars, known as H-France, posted a lively online Forum in 2009 in which four well-known historians and feminists reviewed *Contested Paternity* with a response to their criticisms and comments by Rachel Fuchs. <http://www.h-france.net/forum/h-franceforum.html>.

LYNDAN WARNER *Saint Mary's University*

Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario

Elise Chenier

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008, ix + 294 p., \$75.00 (cloth), \$35.00 (paper)

In *Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario*, Elise Chenier states, "the purpose of history is never to make us comfortable." Chenier tackles the medico-legal construction of sexual deviance and its disturbing history in post-war Ontario. Although Canada's largest province has the starring role, her research also takes into consideration trends apparent in Canada, the United States, and Britain.

Chenier shows that fears over an increase in sex crimes against children and the prevalence of sex deviants in public spaces led to widespread concern over sex deviance. Sexual psychopath legislation passed in 1948 was premised on the belief that sex deviants acted on uncontrollable impulses that could be treated during an indefinite period of incarceration agreed upon by judges and psychiatrists. Whereas the eugenic movement had insisted upon a biological predisposition toward sex deviance, the postwar influence of sexology, psychotherapy, personality development, and child development theories high-

lighted the importance of nurture not nature. In other words, sex criminals were made, not born.

Parents who did not provide their children with sound sex education, mothers who dominated their children, and fathers who were absent from their children's lives were placed under scrutiny. Anxious to do their part, the Parents' Action League (PAL), an activist group, joined forces with legislators, politicians, and medical professionals to establish a treatment clinic for sex deviants connected to the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital. Nevertheless, it was not until the mid-1970s that the federal government began a national treatment program for sex offenders. Earlier solutions like sterilization and castration gave way during the postwar period to individual and group psychotherapy. However, mixed results renewed support for sterilization and castration as well as for electroshock, insulin shock, lobotomy, and aversion therapy. Even when the incarcerated requested treatment, there was little that was available or effective, dooming them to lifelong imprisonment without parole.

While this book can be mined for information about the history of sex crime legislation, the rise of psychiatry or the growth of citizen activism, it is best read for Chenier's insightful analysis of the relationship of gender to concepts of homosexuality and sexual deviance. Gender conventions dogged the Royal Commission of the Criminal Law Relating to Criminal Sexual Psychopaths. Although the public was increasingly restive about sex crimes against children, and against girls in particular, legal and medical experts devoted considerable attention to the male homosexual menace. Cold War fears over Communist blackmail of homosexuals in the civil service, the heightened visibility of homosexual subcultures and the linking of homosexuals to sex deviance, led to the conflation of homosexuality with pedophilia. Homosexual acts, even when acknowledged to be consensual, were seen as abnormal. By contrast, the rape of young girls was viewed as a criminal act but not as an abnormal occurrence because heterosexual contact was considered normal. Emphasis on the homosexual menace reinforced notions about "stranger danger," sidestepping evidence that children were more likely to be abused by a family member. Likewise, because it was considered a family matter, incest was not included in sexual psychopath laws, while many parents did not report assaults against their children because of the stigma associated with victims of sex crimes.

Gender conventions were also at work in the organization of prisons. Male prisoners with a feminine appearance were called "fairies" and separated from the rest of the prisoners because of the notion that they would incite homosexual activity. Prisoners acted upon a hierarchy of gender norms with predatory males or "wolves" sexually exploiting new prisoners named "fish" or "punks" who adopted a feminine role. Men incarcerated for sex crimes against children took the brunt of wolves' abuse, with the wolves asserting their masculinity by violently attacking prisoners segregated for treatment by sexual psychopath laws. Ironically, while same-sex sexual activity among prisoners was regarded as normal under the circumstances, guards invariably punished prisoners for same-sex sexual activity or sexually exploited prisoners themselves. When prisoners complained of sexual exploitation by other prisoners or by guards, prison authorities disbelieved or ignored them on the grounds that they could not be trusted because they were homosexual. Non-coercive sexual relationships between pris-

oners did occur but followed gender norms, with wolves protecting their punks or fish.

Chenier's conclusion is compelling. She stresses that the toxic relationship of masculinity to violence and power is the reason why men commit the vast majority of physical and sexual violence. Today, perpetrators of sex crimes against children are considered less than human inside and outside prison. Yet effective treatments are still elusive and stigma continues to surround victims. Ultimately, readers can expect Chenier to meet the stated purpose of history. Her book is a must read precisely because her account of the medico-legal construction of sexual deviance in postwar Ontario is guaranteed to make us profoundly uncomfortable.

CHRISTABELLE SETHNA *University of Ottawa*

Le vin et les rêves

Jean-Pierre Goubert

Paris, Ed. Glyphe, 2010, 257 p., 21 euros

Historien, Jean-Pierre Goubert enseigne à l'École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales (Paris), et est professeur associé à l'Université de Sao Paulo, où il se rend régulièrement. Il est l'auteur d'une dizaine d'ouvrages dans le domaine de l'histoire de la santé, de l'hygiène, des professions médicales et paramédicales, ainsi que de très nombreux articles, notamment sur le vin.

Si la littérature sur ce dernier sujet est immense, souvent de grande qualité, et ne cesse de se renouveler, l'essai présenté ici se signale d'entrée de jeu, et tout au long des 257 pages qui le composent, par son originalité. Ce chercheur en sciences sociales, qu'est Jean-Pierre Goubert, offre au lecteur une synthèse de ce qu'apporte le vin à l'âme, son apport positif emprunt de religieux et de convivialité. Par là même, ce livre se refuse à donner dans le palmarès comme dans l'histoire traditionnelle des vins. Son ambition consiste à donner à lire, et cela sur vingt-cinq siècles, une civilisation du vin. Pour y parvenir, Jean-Pierre Goubert considère le vin comme une « *essence* ». A son gré, elle symbolise l'humaine condition: fragile et éphémère, et d'autant plus encline à l'outrepasser, en recherchant dans le vin de raisin « *un instant d'éternité* ».

Sans méconnaître les dangers d'une addiction, Jean-Pierre Goubert s'emploie, en transportant le lecteur dans le temps et d'une civilisation à l'autre, à analyser les trois rêves que le vin est susceptible d'apporter: le rêve du Divin, au sens large, puisqu'il y intègre les sociétés de buveurs laïques; celui de la Santé à travers les âges, pour laquelle il consacre un chapitre entier au seul Champagne, « *vin de rêve* » par excellence et essence, et enfin le rêve du Partage social, de la fraternité. L'auteur nous démontre alors qu'en associant rite de passage et convivialité le vin est un vecteur de sociabilité et préside « *aux repas que partagent les membres de la "Famille humaine"* ». Ainsi, de la Grèce antique à nos jours il est un élément central. Convivial chez les grecs, il est un acteur diplomatique lors des repas aristocratiques au Moyen Âge et de plaisir à notre époque. Ainsi, pour résumer, ce livre passionnant, aisé à lire et s'adressant à un large public, présente trois modalités du seul et même rêve d'un accès à la perfection; et cela quel que

soit le sens dévolu au sacré, le sens prêté à la santé, celui attribué à la vie en société.

Tel un vin de qualité, ce livre coloré procure plaisir aux cinq sens. Parce que le sixième les interprète en décelant une Présence, celle du buveur amoureux, les pieds sur terre et les yeux levés au ciel. Un véritable plaisir à découvrir.

STÉPHANIE BARRY *Université Michel de Montaigne, Bordeaux*